

THE PALIVERSE PROJECT

The Universe of Buddha's Wisdom

The Triple Canon (Tipiṭaka)

3. The Canon of Higher Teaching (3. Abhidhamma Piṭaka)

05. Points of Controversy (05. Kathāvatthupāḷi)

9. Discussion on Existence in Immutable Modes
(9. Hevatthikathā)

[Kv 1.10, PTS 160-163]



PaliVerse

05. Points of Controversy

9. Discussion on Existence in Immutable Modes

304. Is there the past? Indeed exists, indeed does not exist. It thus exists, it thus does not exist? That should not be said. Etc. it thus exists, it thus does not exist? Yes. The meaning of existence is the meaning of non-existence, the meaning of non-existence is the meaning of existence, the state of existence is the state of non-existence, the state of non-existence is the state of existence, "there is" or "there is not," "there is not" or "there is" - are these the same in meaning, equal, of equal share, of the same kind? That should not be said. Etc.

Is there the future? Indeed exists, indeed does not exist. It thus exists, it thus does not exist? That should not be said. Etc. it thus exists, it thus does not exist? Yes. The meaning of existence is the meaning of non-existence, the meaning of non-existence is the meaning of existence, the state of existence is the state of non-existence, the state of non-existence is the state of existence, "there is" or "there is not," "there is not" or "there is" - are these the same in meaning, equal, of equal share, of the same kind? That should not be said. Etc.

Is there the present? Indeed exists, indeed does not exist. It thus exists, it thus does not exist? That should not be said. Etc. it thus exists, it thus does not exist? Yes. The meaning of existence is the meaning of non-existence, etc. equal, of equal share, of the same kind? That should not be said. Etc.

305. The past indeed exists, indeed does not exist? Yes. What therein exists, what therein does not exist? The past as past indeed exists, the past as future indeed does not exist, the past as present indeed does not exist. It thus exists, it thus does not exist? That should not be said. Etc. it thus exists, it thus does not exist? Yes. The meaning of existence is the meaning of non-existence, the meaning of non-existence is the meaning of existence, the state of existence is the state of non-existence, the state of non-existence is the state of existence, "there is" or "there is not," "there is not" or "there is" - are these the same in meaning, equal, of equal share, of the same kind? That should not be said. Etc.

The future indeed exists, indeed does not exist? Yes. What therein exists, what therein does not exist? The future as future indeed exists, the future as past indeed does not exist, the future as present indeed does not exist. It thus exists, it thus does not exist? That should not be said. Etc. it thus exists, it thus does not exist? Yes. The meaning of existence is the meaning of non-existence, the meaning of non-existence is the meaning of existence, etc. equal, of equal share, of the same kind? That should not be said. Etc.

The present indeed exists, indeed does not exist? Yes. What therein exists, what therein does not exist? The present as present indeed exists, the present as past indeed does not exist, the present as future indeed does not exist. It thus exists, it

thus does not exist? That should not be said. Etc. it thus exists, it thus does not exist? Yes. The meaning of existence is the meaning of non-existence, etc. equal, of equal share, of the same kind? That should not be said. Etc.

Should it not be said - "The past indeed exists, indeed does not exist; the future indeed exists, indeed does not exist; the present indeed exists, indeed does not exist"? Yes. The past is the future indeed exists, the past is the present indeed exists, the future is the past indeed exists, the future is the present indeed exists, the present is the past indeed exists, the present is the future indeed exists? That should not be said. Etc. Well then, the past indeed exists, indeed does not exist, the future indeed exists, indeed does not exist, the present indeed exists, indeed does not exist.

306. Is there matter? Indeed exists, indeed does not exist. It thus exists, it thus does not exist? That should not be said. Etc. it thus exists, it thus does not exist? Yes. The meaning of existence is the meaning of non-existence, the meaning of non-existence is the meaning of existence, the state of existence is the state of non-existence, the state of non-existence is the state of existence, "there is" or "there is not," "there is not" or "there is" - are these the same in meaning, equal, of equal share, of the same kind? That should not be said. Etc.

Feeling... perception... activities... is there consciousness? Indeed exists, indeed does not exist. It thus exists, it thus does not exist? That should not be said. Etc. it thus exists, it thus does not exist? Yes. The meaning of existence is the meaning of non-existence, etc. equal, of equal share, of the same kind? That should not be said. Etc.

Matter indeed exists, indeed does not exist? Yes. What therein exists, what therein does not exist? Matter is matter - this indeed exists, matter is feeling - this indeed does not exist. Etc. matter is perception - this indeed does not exist. Etc. matter is activities - this indeed does not exist. Etc. matter is consciousness - this indeed does not exist. It thus exists, it thus does not exist? That should not be said. Etc. it thus exists, it thus does not exist? Yes. The meaning of existence is the meaning of non-existence, etc. equal, of equal share, of the same kind? That should not be said. Etc.

Feeling... perception... activities... consciousness indeed exists, indeed does not exist? Yes. What therein exists, what therein does not exist? Consciousness is consciousness indeed exists. Consciousness is matter indeed does not exist, etc. consciousness is feeling indeed does not exist, etc. consciousness is perception indeed does not exist, etc. consciousness is activities indeed does not exist. It thus exists, it thus does not exist? That should not be said. Etc. it thus exists, it thus does not exist? Yes. The meaning of existence is the meaning of non-existence, etc. equal, of equal share, of the same kind? That should not be said. Etc.

Should it not be said - "matter indeed exists, indeed does not exist; feeling... perception... activities... consciousness indeed exists, indeed does not exist? Yes. Matter is feeling indeed exists, etc. matter is perception indeed exists, etc. matter is activities indeed exists, etc. matter is consciousness indeed exists... feeling... perception... activities... consciousness is matter indeed exists... consciousness is feeling indeed exists... consciousness is perception indeed exists... consciousness is activities indeed exists? That should not be said. Etc. Well then, matter indeed exists, indeed does not exist; feeling... perception... activities... consciousness indeed exists, indeed does not exist.

The Discussion on Indeed Exists is finished.

Its summary:

Having got, decline, abiding by the holy life, limitedly;
Full understanding, abandoning of sensual lust, the theory of all exists, sense
base;
Past and future, beautiful factor, all phenomena are establishments of
mindfulness.

Indeed exists, indeed does not exist.

The First Chapter

The Great Chapter.



ABOUT THIS TRANSLATION

This translation is part of the PaliVerse Project - the first complete, unified English translation of the Pāli Canon together with its Commentaries (Aṭṭhakathā) and Subcommentaries (Tīkā), accompanied by interactive study tools. PaliVerse is an ongoing project. The AI translations are continuously improved through experts' revisions and feedback. This text is the latest translation as of the date of download.

PDF Creation Date: 14 September 2026

HOW TO CITE

PaliVerse (2026). The Triple Canon. 3. The Canon of Higher Teaching. 05. Points of Controversy. 9. Discussion on Existence in Immutable Modes Retrieved from paliverse.org

© 2026 The PaliVerse Project · All Rights Reserved
Centre for Study and Practice of Theravāda Buddhism
Civic Non-Profit Company registered in Greece
This PDF may be freely distributed for study and practice.

PaliVerse.org