

THE PALIVERSE PROJECT

The Universe of Buddha's Wisdom

Commentaries (Aṭṭhakathā)

2. The Canon of Discipline - Commentaries (2. Vinaya
Piṭaka - Aṭṭhakathā)

4. Commentary on the Minor Chapter (4. Cūḷavagga-
aṭṭhakathā)

7. The Section on Schism in a Community
(7. Saṅghabhedakakkhandhakaṃ)

[Kd 17, PTS 2.180-2.206]



PaliVerse

4. Commentary on the Minor Chapter

7. The Section on Schism in a Community

Discussion on the Going Forth of the Six Sakyans

330. In the Chapter on the Splitting of the Community, "well-known, well-known" means renowned, renowned. The Sakyan princes means the ten messengers beginning with Kāḷudāyī together with their retainers, and many other people as well. "Of us" means among us; or it is said as "from our family." "I shall instruct in the purpose of household life" means I shall make known what should be done in household life. "Water should be drained off" means it should be done so that the water is even in all places. "The weeds should be removed" means the grasses should be pulled out. "The chaff should be removed" means the husks mixed with fine straw and grain should be winnowed away. "It should be winnowed" means the fine straw should be removed. "You yourself understand the purpose of household life" means you yourself should know the purpose of household life. "I with you; go forth as you wish" - here the meaning should be understood thus: wishing to say impulsively out of affection for his friend "I shall go forth together with you," but then with his heart being pulled back by desire for the glory of kingship, having said only "I with you," he was unable to say the rest.

331. "Led away" means led out. "Full of conceit" means those who resort to conceit; the meaning stated is "dependent on conceit."

332. "For one within whom there are no irritations" means for one in whose mind there are no irritations, because they have been eradicated by the third path. Moreover, since "existence" means prosperity, "non-existence" means adversity; likewise "existence" means growth, "non-existence" means decline; "existence" means eternalism, "non-existence" means annihilationism; "existence" means merit, "non-existence" means demerit; "non-existence" and "non-being" are in meaning one and the same, therefore in "and who has transcended this or that existence," that which is called the manifold nature of existence and non-existence by way of prosperity and adversity, growth and decline, eternalism and annihilationism, merit and demerit; the meaning should be understood thus: one has transcended this or that existence and non-existence by the four paths, in each respective manner as applicable. "Are unable" means they do not attain; the intended meaning is that the sight of such a one is difficult even for the gods.

333. "With a snake as a girdle" means having tied a snake around the waist. "On the lap" means on the lap.

334. "He is honoured" means he honours. "Whatever he does" means whatever he will do.

The discussion on the going forth of the six Sakyans is concluded.

Discussion on the Act of Proclamation, etc.

336. Regarding "one to be spat upon" - here, requisites arisen through wrong livelihood are to be rejected by the noble ones, being like spittle; since this one swallows such requisites, he was called "one to be spat upon" by the Blessed One.

340. "With body stiff" means with a body that was motionless, like a figure in a book.

342. "We, my good men, are known to the king" - he said this exalting himself by the status of being known to the king, meaning "the king knows us." "With ears and tail erect" means having made them rigid and motionless in their binding.

"For indeed, elephant, attacking the elephant is suffering" means: dear elephant, approaching the Buddha-elephant with murderous intent is indeed suffering. "For one who has killed an elephant" means for one who would kill the Buddha-elephant.

"Retreated while still facing" means he backed away with his hind feet while still facing the Truth-finder. "Unfortunate" - here, "one who does not recognise" is unfortunate; the meaning is "one who does not know," he does not know that "I am doing an evil deed." Or "one who should not be regarded" is unfortunate; the meaning is "one who should not be seen."

343. "Group meal" here means food to be eaten by three persons. "I will lay down" means "I will allow that." "For a group meal, one should be dealt with according to the rule." The account of the request for the five cases has been stated in the explanation of the Saṅghādisesa. "A cosmic cycle" means a duration of life. "Supreme merit" means the highest merit. "A cosmic cycle in heaven" means a lifespan cycle itself.

The discussion on the act of proclamation and so forth is concluded.

Discussion on Causing a Schism in the Community

344. "Then Devadatta, having split the Community" - he, it is said, having thus taken the voting ticket, held a separate Observance right there and then departed; therefore this was said.

345. "My back aches" means it is afflicted, overcome by painful feeling due to prolonged sitting. "I will stretch it" means I will extend it. Instruction by the wonder of mind-reading means, having known another's mind thus: "Your mind is thus, your mind is also thus," a teaching of the Dhamma in accordance with that.

346. "Imitating me" means one who is performing imitation of me. "Miserable wretch" means one who is suffering. "Of the great boar" means of the great elephant. "Transforming the earth" means of one who is breaking up the ground. "Eating lotus roots" means of one who is chewing lotus roots. "Watching in the rivers" means here, it is said, that bull elephant, having plunged into that lotus pond called a river in the evening time, being wearied, spent the whole night, keeping watch. Therefore it is said "watching in the rivers."

347. "Sutā" means "a listener" (sotā). "And without doubt declares" means having become free from doubt, he declares by connecting and connecting according to the sequence of meaning.

350. "Will be reborn in a realm of misery" means bound for the realm of misery (āpāyiko). Likewise, doomed to hell (nerayiko). "Will remain for a cosmic cycle" means one who will remain for a cosmic cycle (kappaṭṭho). "Now even a thousand Buddhas could not cure him" means incurable (atekiccho).

"May no one in the world ever" means may no being whatsoever ever in the world. "Arose" (udapajjatha) means was reborn (upapajjatha). "Standing as if blazing with fame" means standing as though ablaze with fame. "Devadatta - thus I have heard" means there is also what was heard by the Blessed One as "such was Devadatta"; taking that very thing, this was said. "He, having practised negligence" - here, "one who practises negligence" means one who has practised it (anuciṇṇo); the meaning is that negligence has not been abandoned. "Having attacked him" means having approached with an evil mind, or the meaning is having drained. "Reached the Avīci hell" - but this is a past tense expression used in the sense of a certainty yet to come. "Fearsome" (bhesmā) means terrifying (bhayānako).

The discussion on the schism of the Community is concluded.

Discussion on the Questions of Upāli

351. "On one side, Upāli, one" means one on the side of those who speak in accordance with the Teaching. "On one side two" means two on the side of those who speak contrary to the Teaching. "A fourth proclaims" means having become the fourth among those who speak contrary to the Teaching, with the intention of splitting the Community, he proclaims; persuading, he announces: "Not only you have fear of hell, we too have it; the path to Avīci is not closed to us; we are not unskilled, we are not afraid. If this were contrary to the Teaching, contrary to the discipline, or contrary to the Teacher's instruction, we would not accept it" - by this method, he makes known the eighteen grounds for schism, such as "what is contrary to the Teaching is the Teaching." This is the meaning. "Has the voting ticket taken" means having thus proclaimed, saying "accept this, approve this," he has the voting ticket taken.

In "On one side, Upāli, there are two" and so forth, the same method applies. "Thus, Upāli, there is both dissension in the Community and schism in the Community" - thus it occurs; but to this extent the Community is not yet split.

"A monk, Upāli, who is regular, belonging to the same communion, standing within the same boundary, breaks the Community" - here one might ask: "How was Devadatta regular?" How was he not irregular, given that he caused the killing of a king and shed the blood of a Buddha? Therein we say - firstly, because the command failed, there was no causing of the king's killing. For his command was thus: "Then you, prince, having killed your father, become king; I, having killed the Blessed One, shall become a Buddha." But the prince, having become king, afterwards killed his father; thus, because the command failed, there was no causing of the king's killing. As for the shedding of blood, at the very time it was done, the Blessed One did not declare his incapability on account of the shedding of blood, and it is not possible to attribute incapability to him without the Blessed One's word.

"One who has shed blood, monks, if unordained, should not be ordained; if ordained, should be expelled" -

this, however, was said by the Blessed One after the schism of the Community; therefore, it was as a regular monk that he split the Community.

In "they show what is contrary to the Teaching as the Teaching" and so forth, among the eighteen grounds for schism, by the method of the discourses, firstly, the ten courses of wholesome action are the Teaching, and the ten courses of unwholesome action are what is contrary to the Teaching. Likewise, the four foundations of mindfulness, the four right strivings, the four bases of spiritual power, the five faculties, the five powers, the seven factors of enlightenment, and the noble eightfold path - these thirty-seven qualities conducive to enlightenment are called the Teaching; three foundations of mindfulness, three right strivings, three bases of spiritual power, six faculties, six powers, eight factors of enlightenment, a ninefold path, and also the four kinds of clinging, the five hindrances, the seven underlying tendencies, and the eight wrong states - this is what is contrary to the Teaching.

Therein, having taken up any one portion of what is contrary to the Teaching, thinking "we shall make this, which is contrary to the Teaching, into the Teaching; thus, depending on our teacher's lineage, it will be leading to liberation, and we shall become well-known in the world" - those who speak of what is contrary to the Teaching as "this is the Teaching" are said to show what is contrary to the Teaching as the Teaching. In the same way, having taken up one among the portions of the Teaching and speaking of it as "this is contrary to the Teaching," they are said to show the Teaching as contrary to the Teaching. By the method of the discipline, however, an act to be carried out after charging and reminding with a real matter, in accordance with the confession, is called the Teaching; an act to be carried out without charging, without reminding, with an unreal matter, without confession, is called what is contrary to the Teaching.

By the method of the discourses, the removal of lust, the removal of hatred, the removal of delusion, restraint, abandonment, and reflection - this is called the discipline; the non-removal of lust and the rest, non-restraint, non-abandonment, and non-reflection - this is called what is contrary to the discipline. By the method of the discipline, completeness of the matter, completeness of the motion, completeness of the proclamation, completeness of the boundary, and completeness of the assembly - this is called the discipline; failure of the matter, etc. failure of the assembly - this is called what is contrary to the discipline.

According to the method of the discourses, the four foundations of mindfulness...the eightfold path - this was spoken, uttered by the Truth-finder; three foundations of mindfulness, three right strivings, three bases of spiritual power, six faculties, six powers, eight factors of enlightenment, a ninefold path - this was not spoken, not uttered by the Truth-finder. According to the method of the monastic discipline, four defeats, thirteen matters entailing initial and subsequent meetings of the Community, two undetermined matters, thirty offences of expiation involving forfeiture - this was spoken, uttered by the Truth-finder; three defeats, fourteen matters entailing initial and subsequent meetings of the Community, three undetermined matters, thirty-one offences of expiation involving forfeiture - this was not spoken, not uttered by the Truth-finder.

According to the method of the discourses, daily attainment of fruition attainment, attainment of the attainment of great compassion, surveying the world with the Buddha-eye, discourse teaching according to the arising of occasions, and Jātaka narration - this is what was practised; not daily attainment of fruition attainment, etc. not the telling of birth stories - this was not practised. According to the method of the monastic discipline, having dwelt the rains residence when invited, departing on a journey after taking leave, departing on a journey after the invitation ceremony, and first making friendly welcome together with visiting monks - this is what was practised; the non-performance of that very practice is called what was not practised.

According to the method of the discourses, the four establishments of mindfulness, etc. the eightfold path - this is called laid down. Three establishments of mindfulness, etc. the ninefold path - this is called not laid down. According to the method of the monastic discipline, the four offences involving expulsion, etc. thirty offences of expiation involving forfeiture - this is called what was laid down; Three offences involving expulsion, etc. thirty-one offences of expiation involving forfeiture - this is called what was not laid down.

"There is no offence for one who does not know, for one without intention to steal, for one without intention of killing, for one with intention of flattering, for one without intention of releasing" - the non-offence stated here and there is called non-offence. "For one who knows, for one with intention to steal" - the offence stated according to this method is called offence. The five classes of offences are called light offences, the two classes of offences are called grave offences. The six classes of offences are called a remediable offence; the one class of offence of expulsion is called an irremediable offence. The two classes of offences are called a coarse offence; the five classes of offences are called not a coarse offence.

But here, by the former method itself, those who speak of what was stated as the Teaching as "this is not the Teaching" are said to represent the Teaching as not the Teaching. What is not the monastic discipline as "this is the monastic discipline", etc. those who speak of a non-gross offence as "this is a gross offence" are said to represent a non-gross offence as a gross offence. Thus, having represented what is not the Teaching as "the Teaching", etc. or having represented a non-gross offence as "a gross offence", having gained a faction, the Community is said to be broken by those who separately perform any one of the four formal acts of the Community within the same boundary. Therefore it was said - "They draw away by these eighteen grounds", etc.

Therein, "they draw away" means they pull the assembly apart, disentangle it, and lead it aside. "They separate" means they make it known excessively, as it were, so that they become disassociated; thus they act. "They divide" means separately. "To this extent, Upāli, the Community is broken" means thus, having demonstrated any one matter among the eighteen grounds for schism, having persuaded by this or that reason "take this, approve of this," having had the voting tickets taken, when a separate Community act is performed, the Community is broken. However, in the Parivāra it is said "In five ways, Upāli, the Community is broken" and so forth; there is no difference in meaning between that and the characteristic of schism in the Community stated here. We shall make clear the absence of that difference in that very place. The remainder is clear everywhere.

The discussion on the questions of Upāli is concluded.

The commentary on the Chapter on the Schism of the Community is concluded.



ABOUT THIS TRANSLATION

This translation is part of the PaliVerse Project - the first complete, unified English translation of the Pāli Canon together with its Commentaries (Aṭṭhakathā) and Subcommentaries (Tīkā), accompanied by interactive study tools. PaliVerse is an ongoing project. The AI translations are continuously improved through experts' revisions and feedback. This text is the latest translation as of the date of download.

PDF Creation Date: 14 September 2026

HOW TO CITE

PaliVerse (2026). Commentaries. 2. The Canon of Discipline - Commentaries. 4. Commentary on the Minor Chapter. 7. The Section on Schism in a Community Retrieved from paliverse.org

© 2026 The PaliVerse Project · All Rights Reserved
Centre for Study and Practice of Theravāda Buddhism
Civic Non-Profit Company registered in Greece
This PDF may be freely distributed for study and practice.

PaliVerse.org