

THE PALIVERSE PROJECT

The Universe of Buddha's Wisdom

The Triple Canon (Tipiṭaka)

The Canon of Discourses (Sutta Piṭaka)

5. The Collection of Minor Texts (5. Khuddaka Nikāya)

20. The Questions of Milinda (20. Milindapañhapāḷi)

5. The Question of Inference (5. Anumānapañho)

[Mil 6.1.1-6.4.2, PTS 237-362]



PaliVerse

5. The Collection of Minor Texts

20. The Questions of Milinda

5. The Question of Inference

1. The Chapter on the Buddha

1. The Question on Two Buddhas Not Arising

1. "Venerable Nāgasena, this was spoken by the Blessed One: 'This is impossible, monks, there is no chance that two Worthy Ones, Perfectly Enlightened Ones, should arise simultaneously in one world system - this is impossible.' And when teaching, venerable Nāgasena, all Truth-finders teach the thirty-seven qualities conducive to enlightenment; when speaking, they speak of the four noble truths; when training, they train in the three trainings; when instructing, they instruct in the practice of diligence. If, venerable Nāgasena, all Truth-finders have one teaching, one talk, one training, one instruction, for what reason do two Truth-finders not arise at one moment? Even by the arising of one Buddha this world has become radiant; if there were a second Buddha, by the radiance of two this world would become radiant to an even greater degree; and two Truth-finders exhorting would exhort easily, and instructing would instruct easily. Tell me the reason for this, so that I may be free from doubt."

"This ten-thousand-fold world system, great king, can bear only one Buddha; it bears the virtue of only one Truth-finder. If a second Buddha were to arise, this ten-thousand-fold world system would not bear it; it would shake, tremble, bend, bend down, twist, scatter, be destroyed, be demolished, and would not remain in place.

Just as, great king, a boat might be able to carry one person; when one person has boarded, that boat would be fully loaded. Then a second person might come, similar in life span, beauty, age, size, thinness and stoutness, and in all major and minor limbs; he might board that boat. Would that boat, great king, bear both of them?" "No indeed, venerable sir, it would shake, tremble, bend, bend down, twist, scatter, be destroyed, be demolished, would not remain in place, and would sink in the water."

"Just so indeed, great king, this ten-thousand-fold world system can bear only one Buddha; it bears the virtue of only one Truth-finder. If a second Buddha were to arise, this ten-thousand-fold world system would not bear it; it would shake, tremble, bend, bend down, twist, scatter, be destroyed, be demolished, and would not remain in place.

Or else, great king, suppose a man were to eat as much food as he likes, satisfying himself, filling up to the throat; he, satisfied, gratified, complete, without interval, drowsy, become stiff as an unbent stick, were to eat again that much food. Would that man, great king, be happy?" "No indeed, venerable sir, having eaten once he would die." "Just so indeed, great king, this ten-thousand-fold world system can bear only one Buddha; it bears the virtue of only one Truth-finder. If a second Buddha were to arise, this ten-thousand-fold world system would not bear it; it would shake, tremble, bend, bend down, twist, scatter, be destroyed, be demolished, and would

not remain in place."

"Is it then, venerable Nāgasena, that the earth shakes because of the excessive burden of the Teaching?" "Here, great king, suppose there were two carts filled with jewels up to the brim; having taken jewels from one cart, they were to heap them onto one cart. Would that cart, great king, bear the jewels of both carts?" "No indeed, venerable sir, its hub would split, its spokes would break, its rim would fall off, its axle would break." "Is it then, great king, that the cart breaks because of the excessive burden of jewels?" "Yes, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, the earth shakes because of the excessive burden of the Teaching."

But moreover, great king, this reason has been brought forward for the elucidation of the power of a Buddha. Listen to another fitting reason for this, by which reason two Perfectly Enlightened Ones do not arise at one moment. If, great king, two Perfectly Enlightened Ones were to arise at one moment, a dispute would arise among their followers: 'Your Buddha, our Buddha,' and they would become divided into two factions. Just as, great king, a dispute might arise among the followers of two powerful ministers: 'Your minister, our minister,' and they become divided into two factions, just so indeed, great king, if two Perfectly Enlightened Ones were to arise at one moment, a dispute would arise among their followers: 'Your Buddha, our Buddha,' and they would become divided into two factions. This, for now, great king, is one reason by which reason two Perfectly Enlightened Ones do not arise at one moment.

Furthermore, great king, listen to a further reason by which reason two Perfectly Enlightened Ones do not arise at one moment. If, great king, two Perfectly Enlightened Ones were to arise at one moment, the statement 'the foremost Buddha' would be wrong, the statement 'the eldest Buddha' would be wrong, 'the best Buddha,' 'the distinguished Buddha,' 'the highest Buddha,' 'the most excellent Buddha,' 'the matchless Buddha,' 'the equal to the matchless Buddha,' 'the incomparable Buddha,' 'the one without counterpart Buddha,' 'the matchless person Buddha' - this statement would be wrong. Accept this reason too, great king, according to its meaning, by which reason two Perfectly Enlightened Ones do not arise at one moment.

But moreover, great king, this is the intrinsic nature of the Buddhas, the Blessed Ones: only one Buddha arises in the world. For what reason? Because of the greatness of the qualities of the omniscient Buddha. Whatever else, great king, is great in the world, that is only one. The earth, great king, is great; it is only one. The ocean is great; it is only one. Sineru, the king of mountains, is great; it is only one. Space is great; it is only one. Sakka is great; he is only one. Māra is great; he is only one. The Great Brahmā is great; he is only one. The Truth-finder, the Worthy One, the Perfectly Enlightened One, is great; he is only one in the world. Wherever they arise, there is no opportunity for another; therefore, great king, the Truth-finder, the Worthy One, the Perfectly Enlightened One, arises only one in the world."

"Well explained, Venerable Nāgasena, is the question with similes and reasons. Even one who is not clever, having heard this, would be delighted, how much more one of great wisdom like me. Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on two Buddhas not arising is the first.

2. The Question on Gotamī's Gift of Cloth

2. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One when his maternal aunt Mahāpajāpati Gotamī was offering a cloth for the rains: 'Give it to the monastic community, Gotamī. When you have given it to the monastic community, both I shall be venerated and the monastic community as well.' Is it indeed, venerable Nāgasena, that the Truth-finder is not weighty, not heavy, not worthy of offerings compared to the jewel of the monastic community, that the Truth-finder had his own maternal aunt give to the monastic community the cloth for the rains that was being given to himself, which she herself had carded, herself had plucked, herself had beaten, herself had spun, herself had woven? If, venerable Nāgasena, the Truth-finder were higher than the jewel of the monastic community, or superior, or distinguished, thinking 'When given to me, there will be great fruit,' the Truth-finder would not have had his maternal aunt give to the monastic community the cloth for the rains that she herself had carded, herself had plucked, herself had beaten. But because, venerable Nāgasena, the Truth-finder does not desire himself, does not rely on himself, therefore the Truth-finder had his maternal aunt give that cloth for the rains to the monastic community."

"This was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One when his maternal aunt Mahāpajāpati Gotamī was offering a cloth for the rains: 'Give it to the monastic community, Gotamī. When you have given it to the monastic community, both I shall be venerated and the monastic community as well.' But that was not because of his own honour being without result, nor because of being unworthy of offerings. But rather, great king, for the sake of welfare, out of compassion, thinking 'In the future time, after my passing, the monastic community will be honoured,' while proclaiming the virtue that exists, he said thus: 'Give it to the monastic community, Gotamī. When you have given it to the monastic community, both I shall be venerated and the monastic community as well.'

Just as, great king, a father while still living, in the midst of ministers, soldiers, troops, doorkeepers, military officers, and attendants, in the presence of the king, proclaims the virtue that exists of his son, thinking 'Placed here, in the future time, he will be venerated in the midst of people.' Just so indeed, great king, the Truth-finder, for the sake of welfare, out of compassion, thinking 'In the future time, after my passing, the monastic community will be honoured,' while proclaiming the virtue that exists, said thus: 'Give it to the monastic community, Gotamī. When you have given it to the monastic community, both I shall be venerated and the monastic community as well.'

Indeed, great king, by that mere giving of a cloth for the rains, the monastic community does not become superior to the Truth-finder or distinguished. Just as, great king, mother and father anoint their sons, massage them, bathe them, shampoo them - does indeed, great king, by that mere anointing, massaging, bathing, and shampooing, 'a son become superior to mother and father or distinguished'?" "No indeed, venerable sir. Sons, venerable sir, are those for whom mother and father must do what they do not wish to do; therefore mother and father do the anointing, massaging, bathing, and shampooing for their sons." "Just so indeed, great king, by that mere giving of a cloth for the rains, the monastic community does not become superior to the Truth-finder or distinguished. But rather, the Truth-finder, doing what need not be done, had his maternal aunt give that cloth

for the rains to the monastic community.

Or else, great king, if some man were to bring a tribute to a king, and the king were to give that tribute to a certain soldier or trooper or general or chaplain. Would that man, great king, by that mere receipt of the tribute, become superior to the king or distinguished?" "No indeed, venerable sir. That man, venerable sir, is maintained by the king, dependent on the king; placing him in that position, the king gives the tribute." "Just so indeed, great king, by that mere giving of a cloth for the rains, the monastic community does not become superior to the Truth-finder or distinguished; but rather it is maintained by the Truth-finder, dependent on the Truth-finder. Placing it in that position, the Truth-finder had the cloth for the rains given to the monastic community.

Moreover, great king, this occurred to the Truth-finder: 'The monastic community is by nature worthy of honour; I shall honour the monastic community with what belongs to me' - thus he had the cloth for the rains given to the monastic community. The Truth-finder, great king, does not praise only the honouring of himself; but those in the world who are worthy of honour, the Truth-finder praises the honouring of them too.

This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One, the god above gods, in the Dhammadāyāda discourse, the excellent seal of the Middle Collection, while praising the practice of fewness of wishes: 'That former monk is more worthy of respect and more praiseworthy to me.' There is not, great king, in the realms of existence any being worthy of offerings or higher or superior or distinguished compared to the Truth-finder; the Truth-finder alone is higher, superior, distinguished.

This too was spoken, great king, in the excellent Connected Collection, by the young god Māṇavagāṃika, standing before the Blessed One, in the midst of gods and humans:

'Vipula is called the foremost mountain of the Rājagaha mountains;
Seta is the foremost of the Himalayan mountains, the sun of those that travel
through the sky.

'The ocean is the foremost of waters, the moon of the constellations;
Of the world with its gods, the Buddha is called the foremost.'

Now these verses, great king, were well sung by the young god Māṇavagāṃika, not badly sung, well spoken, not badly spoken, and approved by the Blessed One. Was it not, great king, spoken also by the elder Sāriputta, the General of the Teaching:

'A single mental placidity; Or going for refuge, a salutation with joined palms;
Is able to save, in the Buddha who destroys the forces of Māra.'

"And it was spoken by the Blessed One, the god above gods: 'One person, monks, arising in the world arises for the welfare of many people, for the happiness of many people, out of compassion for the world, for the good, welfare, and happiness of gods and humans. Which one person? The Truth-finder, the Worthy One, the Perfectly Enlightened One, etc. of gods and humans.'" "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

3. The Question on the Right Practice of Householders and Those Gone Forth

3. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One: 'I praise right practice, monks, whether of a householder or of one gone forth. Whether a householder, monks, or one gone forth, one who has practised rightly, because of right practice, is one who fulfils the true method, the wholesome teaching.' If, Venerable Nāgasena, a householder clad in white, enjoying sensual pleasures, dwelling in the confinement of wife and children, enjoying Kāśi sandalwood, wearing garlands, scents, and cosmetics, accepting gold and silver, bound with jewelled earrings and a variegated topknot, practising rightly, is one who fulfils the true method, the wholesome teaching, and one gone forth also, shaven-headed and clothed in ochre robes, gone to the midst of others' almsfood, one who fulfils completely the four aggregates of morality, living having undertaken one hundred and fifty training rules, living completely in the thirteen virtues of ascetic practice, practising rightly, is one who fulfils the true method, the wholesome teaching. Therein, venerable sir, what is the distinction between a householder or one gone forth? Ascetic practice is fruitless, going forth is useless. Guarding the training rules is barren, undertaking the virtues of ascetic practice is empty; what is the use of practising suffering there? Is not happiness to be attained through happiness alone?"

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'I praise right practice, monks, whether of a householder or of one gone forth. Whether a householder, monks, or one gone forth, one who has practised rightly, because of right practice, is one who fulfils the true method, the wholesome teaching.' Thus, great king, one who has practised rightly is indeed foremost. Even one gone forth, great king, if he should not practise rightly thinking 'I have gone forth,' then he is far from asceticism, far from commitment to holy life, how much more a householder clad in white. A householder also, great king, practising rightly, is one who fulfils the true method, the wholesome teaching; one gone forth also, great king, practising rightly, is one who fulfils the true method, the wholesome teaching.

"But moreover, great king, one gone forth alone is the lord and master of asceticism; going forth, great king, has many virtues, numerous virtues, immeasurable virtues; it is not possible to measure the virtue of going forth.

"Just as, great king, it is not possible to measure by wealth the value of a wish-fulfilling jewel gem, saying 'This much is the price of the jewel gem,' just so indeed, great king, going forth has many virtues, numerous virtues, immeasurable virtues; it is not possible to measure the virtue of going forth.

"Or just as, great king, it is not possible to measure the waves in the great ocean, saying 'There are this many waves in the great ocean,' just so indeed, great king, going forth has many virtues, numerous virtues, immeasurable virtues; it is not possible to measure the virtue of going forth.

"For one gone forth, great king, whatever is to be done, all that succeeds quickly, not after a long time. Why? One gone forth, great king, is of few wishes, content, secluded, not in company, putting forth strenuous energy, free from attachment, without abode, of complete morality, of austere conduct, skilled in the practice of

ascetic practices; for that reason, for one gone forth, whatever is to be done, all that succeeds quickly, not after a long time. Just as, great king, an iron bar without knots, even, well-washed, straight, spotless, well-prepared, goes rightly, just so indeed, great king, for one gone forth, whatever is to be done, all that succeeds quickly, not after a long time." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on the right practice of householders and those gone forth is the third.

4. The Question on the Fault of Practice

4. "Venerable Nāgasena, when the Bodhisatta performed the performance of austerities, there was no such beginning elsewhere, no exertion, no warfare against defilements, no destruction of the army of Death, no discernment of food, no performance of austerities; in such an endeavour, not having obtained any gratification, having neglected that very mind, he spoke thus: 'Yet I do not by this bitter performance of austerities attain any super-human achievement, any distinction of knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones; could there be another path to enlightenment?' Having become disenchanted with that, having attained omniscience by another path, he again instructs and instigates disciples in that very practice.

'Begin, go forth, engage in the Buddha's teaching;
Shake off the army of Death, as an elephant a hut made of reeds.'

For what reason, Venerable Nāgasena, does the Truth-finder instruct and instigate disciples in that very practice from which he himself became disenchanted and dispassionate?"

"Even then, great king, even now, that is the very practice; having proceeded in that very practice, the Bodhisatta attained omniscience. But moreover, great king, the Bodhisatta, making excessive effort, completely stopped food. By that stopping of food, weakness of mind arose for him. He, by that weakness, was not able to attain omniscience; he, partaking of just a little edible food, by that very practice, soon attained omniscience. That indeed, great king, is the practice for the attainment of omniscient knowledge for all Truth-finders.

"Just as, great king, food is the support for all beings, and all beings dependent on food experience happiness, just so indeed, great king, that very practice is for the attainment of omniscient knowledge for all Truth-finders. This, great king, is not the fault of the beginning, nor of exertion, nor of warfare against defilements, by which the Truth-finder at that time did not attain omniscient knowledge; rather this is the fault of the stopping of food; that practice is always prepared.

"Just as, great king, a man might travel a journey with excessive speed, and by that he might become paralysed or a cripple, unable to move on the surface of the earth. Is there indeed, great king, any fault of the great earth, by which that man became paralysed?" "No indeed, venerable sir; the great earth is always prepared, venerable sir; from where would there be fault in it? This is the fault of effort, by which that man became paralysed." "Just so indeed, great king, this is not the fault of the beginning,

nor of exertion, nor of warfare against defilements, by which the Truth-finder at that time did not attain omniscient knowledge; rather this is the fault of the stopping of food; that practice is always prepared.

"Or else, great king, if a man were to wear a soiled cloth and he would not have it washed, this is not the fault of water; water is always prepared. This is the fault of the man. Just so indeed, great king, this is not the fault of the beginning, nor of exertion, nor of warfare against defilements, by which the Truth-finder at that time did not attain omniscient knowledge; rather this is the fault of the stopping of food; that practice is always prepared. Therefore the Truth-finder instructs and instigates disciples in that very practice. Thus indeed, great king, that practice is always prepared and blameless." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on the fault of practice is the fourth.

5. The Question on Returning to the Low Life

5. "Venerable Nāgasena, this Dispensation of the Truth-finder is great, essential, excellent, foremost, noble, incomparable, pure, spotless, white, and blameless; it is not proper to give the going forth to a householder just like that. Having trained a householder in one fruition, when he becomes a non-returner, then he should be given the going forth. Why? These wicked people, having gone forth in that pure Dispensation, having turned back, return to the lower life; by their coming back, this great multitude thinks thus: 'Surely, friends, this Dispensation of the ascetic Gotama must be hollow, since these turn back.' This is the reason here."

"Just as, great king, there might be a lake full of pure, spotless, cool water, and then whoever, being defiled, covered with dirt and mud, having gone to that lake, without bathing, might turn back still defiled - there, great king, which would people censure, the defiled one or the lake?" "The defiled one, venerable sir, people would censure: 'This one, having gone to the lake, without bathing, turned back still defiled. Will the lake itself bathe this one who does not wish to bathe? What is the fault of the lake?' Just so indeed, great king, the Truth-finder created the excellent lake of the Good Teaching, full of the excellent water of liberation: 'Whoever are defiled by the stain of mental defilements, conscious, intelligent beings, they, having bathed here, will wash away all mental defilements.' If anyone, having gone to that excellent lake of the Good Teaching, without bathing, still with defilements, having turned back, returns to the lower life, people will censure that very one: 'This one, having gone forth in the Conqueror's Dispensation, not having obtained support there, has returned to the lower life. Will the Conqueror's Dispensation itself awaken this one who does not practise? What is the fault of the Conqueror's Dispensation?'

Or else, great king, suppose a man, extremely ill, having seen a physician, a surgeon, skilled in the origin of diseases, whose work is unfailing and always successful, having not been treated, might turn back still with his illness - there, which would people censure, the sick one or the physician?" "The sick one, venerable sir, people would censure: 'This one, having seen a physician, a surgeon, skilled in the origin of diseases, whose work is unfailing and always successful, having not been treated, turned back still with his illness. Will the physician himself treat this one who does not get treated? What is the fault of the physician?'" "Just so indeed, great king, the

Truth-finder placed inside the casket of the Dispensation the deathless medicine capable of appeasing the entire disease of all mental defilements: 'Whoever are afflicted by the disease of mental defilements, conscious, intelligent beings, they, having drunk this deathless medicine, will appease all disease of mental defilements.' If anyone, not having drunk that deathless medicine, still with defilements, having turned back, returns to the lower life, people will censure that very one: 'This one, having gone forth in the Conqueror's Dispensation, not having obtained support there, has returned to the lower life. Will the Conqueror's Dispensation itself awaken this one who does not practise? What is the fault of the Conqueror's Dispensation?'

Or else, great king, suppose a hungry man, having gone to a great, great meritorious food distribution, not having eaten that food, might turn back still hungry - there, which would people censure, the hungry one or the meritorious food?" "The hungry one, venerable sir, people would censure: 'This one, afflicted by hunger, having received meritorious food, not having eaten, turned back still hungry. Will the food itself enter the mouth of this one who does not eat? What is the fault of the food?'" "Just so indeed, great king, the Truth-finder placed inside the casket of the Dispensation the supremely noble, peaceful, safe, sublime, deathless, supremely sweet food of mindfulness of the body: 'Whoever are internally hungry with the hunger of mental defilements, with minds overcome by craving, conscious, intelligent beings, they, having eaten this food, will remove all craving in the existences of sensual pleasure, fine-material, and immaterial realms.' If anyone, not having eaten that food, still attached to craving, having turned back, returns to the lower life, people will censure that very one: 'This one, having gone forth in the Conqueror's Dispensation, not having obtained support there, has returned to the lower life. Will the Conqueror's Dispensation itself awaken this one who does not practise? What is the fault of the Conqueror's Dispensation?'

If, great king, the Truth-finder were to give the going forth to a householder trained in just one fruition, then this going forth would not be for the abandoning of mental defilements or for purification; there would be nothing to be done by the going forth. Just as, great king, a man, having had a lake dug with many hundreds of labours, might proclaim to an assembly thus: 'Let none of you who are defiled, sirs, enter this lake; let those who have washed away dust and dirt, who are pure, spotlessly clean, enter this lake.' Would there be anything to be done with that lake, great king, for those who have washed away dust and dirt, who are pure, spotlessly clean?" "No indeed, venerable sir; for whatever purpose they would approach that lake, that task has already been done elsewhere for them. What use is that lake to them?" "Just so indeed, great king, if the Truth-finder were to give the going forth to a householder trained in just one fruition, that task has already been done right there for them. What use is the going forth to them?

"Or else, great king, suppose a physician, a surgeon, who is devoted to sages by nature, who retains what he has heard of the sacred texts and their meanings, who is not a mere rationalist, who is skilled in the origin of diseases, whose work is unfailing and always successful, having gathered together medicine for the pacification of all diseases, were to proclaim to the assembly thus: 'Do not, sirs, let any who are sick approach me; let those who are free from sickness, who are healthy, approach me.' Would there, great king, be anything to be done by that physician for those who are

free from sickness, who are healthy, who are complete, who are elated?" "No indeed, venerable sir, for the purpose for which they would approach that physician, that surgeon, that has already been done for them elsewhere; what have they to do with that physician?" "Just so indeed, great king, if the Truth-finder were to give the going forth to a householder who has already been disciplined in one fruit, that which was to be done for them has already been done right there; what have they to do with the going forth?"

"Or else, great king, suppose some man, having had food prepared consisting of many hundreds of pots of cooked rice, were to proclaim to the assembly thus: 'Do not, sirs, let any who are hungry approach this food distribution; let those who have eaten well, who are satisfied, who are content, who are nourished, who are pleased, who are complete, approach this food distribution.' Would there, great king, be anything to be done with that food for those who have eaten, who are satisfied, who are content, who are nourished, who are pleased, who are complete?" "No indeed, venerable sir, for the purpose for which they would approach that food distribution, that has already been done for them elsewhere; what have they to do with that food distribution?" "Just so indeed, great king, if the Truth-finder were to give the going forth to a householder who has already been disciplined in one fruit, that which was to be done for them has already been done right there; what have they to do with the going forth?"

"Moreover, great king, those who return to the lower life, they show five incomparable qualities of the Conqueror's Dispensation. Which five? They show the greatness of the plane, they show the state of being pure and spotless, they show the state of not associating with the evil, they show the state of being difficult to penetrate, they show the state of being protected by manifold restraint.

"How do they show the greatness of the plane? Just as, great king, a man who is poor, of low birth, showing no difference, declined in higher intelligence, having obtained a great kingdom, soon falls down, falls away, declines from fame, and is not able to hold the supremacy. What is the reason? Because of the greatness of the supremacy. Just so, great king, whoever, showing no difference, having not made merit, declined in higher intelligence, go forth in the Conqueror's Dispensation, they, being unable to maintain that noble and excellent going forth, having soon fallen down, having fallen away, having declined from the Conqueror's Dispensation, return to the lower life; they are not able to maintain the Conqueror's Dispensation. What is the reason? Because of the greatness of the plane of the Conqueror's Dispensation. Thus they show the greatness of the plane.

"How do they show the state of being pure and spotless? Just as, great king, water scatters, disperses, and is destroyed on a lotus leaf, does not stay in place, and does not adhere. What is the reason? Because of the purity and spotlessness of the lotus. Just so, great king, whoever are fraudulent, deceitful, crooked, bent, and of wrong view go forth in the Conqueror's Dispensation, they, having soon scattered, having dispersed, having been destroyed, not having remained, not having adhered, return to the lower life from the pure, spotless, thornless, white, noble, and excellent Dispensation. What is the reason? Because of the purity and spotlessness of the Conqueror's Dispensation. Thus they show the state of being pure and spotless.

"How do they show the state of not associating with the evil? Just as, great king, the great ocean does not associate with a dead corpse; whatever dead corpse there is in the great ocean, it quickly brings it to the shore or pushes it onto dry land. What is the reason? Because the great ocean is the abode of great beings. Just so, great king, whoever are evil, unrestrained, shameless, non-doers, with sunken energy, lazy, defiled, wicked people go forth in the Conqueror's Dispensation, they, having soon departed from the Conqueror's Dispensation, from the abode of the great beings who are Worthy Ones, spotless, with mental corruptions eliminated, not having associated, return to the lower life. What is the reason? Because of the Conqueror's Dispensation not associating with the evil. Thus they show the state of not associating with the evil.

"How do they show the state of being difficult to penetrate? Just as, great king, whoever archers are unskilled, untrained, without craft, devoid of intelligence, being unable to pierce the tip of a hair, fall away and depart. What is the reason? Because of the smooth, subtle, and difficult-to-penetrate nature of the tip of a hair. Just so, great king, whoever people lacking wisdom, stupid, idiots, confused, and slow in progress go forth in the Conqueror's Dispensation, they, being unable to penetrate that supremely smooth and subtle penetration of the four truths, having fallen away and departed from the Conqueror's Dispensation, return soon to the lower life. What is the reason? Because of the supremely smooth, subtle, and difficult-to-penetrate nature of the truths. Thus they show the state of being difficult to penetrate.

"How do they show the state of being protected by manifold restraint? Just as, great king, some man, having gone to a great battlefield, surrounded on all sides by an enemy army from all directions, having seen people approaching with weapons in hand, frightened, draws back, turns back, and flees. What is the reason? Because of fear of guarding against many kinds of battle fronts. Just so indeed, great king, whatever evil ones, unrestrained, shameless, non-doers, impatient, fickle, wavering, insignificant, foolish people go forth in the Conqueror's Dispensation, they, being unable to protect the manifold training rules, having drawn back, having turned back, having fled, return soon to the lower life. What is the reason? Because of the state of being protected by manifold restraint of the Conqueror's Dispensation. Thus they show the state of being protected by manifold restraint.

"Also, great king, on a jasmine bush, the best of land-born plants, there are worm-eaten flowers; those buds, shrivelled, fall off right in between, and when those have fallen off, the jasmine bush is not called despised. Whatever flowers remain there, they properly pervade all directions with their fragrance. Just so indeed, great king, those who, having gone forth in the Conqueror's Dispensation, return to the lower life, they, like worm-eaten jasmine flowers in the Conqueror's Dispensation, devoid of beauty and fragrance, of colourless appearance and morality, are incapable of expansion; and by their returning to the lower life, the Conqueror's Dispensation is not called despised. Whatever monks remain there, they pervade the world with its gods with the fragrance of excellent morality.

"Also, great king, among healthy red rice, a rice variety called karumbhaka, having arisen, perishes right in between, and because of its perishing, the red rice is not called despised. Whatever rice remains there, that becomes fit for royal enjoyment. Just so indeed, great king, those who, having gone forth in the Conqueror's Dispensation, return to the lower life, they, like karumbhaka among red rice, not

having grown in the Conqueror's Dispensation, not having attained full expansion, return to the lower life right in between; and by their returning to the lower life, the Conqueror's Dispensation is not called despised. Whatever monks remain there, they are suitable for arahantship.

"Also, great king, in a wish-fulfilling jewel gem, a rough portion arises, and because of that rough portion having arisen there, the jewel gem is not called despised. Whatever is pure of the jewel gem there, that brings delight to people. Just so indeed, great king, those who, having gone forth in the Conqueror's Dispensation, return to the lower life, they are rough outer bark in the Conqueror's Dispensation; and by their returning to the lower life, the Conqueror's Dispensation is not called despised. Whatever monks remain there, they are producers of delight for gods and humans.

"Also, great king, of red sandalwood of excellent birth, a portion becomes rotten and of little fragrance. By that, the red sandalwood is not called despised. Whatever is not rotten there, fragrant, that spreads and pervades all around. Just so indeed, great king, those who, having gone forth in the Conqueror's Dispensation, return to the lower life, they, like a rotten portion in the core of red sandalwood, are to be discarded in the Conqueror's Dispensation; and by their returning to the lower life, the Conqueror's Dispensation is not called despised. Whatever monks remain there, they anoint the world with its gods with the fragrance of excellent morality and sandalwood."

"Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, by this and that suitable, by this and that similar reason, the Conqueror's Dispensation has been brought to a faultless state and illuminated as supreme; even those returning to the lower life illuminate the supreme state of the Conqueror's Dispensation."

The question on returning to the low life is the fifth.

6. The Question on the Worthy One Experiencing Feeling

6. "Venerable Nāgasena, you say 'a Worthy One feels one feeling, bodily, not mental.' Is it then, venerable Nāgasena, that the Worthy One's mind, which proceeds in dependence on the body, there the Worthy One is without power, without mastery, not wielding control?" "Yes, great king." "That is not proper, venerable Nāgasena, that he is without power, without mastery, not wielding control over the body in which his own mind proceeds; even a bird, venerable sir, in whatever nest it dwells, there it is the lord, the master, wielding power."

"There are, great king, these ten states accompanying the body that pursue the body and revolve around the body from existence to existence. What are the ten? Cold, heat, hunger, thirst, defecation, urination, torpor, ageing, illness, death. These, great king, are the ten states accompanying the body that pursue the body and revolve around the body from existence to existence; there the Worthy One is without power, without mastery, not wielding control."

"Venerable Nāgasena, for what reason does command or supremacy not proceed over the body of a Worthy One? Tell me the reason for this." "Just as, great king, whatever beings are dependent on the earth, all of them, in dependence on the earth, walk, dwell, and make a livelihood; do they, great king, have command or

supremacy over the earth?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, the mind of a Worthy One proceeds in dependence on the body, but command or supremacy does not proceed over the body of a Worthy One."

"Venerable Nāgasena, for what reason does a worldling feel both bodily and mental feeling?" "Because of undevelopment of mind, great king, a worldling feels both bodily and mental feeling. Just as, great king, a hungry, frightened bull might be tied to weak, feeble, small grass or a creeper; when that bull becomes agitated, then it departs together with the binding. Just so indeed, great king, for one with undeveloped mind, when feeling arises, it agitates the mind; the agitated mind bends the body, unbends it, makes it roll about. Then that one with undeveloped mind trembles, cries out, utters a fearful cry. This, great king, is the reason here, by which reason a worldling feels both bodily and mental feeling."

"But what is that reason, by which reason a Worthy One feels one feeling, bodily, not mental?" "The mind of a Worthy One, great king, is developed, well-developed, tamed, well-tamed, obedient, doing what is told. He, being touched by unpleasant feeling, firmly grasps 'impermanent,' he ties the mind to the pillar of concentration. That mind of his, tied to the pillar of concentration, does not tremble, does not waver, remains steady, undistracted. By the change and diffusion of feeling, his body bends, unbends, rolls about. This, great king, is the reason here, by which reason a Worthy One feels one feeling, bodily, not mental."

"Venerable Nāgasena, this indeed is a marvel in the world, that when the body is moving, the mind does not move. Tell me the reason for this." "Just as, great king, in a great, large tree endowed with trunk, branches and leaves, struck by the force of the wind, the branches move; does the trunk also move?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, a Worthy One, being touched by unpleasant feeling, firmly grasps 'impermanent,' he ties the mind to the pillar of concentration. That mind of his, tied to the pillar of concentration, does not tremble, does not waver, remains steady, undistracted. By the change and diffusion of feeling, his body bends, unbends, rolls about. But his mind does not tremble, does not waver, like the trunk of a great tree." "Wonderful, venerable Nāgasena, marvellous, venerable Nāgasena, such a lamp of the Teaching for all time has not been seen by me before."

The question on the Worthy One experiencing feeling is the sixth.

7. The Question on Making Obstacles to Full realisation

7. "Venerable Nāgasena, here if any householder were to have committed an offence involving expulsion, and he at a later time were to go forth, and he himself would not know 'I have committed a householder's offence involving expulsion,' nor would anyone else tell him 'You have committed a householder's offence involving expulsion.' And if he were to proceed towards the truth, would there be full realisation of the teaching for him?" "No indeed, great king." "For what reason, venerable sir?" "That which is the cause for his full realisation of the teaching, that has been cut off for him; therefore there is no full realisation of the teaching."

"Venerable Nāgasena, you say 'For one who knows there is remorse, when there is remorse there is obstruction, when the mind is obstructed there is no full realisation of the teaching.' But for this one who does not know, in whom remorse has not arisen,

who dwells with a peaceful mind, for what reason is there no full realisation of the teaching? This question goes unevenly with unevenness; having considered, answer it."

"Does a seed, great king, grow in well-tilled, good soil, in a cleared field, in autumn, when well placed?" "Yes, venerable sir." "Would that same seed, great king, grow on the surface of a compact rock?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "But why, great king, does that same seed grow in soil, why does it not grow on a compact rock?" "There is not, venerable sir, a cause for that seed's growing on a compact rock; without cause the seed does not grow." "Just so indeed, great king, that cause by which there would be full realisation of the teaching for him, that cause has been cut off for him; without cause there is no full realisation of the teaching."

"Or else, great king, sticks, clods, clubs, and mallets find a place on the earth; do those same sticks, clods, clubs, and mallets, great king, find a place in the sky?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "But what, great king, is the reason here, by what reason do those same sticks, clods, clubs, and mallets find a place on the earth, by what reason do they not remain in the sky?" "There is not, venerable sir, a cause for those sticks, clods, clubs, and mallets to be established in space; without cause they do not remain." "Just so indeed, great king, the cause for full realisation has been cut off for him by that fault; when the cause is uprooted, without cause there is no full realisation."

"Or else, great king, fire burns on dry ground; does that same fire, great king, burn in water?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "But what, great king, is the reason here, by what reason does that same fire burn on dry ground, by what reason does it not burn in water?" "There is not, venerable sir, a cause for fire's burning in water; without cause it does not burn." "Just so indeed, great king, the cause for full realisation has been cut off for him by that fault; when the cause is uprooted, without cause there is no full realisation of the teaching."

"Venerable Nāgasena, consider this matter again; there is no conviction of mind for me in this, that for one not knowing, when there is no remorse, there is obstruction; convince me by a reason." "Does deadly poison, great king, eaten by one not knowing, take away life?" "Yes, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, evil done even by one not knowing is an obstacle to full realisation."

"Does fire, great king, burn one stepping on it not knowing?" "Yes, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, evil done even by one not knowing is an obstacle to full realisation."

"Does a venomous snake, great king, having bitten one who does not know, take away life?" "Yes, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, evil done even by one not knowing is an obstacle to full realisation."

"Is it not, great king, that the king of Kāliṅga, the ascetic Kolañña, surrounded by the seven treasures, having mounted the elephant treasure, going to visit families, even not knowing was not able to go above the seat of enlightenment? This, great king, is the reason here, by which reason evil done even by one not knowing is an obstacle to full realisation." "What was spoken by the Conqueror, Venerable Nāgasena, the reason cannot be protested against; this is indeed its meaning, thus I accept it."

8. The Question on Immorality

8. "Venerable Nāgasena, what is the distinction between an immoral layman and an immoral ascetic, what is the difference? Do both of these have the same destination, is the result the same for both, or is there some difference?"

"There are, great king, these ten virtues by which an immoral ascetic exceeds an immoral layman by distinction, and by ten reasons he further purifies the offering.

"What are the ten virtues by which an immoral ascetic exceeds an immoral layman by distinction? Here, great king, an immoral ascetic is respectful towards the Buddha, is respectful towards the Teaching, is respectful towards the Community, is respectful towards his fellows in the holy life, he strives in recitation and questioning, he is one who hears much; even one with broken morality, great king, an immoral one who has gone to an assembly, sets up deportment, through fear of blame he guards bodily and verbal conduct, and his mind is directed towards striving, he has attained the state of a monk. Even when doing evil, great king, an immoral ascetic practises it concealed. Just as, great king, a married woman, having hidden, practises evil only in secret; just so indeed, great king, even when doing evil, an immoral ascetic practises it concealed. These, great king, are the ten virtues by which an immoral ascetic exceeds an immoral layman by distinction.

"By which ten reasons does he further purify the offering? By wearing the blameless armour he purifies the offering, by wearing the shaven mark of the sages' state he purifies the offering, by having entered the convention of the Community he purifies the offering, by having gone for refuge to the Buddha, the Teaching, and the Community he purifies the offering, by dwelling in the abode of striving he purifies the offering, by seeking one who bears the Conqueror's Dispensation he purifies the offering, by teaching the excellent Teaching he purifies the offering, by having the Teaching as island, destination, and final goal he purifies the offering, by having absolutely upright view that 'the Buddha is foremost' he purifies the offering, by undertaking the Observance he purifies the offering. By these ten reasons, great king, he further purifies the offering.

"For even one who has completely failed, great king, an immoral ascetic purifies the offering of donors. Just as, great king, water, even very thick, removes mud, mire, dust, and dirt; just so indeed, great king, even one who has completely failed, an immoral ascetic purifies the offering of donors.

"Or else, great king, just as hot water, even very little, extinguishes a blazing great mass of fire, just so indeed, great king, even one who has completely failed, an immoral ascetic purifies the offering of donors.

"Or else, great king, just as food, even tasteless, removes hunger and weakness, just so indeed, great king, even one who has completely failed, an immoral ascetic purifies the offering of donors.

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Truth-finder, the god above gods, in the explanation of the Analysis of Offerings, the excellent seal of the Middle Collection:

"Whoever, being moral, gives a gift to the immoral, obtained by the Teaching, with a well-pleased mind;
Believing in the lofty fruit of action, that offering becomes pure on account of the donor."

"Wonderful, Venerable Nāgasena, marvellous, Venerable Nāgasena, we asked just so much a question, and you, making it clear with similes and reasons, made it sweet as the Deathless, fit for hearing. Just as, venerable sir, a cook or a cook's apprentice, having obtained just so much meat, having prepared it with various ingredients, makes it fit for the king's enjoyment; just so indeed, Venerable Nāgasena, we asked just so much a question, and you, having made it clear with similes and reasons, made it sweet as the Deathless, fit for hearing."

The question on immorality is the eighth.

9. The Question on Beings and Souls in Water

9. "Venerable Nāgasena, this water being heated in fire hisses, sizzles, makes a noise in manifold ways. What indeed, venerable Nāgasena, does the water live? Does it make a noise while playing, or does it make a noise being oppressed by something else?" "No indeed, great king, water does not live; there is no soul or being in water. But, great king, due to the greatness of the force of the heat of fire, water hisses, sizzles, makes a noise in manifold ways."

"Venerable Nāgasena, here some sectarians, thinking 'water lives,' having rejected cold water, having heated water, consume it bit by bit. They censure and despise you, saying 'The ascetics, disciples of the Sakyan, are harming a living being with one faculty.' Dispel, remove, clear away that censure and contempt of theirs." "No indeed, great king, water does not live; there is not, great king, a soul or being in water. But, great king, due to the greatness of the force of the heat of fire, water hisses, sizzles, makes a noise in manifold ways."

"Just as, great king, water that has gone into pools, lakes, rivers, reservoirs, tanks, caves, crevices, wells, low-lying areas, and ponds is exhausted and depleted due to the greatness of the force of wind and heat, does the water there hiss, sizzle, make a noise in manifold ways?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "If, great king, water were to live, there too water would make a noise. By this reason too, great king, know that 'there is no soul or being in water; due to the greatness of the force of the heat of fire, water hisses, sizzles, makes a noise in manifold ways.'"

"Furthermore, great king, listen to a further reason that 'there is no soul or being in water; due to the greatness of the force of the heat of fire, water makes a noise.' But when, great king, water mixed with rice grains, having gone into a vessel, is covered and placed on a fireplace, does the water there make a noise?" "No indeed, venerable sir, it is still, very peaceful." "But that same water, great king, having gone into a vessel, when fire is kindled and it is placed on a fireplace, is the water there still, very peaceful?" "No indeed, venerable sir, it moves, is agitated, stirs, becomes turbid, becomes full of waves, goes up and down, in all directions, rises up, falls down, becomes covered with foam." "Why then, great king, does that natural water not move and is very peaceful, but why does that which has gone to fire move, become agitated, stir, become turbid, become full of waves, go up and down, in all

directions, rise up, fall down, become covered with foam?" "Natural water, venerable sir, does not move, but water that has been heated by fire, due to the greatness of the force of the heat of fire, hisses, sizzles, makes a noise in manifold ways." "By this reason too, great king, know that 'there is no soul or being in water; due to the greatness of the force of the heat of fire, water makes a noise.'

"Furthermore, great king, listen to a further reason: there is no soul or being in water; due to the greatness of the force of the heat of fire, water makes a noise. Is there, great king, water in house after house, having gone into water jars, covered?" "Yes, venerable sir." "Does that water, great king, move, become agitated, stir, become turbid, become full of waves, go up and down, in all directions, rise up, fall down, become covered with foam?" "No indeed, venerable sir, that natural water having gone into a water jar is still."

"But have you heard before, great king, that 'in the great ocean water moves, becomes agitated, stirs, becomes turbid, becomes full of waves, goes up and down, in all directions, rises up, falls down, becomes covered with foam, having surged forward and having receded, strikes the shore, makes a noise in manifold ways'?"

"Yes, venerable sir, I have heard this before and have seen it before: 'in the great ocean water rises up into the sky even a hundred cubits, even two hundred cubits.'"

"Why, great king, does water having gone into a water jar not move and not make a noise, but why does water in the great ocean move and make a noise?" "Due to the greatness of the force of the wind, venerable sir, water in the great ocean moves and makes a noise; water having gone into a water jar, not struck by anything, does not move and does not make a noise." "Just as, great king, due to the greatness of the force of the wind, water in the great ocean moves and makes a noise, just so due to the greatness of the force of the heat of fire, water makes a noise."

"Is it not, great king, that they cover a dry drum-head with dry cow-hide?" "Yes, venerable sir." "Is there, great king, a soul or being in the drum?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "But why, great king, does the drum make a noise?" "By the appropriate effort of a woman or a man, venerable sir." "Just as, great king, by the appropriate effort of a woman or a man the drum makes a noise, just so due to the greatness of the force of the heat of fire, water makes a noise. By this reason too, great king, know that 'there is no soul or being in water; due to the greatness of the force of the heat of fire, water makes a noise.'"

"First, great king, I have a question to ask you, thus this question will be well determined. Does water, great king, make a noise when being heated in all vessels, or does it make a noise when being heated only in some vessels?" "No indeed, venerable sir, water does not make a noise when being heated in all vessels; water makes a noise when being heated only in some vessels." "Well then, great king, you have abandoned your own doctrine, you have come back to my domain; there is no soul or being in water. If, great king, water were to make a noise when being heated in all vessels, it would be proper to say 'water is alive.' For water, great king, is not twofold - that which makes a noise is alive, that which does not make a noise is not alive. If, great king, water were alive, when great large bull elephants with massive bodies, in rut, having drawn up water with their trunks, having put it in their mouths, making it enter their bellies, that water too, being squeezed between their teeth,

would make a noise. Even great ships of a hundred cubits, heavy, laden, filled with many hundreds of thousands of loads, travel in the great ocean; the water being squeezed by them too would make a noise. Even very great fish with bodies of many hundreds of yojanas - timi, timiṅgala, timirapiṅgala - submerged inside, dwelling in the great ocean as their place of residence, drink and blow out great streams of water; that water too, being squeezed between their teeth and in their bellies, would make a noise. But because, great king, water oppressed by such and such great oppressions does not make a noise, therefore too there is no soul or being in water; thus, great king, remember this."

"Excellent, venerable Nāgasena, the question that came with a fault has been analysed with a fitting analysis. Just as, venerable Nāgasena, a very costly jewel gem, having reached a clever teacher, a skilled, trained gem-cutter, would obtain fame, praise, and commendation; or a pearl gem reaching a pearl-worker, or a cloth gem reaching a cloth-worker, or red sandalwood reaching a perfumer, would obtain fame, praise, and commendation. Just so indeed, venerable Nāgasena, the question that came with a fault has been analysed with a fitting analysis; thus I accept this as true."

The question on beings and souls in water is the ninth.

The Chapter on the Buddha is first.

In this chapter there are nine questions.

2. The Chapter on the Absence of Obsession

1. The Question on Absence of Obsession

1. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One: 'Monks, dwell delighting in the absence of obsession, taking pleasure in the absence of obsession.' What is that absence of obsession?" "The fruition of stream-entry, great king, is absence of obsession; the fruition of once-returning is absence of obsession; the fruition of non-returning is absence of obsession; the fruition of arahantship is absence of obsession."

"If, venerable Nāgasena, the fruition of stream-entry is absence of obsession, the fruition of once-returning, non-returning, and arahantship is absence of obsession, then why do these monks recite and interrogate discourse, mixed prose and verse, explanation, verse, inspired utterance, thus-it-is-said, birth story, wonderful phenomena, catechism, are occupied with new construction work and with giving and with veneration - are they not doing action rejected by the Conqueror?"

"Those monks, great king, who recite and interrogate discourse, mixed prose and verse, explanation, verse, inspired utterance, thus-it-is-said, birth story, wonderful phenomena, catechism, are occupied with new construction work and with giving and with veneration - all of them do so for the attainment of absence of obsession. Those, great king, who are pure by intrinsic nature, who have formerly cultivated mastery, they become without obsession in a single moment of consciousness. But those monks who have great defilement, they become without obsession by these practices."

"Just as, great king, one man, having planted seed in a field, according to his own strength and energy, without a fence and wall, might harvest the grain; another man, having planted seed in a field, having entered the forest, having cut sticks and branches, having made a fence and wall, might harvest the grain. Whatever search for a fence and wall there is for him there, that is for the sake of grain. Just so indeed, great king, those who are pure by intrinsic nature, who have formerly cultivated mastery, they become without obsession in a single moment of consciousness, like a man harvesting grain without a fence and wall. But those monks who have great defilement, they become without obsession by these practices, like a man harvesting grain having made a fence and wall.

"Or else, great king, suppose there were a cluster of fruit at the top of a very great mango tree, then whoever possessing supernormal power, having come there, might take its fruit; but whoever there without supernormal power, he, having cut sticks and creepers, having tied a ladder, having climbed that tree by it, might take the fruit. Whatever search for a ladder there is for him there, that is for the sake of fruit. Just so indeed, great king, those who are pure by intrinsic nature, who have formerly cultivated mastery, they become without obsession in a single moment of consciousness, like one possessing supernormal power taking tree fruit. But those monks who have great defilement, they fully realise the truths by this practice, like a man taking tree fruit by a ladder.

"Or else, great king, one man having a legal case, going alone to the master, accomplishes his purpose. One wealthy man, by the power of wealth, having increased his following, accomplishes his purpose by the following. Whatever search for a following there is for him there, that is for the sake of purpose. Just so indeed, great king, those who are pure by intrinsic nature, who have formerly cultivated mastery, they attain mastery in the six direct knowledges in a single moment of consciousness, like a man alone accomplishing success of purpose. But those monks who have great defilement, they accomplish the goal of asceticism by these practices, like a man accomplishing success of purpose by a following.

"Recitation too, great king, is of great service; interrogation too is of great service; new construction work too is of great service; giving too is of great service; veneration too is of great service in those various duties. Just as, great king, a man serving the king, having done favours with ministers, soldiers, troops, doorkeepers, bodyguards, and members of the assembly - when his duty arrives, all of them are helpful. Just so indeed, great king, recitation too is of great service; interrogation too is of great service; new construction work too is of great service; giving too is of great service; veneration too is of great service in those various duties. If, great king, all were pure by birth, there would be nothing to be done by instruction. But because, great king, there is something to be done by hearing, the Elder Sāriputta, great king, having accumulated wholesome roots from an immeasurable incalculable aeon onwards, having gone to the summit of wisdom, even he, without hearing, was not able to attain the elimination of mental corruptions. Therefore, great king, hearing is of great service, likewise recitation and interrogation too. Therefore recitation and interrogation too are reckoned as absence of obsession." "The question has been well elucidated, venerable Nāgasena; thus I accept this as true."

The question on absence of obsession is the first.

2. The Question on the State of One Who Eliminated the Mental Corruptions

2. "Venerable Nāgasena, you say 'whoever is a layman who has attained arahantship, there are only two destinations for him, no other: on that very day he either goes forth or attains final nibbāna. That day cannot be passed beyond.' If, venerable Nāgasena, on that day he should not obtain a teacher or a preceptor or bowl and robes, would that Worthy One go forth by himself or would he pass beyond the day, or would some other Worthy One possessing supernormal power, having come, give him the going forth or would he attain final nibbāna?" "That Worthy One, great king, would not go forth by himself; going forth by himself, he commits theft; nor would he pass beyond the day; whether or not another Worthy One's coming might occur, on that very day he would attain final nibbāna." "Well then, venerable Nāgasena, the peaceful state of arahantship is abandoned, by which there is the taking away of life for one who has attained it."

"Abnormal, great king, is the layman's outward sign; in the abnormal outward sign, due to the weakness of the outward sign, a layman who has attained arahantship on that very day either goes forth or attains final nibbāna. This, great king, is not the fault of arahantship; this is indeed the fault of the layman's outward sign, that is to say, the weakness of the outward sign.

"Just as, great king, food, which protects the life span and guards the life of all beings, for one with an abnormal stomach, with slow and weak digestion, through non-digestion takes away life. This, great king, is not the fault of the food; this is indeed the fault of the stomach, that is to say, the weakness of the digestive fire. Just so indeed, great king, in the abnormal outward sign, due to the weakness of the outward sign, a layman who has attained arahantship on that very day either goes forth or attains final nibbāna. This, great king, is not the fault of arahantship; this is indeed the fault of the layman's outward sign, that is to say, the weakness of the outward sign.

"Or else, great king, just as a small blade of grass, when a heavy stone is placed upon it, due to weakness, having broken, falls. Just so indeed, great king, a layman who has attained arahantship, being unable to maintain arahantship with that outward sign, on that very day either goes forth or attains final nibbāna.

"Or else, great king, just as a man who is powerless, weak, of low birth, of little merit, having obtained a very great kingdom, in a moment falls down, falls away, draws back, and is not able to maintain the sovereignty; just so indeed, great king, a layman who has attained arahantship is not able to maintain arahantship with that outward sign; for that reason, on that very day he either goes forth or attains final nibbāna." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on the state of one who eliminated the mental corruptions is the second.

3. The Question on the Lapse of Mindfulness of One Who Eliminated the Mental Corruptions

3. "Venerable Nāgasena, is there a lapse of mindfulness for a Worthy One?" "Worthy Ones, great king, are free from a lapse of mindfulness; there is no lapse of mindfulness for Worthy Ones." "But, venerable sir, would a Worthy One commit an

offence?" "Yes, great king." "In what case?" "In building a hut, great king, in matchmaking, at the improper time with the perception of proper time, when invited to admonish with the perception of not being invited to admonish, when it is not leftover with the perception of leftover."

"Venerable Nāgasena, you say 'those who commit an offence, they commit it for two reasons: either through disrespect or through not knowing.' But indeed, venerable sir, is there disrespect for a Worthy One, that a Worthy One commits an offence?" "No indeed, great king."

"If, Venerable Nāgasena, a Worthy One commits an offence, and there is no disrespect for a Worthy One, then there is a lapse of mindfulness for a Worthy One?" "There is not, great king, a lapse of mindfulness for a Worthy One, yet a Worthy One commits an offence."

"Well then, venerable sir, convince me by a reason; what is the reason there?" "There are these two, great king, mental defilements: worldly fault and fault by regulation. What, great king, is worldly fault? The ten unwholesome courses of action - this is called worldly fault. What is fault by regulation? That which in the world is unsuitable and not becoming for ascetics, but blameless for householders. Therein the Blessed One lays down a training rule for disciples: 'not to be transgressed for life.' Eating at the improper time, great king, is blameless for the world, but that is a fault in the Conqueror's Dispensation. Damaging growing plants, great king, is blameless for the world, but that is a fault in the Conqueror's Dispensation. Joking in water, great king, is blameless for the world, but that is a fault in the Conqueror's Dispensation. Thus such and such things, great king, are faults in the Conqueror's Dispensation - this is called fault by regulation.

"One who has eliminated the mental corruptions is incapable of transgressing a worldly fault; that which is a mental defilement, a fault by regulation, that he might commit through not knowing. It is not within the domain, great king, of a certain Worthy One to know everything; for he does not have the power to know everything. Unknown, great king, to a Worthy One are the names and clans of women and men; the path too on the earth is unknown to him; only liberation, great king, would a certain Worthy One know; a Worthy One possessing the six higher knowledges would know his own domain; "Great king, only the omniscient Truth-finder knows everything." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on the lapse of mindfulness of one who eliminated the mental corruptions is the third.

4. The Question on Absence in the World

4. "Venerable Nāgasena, in the world Buddhas are seen, Individually Enlightened Ones are seen, disciples of the Truth-finder are seen, universal monarchs are seen, sub-kings are seen, gods and humans are seen, the wealthy are seen, the poor are seen, the fortunate are seen, the ill-fated are seen, the female organ become manifest in a man is seen, the male organ become manifest in a woman is seen, well-done and wrongly-done action is seen, beings who experience the results of good and evil actions are seen, there are in the world beings born in eggs, born in wombs, born in moisture, spontaneously born, there are beings footless, two-footed, four-footed, many-footed, there are in the world demons, goblins, kumbhaṇḍas, titans, dānavas,

gandhabbas, ghosts, sprites, there are kinnaras, great serpents, nāgas, supaññas, accomplished ones, sorcerers, there are elephants, horses, cattle, buffaloes, camels, donkeys, goats, wild goats, deer, pigs, lions, tigers, panthers, bears, wolves, hyenas, dogs, jackals, there are birds of many kinds, there is gold, silver, pearls, gems, conch shells, stones, coral, rubies, cat's eye gems, lapis lazuli, diamonds, crystal, black metal, copper, lead, bronze, there is linen, silk, cotton, hempen, hemp, woollen blanket, there is rice, paddy, barley, millet, kudrūsa, varaka, wheat, mung beans, black beans, sesame, horse gram, there is the odour of roots, the odour of heartwood, the odour of softwood, the odour of bark, the odour of leaves, the odour of flowers, the odour of fruits, the odour of all things, there are grass, creepers, shrubs, trees, medicinal plants, large trees, rivers, mountains, oceans, fish and turtles - everything exists in the world. What, venerable sir, does not exist in the world, tell me that."

"There are, great king, these three things that do not exist in the world. What three? Whether conscious or unconscious, there is nothing free from ageing and death in the world, there is no permanence of activities, there is no finding of a being in the ultimate reality - these, great king, are the three things that do not exist in the world." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on absence in the world is the fourth.

5. The Question on What is Not Born of Action and so on

5. "Venerable Nāgasena, in the world things produced by kamma are seen, things produced by cause are seen, things produced by season are seen; tell me what in the world is not born of kamma, not born of cause, not born of season." "There are, great king, two things in the world not born of kamma, not born of cause, not born of season. Which two? Space, great king, is not born of kamma, not born of cause, not born of season; Nibbāna, great king, is not born of kamma, not born of cause, not born of season. These, great king, are the two not born of kamma, not born of cause, not born of season."

"Do not, Venerable Nāgasena, treat the Conqueror's word with contempt, do not answer the question without knowing." "What indeed, great king, do I say, that you speak to me thus: 'Do not, Venerable Nāgasena, treat the Conqueror's word with contempt, do not answer the question without knowing'?" "Venerable Nāgasena, it is proper to say this much: 'Space is not born of kamma, not born of cause, not born of season.' But, Venerable Nāgasena, by many hundreds of reasons the path for the realisation of Nibbāna has been declared by the Blessed One for disciples, and yet you say thus: 'Nibbāna is not born of cause.'" "True, great king, by many hundreds of reasons the path for the realisation of Nibbāna has been declared by the Blessed One for disciples, but no cause for the arising of Nibbāna has been declared."

"Here, Venerable Nāgasena, we are entering from darkness into greater darkness, from forest into denser forest, from thicket into denser thicket, inasmuch as there is a cause for the realisation of Nibbāna, but there is no cause for the arising of that state. If, Venerable Nāgasena, there is a cause for the realisation of Nibbāna, then a cause for the arising of Nibbāna should also be expected."

"Just as, Venerable Nāgasena, a son has a father, by that reason a father of the father should also be expected. Just as a pupil has a teacher, by that reason a teacher of the teacher should also be expected. Just as a sprout has a seed, by that reason a seed of the seed should also be expected. Just so indeed, Venerable Nāgasena, if there is a cause for the realisation of Nibbāna, by that reason a cause for the arising of Nibbāna should also be expected.

"Just as when there is a top of a tree or a creeper, by that reason there is also a middle and also a root. Just so indeed, Venerable Nāgasena, if there is a cause for the realisation of Nibbāna, by that reason a cause for the arising of Nibbāna should also be expected."

"Nibbāna, great king, is not to be produced, therefore no cause for the arising of Nibbāna has been declared." "Come now, Venerable Nāgasena, having shown a reason, convince me by a reason, so that I may know: there is a cause for the realisation of Nibbāna, there is no cause for the arising of Nibbāna."

"Well then, great king, apply your ear attentively, listen well, I will tell the reason there. Could, great king, a man by his natural power go from here to the Himalaya, the king of mountains?" "Yes, venerable sir." "But could that man, great king, by his natural power bring the Himalaya, the king of mountains, here?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, it is possible to declare the path for the realisation of Nibbāna, it is not possible to show a cause for the arising of Nibbāna.

"Could, great king, a man by his natural power, having crossed the great ocean by boat, go to the farther shore?" "Yes, venerable sir." "But could that man, great king, by his natural power bring the farther shore of the great ocean here?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, it is possible to declare the path for the realisation of Nibbāna, it is not possible to show a cause for the arising of Nibbāna. Why? Because of the unconditioned nature of that state."

"Is Nibbāna unconditioned, Venerable Nāgasena?" "Yes, great king, Nibbāna is unconditioned, not made by anyone. Nibbāna, great king, is not to be said to be arisen or unarisen or to be produced or past or future or present or cognisable by eye or cognisable by ear or cognisable by nose or cognisable by tongue or cognisable by body." "If, Venerable Nāgasena, Nibbāna is not arisen, not unarisen, not to be produced, not past, not future, not present, not cognisable by eye, not cognisable by ear, not cognisable by nose, not cognisable by tongue, not cognisable by body, then, Venerable Nāgasena, you point to Nibbāna as a non-existent phenomenon: 'There is no Nibbāna.' "There is, great king, Nibbāna; Nibbāna is cognisable by mind. A noble disciple rightly practising, with a pure mind, sublime, straight, unobstructed, spiritual, sees Nibbāna."

"But what kind is that Nibbāna, venerable sir? Convince me by reasons that can be illuminated by similes, just as an existing phenomenon can be illuminated by similes." "Is there, great king, what is called wind?" "Yes, venerable sir." "Come now, great king, show the wind by colour or by shape, whether subtle or gross or long or short." "It is not possible, Venerable Nāgasena, to show the wind; the wind does not lend itself to being held in the hand or to being crushed; but yet there is wind." "If, great king, it is not possible to show the wind, then there is no wind?" "I know, Venerable Nāgasena, that wind exists; it has entered my heart, but I am not able to show the

wind." "Just so indeed, great king, there is Nibbāna, but it is not possible to show Nibbāna by colour or by shape." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, the simile has been well shown, the reason well explained; thus I accept this as true: 'There is Nibbāna.'"

The question on what is not born of action and so on is the fifth.

6. The Question on What is Born of Action and so on

6. "Venerable Nāgasena, which of these are born of kamma, which are born of cause, which are born of season, which are not born of kamma, not born of cause, not born of season?" "Whatever beings, great king, are conscious, all of them are born of kamma; fire and all species of seed are born of cause; earth and mountains and water and wind, all of them are born of season; space and Nibbāna, these two are not born of kamma, not born of cause, not born of season. But Nibbāna, great king, is not to be said to be born of kamma or born of cause or born of season or arisen or unarisen or to be produced or past or future or present or cognisable by eye or cognisable by ear or cognisable by nose or cognisable by tongue or cognisable by body; but moreover, great king, Nibbāna is cognisable by mind, which the noble disciple rightly practising sees with purified knowledge." "Delightful, Venerable Nāgasena, the question has been well determined, free from doubt, gone to the ultimate, doubt has been cut off; you have approached the most excellent of the excellent leaders of groups."

The question on what is born of action and so on is the sixth.

7. The Question on the Demon

7. "Venerable Nāgasena, are there in the world beings called demons?" "Yes, great king, there are in the world beings called demons." "But do those demons, venerable sir, pass away from that realm?" "Yes, great king, those demons pass away from that realm." "But why, Venerable Nāgasena, is the body of those dead demons not seen, and the smell of a corpse does not blow?" "It is seen, great king, the body of dead demons, and the smell of a corpse blows from them. The body of dead demons, great king, is seen in the form of an insect, or is seen in the form of a worm, or is seen in the form of an ant, or is seen in the form of a grasshopper, or is seen in the form of a snake, or is seen in the form of a scorpion, or is seen in the form of a centipede, or is seen in the form of a bird, or is seen in the form of a beast." "Who indeed, Venerable Nāgasena, another being asked this question could answer it except by one wise like you?"

The question on the demon is the seventh.

8. The Question on the Complete Training Rules

8. "Venerable Nāgasena, those who were the ancient teachers of physicians, as follows: Nārada, Dhammantarī, Aṅgīrasa, Kapila, Kaṇḍarāggi, Sāma, Atula, Pubbakaccāyana - all these teachers, having known once only the arising of diseases, the source, the intrinsic nature, the origination, the medical treatment, the function, and the success and failure, all that without remainder, thinking 'this many diseases will arise in this body,' all at once making a comprehensive grasp, composed a treatise. All these were not omniscient. Why then did the Truth-finder, being omniscient, having known future action by the Buddha's knowledge, having

determined 'in such and such a case such and such a training rule will have to be laid down,' not lay down the training rule completely, but laid down the training rule for disciples on each occasion as it arose, when there was disgrace, when the fault was obvious, when it was widespread, when it had gone far and wide, when people were grumbling, at each and every time?"

"This was known, great king, to the Truth-finder: 'At this time, for these human beings, more than one hundred and fifty training rules will have to be laid down.' But this occurred to the Truth-finder: 'If I were to lay down more than one hundred and fifty training rules all at once, the great multitude would fall into fear, thinking "Much is to be guarded here; difficult indeed, friend, is it to go forth in the Dispensation of the ascetic Gotama." Even those wishing to go forth would not go forth, and they would not believe my word; those human beings not believing would become ones going to realms of misery.' Thus, 'On each occasion as it arises, having informed them through the proclamation of the Teaching, when the fault is obvious, I shall lay down the training rule.'" "Wonderful, Venerable Nāgasena, of the Buddhas! Marvellous, Venerable Nāgasena, of the Buddhas! How great is the Truth-finder's omniscient knowledge! Thus it is, Venerable Nāgasena, this meaning was well shown by the Truth-finder. Having heard 'much is to be trained in here,' fear would arise in beings; not even one would go forth in the Conqueror's Dispensation. Thus I accept this as true."

The question on the complete training rules is the eighth.

9. The Question on the Sun's Heat

9. "Venerable Nāgasena, does this sun shine intensely at all times, or does it shine weakly at some times?" "At all times, great king, the sun shines intensely; it does not shine weakly at any time." "If, venerable Nāgasena, the sun shines intensely at all times, why then does the sun sometimes shine intensely and sometimes shine weakly?" "There are, great king, these four diseases of the sun, oppressed by one or other of which diseases the sun shines weakly. Which four? Cloud, great king, is a disease of the sun; oppressed by that disease the sun shines weakly. Frost, great king, is a disease of the sun; oppressed by that disease the sun shines weakly. Rain-cloud, great king, is a disease of the sun; oppressed by that disease the sun shines weakly. Rāhu, great king, is a disease of the sun; oppressed by that disease the sun shines weakly. These, great king, are the four diseases of the sun, oppressed by one or other of which diseases the sun shines weakly." "Wonderful, venerable Nāgasena, marvellous, venerable Nāgasena, that even for the sun, so endowed with radiance, disease will arise; how much more then for other beings. There is not, venerable sir, this classification by another except by one wise like you."

The question on the sun's heat is the ninth.

10. The Question on the Kathina Heat

10. "Venerable Nāgasena, why does the sun shine intensely in winter, but not so in summer?" "In summer, great king, the muddy dirt is undisturbed, dust particles stirred by the wind rise up into the sky, clouds in the sky are very thick, and a great wind blows excessively; all these various elements combined together obstruct the sun's rays; therefore in summer the sun shines weakly."

"In winter, however, great king, the earth below is cooled, a great rain cloud is present above, the muddy dirt is calmed, dust moves very gently in the sky, the sky is free from clouds, and the wind blows very gently; with the cessation of these, the sun's rays become pure, and the heat of the sun freed from obstruction shines as if exceedingly. This, great king, is the reason here, by which reason the sun shines intensely in winter, but not so in summer." "Freed from all calamities, venerable sir, the sun shines intensely; accompanied by clouds and so on, it does not shine intensely."

The question on the kathina heat is the tenth.

The Chapter on Absence of Obsession is the second.

In this chapter there are ten questions.

3. The Chapter about Vessantara

1. The Question on Vessantara

1. "Venerable Nāgasena, do all Bodhisattas give away their children and wife, or was children and wife given only by King Vessantara?" "All Bodhisattas, great king, give away their children and wife, not only by King Vessantara was children and wife given." "And yet, venerable Nāgasena, do they give with their consent?" "The wife, great king, consented, but the children lamented due to their childishness; if they had known the meaning, they too would have rejoiced, they would not have lamented."

"A difficult thing, venerable Nāgasena, was done by the Bodhisatta, in that he gave his own legitimate dear sons to the brahmin for the purpose of slavery.

"This second thing too is more difficult than the difficult, in that he, having bound his own legitimate dear sons, young children, tender ones, with a creeper, looked on with equanimity seeing them being stroked with the creeper by that brahmin.

"This third thing too is more difficult than the difficult, in that he, when the children having freed themselves from the bonds by their own strength came back filled with fear, again bound them with a creeper and gave them away.

"This fourth thing too is more difficult than the difficult, in that he did not console the children lamenting 'This demon, dear father, is taking us away to eat' with 'Do not be afraid.'

"This fifth thing too is more difficult than the difficult, in that he did not accept thus the entreaty of the prince Jālī who, weeping, having fallen at his feet, was begging 'Enough, dear father, turn back Kaṇhājinā, I myself will go with the demon, let the demon eat me.'

"This sixth thing too is more difficult than the difficult, in that he did not show compassion to the prince Jālī who was lamenting 'Surely your heart, dear father, is like a stone, in that you, looking at us suffering, being led away by a demon in the great forest devoid of humans, did not prevent him.'

"This seventh thing too is more difficult than the difficult, in that when the children were led away by that terrifying, dreadful one and had gone out of sight, his heart did not split into a hundred or a thousand pieces. What has a human being desiring merit to do with causing suffering to others? Should not one's own gift be given?"

"Because of doing the difficult, great king, the fame of the Bodhisatta has risen up in the ten-thousand-fold world system among gods and humans; the gods proclaim it in the heavenly abode, the titans proclaim it in the titan abode, the garuḷas proclaim it in the garuḷa abode, the serpents proclaim it in the serpent abode, the demons proclaim it in the demon abode; gradually that fame has reached in succession from then until now here to our time. Are we, sitting here praising and examining that gift, discussing whether it was well-given or badly given? And this fame, great king, shows ten qualities of the subtle, wise, learned, intelligent Bodhisattas. What are the ten? Freedom from greed, freedom from attachment, generosity, abandoning, non-returning, subtlety, greatness, difficulty of understanding, rarity, and incomparability of the Buddha's Teaching - this fame, great king, shows these ten qualities of the subtle, wise, learned, intelligent Bodhisattas."

"Venerable Nāgasena, one who gives a gift having caused suffering to another, does that gift have pleasant results and lead to heaven?" "Yes, great king, what is there to say?" "Come now, venerable Nāgasena, show me a reason." "Here, great king, suppose some ascetic or brahmin is moral, of good character, and he might be paralysed or a cripple or afflicted with some disease; whoever desiring merit, having placed him on a vehicle, might convey him to the place he wished for - would any happiness arise for that man on that account, would that action lead to heaven?" "Yes, venerable sir, what is there to say? That man, venerable sir, might obtain an elephant vehicle or a horse vehicle or a chariot vehicle, on land a land vehicle, in water a water vehicle, among gods a divine vehicle, among humans a human vehicle; he would be reborn in existence after existence with what is suitable and appropriate; suitable and appropriate happinesses would arise for him; from a fortunate world he would go to a fortunate world; by that very outflow of action, having ascended the vehicle of supernormal power, he would reach the wished-for city of Nibbāna." "Well then, great king, a gift given by causing suffering to another has pleasant results and leads to heaven, in that that man, having caused suffering to oxen, experiences such happiness."

"Furthermore, great king, listen to a reason how a gift given through causing suffering to others results in happiness and leads to heaven. Here, great king, suppose any king, having collected righteous taxes from the country, were to give a gift by the exercise of authority, would that king, great king, on that account experience any happiness, that gift leading to heaven?" "Yes, venerable sir, what need is there to say? On that account, venerable sir, that king would obtain many hundreds of thousands of times more. He would become a king above kings, a god above gods, a Brahmā above Brahmās, an ascetic above ascetics, a brahmin above brahmins, a Worthy One above Worthy Ones." "Well then, great king, a gift given through causing suffering to others results in happiness and leads to heaven, since that king, having oppressed the people with taxes, by the gift given, experiences such further happiness and fame."

"Excessive giving, venerable Nāgasena, was given by King Vessantara, in that he

gave his own wife to another for the purpose of being his wife, he gave his own legitimate sons to a brahmin for the purpose of being slaves. Excessive giving, venerable Nāgasena, is blamed and censured by the wise in the world. Just as, venerable Nāgasena, by an excessive load the axle of a cart breaks, by an excessive load a boat sinks, by excessive eating food is digested abnormally, by excessive rain grain perishes, by excessive giving one comes to the destruction of wealth, by excessive heat the earth is scorched, by excessive lust one becomes mad, by excessive hate one becomes fit to be killed, by excessive delusion one falls into calamity, by excessive greed one undergoes seizure as a thief, by excessive fear one is obstructed, by excessive fullness a river overflows, by excessive wind a thunderbolt falls, by excessive fire cooked rice boils over, by excessive wandering one does not live long. Just so indeed, venerable Nāgasena, excessive giving is blamed and censured by the wise in the world; excessive giving, venerable Nāgasena, was given by King Vessantara; no fruit should be expected from that."

"Excessive giving, great king, is praised, extolled, and commended by the wise in the world; whoever gives whatever kind of gift, the giver of excessive gifts attains fame in the world. Just as, great king, a divine forest root, due to its extreme excellence, even when grasped does not show itself to other people standing within arm's reach; a medicine, due to its extreme potency, is an uprooter of affliction, a destroyer of diseases; fire, due to its extreme brightness, burns; water, due to its extreme coolness, extinguishes; a lotus, due to its purity, is not tainted by water and mud; a gem, due to its extreme quality, grants desires; a diamond, due to its extreme sharpness, pierces gems, pearls, and crystal; the earth, due to its extreme greatness, supports humans, serpents, beasts, birds, water, rocks, mountains, and trees; the ocean, due to its extreme greatness, is unfillable; Sineru, due to its extreme weight, is immovable; space, due to its extreme vastness, is endless; the sun, due to its extreme radiance, destroys darkness; a lion, due to its extreme birth, is without fear; a wrestler, due to his extreme strength, quickly throws down his opponent; a king, due to his extreme merit, is a ruler; a monk, due to his extreme morality, is worthy of homage by serpents, demons, humans, and gods; the Buddha, due to his extreme supremacy, is incomparable. Just so indeed, great king, excessive giving is praised, extolled, and commended by the wise in the world; whoever gives whatever kind of gift, the giver of excessive gifts attains fame in the world; through excessive giving, King Vessantara was praised, extolled, commended, honoured, and celebrated in the ten-thousand-fold world system; by that very excessive giving, King Vessantara has now today become the Buddha, the foremost in the world with its gods.

"But is there, great king, in the world a gift that should be withheld, which should not be given when one worthy of offerings has not arrived?" "There are indeed, venerable Nāgasena, these ten gifts which are considered not-gifts in the world; whoever gives those gifts, he goes to a realm of misery. What are the ten? The gift of intoxicants, venerable Nāgasena, is considered a not-gift in the world; whoever gives that gift, he goes to a realm of misery. The gift of entertainment, etc. The gift of women, etc. The gift of a bull, etc. The gift of paintings, etc. The gift of weapons, etc. The gift of poison, etc. The gift of fetters, etc. The gift of fowl and pigs, etc. The gift of false scales and false measures, venerable Nāgasena, is considered a not-gift in the world; whoever gives that gift, he goes to a realm of misery. These, venerable Nāgasena, are the ten gifts considered not-gifts in the world; whoever gives those gifts, he goes

to a realm of misery."

"I am not asking you, great king, about what is considered a not-gift; this is what I ask you, great king: 'Is there, great king, in the world a gift that should be withheld, which should not be given when one worthy of offerings has not arrived?'" "There is not, venerable Nāgasena, in the world a gift that should be withheld. Which should not be given when one worthy of offerings has not arrived - when confidence of mind has arisen, some give food to those worthy of offerings, some give clothing, some give beds, some give public rest-houses, some give spreads and cloaks, some give female and male slaves, some give fields and sites, some give two-footed and four-footed animals, some give a hundred, a thousand, a hundred thousand, some give a great kingdom, some even give their lives." "If, great king, some even give their lives, why do you excessively criticise Vessantara, the master of giving, when his children and wife were well given?"

"Is there, great king, a worldly custom, a worldly practice, that a father may pledge or sell his child when oppressed by debt or driven by livelihood?" "Yes, venerable sir, a father may pledge or sell his child when oppressed by debt or driven by livelihood." "If, great king, a father may pledge or sell his child when oppressed by debt or driven by livelihood, King Vessantara too, great king, not obtaining the knowledge of omniscience, troubled and afflicted, for the attainment of that wealth of the Teaching, pledged and sold his children and wife. Thus, great king, what was given by King Vessantara to others was indeed given, what was done was indeed done. Why then do you, great king, excessively disparage Vessantara, the master of giving, because of that gift?"

"I do not, venerable Nāgasena, censure the gift of Vessantara, the master of giving; but when children and wife are requested, one should give oneself in exchange."

"This indeed, great king, is an unreasonable argument, that when children and wife are requested, one should give oneself; for whatever is requested, that very thing should be given; this is the action of good persons. Just as, great king, if some man were to have drinking water brought, and someone were to give him food, would that man, great king, be doing what should be done for him?" "No indeed, venerable sir; giving him that very thing which he has brought, one would be doing what should be done." "Just so indeed, great king, when the brahmin requested children and wife, King Vessantara gave just the children and wife. If, great king, the brahmin were to request Vessantara's body, he, great king, would not protect himself, would not tremble, would not be attached; his body would be given and relinquished. If, great king, anyone were to approach Vessantara, the master of giving, and request 'Become a slave for me,' his body would be given and relinquished; he would not regret having given; the body of King Vessantara, great king, was common to many."

"Just as, great king, a cooked piece of flesh is common to many, even so, great king, the body of King Vessantara was common to many. Or else, great king, just as a tree bearing fruit is common to various groups of birds, even so, great king, the body of King Vessantara was common to many. Why? 'Thus practising, I shall attain perfect enlightenment.'"

"Just as, great king, a man who is poor, desiring wealth, wandering in search of wealth, goes along the goat-path, the stake-path, the cane-path, engages in trade by water and land, strives for wealth by body, speech, and mind, endeavours for the acquisition of wealth. Even so, great king, Vessantara, the master of giving, poor in the Buddha's wealth, for the acquisition of the jewel of omniscient knowledge, having given up to beggars wealth and grain, female and male slaves, vehicles and conveyances, all his property, his own children and wife, and himself, seeks only perfect enlightenment.

"Or else, great king, a minister desiring a seal, for the sake of the seal, whatever wealth and grain, gold and silver there is in the house, having given all that, strives for the acquisition of the seal. Even so, great king, Vessantara, the master of giving, having given all that external and internal wealth, having given even his life to others, seeks only perfect enlightenment.

"Moreover, great king, this occurred to Vessantara, the master of giving: 'Whatever that brahmin requests, giving just that to him, I am called one who does what should be done,' thus he gave his children and wife to him. Indeed, great king, Vessantara, the master of giving, did not give his children and wife to the brahmin out of hatred, did not give his children and wife out of desire not to see them, did not give his children and wife thinking 'my children and wife are too many, I am not able to support them,' did not give his children and wife out of discontent, out of desire to remove them thinking 'they are not dear to me.' But because of the dearness of the jewel of omniscient knowledge, for the sake of omniscient knowledge, King Vessantara gave to the brahmin such an incomparable, vast, unsurpassed, dear, agreeable, beloved, dear as life, excellent gift of children and wife.

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One, the god above gods, in the Conduct Collection:

"'Both sons are not odious to me, Queen Maddī is not odious to me;
Omniscience is dear to me, therefore I gave what is dear.'

"Therefore, great king, King Vessantara, having given the gift of his children, having entered the leaf-hut, lay down. For him, distressed by excessive love, powerful grief arose, his heart-base became hot. His nose not being sufficient, he released hot in-breaths and out-breaths through his mouth; his tears, having turned, becoming drops of blood, came out from his eyes. Even so, great king, with suffering King Vessantara gave his children and wife to the brahmin, thinking 'may my path of giving not decline.'

"Moreover, great king, King Vessantara gave the two children to the brahmin dependent on two reasons. Which two? 'My path of giving will not decline, and from here my grandfather will release my distressed little children from forest roots and fruits.' For King Vessantara knows, great king: 'My children cannot be enjoyed by anyone as slaves; my grandfather will redeem these children, thus there will be a going for us too.' These, great king, are the two reasons dependent on which he gave the two children to the brahmin.

"Moreover, great king, King Vessantara knows: 'This brahmin is old, aged, elderly, weak, broken, dependent on a staff, with exhausted life span, of little merit; he is not capable of enjoying these children as slaves.' But could, great king, a man by his natural power, having taken these moon and sun, so mighty, so powerful, having put them in a box or a casket, having made them without radiance, enjoy them for use as a plate?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Even so, great king, in this world, the children of Vessantara, who is comparable to the moon and sun, cannot be enjoyed by anyone as slaves.

"Furthermore, great king, listen to a reason by which reason the children of Vessantara cannot be enjoyed by anyone as slaves. Just as, great king, the jewel gem of a wheel-turning monarch, beautiful, of good birth, octagonal, well-polished, four cubits in length, with the circumference of a cart-hub, cannot be wrapped by anyone in a rag, put in a box, and enjoyed for use as a knife and whetstone, even so, great king, in the world, the children of Vessantara, who is comparable to the jewel gem of a wheel-turning monarch, cannot be enjoyed by anyone as slaves.

"Furthermore, great king, listen to a reason by which reason the children of Vessantara cannot be enjoyed by anyone as slaves. Just as, great king, Uposatha the king of elephants, in three-fold rut, all white, standing on seven supports, eight ratanas in height, nine ratanas in length and circumference, pleasing, handsome, cannot be covered by anyone with a winnowing basket or a saucer, or put in a calf-shed like a cow's calf and looked after, even so, great king, in the world, the children of Vessantara, who is comparable to Uposatha the king of elephants, cannot be enjoyed by anyone as slaves.

"Furthermore, great king, listen to a reason by which reason the children of Vessantara cannot be enjoyed by anyone as slaves. Just as, great king, the great ocean, long, broad, extended, deep, immeasurable, hard to cross, unfathomable, uncovered, cannot be covered everywhere by anyone and made for use at a single landing place, even so indeed, great king, the children of Vessantara, who is comparable to the great ocean in the world, could not be enjoyed by anyone as slaves.

"Furthermore, great king, listen to a reason by which reason the children of Vessantara cannot be enjoyed by anyone as slaves. Just as, great king, the Himalaya, the king of mountains, five hundred yojanas high, three thousand yojanas in length and breadth in the sky, adorned with eighty-four thousand peaks, the source of five hundred great rivers, a dwelling place for hosts of great beings, bearing various kinds of odours, decorated with hundreds of divine medicines, appears risen high in the sky like a rain cloud, even so indeed, great king, the children of Vessantara, who is comparable to the Himalaya, the king of mountains, in the world, could not be enjoyed by anyone as slaves.

"Furthermore, great king, listen to a reason by which reason the children of Vessantara cannot be enjoyed by anyone as slaves. Just as, great king, in the darkness of the night, a great mass of fire burning on a mountain peak is discerned even from very far away, even so indeed, great king, King Vessantara, like a great mass of fire burning on a mountain peak, is well-known and discerned even from very far away; his children could not be enjoyed by anyone as slaves.

"Furthermore, great king, listen to a reason by which reason the children of Vessantara cannot be enjoyed by anyone as slaves. Just as, great king, on the Himalaya mountain, at the time of the ironwood tree flowers, when a straight wind blows, the odour of flowers blows for ten or twelve yojanas, even so indeed, great king, for King Vessantara, even for thousands of yojanas, up to the Akaniṭṭha realm, in between here, in the abodes of gods, titans, garuḷas, gandhabbas, demons, rakkhasas, great serpents, kinnaras, and Indra, a sound of fame has arisen, and the odour of his excellent morality blows forth; therefore his children could not be enjoyed by anyone as slaves. Great king, the prince Jālī was instructed by his father King Vessantara: 'Your grandfather, dear son, redeeming you by giving wealth to the brahmin, let him redeem by giving that thousand gold coins; redeeming Kaṇhājinā, let him redeem by giving a hundred of each - a hundred male slaves, a hundred female slaves, a hundred elephants, a hundred horses, a hundred cows, a hundred bulls, a hundred gold coins. If, dear son, your grandfather takes you from the brahmin's hand by command, by force, for nothing, do not do your grandfather's word; be followers of the brahmin only.' Having thus instructed, he sent his sons. Then Prince Jālī, having gone, when asked by his grandfather, said:

'For a thousand in value indeed, dear father, my father gave me to the brahmin;

And Kaṇhājinā the maiden, with a hundred elephants as well.'

"Well unravelled, Venerable Nāgasena, is the question; the net of wrong views has been well broken; the opposing doctrines have been well crushed; one's own doctrine has been well illuminated; the phrasing has been well purified; the meaning has been well analysed; thus I accept this as true."

The question on Vessantara is the first.

2. The Question on the Performance of Austerities

2. "Venerable Nāgasena, do all Bodhisattas perform the performance of austerities, or was the performance of austerities done only by the Bodhisatta Gotama?" "There is not, great king, a performance of austerities for all Bodhisattas; the performance of austerities was done only by the Bodhisatta Gotama."

"Venerable Nāgasena, if so, it is inappropriate that there is distinction among Bodhisattas." "There is distinction among Bodhisattas, great king, in four respects. With which four? Distinction in family, distinction in striving, distinction in lifespan, distinction in measure. By these four respects, great king, there is distinction among Bodhisattas. For all Buddhas, great king, in form, in morality, in concentration, in wisdom, in liberation, in knowledge and vision of liberation, in the four grounds of self-confidence, in the ten powers of the Truth-finder, in the six kinds of knowledge not shared with others, in the fourteen kinds of Buddha-knowledge, in the eighteen qualities of a Buddha, and in the entire virtues of a Buddha, there is no distinction; all Buddhas are exactly equal in the qualities of a Buddha."

"If, Venerable Nāgasena, all Buddhas are exactly equal in the qualities of a Buddha, for what reason was the performance of austerities done only by the Bodhisatta Gotama?" "When knowledge was not fully matured, great king, when enlightenment was not fully matured, the Bodhisatta Gotama went forth into renunciation; the

performance of austerities was done by one who was maturing the unmatured knowledge."

"Venerable Nāgasena, for what reason did the Bodhisatta make the great renunciation when knowledge was not fully matured, when enlightenment was not fully matured? Should one not go forth when knowledge is fully matured, having matured the knowledge?"

"The Bodhisatta, great king, having seen the women's quarters in disarray, became remorseful; for him who was remorseful, discontent arose. Having seen the mind of discontent arisen, a certain young god of Māra's retinue, thinking 'This is the time for dispelling the mind of discontent,' standing in the sky, spoke these words:

'Dear sir, do not be dissatisfied. On the seventh day from now, the divine wheel treasure will appear for you, with a thousand spokes, with rim, with nave, complete in every respect; and treasures on earth and in the sky will come to you of their own accord. In the four great continents with their two thousand surrounding small islands, command will proceed with one voice. And you will have more than a thousand sons, brave, heroic in form, crushers of enemy armies. Surrounded by those sons, possessed of the seven treasures, you will rule over the four continents.'

Just as an iron stake heated all day, burning everywhere, might enter the ear-hole, even so, great king, that word entered the ear-hole of the Bodhisatta. Thus he, already dissatisfied by nature, by the word of that deity became even more alarmed, agitated, and stirred.

Just as, great king, a great mass of fire burning, when fuelled with other wood, would burn even more, even so, great king, the Bodhisatta, already dissatisfied by nature, by the word of that deity became even more alarmed, agitated, and stirred.

Or just as, great king, the great earth, naturally moist, with green grass sprouted, sprinkled with water, become muddy, when a great rain cloud has rained upon it, would become even muddier, even so, great king, the Bodhisatta, already dissatisfied by nature, by the word of that deity became even more alarmed, agitated, and stirred."

"But indeed, Venerable Nāgasena, if the divine wheel treasure were to arise for the Bodhisatta on the seventh day, would the Bodhisatta turn back when the divine wheel treasure had arisen?" "No indeed, great king, the divine wheel treasure would not arise for the Bodhisatta on the seventh day; but it was spoken falsely by that deity for the purpose of enticement. Even if, great king, the divine wheel treasure were to arise on the seventh day, the Bodhisatta would not turn back. What is the reason? 'Impermanent' - the Bodhisatta, great king, firmly grasped this; 'suffering, non-self' - he firmly grasped this; he had reached the elimination of clinging.

Just as, great king, water from Lake Anotatta enters the river Ganges, from the river Ganges enters the great ocean, from the great ocean enters the mouth of the abyss - would that water, great king, having gone to the mouth of the abyss, having turned back, enter the great ocean, from the great ocean enter the river Ganges, from the river Ganges enter Anotatta again?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, wholesome merit was matured by the Bodhisatta during a hundred thousand

cosmic cycles and four incalculable periods for the sake of this existence; having reached this final existence, with enlightenment-knowledge fully matured, in six years he will become a Buddha, omniscient, the foremost person in the world. Would the Bodhisatta, great king, turn back for the sake of the wheel treasure?" "No indeed, venerable sir."

"But moreover, great king, the great earth with its forests and mountains might overturn, yet the Bodhisatta would not turn back without attaining perfect enlightenment. Even if, great king, the water of the Ganges were to flow upstream, yet the Bodhisatta would not turn back without attaining perfect enlightenment; Even if, great king, the great ocean holding immeasurable water were to dry up like water in a cow's hoofprint, yet the Bodhisatta would not turn back without attaining perfect enlightenment; Even if, great king, Mount Sineru, the king of mountains, were to split into a hundred or a thousand pieces, yet the Bodhisatta would not turn back without attaining perfect enlightenment; Even if, great king, the moon and sun with their stars were to fall to the ground like clods of earth, yet the Bodhisatta would not turn back without attaining perfect enlightenment; Even if, great king, space were to roll up like a mat, yet the Bodhisatta would not turn back without attaining perfect enlightenment. Why? Because all bonds had been burst asunder."

"Venerable Nāgasena, how many bondages are there in the world?" "There are indeed, great king, these ten bondages in the world, by which bondages bound beings do not go forth, and even having gone forth, they turn back. What are the ten? Mother, great king, is a bondage in the world; father, great king, is a bondage in the world; wife, great king, is a bondage in the world; sons, great king, are a bondage in the world; relatives, great king, are a bondage in the world; friends, great king, are a bondage in the world; wealth, great king, is a bondage in the world; material gain and honour, great king, are a bondage in the world; supremacy, great king, is a bondage in the world; the five types of sensual pleasure, great king, are a bondage in the world. These, great king, are the ten bondages in the world, by which bondages bound beings do not go forth, and even having gone forth, they turn back. Those ten bondages of the Bodhisatta were cut and burst apart; therefore, great king, the Bodhisatta does not turn back."

"Venerable Nāgasena, if the Bodhisatta, when discontent had arisen in his mind, by the word of the deity, with knowledge not yet matured, with enlightenment not yet matured, went forth into renunciation, what was the purpose of his performance of austerities? Should not one who is waiting for the maturing of knowledge be an eater of everything?"

"There are indeed, great king, these ten persons in the world who are looked down upon, despised, scorned, mocked, blamed, treated with contempt, and disrespected. What are the ten? A widow, great king, is looked down upon, despised, scorned, mocked, blamed, treated with contempt, and disrespected in the world. A weak person, great king, etc. One without relatives, great king, is a person, etc. A gluttonous person, great king, etc. One not dwelling in a respected family, great king, is a person, etc. One with evil friends, great king, is a person, etc. One lacking wealth, great king, is a person, etc. One lacking good conduct, great king, is a person, etc. One lacking action, great king, is a person, etc. One lacking exertion, great king, is a person looked down upon, despised, scorned, mocked, blamed, treated with

contempt, and disrespected in the world. These, great king, are the ten persons in the world who are looked down upon, despised, scorned, mocked, blamed, treated with contempt, and disrespected. Recollecting these ten states, great king, this perception arose in the Bodhisatta: 'May I not be one lacking action, lacking exertion, blamed by gods and humans; what if I were to be a master of action, respecting action, having action as authority, having action as habit, bearing the yoke of action, having action as my abode, dwelling diligently.' Thus indeed, great king, the Bodhisatta, while maturing knowledge, performed austerities."

"Venerable Nāgasena, the Bodhisatta, while performing austerities, said thus: 'Yet I do not by this bitter performance of austerities attain any super-human achievement, any distinction of knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones; could there be another path to enlightenment?' Was there then at that time forgetfulness regarding the path for the Bodhisatta?"

"There are indeed, great king, these twenty-five mental states that weaken the mind, by which a weakened mind does not rightly become concentrated for the elimination of mental corruptions. What are the twenty-five? Wrath, great king, is a mental state that weakens the mind, by which a weakened mind does not rightly become concentrated for the elimination of mental corruptions; hostility, etc. Contempt, etc. Insolence, etc. Envy, etc. Stinginess, etc. Deceit, etc. Fraudulence, etc. Obstinacy, etc. Impetuosity, etc. Conceit... etc. arrogance... Vanity, etc. Negligence, etc. Sloth and torpor, etc. Weariness, etc. Laziness, etc. Evil friendship, etc. Forms, etc. Sounds, etc. Odours, etc. Flavours, etc. Tangible objects, etc. Hunger and thirst, etc. Discontent, great king, is a mental state that weakens the mind, by which a weakened mind does not rightly become concentrated for the elimination of mental corruptions. These, great king, are the twenty-five mental states that weaken the mind, by which a weakened mind does not rightly become concentrated for the elimination of mental corruptions.

For the Bodhisatta, great king, hunger and thirst overpowered the body; when the body was overpowered, the mind does not rightly become concentrated for the elimination of mental corruptions. For a hundred thousand cosmic cycles, great king, and four incalculable cosmic cycles, the Bodhisatta sought the full realisation of just the four noble truths in those various births; how then could there be forgetfulness concerning the path in his final existence, in the birth of full realisation? But, great king, a mere perception arose for the Bodhisatta: 'Could there be another path to enlightenment?' Formerly indeed, great king, the Bodhisatta, being one month old, while his father the Sakyan was working, seated on a royal couch in the cool shade of a rose-apple tree, folding his legs crosswise, quite secluded from sensual pleasures, secluded from unwholesome mental states, having attained, dwelt in the first meditative absorption, which is accompanied by applied thought and sustained thought, with rapture and happiness born of seclusion, etc. having attained, he dwelt in the fourth meditative absorption." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true: the Bodhisatta performed austerities while ripening his knowledge."

The question on the performance of austerities is the second.

3. The Question on the Greater Power of Wholesome and Unwholesome

3. "Venerable Nāgasena, which is exceeding, more powerful - wholesome or unwholesome?" "Wholesome, great king, is exceeding, more powerful, not so unwholesome." "I do not accept that statement, venerable Nāgasena, 'wholesome is exceeding, more powerful, not so unwholesome.' Here, venerable Nāgasena, killers of living beings, takers of what is not given, those who engage in sexual misconduct, liars, village destroyers, road corrupters, cheats, deceivers are seen - all of them by that much evil obtain cutting off of hands, cutting off of feet, cutting off of hands and feet, cutting off of ears, cutting off of nose, cutting off of ears and nose, the gruel-pot torture, the shell-tonsure torture, the Rāhu's mouth torture, the fire-garland torture, the hand-torch torture, the grass-strip torture, the bark-dress torture, the antelope torture, the flesh-hook torture, the coin-cutting torture, the lye-pickling torture, the pivot-turning torture, the straw-chair torture, being sprinkled with boiling oil, being made to be eaten by dogs, impalement alive, beheading with a sword. Some, having done evil at night, experience the result at night itself; some, having done it at night, experience it by day itself; some, having done it by day, experience it by day itself; some, having done it by day, experience it at night itself; some experience it after two or three days have passed - all of them experience the result in this very life. But is there, venerable Nāgasena, anyone who, having given a gift with retinue to one or two or three or four or five or ten or a hundred or a thousand or a hundred thousand, experienced wealth or fame or happiness pertaining to the present life through morality or through the Observance practice?"

"There are, great king, four men who, having given gifts, having taken upon themselves morality, having performed the Observance practice, in this very life, with that very bodily form, reached the city of the devas." "Who and who, venerable sir?" "King Mandhātā, great king, King Nimi, King Sādhina, and the gandhabba Guttila."

"Venerable Nāgasena, that is separated by many thousands of existences; that is beyond the sight of both of us. If you are able, tell of the present existence, during the time when the Blessed One was living." "Even in the present existence, great king, the slave Puṇṇaka, having given food to the Elder Sāriputta, on that very day attained the position of treasurer; he is now known as Puṇṇaka the treasurer. Queen Gopālamātā, having sold her own hair, with the eight coins obtained, having given almsfood to the Elder Mahākaccāyana together with seven others, on that very day attained the position of chief queen of King Candapajjota. The female lay follower Suppiyā, having given food for convalescence made from the flesh of her own thigh to a certain sick monk, on the very second day became one with healed wound, with restored skin, healthy. Queen Mallikā, having given a lump of barley-gruel from the previous evening to the Blessed One, on that very day became the chief queen of the King of Kosala. Sumana the garland-maker, having venerated the Blessed One with eight handfuls of jasmine flowers, on that very day attained great success. The brahmin with one cloth, having venerated the Blessed One with his upper cloth, on that very day obtained everything eightfold. All these, great king, experienced wealth and fame pertaining to the present life."

"Venerable Nāgasena, having searched and sought, you saw only six people." "Yes, great king." "Well then, venerable Nāgasena, unwholesome alone is exceeding, more powerful, not so wholesome. For I, venerable Nāgasena, in a single day see even ten men being impaled on stakes as the result of evil action; I see twenty, thirty, forty,

fifty, a hundred men, a thousand men being impaled on stakes as the result of evil action. Of the Nanda family, venerable Nāgasena, there was a general's son named Bhaddasāla. And with King Candagutta a battle was fully engaged. In that battle, venerable Nāgasena, on both sides of the army there were eighty headless-body forms; when one head-and-trunk fell, one headless-body form arose. All these fell into calamity and disaster as the result of evil action alone. By this reason too, venerable Nāgasena, I say unwholesome alone is exceeding, more powerful, not so wholesome."

"Is it heard, venerable Nāgasena, that in this Buddha's Dispensation an incomparable gift was given by the King of Kosala?" "Yes, great king, it is heard." "But indeed, venerable Nāgasena, did the King of Kosala, having given that incomparable gift, obtain on that account any wealth or fame or happiness pertaining to the present life?" "No indeed, great king." "If, venerable Nāgasena, the King of Kosala, even having given such an unsurpassed gift, did not obtain on that account any wealth or fame or happiness pertaining to the present life, then, venerable Nāgasena, unwholesome alone is exceeding, more powerful, not so wholesome."

"Because of its smallness, great king, unwholesome ripens quickly; because of its extensiveness, wholesome ripens over a long time. This, great king, should be examined even by simile. Just as, great king, in the western country there is a grain type called kumudabhaṇḍikā which is reaped in a month and brought inside the house, while rice ripens in five or six months - what then, great king, is the difference, what is the distinction between kumudabhaṇḍikā and rice?" "Because of its smallness, venerable sir, of kumudabhaṇḍikā, and because of the extensiveness of rice. Rice, venerable Nāgasena, is worthy of kings, food for kings; kumudabhaṇḍikā is food for slaves and workers." "Just so indeed, great king, because of its smallness, unwholesome ripens quickly; because of its extensiveness, wholesome ripens over a long time."

"Whatever therein, venerable Nāgasena, matures quickly, that indeed in the world is exceeding, more powerful; therefore unwholesome is more powerful, not so wholesome. Just as, venerable Nāgasena, whatever warrior, having entered a great battle, having seized the enemy by the armpit, having dragged him, might bring him very quickly to his master, that warrior in the world is called able and heroic. And whatever physician quickly extracts a dart and removes the disease, that physician is called skilled. Whatever accountant, having calculated very quickly, quickly shows the result, that accountant is called skilled. Whatever wrestler quickly lifts up his opponent and throws him down on his back, that wrestler is called able and heroic. Just so indeed, venerable Nāgasena, whatever matures quickly, whether wholesome or unwholesome, that in the world is exceeding, more powerful."

"Both of those, great king, are actions to be experienced in a future state; but unwholesome, because of its blameworthiness, is experienced in the present life in a moment. By the warriors of old, great king, this procedure was established: 'Whoever kills a living being, he is worthy of punishment, etc. whoever takes what is not given, etc. whoever goes to another's wife, etc. whoever speaks falsely, etc. whoever sacks a village, etc. whoever spoils the road, etc. whoever commits fraud, etc. whoever commits deception, he is worthy of punishment, should be killed, should be cut, should be broken, should be slain.' Taking that as basis, having investigated and investigated, they punish, they kill, they cut, they break, and they slay. But is there,

great king, any procedure established by anyone: 'Whoever gives a gift, or guards morality, or performs the Observance practice, to him wealth or fame should be given'? Do they, having investigated and investigated, give wealth or fame, like the killing and imprisonment for a thief who has committed a deed?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "If, great king, having investigated and investigated, they would give wealth or fame to donors, wholesome too would be experienced in the present life. But because, great king, they do not investigate donors thinking 'We shall give wealth or fame,' therefore wholesome is not experienced in the present life. By this reason, great king, unwholesome is experienced in the present life; in the future state indeed he experiences exceeding, more powerful feeling." "Excellent, venerable Nāgasena, without one wise like you this question could not be well unravelled; the mundane, venerable Nāgasena, has been made known by the supramundane."

The question on the greater power of wholesome and unwholesome is the third.

4. The Question on Dedications to Deceased Spirits

4. "Venerable Nāgasena, these donors, having given a gift, dedicate it to deceased spirits: 'May this reach them.' Do they obtain any result on that account?" "Some, great king, obtain, some do not obtain." "Who, venerable sir, obtain, who do not obtain?" "Those reborn in hell, great king, do not obtain; those gone to heaven do not obtain; those gone to the animal realm do not obtain; of four kinds of ghosts, three kinds of ghosts do not obtain - those who feed on vomit, those afflicted by hunger and thirst, those consumed by craving; ghosts who live on what is given by others obtain; and they too obtain only when remembering."

"Well then, venerable Nāgasena, the gift of the donors is dried up, fruitless, if those for whom it was made do not obtain it?" "No indeed, great king, that gift is not fruitless, not without result; the donors themselves experience its fruit." "Well then, venerable Nāgasena, convince me by a reason." "Here, great king, some people, having prepared fish, meat, liquor, food and sweets, go to their relatives' family. If those relatives were not to accept that tribute, would that tribute go dried up or perish?" "No indeed, venerable sir, it would belong just to the owners." "Just so indeed, great king, the donors themselves experience its fruit. But, great king, if a man who has entered an inner room, when there is no exit in front, by what would he exit?" "By the way he entered, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, the donors themselves experience its fruit." "Let it be, venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true: the donors themselves experience its fruit; we do not dispute that reason."

Venerable Nāgasena, if the gift given by these donors reaches the deceased spirits, and they experience its result, then if one who kills living beings, cruel, with bloody hands, with corrupted mental intention, having killed people, having done a cruel deed, were to dedicate to deceased spirits: 'May the result of this action of mine reach the deceased spirits,' would its result reach the deceased spirits?" "No indeed, great king."

"Venerable Nāgasena, what is the cause there, what is the reason, by which the wholesome reaches but the unwholesome does not reach?" "This, great king, is not a question to be asked. And do not, great king, thinking 'there is one who can answer,' ask what should not be asked. 'Why is space unsupported, why does the Ganges not

flow upwards, why are these humans and birds two-footed and deer four-footed?' - you will ask me that too." "I do not ask that, venerable Nāgasena, seeking to trouble, but I ask for the purpose of removing doubt. Many people in the world are going the wrong way, without vision. 'How might they not gain access?' - thus I ask that." "It is not possible, great king, to share evil action together with one who has not done it, who has not consented.

Just as, great king, people carry water even very far by means of a water channel, is it possible, great king, to carry a compact great rock mountain by a channel wherever one wishes?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, it is possible to share the wholesome, it is not possible to share the unwholesome. Or else, great king, it is possible to light a lamp with oil; is it possible, great king, to light a lamp with water?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, it is possible to share the wholesome, it is not possible to share the unwholesome. Or else, great king, farmers, having drawn water from a lake, ripen grain; is it possible, great king, having drawn water from the great ocean, to ripen grain?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, it is possible to share the wholesome, it is not possible to share the unwholesome."

"Venerable Nāgasena, for what reason is it possible to share wholesome, but not possible to share unwholesome? Convince me by a reason; I am not blind, without light - having heard I will know." "Unwholesome, great king, is little; wholesome is much. Because of its littleness, unwholesome is exhausted by the doer alone; because of its muchness, wholesome spreads over the world with its gods." "Give a simile."

"Just as, great king, if a small single drop of water were to fall on the earth, would that drop of water, great king, spread over ten or twelve yojanas?" "No indeed, venerable sir; where that drop of water fell, right there it is exhausted." "For what reason, great king?" "Because of the smallness, venerable sir, of the drop of water." "Just so indeed, great king, unwholesome being small, because of its smallness, is exhausted by the doer alone; it is not possible to share.

"Or just as, great king, a great rain cloud might pour down, satisfying the surface of the earth, would that great rain cloud, great king, spread over all around?" "Yes, venerable sir, having filled pools, lakes, rivers, channels, grottoes, crevices, reservoirs, tanks, wells and ponds, that great rain cloud would spread over ten or twelve yojanas." "For what reason, great king?" "Because of the greatness, venerable sir, of the rain cloud." "Just so indeed, great king, wholesome is much; because of its muchness, it is possible to share even with gods and humans."

"Venerable Nāgasena, for what reason is unwholesome little and wholesome more?" "Here, great king, whoever gives a gift, takes upon himself morality, performs the Observance practice, he is glad, delighted, smiling, greatly pleased, with a gladdened mind, filled with joy; for him rapture arises again and again; for one whose mind is filled with rapture, wholesome grows more and more.

"Just as, great king, in a well full of much water, water might enter from one direction and exit from another; even as it exits, it arises again and again; it is not possible to bring it to exhaustion. Just so indeed, great king, wholesome grows more and more. Even if for a hundred years, great king, a man were to reflect upon wholesome done,

with each reflection, wholesome grows more and more. That wholesome of his is possible to share with whomever he wishes; this, great king, is the reason here, by which reason wholesome is more.

"But one doing unwholesome, great king, afterwards becomes remorseful; the mind of one who is remorseful shrinks back, contracts, turns away, does not expand, grieves, is tormented, diminishes, is exhausted, does not grow, and is depleted right there. Just as, great king, in a dry river with a great sandbank, with elevations and depressions, with bends and curves, a small amount of water coming from above diminishes, is exhausted, does not grow, and is depleted right there. Just so indeed, great king, the mind of one doing unwholesome shrinks back, contracts, turns away, does not expand, grieves, is tormented, diminishes, is exhausted, does not grow, and is depleted right there; this, great king, is the reason here, by which reason unwholesome is little." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The Question on the dedications to deceased spirits is the fourth.

5. The Question on Dreams

5. "Venerable Nāgasena, in this world men and women see dreams, both good and evil, both seen before and not seen before, both done before and not done before, both secure and fearful, both far and near, and manifold thousands of various kinds are seen. What is this thing called a dream, and who sees it?" "This, great king, is a sign called a dream, which comes into the range of consciousness. There are these six, great king, who see dreams: one of wind humour sees a dream, one of bile humour sees a dream, one of phlegm humour sees a dream, one sees a dream through divine intervention, one sees a dream through habitual practice, one sees a dream through an advanced sign. Therein, great king, whatever dream one sees through an advanced sign, that alone is true, the rest is false."

"Venerable Nāgasena, one who sees a dream through an advanced sign, does his consciousness itself go and select that sign, or does that sign come into the range of consciousness, or does another come and inform him?" "No, great king, his consciousness does not itself go and select that sign, nor does anyone else come and inform him, but rather that very sign comes into the range of consciousness. Just as, great king, a mirror does not itself go anywhere and select a reflection, nor does anyone else bring a reflection and place it on the mirror, but rather a reflection comes from somewhere and comes into the range of the mirror, just so indeed, great king, his consciousness does not itself go and select that sign, nor does anyone else come and inform him, but rather a sign comes from somewhere and comes into the range of consciousness."

"Venerable Nāgasena, that consciousness which sees a dream, does that consciousness know 'such will be the result, whether security or danger'?" "No indeed, great king, that consciousness does not know 'such will be the result, whether security or danger', but when the sign has arisen, one tells others, and then they explain the meaning."

"Come now, venerable Nāgasena, show me a reason." "Just as, great king, moles, boils, and skin eruptions arise on the body for gain or loss, for fame or disrepute, for blame or praise, for happiness or suffering, do those boils, great king, arise knowing

'we shall produce this particular result'?" "No indeed, venerable sir, in whatever place those boils arise, there, having seen those boils, interpreters of signs declare 'such will be the result'." "Just so indeed, great king, that consciousness which sees a dream, that consciousness does not know 'such will be the result, whether security or danger', but when the sign has arisen, one tells others, and then they explain the meaning."

"Venerable Nāgasena, one who sees a dream, does he see it while sleeping or while awake?" "Whoever, great king, sees a dream, he does not see it while sleeping, nor does he see it while awake. But when torpor has descended and the life-continuum has not been reached, in between here one sees a dream. For one who has ascended into torpor, great king, consciousness has gone to the life-continuum; consciousness gone to the life-continuum does not proceed; consciousness that does not proceed does not understand happiness and suffering; for one not understanding there is no dream; when consciousness is proceeding one sees a dream.

Just as, great king, in gloom, in darkness, in dim light, even in a very pure mirror a reflection is not seen, just so indeed, great king, when consciousness has ascended into torpor and gone to the life-continuum, even though the body remains, consciousness does not proceed; when consciousness does not proceed one does not see a dream. Just as, great king, a mirror, so should the body be seen; just as darkness, so should torpor be seen; just as light, so should consciousness be seen.

"Or just as, great king, when the sun is covered by frost, the radiance of the sun is not seen, though the sun's rays exist they do not proceed, and when the sun's rays do not proceed there is no light, just so indeed, great king, for one who has ascended into torpor, the mind has gone to the life-continuum, the mind that has gone to the life-continuum does not proceed, when the mind does not proceed one does not see a dream. Just as, great king, the sun, so should the body be seen; just as the covering of frost, so should torpor be seen; just as the sun's rays, so should the mind be seen.

"For two, great king, even while the body exists, the mind does not proceed: for one who has ascended into torpor and gone to the life-continuum, even while the body exists, the mind does not proceed; for one who has attained cessation, even while the body exists, the mind does not proceed. For one who is awake, great king, the mind is fickle, open, unconcealed, unbound; for one of such nature, a sign does not come within range of the mind. Just as, great king, those desiring secrecy avoid a man who is open, unconcealed, inactive, without secrets, just so indeed, great king, for one who is awake, a divine matter does not come within range; therefore one who is awake does not see a dream. Or just as, great king, for a monk of broken livelihood, of misconduct, of evil friends, immoral, lazy, of inferior energy, wholesome qualities conducive to enlightenment do not come within range, just so indeed, great king, for one who is awake, a divine matter does not come within range; therefore one who is awake does not see a dream."

"Venerable Nāgasena, is there a beginning, middle, and end of torpor?" "Yes, great king, there is a beginning, middle, and end of torpor." "Which is the beginning, which is the middle, which is the end?" "That which, great king, is the covering and enveloping of the body, the weakness, the sluggishness, the unfitness for work of the body, this is the beginning of torpor; that which, great king, is when one overcome by

light sleep watches intermittently, this is the middle of torpor; going to the life-continuum is the end. One who has reached the middle, great king, overcome by light sleep, sees a dream. Just as, great king, someone of restrained conduct, with concentrated mind, stable in nature, of unshakeable understanding, having abandoned the sound of curiosity, having plunged into the midst of the forest, reflects on a subtle matter, and he does not fall into torpor there, he, concentrated there with fully focused mind, penetrates the subtle matter, just so indeed, great king, one who is awake, not having attained torpor, having reached the middle, overcome by light sleep, sees a dream. Just as, great king, the sound of curiosity, so should wakefulness be seen; just as a secluded forest, so should one overcome by light sleep be seen; just as he, having abandoned the sound of curiosity, having avoided torpor, having become neutral, penetrates the subtle matter, so one who is awake, not having attained torpor, overcome by light sleep, sees a dream." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on dreams is the fifth.

6. The Question on Untimely Death

6. "Venerable Nāgasena, those beings who die, do they all die at the proper time, or do some die at an improper time?" "There is, great king, death at the proper time, and there is death at an improper time."

"Venerable Nāgasena, who die at the proper time, who die at an improper time?"

"Have you, great king, previously seen mango trees or rose-apple trees, or from another fruit tree, fruits falling, both unripe and ripe?" "Yes, venerable sir." "Those fruits, great king, that fall from the tree, do they all fall at the proper time, or at an improper time?" "Those fruits, venerable Nāgasena, that fall fully ripe and loosened, all those fall at the proper time. But those remaining fruits among them, some fall worm-eaten, some fall struck by a stick, some fall struck by the wind, some fall having become rotten inside, all those fall at an improper time." "Just so, great king, those who die struck by the force of ageing, they indeed die at the proper time; the rest, some die oppressed by action, some die oppressed by destination, some die oppressed by activity."

"Venerable Nāgasena, those who die oppressed by action, those who die oppressed by destination, those who die oppressed by activity, those who die oppressed by the force of ageing, all of them die at the proper time only. Even one who dies in the mother's womb, that is his time, he dies at the proper time. Even one who dies in the birth-house, that is his time, he too dies at the proper time. Even one who dies at a month old, etc. Even one who dies at a hundred years old, that is his time, he dies at the proper time. Therefore, venerable Nāgasena, there is no such thing as untimely death; whoever dies, they all die at the proper time only."

"These seven, great king, die at an improper time even while further life span exists. Which seven? One who is hungry, great king, not obtaining food, with damaged interior, dies at an improper time even while further life span exists; one who is thirsty, great king, not obtaining drinking water, with dried-up heart, dies at an improper time even while further life span exists; one bitten by a snake, great king, overcome by the force of poison, not obtaining a physician, dies at an improper time

even while further life span exists; one who has consumed poison, great king, with limbs and minor limbs burning, not obtaining medicine, dies at an improper time even while further life span exists; one who has entered fire, great king, burning, not obtaining extinguishing, dies at an improper time even while further life span exists; one who has entered water, great king, not obtaining a foothold, dies at an improper time even while further life span exists; one struck by a spear, great king, being sick, not obtaining a physician, dies at an improper time even while further life span exists. These, great king, are the seven who die at an improper time even while further life span exists. Therein I, great king, speak definitely.

"In eight ways, great king, death occurs for beings: by wind-originated disorder, by bile-originated disorder, by phlegm-originated disorder, by a combination of these, by change of season, by improper care, by external attack, by the result of action, great king, death occurs for beings. Therein, great king, that which is death by the result of action, that alone is timely death; the rest is untimely death." And there is this:

"By hunger and by thirst, bitten by a snake and by poison;
By fire, water, and spears, one dies there at an improper time;
By wind, bile, and phlegm, by their combination and by seasons;
By improper care, external attack, and action, one dies there at an improper time."

"Some beings, great king, die by the result of this or that unwholesome action done before. Here, great king, whoever formerly kills others by hunger, he for many hundreds of thousands of years, oppressed by hunger, starving, exhausted, with dried and withered heart, famished, parched, burning, internally scorching, dies by hunger alone, whether young, middle-aged, or old; this too is his timely death.

"Whoever formerly kills others by thirst, he for many hundreds of thousands of years, having become a ghost, being one consumed by thirst, rough, emaciated, with dried-up heart, dies by thirst alone, whether young, middle-aged, or old; this too is his timely death.

"Whoever formerly kills others by having them bitten by a snake, he for many hundreds of thousands of years, having transformed from python-mouth to python-mouth, from black-snake-mouth to black-snake-mouth, repeatedly eaten by them, dies bitten by snakes alone, whether young, middle-aged, or old; this too is his timely death.

"Whoever formerly kills others by giving poison, he for many hundreds of thousands of years, with burning limbs and minor limbs, with body breaking apart, emitting the smell of a corpse, dies by poison alone, whether young, middle-aged, or old; this too is his timely death.

"Whoever formerly kills others by fire, he for many hundreds of thousands of years, having rolled from one mountain of embers to another mountain of embers, from one domain of Yama to another domain of Yama, with body burnt and half-burnt, dies by fire alone, whether young, middle-aged, or old; this too is his timely death.

"Whoever formerly kills others by water, he for many hundreds of thousands of years, with body destroyed, plundered, broken, and weak, with agitated mind, dies by water alone, whether young, middle-aged, or old; this too is his timely death.

"Whoever formerly kills others by a spear, he for many hundreds of thousands of years, cut, split, pounded, and crushed, struck by the point of a spear, dies by a spear alone, whether young, middle-aged, or old; this too is his timely death."

"Venerable Nāgasena, as you say that there is untimely death, come, explain to me the reason for that." "Just as, great king, a great mass of fire, having taken up grass, sticks, branches, and leaves, with its fuel exhausted, is quenched by the extinction of clinging, that fire is called 'quenched at the right time, without harm, without danger'; just so, great king, whoever, having lived for many thousands of days, worn out by old age, dies by the expiration of the life-span, without harm, without danger, he is called 'one who has reached death at the right time.'

"Or just as, great king, there might be a great mass of fire that has taken up grass, sticks, branches, and leaves, and while that grass, sticks, branches, and leaves are not yet exhausted, a great rain cloud, having rained down, might extinguish it - would that great mass of fire, great king, be called 'quenched at the right time'?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "But why, great king, did that latter mass of fire not have the same destination as the former mass of fire?" "Venerable sir, oppressed by a visiting rain cloud, that mass of fire was quenched at the wrong time." Just so, great king, whoever dies at the wrong time, he, oppressed by a visiting disease - whether originating from wind, or originating from bile, or originating from phlegm, or from a combination of humours, or produced by change of season, or produced by improper care, or by external attack, or by hunger, or by thirst, or by snake bite, or by eating poison, or by fire, or by water, or oppressed by the force of a spear - dies at the wrong time. This, great king, is the reason by which there is untimely death.

"Or just as, great king, a great rain cloud, having arisen in the sky, filling both the low ground and the high, rains down, it is called 'the cloud rains without harm, without danger.' Just so, great king, whoever, having lived long, worn out by old age, dies by the expiration of the life-span, without harm, without danger, he is called 'one who has reached death at the right time.'

"Or just as, great king, a great rain cloud, having arisen in the sky, might right there in between pass away by a great wind - would that great rain cloud, great king, be called 'departed at the right time'?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "But why, great king, did that latter rain cloud not have the same destination as the former rain cloud?" "Venerable sir, oppressed by a visiting wind, that rain cloud departed without reaching the right time." "Just so, great king, whoever dies at the wrong time, he, oppressed by a visiting disease - whether originating from wind, etc. or oppressed by the force of a spear - dies at the wrong time. This, great king, is the reason by which there is untimely death.

"Or just as, great king, a powerful venomous snake, angered, might bite some person, and that poison might bring him to death without harm, without danger, that poison is called 'without harm, without danger, having reached its end.' Just so, great king, whoever, having lived long, worn out by old age, dies by the expiration of the life-span, without harm, without danger, he is called 'without harm, without danger,

having reached the end of life, having reached timely death.'

"Or just as, great king, for one bitten by a powerful venomous snake, right there in between a snake charmer, having given medicine, might render it non-poisonous - would that poison, great king, be called 'departed at the right time'?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "But why, great king, did that latter poison not have the same destination as the former poison?" "Venerable sir, oppressed by a visiting medicine, that poison departed without reaching its end." "Just so, great king, whoever dies at the wrong time, he, oppressed by a visiting disease - whether originating from wind, etc. or oppressed by the force of a spear - dies at the wrong time. This, great king, is the reason by which there is untimely death.

"Or just as, great king, an archer might shoot an arrow; if that arrow goes to the end of its natural path of travel, that arrow is called 'without harm, without danger, having gone to the end of its natural path of travel.' Just so, great king, whoever, having lived long, worn out by old age, dies by the expiration of the life-span, without harm, without danger, he is called 'without harm, without danger, having reached death at the right time.'

"Or else, great king, suppose an archer were to shoot an arrow, and someone were to catch that arrow at that very moment, would that arrow, great king, be called one that has gone to the end of its natural path of travel?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "But why, great king, did the latter arrow not have the same destination as the former arrow?" "Because, venerable sir, by the visiting act of catching, the going of that arrow was interrupted." "Just so, great king, whoever dies at the wrong time, he, oppressed by a visiting disease - whether originating from wind, etc. or oppressed by the force of a spear - dies at the wrong time. This, great king, is the reason by which there is untimely death.

"Or else, great king, whoever might strike a metal vessel, by that striking a sound having arisen goes to the end of its natural path of travel, that sound is called 'free from harm, free from danger, one that has gone to the end of its natural path of travel.' Just so, great king, whoever having lived for many thousands of days, worn out by old age, dies through the expiration of the life-span, free from harm, free from danger, he is called 'free from harm, free from danger, one who has reached death at the right time.'

"Or else, great king, whoever might strike a metal vessel, by that striking a sound might arise, and when the sound has arisen, not having gone far, someone might touch it, and together with the touching the sound might cease, would that sound, great king, be called one that has gone to the end of its natural path of travel?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "But why, great king, did the latter sound not have the same destination as the former sound?" "Because, venerable sir, by the visiting act of touching, that sound ceased." "Just so, great king, whoever dies at the wrong time, he, oppressed by a visiting disease - whether originating from wind, etc. or oppressed by the force of a spear - dies at the wrong time. This here, great king, is the reason by which there is untimely death.

"Or else, great king, a grain seed well-grown in a field, with rain falling properly, having become spread out, extended, scattered, and abundant in fruit, reaches the time for harvesting the crop, that grain is called 'free from harm, free from danger, one that has reached the right time.' Just so, great king, whoever having lived for many thousands of days, worn out by old age, dies through the expiration of the life-span, free from harm, free from danger, he is called 'free from harm, free from danger, one who has reached death at the right time.'

"Or else, great king, if a grain seed well-grown in a field were to die, damaged by water, would that grain, great king, be called one that has not reached the right time?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "But why, great king, did the latter grain not have the same destination as the former grain?" "Because, venerable sir, that grain died, oppressed by visiting heat." "Just so, great king, whoever dies at the wrong time, he, oppressed by a visiting disease - whether originating from wind, etc. or oppressed by the force of a spear - dies at the wrong time. This, great king, is the reason by which there is untimely death.

"But have you heard before, great king, that 'worms having arisen destroy a flourishing young crop together with its roots'?" "We have both heard that before, venerable sir, and seen it before." "Was that crop, great king, destroyed at the right time, or destroyed at an untimely time?" "At an untimely time, venerable sir, for if, venerable sir, worms had not eaten that crop, it would have reached the time for harvesting the crop." "But, great king, does the crop perish by a visiting destruction, and does the crop without destruction reach the time for harvesting the crop?" "Yes, venerable sir." "Just so, great king, whoever dies at the wrong time, he, oppressed by a visiting disease - whether originating from wind, etc. or oppressed by the force of a spear, dies. This, great king, is the reason by which there is untimely death.

"But have you heard before, great king, 'When the crop is accomplished, bending with the weight of fruit, with leaves spread on the stalks, a type of rain called hail-storm, having fallen down, destroys it and makes it fruitless'?" "We have both heard that before, venerable sir, and seen it before." "Was that crop, great king, destroyed at the proper time, or destroyed at an improper time?" "At an improper time, venerable sir. If, venerable sir, that crop were not rained upon by hail-storm, it would reach the time for harvesting the crop." "But, great king, does the crop perish by a visiting destruction, and does the crop without destruction reach the time for harvesting the crop?" "Yes, venerable sir." "Just so, great king, whoever dies at an improper time, he, oppressed by a visiting disease - whether arising from wind, or arising from bile, or arising from phlegm, or from a combination of humours, or born from change of season, or born from improper care, or from external attack, or from hunger, or from thirst, or from snake-bite, or from having eaten poison, or from fire, or from water, or oppressed by the force of a weapon - dies at an improper time. But if he were not oppressed by a visiting disease, he would reach death at the proper time. This, great king, is the reason here, by which reason there is untimely death."

"Wonderful, venerable Nāgasena, marvellous, venerable Nāgasena, the reason has been well shown, the simile has been well shown for the illustration of untimely death. 'There is untimely death' has been made clear, made obvious, made manifest. Even a person without mental distraction, venerable Nāgasena, would come to the conclusion by even one simile that 'there is untimely death,' how much more a

person with consciousness? I was convinced, venerable sir, by the very first simile that 'there is untimely death,' but wishing to hear further explanations, I did not accept it."

The question on untimely death is the sixth.

7. The Question on the Wonder of the Shrine

7. "Venerable Nāgasena, do miracles occur at the shrines of all those who have attained final Nibbāna, or only of some?" "Of some, great king, they occur, of some they do not occur." "Of which, venerable sir, do they occur, of which do they not occur?" "Great king, by the determination of any one of three, miracles occur at the shrine of one who has attained final Nibbāna. Which three? Here, great king, a Worthy One, out of compassion for gods and humans, while still living, determines: 'May miracles occur at such-and-such a shrine'; by the power of his determination, miracles occur at the shrine. Thus, by the power of a Worthy One's determination, miracles occur at the shrine of one who has attained final Nibbāna.

"Furthermore, great king, deities, out of compassion for humans, display miracles at the shrine of one who has attained final Nibbāna, thinking: 'By this miracle, the Good Teaching will be constantly upheld, and humans, being devoted, will increase in wholesomeness.' Thus, by the power of the deities' determination, miracles occur at the shrine of one who has attained final Nibbāna.

"Furthermore, great king, a woman or a man who is faithful, devoted, wise, experienced, intelligent, endowed with higher intelligence, having wisely considered, having determined upon fragrance or a garland or cloth or something else, offers it at the shrine, thinking: 'May it be thus.' By the power of that one's determination too, miracles occur at the shrine of one who has attained final Nibbāna. Thus, by the power of humans' determination, miracles occur at the shrine of one who has attained final Nibbāna.

"Indeed, great king, by the power of the determination of any one of these three, miracles occur at the shrine of one who has attained final Nibbāna.

"If, great king, there is no determination by them, miracles do not occur at the shrine even of one who has eliminated the mental corruptions, who possesses the six higher knowledges, who has attained mastery of mind. Even when there is no miracle, great king, having seen the completely pure conduct, one should have confidence, one should come to a conclusion, one should believe: 'This son of the Buddha has well attained final Nibbāna.'" "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on the wonder of the shrine is the seventh.

8. The Question on the Full realisation of the Teaching

8. "Venerable Nāgasena, for those who proceed rightly, is there full realisation of the teaching for all of them, or is there not for some?" "For some, great king, there is, for some there is not." "For whom, venerable sir, is there, for whom is there not?" "For one gone to the animal realm, great king, even if practising well, there is no full realisation of the teaching; for one reborn in the sphere of ghosts, etc. for one holding wrong view, etc. for a cheat, etc. for a matricide, etc. for a patricide, etc. for a killer of

an arahant, etc. for a schismatic, etc. for one who wounds, etc. for one who is in communion by theft, etc. for one gone over to other sects, etc. for a seducer of nuns, etc. for one who, having committed any one of the thirteen heavy offences, has not risen from it, etc. for a eunuch, etc. for a hermaphrodite, even if practising well, there is no full realisation of the teaching, etc. Also for a young human being less than seven years old, even if practising well, there is no full realisation of the teaching. For these sixteen persons, great king, even if practising well, there is no full realisation of the teaching."

"Venerable Nāgasena, those fifteen persons are indeed opposed; whether there is or is not full realisation of the teaching for them, then for what reason is there no full realisation of the teaching for a young human being less than seven years old, even if practising well? Here first there is a question: 'Is it not so that for a young one there is no lust, there is no hate, there is no delusion, there is no conceit, there is no wrong view, there is no discontent, there is no sensual thought, unmixed with mental defilements; that young one, being fit and ready and deserving, should penetrate the four truths with a single penetration?'"

"That itself, great king, is the reason by which reason I say 'for one less than seven years old, even if practising well, there is no full realisation of the teaching.' If, great king, one less than seven years old would find pleasure in what is enticing, would become corrupted towards what leads to hate, would become deluded towards what leads to infatuation, would become intoxicated towards what is intoxicating, would cognise view, would cognise delight and discontent, would think about the wholesome and unwholesome, there would be full realisation of the teaching for him. But, great king, the mind of one less than seven years old is weak, feeble, limited, small, slight, dull, obscure; the unconditioned element of Nibbāna is heavy, weighty, extensive, great. One less than seven years old, great king, with that feeble, limited, dull, obscure mind, is not able to penetrate the heavy, weighty, extensive, great, unconditioned element of Nibbāna.

"Just as, great king, Sineru, the king of mountains, is heavy, weighty, extensive, great - could, great king, a man by his own natural strength and power and energy lift up Sineru, the king of mountains?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "For what reason, great king?" "Because of the weakness, venerable sir, of the man, because of the greatness of Sineru, the king of mountains." "Just so indeed, great king, the mind of one less than seven years old is weak, feeble, limited, small, slight, dull, obscure; the unconditioned element of Nibbāna is heavy, weighty, extensive, great. One less than seven years old, with that feeble, limited, dull, obscure mind, is not able to penetrate the heavy, weighty, extensive, great, unconditioned element of Nibbāna; for that reason, for one less than seven years old, even if practising well, there is no full realisation of the teaching.

"Or else, great king, this great earth is long, extended, broad, spread out, extensive, wide, vast, and great. Is it possible, great king, to make that great earth into watery mud by moistening it with a small drop of water?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "For what reason, great king?" "Because of the smallness, venerable sir, of the drop of water, and because of the greatness of the great earth." Just so indeed, great king, the mind of one less than seven years old is weak, feeble, limited, small, slight, dull, and obscure, while the unconditioned element of Nibbāna is long, extended, broad,

spread out, extensive, wide, vast, and great. One less than seven years old, with that feeble mind, limited, dull, and obscure, is not able to penetrate the great unconditioned element of Nibbāna; for that reason, even for one less than seven years old who practises well, there is no full realisation of the teaching.

"Or else, great king, if there were a fire that is weak, feeble, limited, small, slight, and dull, would it be possible, great king, with that much dull fire to dispel the darkness in the world with its gods and show light?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "For what reason, great king?" "Because of the dullness, venerable sir, of the fire, and because of the greatness of the world." Just so indeed, great king, the mind of one less than seven years old is weak, feeble, limited, small, slight, dull, and obscure, and is covered by the great darkness of ignorance. Therefore it is difficult to show the light of knowledge; for that reason, even for one less than seven years old who practises well, there is no full realisation of the teaching.

"Or else, great king, if a sick, emaciated worm with a minute and limited body, having seen a large bull elephant in three-fold rut, nine cubits long, three cubits wide, ten cubits in circumference, eight cubits high, having reached its own place, were to try to swallow it, would that worm, great king, be able to swallow that large bull elephant?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "For what reason, great king?" "Because of the smallness, venerable sir, of the worm, and because of the greatness of the large bull elephant." Just so indeed, great king, the mind of one less than seven years old is weak, feeble, limited, small, slight, dull, and obscure, while the unconditioned element of Nibbāna is great. He, with that feeble mind, limited, dull, and obscure, is not able to penetrate the great unconditioned element of Nibbāna; for that reason, even for one less than seven years old who practises well, there is no full realisation of the teaching." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on the full realisation of the teaching is the eighth.

9. The Question on Nibbāna as Exclusively Pleasant

9. "Venerable Nāgasena, is Nibbāna exclusively pleasant, or is it mixed with suffering?" "Nibbāna, great king, is exclusively pleasant, not mixed with suffering."

"We do not believe that statement, venerable Nāgasena, 'Nibbāna is exclusively pleasant'; thus here we, venerable Nāgasena, conclude 'Nibbāna is mixed with suffering', and here we find a reason 'Nibbāna is mixed with suffering'. What is the reason here? Those who, venerable Nāgasena, seek Nibbāna, for them is seen ardour and torment of body and mind, restraint in standing, walking, sitting, lying down and food, and obstruction of torpor, and oppression of the sense bases, and abandoning of wealth, grain, dear ones, relatives and friends. Whoever in the world are happy, devoted to happiness, all of them delight and develop the sense bases with the five types of sensual pleasure; they delight and develop the eye with forms of many kinds of beautiful signs, pleasing and displeasing; they delight and develop the ear with sounds of many kinds of beautiful signs, pleasing and displeasing, of song and music; they delight and develop the nose with odours of many kinds of beautiful signs, pleasing and displeasing, of flowers, fruits, leaves, bark, roots and heartwood; they delight and develop the tongue with flavours of many kinds of beautiful signs, pleasing and displeasing, of hard food, soft food, food to be licked, food to be drunk

and food to be tasted; they delight and develop the body with contacts of many kinds of beautiful signs, pleasing and displeasing, smooth, subtle, soft and gentle; they delight and develop the mind with attention of many kinds of applied thought, pleasing and displeasing, good and bad, beautiful and ugly. You strike and injure, cut and cut off, obstruct and block that development of eye, ear, nose, tongue, body and mind. By that the body is tormented, the mind too is tormented; when the body is tormented, one feels bodily painful feeling; when the mind is tormented, one feels mental painful feeling. Did not the wandering ascetic Māgaṇḍiya too, censuring the Blessed One, say thus: 'The ascetic Gotama is a destroyer of growth'? This is the reason here, by which reason I say 'Nibbāna is mixed with suffering.'

"No indeed, great king, Nibbāna is not mixed with suffering; Nibbāna is exclusively pleasant. But as for what you, great king, say 'Nibbāna is suffering', that suffering is not called Nibbāna; rather this is the preliminary part for the realisation of Nibbāna, this is the quest for Nibbāna; Nibbāna is indeed exclusively pleasant, great king, not mixed with suffering. I will tell the reason here. Is there, great king, for kings something called the happiness of kingship?" "Yes, venerable sir, there is for kings the happiness of kingship." "Is that happiness of kingship, great king, mixed with suffering?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "But why then, great king, do kings, when the borderland is agitated, for the restraint of those dwelling in the borderland, surrounded by ministers, leaders, soldiers and army members, having gone abroad, afflicted by gadflies, mosquitoes, wind and heat, run about on even and uneven ground, and make great war, and reach danger to life?" "That, venerable Nāgasena, is not called the happiness of kingship; this is the preliminary part for the quest of the happiness of kingship. With suffering, venerable Nāgasena, kings, having sought kingship, experience the happiness of kingship. Thus, venerable Nāgasena, the happiness of kingship is not mixed with suffering; that happiness of kingship is one thing, suffering is another." "Just so indeed, great king, Nibbāna is exclusively pleasant, not mixed with suffering. But those who seek that Nibbāna, having tormented body and mind, having restrained standing, walking, sitting, lying down and food, having obstructed torpor, having oppressed the sense bases, having abandoned body and life, having sought Nibbāna with suffering, experience Nibbāna which is exclusively pleasant, like kings who experience the happiness of kingship after defeating their enemies. Thus, great king, Nibbāna is exclusively pleasant, not mixed with suffering; Nibbāna is one thing, suffering is another."

"Furthermore, great king, listen to a further reason that Nibbāna is exclusively pleasant, not mixed with suffering; suffering is one thing, Nibbāna is another. Is there, great king, for teachers who possess craft something called the happiness of craft?" "Yes, venerable sir, there is for teachers who possess craft the happiness of craft." "Is that happiness of craft, great king, mixed with suffering?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "But why then, great king, do teachers, by paying respect and rising up for teachers, by bringing water, sweeping the house, providing tooth-sticks and water for the mouth, by receiving leftovers, by rubbing, bathing and attending to the feet, having set aside their own mind, by following another's mind, by uncomfortable sleeping, by irregular food, torment the body?" "That, venerable Nāgasena, is not called the happiness of craft; this is the preliminary part for the quest of craft. With suffering, venerable Nāgasena, teachers, having sought craft, experience the happiness of craft. Thus, venerable Nāgasena, the happiness of craft is not mixed with suffering;

that happiness of craft is one thing, suffering is another." "Just so indeed, great king, Nibbāna is exclusively pleasant, not mixed with suffering. But those who seek that Nibbāna, having tormented body and mind, having restrained standing, walking, sitting, lying down and food, having obstructed torpor, having oppressed the sense bases, having abandoned body and life, having sought Nibbāna with suffering, experience Nibbāna which is exclusively pleasant, like teachers the happiness of craft. Thus, great king, Nibbāna is exclusively pleasant, not mixed with suffering; suffering is one thing, Nibbāna is another." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on Nibbāna as exclusively pleasant is the ninth.

10. The Question on the Form and Shape of Nibbāna

10. "Venerable Nāgasena, as for what you say 'Nibbāna, Nibbāna', but is it possible to show the form or shape or passing away or measure of that Nibbāna by simile or by reason or by cause or by method?" "Nibbāna is without counterpart, great king; it is not possible to show the form or shape or passing away or measure of Nibbāna by simile or by reason or by cause or by method." "This I do not accept, Venerable Nāgasena, that there is no declaration of the form or shape or passing away or measure of Nibbāna, which is an existing phenomenon, by simile or by reason or by cause or by method; convince me by a reason." "Let it be so, great king, I will convince you by a reason. Is there, great king, what is called the great ocean?" "Yes, venerable sir, there is that great ocean." "If, great king, someone were to ask you thus: 'How much, great king, is the water in the great ocean, and how many are those beings who dwell in the great ocean?' - thus asked, great king, how would you answer him?" "If, venerable sir, someone were to ask me thus: 'How much, great king, is the water in the great ocean, and how many are those beings who dwell in the great ocean?' - I, venerable sir, would say thus to him: 'You ask me, my good man, what should not be asked; this question should not be asked by anyone; this question should be set aside. The great ocean has not been analysed by those who describe the world; it is not possible to measure the water in the great ocean or the beings who have come to dwell there' - thus, venerable sir, I would give him an answer."

"But why, great king, would you give such an answer about the great ocean, which is an existing phenomenon? Should it not be told to him after calculating: 'This much is the water in the great ocean, and this many beings dwell in the great ocean'?" "It is not possible, venerable sir; this question is outside the domain."

"Just as, great king, in the great ocean, which is indeed an existing phenomenon, it is not possible to calculate the water or the beings who have come to dwell there, just so indeed, great king, it is not possible to show the form or shape or passing away or measure of Nibbāna, which is indeed an existing phenomenon, by simile or by reason or by cause or by method. One possessing supernormal power, having attained mastery of mind, great king, might calculate the water in the great ocean and the beings dwelling there, but even that one possessing supernormal power, having attained mastery of mind, would not be able to show the form or shape or passing away or measure of Nibbāna by simile or by reason or by cause or by method."

"Furthermore, great king, listen to a further reason why it is not possible to show the form or shape or passing away or measure of Nibbāna, which is indeed an existing phenomenon, by simile or by reason or by cause or by method. Are there, great king, among the gods, gods called immaterial-bodied?" "Yes, venerable sir, it is heard: 'There are among the gods, gods called immaterial-bodied.'" "But is it possible, great king, to show the form or shape or passing away or measure of those immaterial-bodied gods by simile or by reason or by cause or by method?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Well then, great king, are there no immaterial-bodied gods?" "There are, venerable sir, immaterial-bodied gods, but it is not possible to show their form or shape or passing away or measure by simile or by reason or by cause or by method." "Just as, great king, it is not possible to show the form or shape or passing away or measure of the immaterial-bodied gods, who are indeed existing beings, by simile or by reason or by cause or by method, just so indeed, great king, it is not possible to show the form or shape or passing away or measure of Nibbāna, which is indeed an existing phenomenon, by simile or by reason or by cause or by method."

"Venerable Nāgasena, let Nibbāna be exclusively happiness, but it is not possible to show its matter or shape or passing away or measure by simile or by reason or by cause or by method. But is there, venerable sir, any simile and comparison whatsoever that has entered into the quality of Nibbāna from other things?" "In terms of its own form, great king, there is not, but in terms of quality it is possible to show some simile and comparison." "Excellent, venerable Nāgasena, in such a way that I may obtain even a partial illustration of the quality of Nibbāna, speak quickly thus, quench the fever of my heart, remove it with the breeze of cool and sweet words."

"One quality of the lotus, great king, has entered into Nibbāna, two qualities of water, three qualities of medicine, four qualities of the great ocean, five qualities of food, ten qualities of space, three qualities of the jewel gem, three qualities of red sandalwood, three qualities of the cream of ghee, five qualities of a mountain peak have entered into Nibbāna."

"Venerable Nāgasena, when you say 'one quality of the lotus has entered into Nibbāna', what is the one quality of the lotus that has entered into Nibbāna?" "Just as, great king, a lotus is untainted by water, even so, great king, Nibbāna is untainted by all mental defilements. This, great king, is the one quality of the lotus that has entered into Nibbāna."

"Venerable Nāgasena, when you say 'two qualities of water have entered into Nibbāna', what are the two qualities of water that have entered into Nibbāna?" "Just as, great king, water is cool and quenches fever, even so, great king, Nibbāna is cool and quenches the fever of all mental defilements. This, great king, is the first quality of water that has entered into Nibbāna. Furthermore, great king, water removes the thirst of people and cattle and offspring who are weary, parched, thirsty, and scorched by heat, even so, great king, Nibbāna removes the thirst of sensual craving, craving for existence, and craving for non-existence. This, great king, is the second quality of water that has entered into Nibbāna. These, great king, are the two qualities of water that have entered into Nibbāna."

"Venerable Nāgasena, when you say 'three qualities of medicine have entered into Nibbāna', what are the three qualities of medicine that have entered into Nibbāna?" "Just as, great king, medicine is a refuge for beings oppressed by poison, even so, great king, Nibbāna is a refuge for beings oppressed by the poison of mental defilements. This, great king, is the first quality of medicine that has entered into Nibbāna. Furthermore, great king, medicine puts an end to diseases, even so, great king, Nibbāna puts an end to all suffering. This, great king, is the second quality of medicine that has entered into Nibbāna. Furthermore, great king, medicine is the Deathless, even so, great king, Nibbāna is the Deathless. This, great king, is the third quality of medicine that has entered into Nibbāna. These, great king, are the three qualities of medicine that have entered into Nibbāna."

"Venerable Nāgasena, when you say 'four qualities of the great ocean have entered into Nibbāna', what are the four qualities of the great ocean that have entered into Nibbāna?" "Just as, great king, the great ocean is empty of all corpses, even so, great king, Nibbāna is empty of all corpses of mental defilements. This, great king, is the first quality of the great ocean that has entered into Nibbāna. Furthermore, great king, the great ocean is great, without a near or far shore, and is not filled by all rivers, even so, great king, Nibbāna is great, without a near or far shore, and is not filled by all beings. This, great king, is the second quality of the great ocean that has entered into Nibbāna. Furthermore, great king, the great ocean is the residence of great beings, even so, great king, Nibbāna is the residence of great Worthy Ones, great beings who are stainless, who have eliminated the mental corruptions, who have attained power, and who have become masters. This, great king, is the third quality of the great ocean that has entered into Nibbāna. Furthermore, great king, the great ocean is bedecked with the flowers of limitless, various, and extensive waves, even so, great king, Nibbāna is bedecked with the flowers of limitless, various, extensive, pure true knowledge and liberation. This, great king, is the fourth quality of the great ocean that has entered into Nibbāna. These, great king, are the four qualities of the great ocean that have entered into Nibbāna."

"Venerable Nāgasena, when you say 'five qualities of food have entered into Nibbāna', what are the five qualities of food that have entered into Nibbāna?" "Just as, great king, food sustains the life of all beings, even so, great king, Nibbāna when realised sustains life through the removal of ageing and death. This, great king, is the first quality of food that has entered into Nibbāna. Furthermore, great king, food increases the strength of all beings, even so, great king, Nibbāna when realised increases the supernormal power of all beings. This, great king, is the second quality of food that has entered into Nibbāna. Furthermore, great king, food produces beauty in all beings, even so, great king, Nibbāna when realised produces the beauty of virtues in all beings. This, great king, is the third quality of food that has entered into Nibbāna. Furthermore, great king, food appeases the disturbance of all beings, even so, great king, Nibbāna when realised appeases the disturbance of all mental defilements in all beings. This, great king, is the fourth quality of food that has entered into Nibbāna. Furthermore, great king, food removes the hunger and weakness of all beings, even so, great king, Nibbāna when realised removes the hunger and weakness of all suffering in all beings. This, great king, is the fifth quality of food that has entered into Nibbāna. These, great king, are the five qualities of food that have entered into Nibbāna."

"Venerable Nāgasena, as for this that you say 'ten qualities of space have entered into Nibbāna', what are the ten qualities of space that have entered into Nibbāna?" "Just as, great king, space is not born, does not age, does not die, does not pass away, does not arise, is difficult to overcome, cannot be taken by thieves, is independent, is the path of birds, is unobstructed, is infinite. Just so indeed, great king, Nibbāna is not born, does not age, does not die, does not pass away, does not arise, is difficult to overcome, cannot be taken by thieves, is independent, is the path of the noble ones, is unobstructed, is infinite. These, great king, are the ten qualities of space that have entered into Nibbāna."

"Venerable Nāgasena, as for this that you say 'three qualities of the jewel gem have entered into Nibbāna', what are the three qualities of the jewel gem that have entered into Nibbāna?" "Just as, great king, the jewel gem grants desires, just so indeed, great king, Nibbāna grants desires. This, great king, is the first quality of the jewel gem that has entered into Nibbāna. Furthermore, great king, the jewel gem brings delight, just so indeed, great king, Nibbāna brings delight. This, great king, is the second quality of the jewel gem that has entered into Nibbāna. Furthermore, great king, the jewel gem produces radiance, just so indeed, great king, Nibbāna produces radiance. This, great king, is the third quality of the jewel gem that has entered into Nibbāna. These, great king, are the three qualities of the jewel gem that have entered into Nibbāna."

"Venerable Nāgasena, as for this that you say 'three qualities of red sandalwood have entered into Nibbāna', what are the three qualities of red sandalwood that have entered into Nibbāna?" "Just as, great king, red sandalwood is rare, just so indeed, great king, Nibbāna is rare. This, great king, is the first quality of red sandalwood that has entered into Nibbāna. Furthermore, great king, red sandalwood has an incomparable fragrance, just so indeed, great king, Nibbāna has an incomparable fragrance. This, great king, is the second quality of red sandalwood that has entered into Nibbāna. Furthermore, great king, red sandalwood is praised by good people, just so indeed, great king, Nibbāna is praised by noble good people. This, great king, is the third quality of red sandalwood that has entered into Nibbāna. These, great king, are the three qualities of red sandalwood that have entered into Nibbāna."

"Venerable Nāgasena, as for this that you say 'three qualities of the cream of ghee have entered into Nibbāna', what are the three qualities of the cream of ghee that have entered into Nibbāna?" "Just as, great king, the cream of ghee is endowed with colour, just so indeed, great king, Nibbāna is endowed with the colour of virtues. This, great king, is the first quality of the cream of ghee that has entered into Nibbāna. Furthermore, great king, the cream of ghee is endowed with fragrance, just so indeed, great king, Nibbāna is endowed with the fragrance of morality. This, great king, is the second quality of the cream of ghee that has entered into Nibbāna. Furthermore, great king, the cream of ghee is endowed with flavour, just so indeed, great king, Nibbāna is endowed with flavour. This, great king, is the third quality of the cream of ghee that has entered into Nibbāna. These, great king, are the three qualities of the cream of ghee that have entered into Nibbāna."

"Venerable Nāgasena, as for this that you say 'five qualities of a mountain peak have entered into Nibbāna', what are the five qualities of a mountain peak that have entered into Nibbāna?" "Just as, great king, a mountain peak is very lofty, just so

indeed, great king, Nibbāna is very lofty. This, great king, is the first quality of a mountain peak that has entered into Nibbāna. Furthermore, great king, a mountain peak is immovable, just so indeed, great king, Nibbāna is immovable. This, great king, is the second quality of a mountain peak that has entered into Nibbāna. Furthermore, great king, a mountain peak is difficult to climb, just so indeed, great king, Nibbāna is difficult to climb for all defilements. This, great king, is the third quality of a mountain peak that has entered into Nibbāna. Furthermore, great king, a mountain peak is a place where no seeds grow, just so indeed, great king, Nibbāna is a place where no defilements grow. This, great king, is the fourth quality of a mountain peak that has entered into Nibbāna. Furthermore, great king, a mountain peak is free from attachment and aversion, just so indeed, great king, Nibbāna is free from attachment and aversion. This, great king, is the fifth quality of a mountain peak that has entered into Nibbāna. These, great king, are the five qualities of a mountain peak that have entered into Nibbāna." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on the form and shape of Nibbāna is the tenth.

11. The Question on the realisation of Nibbāna

11. "Venerable Nāgasena, you say 'Nibbāna is not past, not future, not present, not arisen, not unarisen, not to be produced.' Here, Venerable Nāgasena, whoever is rightly practising realises Nibbāna, does he realise what is arisen, or does he realise having produced it?" "Whoever, great king, is rightly practising realises Nibbāna, he does not realise what is arisen, he does not realise having produced it; but moreover, great king, there is this element of Nibbāna, which one rightly practising realises."

"Do not, Venerable Nāgasena, explain this question having made it concealed; having made it opened and manifest, explain it. I am desirous and eager; whatever has been trained by you, scatter all that right here. Here this person is confused, has become doubtful, has plunged into uncertainty; break this inner dart of fault." "There is, great king, this element of Nibbāna, peaceful, pleasant, sublime; one rightly practising, meditating on activities according to the Conqueror's instruction, realises it with wisdom. Just as, great king, a pupil realises true knowledge with wisdom according to the teacher's instruction, just so indeed, great king, one rightly practising realises Nibbāna with wisdom according to the Conqueror's instruction.

"But how should that Nibbāna be seen?" It should be seen as free from affliction, free from danger, free from fear, as security, as peaceful, as pleasant, as comfortable, as sublime, as pure, as cool.

"Just as, great king, a man being burnt by fire with a large heap of firewood, blazing with burning wood, by effort having freed himself from there, having entered a place free from fire, would obtain the highest happiness there; just so indeed, great king, whoever is rightly practising, by wise attention realises the highest happiness of Nibbāna, free from the torment of the threefold fire. Just as, great king, fire, so should the threefold fire be seen; just as a man gone into fire, so should one rightly practising be seen; just as a place free from fire, so should Nibbāna be seen.

"Or else, great king, just as a man gone into a heap of portions of bodily secretions of corpses of snakes, dogs, and humans, having entered among the tangled mass of corpses, by effort having freed himself from there, having entered a place free from

corpses, would obtain the highest happiness there; just so indeed, great king, whoever is rightly practising, by wise attention realises the highest happiness of Nibbāna, free from the corpse of mental defilements. Just as, great king, a corpse, so should the five types of sensual pleasure be seen; just as a man gone into corpses, so should one rightly practising be seen; just as a place free from corpses, so should Nibbāna be seen.

"Or else, great king, just as a man frightened, trembling, shaking, with mind perverted and confused, by effort having freed himself from there, having entered a firm, stable, unshakeable, fearless place, would obtain the highest happiness there; just so indeed, great king, whoever is rightly practising, by wise attention realises the highest happiness of Nibbāna, free from fear and terror. Just as, great king, fear, so should the fear that occurs again and again dependent on birth, ageing, illness, and death be seen; just as a frightened man, so should one rightly practising be seen; just as a fearless place, so should Nibbāna be seen.

"Or else, great king, just as a man fallen in a defiled, dirty, muddy, miry place, by effort having washed away that mud and mire, having gone to a pure, spotless place, would obtain the highest happiness there; just so indeed, great king, whoever is rightly practising, by wise attention realises the highest happiness of Nibbāna, free from the mire of defilement and stain. Just as, great king, mud, so should material gain, honour, and fame be seen; just as a man gone into mud, so should one rightly practising be seen; just as a pure, spotless place, so should Nibbāna be seen.

"But how does one rightly practising realise that Nibbāna? Whoever, great king, is rightly practising, he meditates on the occurrence of activities. Meditating on the occurrence, therein he sees birth, he sees ageing, he sees illness, he sees death; therein he sees nothing of happiness or comfort, from the beginning, from the middle, or from the end. Therein he sees nothing fit to be grasped. Just as, great king, a man sees no place fit to be grasped from the beginning, from the middle, or from the end in an iron ball heated by the day, blazing, heated, glowing; just so indeed, great king, whoever meditates on the occurrence of activities, meditating on the occurrence, therein he sees birth, he sees ageing, he sees illness, he sees death; therein he sees nothing of happiness or comfort, from the beginning, from the middle, or from the end. Therein he sees nothing fit to be grasped; for him not seeing anything fit to be grasped, discontent becomes established in the mind, burning enters the body; he, without shelter, without refuge, having become without refuge, becomes disenchanted with existences.

"Just as, great king, a man might enter a blazing mass of flames, a great mass of fire, and there, without shelter, without refuge, having become without refuge, he would become disenchanted with the fire, just so indeed, great king, for one not seeing anything fit to be grasped, discontent becomes established in the mind, burning comes upon the body, and he, without shelter, without refuge, having become without refuge, becomes disenchanted with existences.

"For him who sees danger in occurrence, such a thought arises: 'This occurrence is indeed heated, ablaze, with much suffering, with much anguish. If anyone could obtain non-occurrence, this is peaceful, this is sublime, that is to say, the stilling of all

activities, the relinquishment of all clinging, the elimination of craving, dispassion, cessation, Nibbāna.' Thus indeed his mind springs forward to non-occurrence, becomes clear, becomes joyful, becomes satisfied: 'I have attained the escape.'

"Just as, great king, a man who has lost his way, having strayed into a foreign land, having seen the way out, springs forward there, becomes clear, becomes joyful, becomes satisfied: 'I have attained the way out,' just so indeed, great king, for one who sees danger in occurrence, the mind springs forward to non-occurrence, becomes clear, becomes joyful, becomes satisfied: 'I have attained the escape.'

"He strives for the path for the purpose of non-occurrence, seeks it, develops it, cultivates it. For him, mindfulness becomes established for that purpose, energy becomes established for that purpose, joy becomes established for that purpose. For him, attending again and again to that mind, having transcended occurrence, he enters non-occurrence. Having attained non-occurrence, great king, one practising rightly is said to 'realise Nibbāna.'" "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on the realisation of Nibbāna is the eleventh.

12. The Question on the Location of Nibbāna

12. "Venerable Nāgasena, is there that place in the eastern direction or the southern direction or the western direction or the northern direction or above or below or across, where Nibbāna is placed?" "There is not, great king, that place in the eastern direction or the southern direction or the western direction or the northern direction or above or below or across, where Nibbāna is placed."

"If, Venerable Nāgasena, there is no place where Nibbāna is placed, then there is no Nibbāna? And for those by whom that Nibbāna has been realised, their realisation too is wrong. I will state the reason there. Just as, Venerable Nāgasena, there is a field on earth as a source of grain, there is a flower as a source of fragrance, there is a bush as a source of flowers, there is a tree as a source of fruit, there is a mine as a source of jewels - whoever there desires whatever, he, having gone there, takes that very thing - just so indeed, Venerable Nāgasena, if there is Nibbāna, a place of origin for that Nibbāna should also be expected. But because, Venerable Nāgasena, there is no place of origin for Nibbāna, therefore I say there is no Nibbāna, and for those by whom Nibbāna has been realised, their realisation too is wrong."

"There is not, great king, a place where Nibbāna is placed, yet there is this Nibbāna; one rightly practising by wise attention realises Nibbāna. Just as, great king, there is what is called fire, there is no place where it is placed, but by rubbing two sticks together one attains fire. Just so indeed, great king, there is Nibbāna, there is no place where it is placed; one rightly practising by wise attention realises Nibbāna.

"Or else, great king, there are what are called the seven treasures. As follows: the wheel treasure, the elephant treasure, the horse treasure, the jewel treasure, the woman treasure, the householder treasure, and the adviser treasure. And there is no place where those treasures are placed, but by the power of practice they approach a

warrior of the warrior caste who is rightly practising. Just so indeed, great king, there is Nibbāna, there is no place where it is placed; one rightly practising by wise attention realises Nibbāna."

"Venerable Nāgasena, let there not be a place where Nibbāna is placed, but is there that state where one standing, rightly practising, realises Nibbāna?" "Yes, great king, there is that state where one standing, rightly practising, realises Nibbāna."

"But what, venerable sir, is that state where one standing, rightly practising, realises Nibbāna?" "Morality, great king, is the state; one established in morality, wisely attending, standing in the forest of the Sakas or in China or in Alexandria or in Nikumba or in Kāsi-Kosala or in Kashmir or in Gandhāra or on a mountain peak or in the Brahma world or wherever at all, rightly practising, realises Nibbāna. Just as, great king, whoever is a man with eyes, standing in the forest of the Sakas or in China or in Alexandria or in Nikumba or in Kāsi-Kosala or in Kashmir or in Gandhāra or on a mountain peak or in the Brahma world or wherever at all, sees space; just so indeed, great king, one established in morality, wisely attending, in the forest of the Sakas, etc. standing wherever at all, rightly practising, realises Nibbāna."

"Or else, great king, in the forest of the Sakas, etc. for one standing wherever at all, there is the eastern direction; just so indeed, great king, for one established in morality, wisely attending, in the forest of the Sakas, etc. for one standing wherever at all, rightly practising, there is the realisation of Nibbāna." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, Nibbāna has been taught by you, the realisation of Nibbāna has been taught, the virtues of morality have been equipped, right practice has been shown, the banner of the Teaching has been raised, the guideline of the Teaching has been established, the right exertion of those well-applied is not barren; thus I accept this as true, O most excellent of excellent teachers."

The question on the location of Nibbāna is the twelfth.

The Vessantara Chapter is the third.

In this chapter there are twelve questions.

4. The Chapter on Inference

1. The Question of Inference

1. Then King Milinda approached the Venerable Nāgasena; having approached, having paid respect to the Venerable Nāgasena, he sat down to one side. Seated to one side, King Milinda, wishing to know, wishing to hear, wishing to retain, wishing to see the light of knowledge, wishing to break through not knowing, wishing to produce the light of knowledge, wishing to remove the darkness of ignorance, having established exceeding courage and endeavour and mindfulness and full awareness, said this to the Venerable Nāgasena: "Venerable Nāgasena, has the Buddha been seen by you?" "No indeed, great king." "Then has the Buddha been seen by your teachers?" "No indeed, great king." "Venerable Nāgasena, it seems the Buddha has not been seen by you, nor it seems has the Buddha been seen by your teachers; well then, Venerable Nāgasena, there is no Buddha, for here no Buddha is evident."

"But are there, great king, former warriors who were the forerunners of your warrior lineage?" "Yes, venerable sir. What doubt is there? There are former warriors who were the forerunners of my warrior lineage." "Have the former warriors been previously seen by you, great king?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "But those who instruct you, great king - chaplains, generals, judges, chief ministers - have the former warriors been previously seen by them?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "If, great king, the former warriors have not been seen by you, nor it seems have the former warriors been seen by your instructors, well then, there are no former warriors, for here no former warriors are evident."

"There are seen, Venerable Nāgasena, articles of use enjoyed by the former warriors. As follows: the white parasol, the turban, the sandals, the yak-tail fan, the sword-jewel, and very costly beds. By which we would know and believe: 'There are former warriors.'" "Just so indeed, great king, we too would know and believe in that Blessed One. There is that reason, by which reason we would know and believe: 'There is that Blessed One.' What is that reason? There are indeed, great king, articles of use enjoyed by that Blessed One, who knows and sees, the Worthy One, the Perfectly Enlightened One. As follows: the four establishments of mindfulness, the four right strivings, the four bases for spiritual power, the five faculties, the five powers, the seven factors of enlightenment, the noble eightfold path - by which the world with its gods knows and believes: 'There is that Blessed One.' By this reason, great king, by this cause, by this method, by this inference, it should be known: 'There is that Blessed One.'

'Having helped many people cross over, quenched in the extinction of clinging; By inference it should be known: there is that best of bipeds.'"

"Venerable Nāgasena, give a simile." "Just as, great king, a city builder, wishing to build a city, first having surveyed a piece of land that is level, neither elevated nor depressed, without gravel and stones, free from danger and faultless, delightful, whatever therein is uneven, having had that made level, having had stumps and thorns cleared away, might build there a city - beautiful, well-divided, measured in sections, with excavated moats and walls, with strong gateways, watchtowers and porches, with many courtyards, crossroads, junctions and intersections, with clean, level, smooth royal highways, with well-divided market places, endowed with parks, pleasure groves, lakes, lotus ponds and wells, adorned with various kinds of shrines, free from all faults - and he, when that city had attained full expansion in every way, might depart to another region; then that city at a later time might become successful, prosperous, with abundant food, secure, flourishing, safe, free from harm, free from danger, crowded with various people - many warriors, brahmins, merchants, workers, elephant riders, horse riders, charioteers, infantry soldiers, archers, swordsmen, standard-bearers, camp marshals, food distributors, fierce warrior princes, charging warriors, great warriors, heroes, armoured warriors, soldiers, sons of slave women, sons of soldiers, wrestlers, accountants, cooks, chefs, barbers, bath attendants, turners, garland-makers, goldsmiths, silversmiths, lead workers, tin workers, copper workers, lathe workers, iron workers, gem-cutters, weavers, potters, bamboo workers, salt makers, tanners, chariot-makers, ivory workers, rope-makers, brush-makers, thread-makers, reed workers, bow-makers, bowstring-makers, arrow-makers, painters, dyers, washermen, loom weavers, tailors,

money-changers, cloth dealers, perfumers, grass-carriers, wood-carriers, hired servants, leaf-sellers, fruit-sellers, root-sellers, rice-gruel sellers, cake-sellers, fish-sellers, meat-sellers, liquor-sellers, performers, dancers, acrobats, magicians, vetāla performers, wrestlers, corpse-burners, rubbish removers, basket-makers, hunters, courtesans, dancing girls, water-carrying slave women, Sakas, Greeks, Chinese, Vilātas, Ujjenikas, Bhārukacchakas, Kāsis, Kosalans, Parantakas, Magadhans, Sāketans, Soreyyans, Pāveyyans, Koṭumbarans, Mathurans, Alasandans, Kasmīrans, Gandhārans - people from various regions having come to that city to dwell, having seen that city, new, well-divided, without fault, faultless, delightful, they know by inference: 'Skilled indeed, friend, is that city builder who is the builder of this city.' Just so indeed, great king, that Blessed One is matchless, equal to the matchless, without equal, incomparable, unequalled, incalculable, immeasurable, boundless, of immeasurable virtue, having attained the perfection of virtues, of infinite courage, of infinite radiance, of infinite energy, of infinite power, having gone to the perfection of the Buddha's powers, having defeated Māra with his army, having broken through the net of wrong views, having dispelled ignorance, having produced true knowledge, having held aloft the torch of the Teaching, having attained omniscience, victorious in battle, established the city of the Teaching.

The Blessed One's city of the Teaching, great king, has morality as its wall, shame as its moat, knowledge as its gateway porch, energy as its watchtower, faith as its pillar, mindfulness as its doorkeeper, wisdom as its palace, the discourses as its courtyard, the higher teaching as its crossroads, the discipline as its judgment hall, the establishments of mindfulness as its street. And in that street of the establishments of mindfulness, great king, such shops are spread out. As follows: the flower shop, the perfume shop, the fruit shop, the medicine shop, the herb shop, the deathless shop, the jewel shop, the general shop."

"Venerable Nāgasena, what is the flower shop of the Buddha, the Blessed One?"

"There are indeed, great king, classifications of objects declared by that Blessed One, who knows and sees, the Worthy One, the Perfectly Enlightened One. As follows: perception of impermanence, perception of suffering, perception of non-self, perception of foulness, perception of danger, perception of abandoning, perception of dispassion, perception of cessation, perception of non-delight in the entire world, perception of impermanence in all activities, mindfulness of breathing, perception of the bloated, perception of the discoloured, perception of the festering, perception of the full of holes, perception of the gnawed, perception of the scattered, perception of the hacked and scattered, perception of the bloody, perception of worms, perception of a skeleton, perception of friendliness, perception of compassion, perception of altruistic joy, perception of equanimity, recollection of death, mindfulness of the body - these, great king, are the classifications of objects declared by the Buddha, the Blessed One. Therein, whoever wishes to be released from ageing and death, he takes up one of those objects; by that object he becomes liberated from lust, becomes liberated from hate, becomes liberated from delusion, becomes liberated from conceit, becomes liberated from wrong view, crosses over the round of rebirths, prevents the stream of craving, purifies the threefold stain, and having destroyed all defilements, having entered the stainless, dustless, pure, white, birthless, ageless, deathless, happy, cooled, fearless, excellent city, the city of Nibbāna, he liberates the mind in arahantship. This is called, great king, 'the flower shop of the Blessed One.'

""Having taken the root of action, approach the shop;
Having bought the object, from that be released by freedom.""

"Venerable Nāgasena, what is the perfume shop of the Buddha, the Blessed One?"

"There are indeed, great king, classifications of morality declared by that Blessed One, by which fragrance of morality the sons of the Blessed One, anointed, perfume and thoroughly perfume the world with its gods with the fragrance of morality; they blow and blow beyond in the direction and the intermediate direction, with the wind and against the wind, having pervaded, they remain. What are those classifications of morality? The morality of refuge, the five-factored morality, the eight-factored morality, the ten-factored morality, the morality of restraint according to the Pātimokkha included in the five recitations. This is called, great king, 'the perfume shop of the Blessed One.' This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One, the god above gods -

""The odour of flowers does not go against the wind, nor sandalwood, tagara, or jasmine;
But the odour of the good goes against the wind, a good person pervades all directions.

""Sandalwood or tagara, water lily and also jasmine;
Of these kinds of odours, the odour of morality is unsurpassed.

""This odour is insignificant, which is of tagara and sandalwood;
But the odour of the moral ones blows as the highest among the gods.""

"Venerable Nāgasena, what is the fruit shop of the Buddha, the Blessed One?" "Fruits indeed, great king, have been declared by the Blessed One. As follows: the fruition of stream-entry, the fruition of once-returning, the fruition of non-returning, the fruition of arahantship, the attainment of the fruition of emptiness, the attainment of the fruition of the signless, the attainment of the fruition of the desireless. Therein, whoever desires whatever fruit, he, having given the root of action, buys the wished-for fruit. Whether the fruition of stream-entry, whether the fruition of once-returning, whether the fruition of non-returning, whether the fruition of arahantship, whether the attainment of the fruition of emptiness, whether the attainment of the fruition of the signless, whether the attainment of the fruition of the desireless. Just as, great king, a certain man might have a mango tree bearing fruit constantly; he does not drop fruits from it until buyers come; but when a buyer has arrived, having taken the price, he tells thus: 'My good man, this is indeed a mango tree bearing fruit constantly; from it, whatever you wish, take that much fruit - whether unripe, whether half-ripe, whether fibrous, whether raw, whether ripe.' He, with the price given by himself, if he wishes for unripe, takes unripe; if he wishes for half-ripe, takes half-ripe; if he wishes for fibrous, takes fibrous; if he wishes for raw, takes raw; if he wishes for ripe, takes ripe. Just so indeed, great king, whoever desires whatever fruit, he, having given the root of action, takes the wished-for fruit, whether the fruition of stream-entry, etc. whether the attainment of the fruition of the desireless. This is called, great king, 'the fruit shop of the Blessed One.'

""People, having given the root of action, take the deathless fruit;

By that they become happy, those who have bought the deathless fruit."

"Venerable Nāgasena, what is the medicine shop of the Buddha, the Blessed One?"

"Medicines indeed, great king, have been declared by the Blessed One, by which medicines that Blessed One releases the world with its gods from the poison of defilements. But what are those medicines? These, great king, are the four noble truths declared by the Blessed One. As follows: the noble truth of suffering, the noble truth of the origin of suffering, the noble truth of the cessation of suffering, the noble truth of the practice leading to the cessation of suffering. Therein, whoever expecting final liberating knowledge hears the teaching of the four truths, they are released from birth, they are released from ageing, they are released from death, they are released from sorrow, lamentation, suffering, displeasure, and anguish. This is called, great king, 'the medicine shop of the Blessed One.'"

"Whatever medicines there are in the world, repelling poisons;
There is none equal to the medicine of the Dhamma, drink this, monks."

"Venerable Nāgasena, what is the Blessed One, the Buddha's medicine shop?"

"Medicines indeed, great king, have been declared by the Blessed One, with which medicines that Blessed One treats gods and humans. As follows: the four establishments of mindfulness, the four right strivings, the four bases for spiritual power, the five faculties, the five powers, the seven factors of enlightenment, the noble eightfold path; with these medicines the Blessed One purges wrong view, purges wrong thought, purges wrong speech, purges wrong action, purges wrong livelihood, purges wrong effort, purges wrong mindfulness, purges wrong concentration; he causes the vomiting of greed, causes the vomiting of hate, causes the vomiting of delusion, causes the vomiting of conceit, causes the vomiting of views, causes the vomiting of doubt, causes the vomiting of restlessness, causes the vomiting of sloth and torpor, causes the vomiting of shamelessness and moral fearlessness, causes the vomiting of all mental defilements. This is called, great king, 'the Blessed One's medicine shop.'

"Whatever medicines there are in the world, various and many are found;
There is none equal to the medicine of the Dhamma, drink this, monks."

"Having drunk the medicine of the Dhamma, they would be free from ageing and death;
Having developed and having seen, quenched in the elimination of clinging."

"Venerable Nāgasena, what is the Blessed One, the Buddha's deathless shop?" "The Deathless indeed, great king, has been declared by the Blessed One, with which Deathless that Blessed One sprinkled the world with its gods; sprinkled with which Deathless, gods and humans were released from birth, ageing, illness, death, sorrow, lamentation, suffering, displeasure, and anguish. What is that Deathless? That is to say, mindfulness of the body. This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One, the god above gods: 'Those, monks, consume the Deathless who consume mindfulness of the body.' This is called, great king, 'the Blessed One's deathless shop.'

"Having seen the afflicted populace, he spread out the deathless shop;

Having bought that with action, take the Deathless, monks."

"Venerable Nāgasena, what is the Blessed One, the Buddha's jewel shop?" "Jewels indeed, great king, have been declared by the Blessed One, adorned with which jewels the Blessed One's sons shine, illuminate, radiate, blaze, and burn forth in the world with its gods, showing light above, below, and across. What are those jewels? The jewel of morality, the jewel of concentration, the jewel of wisdom, the jewel of liberation, the jewel of knowledge and vision of liberation, the jewel of analytical knowledge, the jewel of the factors of enlightenment.

"What, great king, is the Blessed One's jewel of morality? Morality of restraint according to the principal monastic code, morality of sense restraint, morality of purity of livelihood, morality consisting in the wise use of requisites, the lesser morality, the middle morality, the greater morality, path morality, fruition morality. Indeed, great king, the world with its gods, with its Māras, with its Brahmās, this generation with its ascetics and brahmins, desires and aspires to a person adorned with the jewel of morality. Indeed, great king, a monk wearing the jewel of morality shines and outshines in the directions, in the intermediate directions, above, below, and across; from below, taking Avīci, from above, taking the highest existence, in between here, having surpassed, overcome, and submerged all jewels, he stands. Such jewels of morality, great king, have been spread out in the Blessed One's jewel shop. This is called, great king, 'the Blessed One's jewel of morality.'

"Such moral practices exist in the Buddha's shop;
Having bought that with action, wear the jewel."

"What, great king, is the Blessed One's jewel of concentration? Concentration with applied and sustained thought, concentration without applied but with sustained thought only, concentration without applied and sustained thought, emptiness concentration, signless concentration, desireless concentration. Indeed, great king, for a monk wearing the jewel of concentration, whatever thoughts of sensuality, thoughts of anger, thoughts of violence, conceit, restlessness, views, doubt, bases of mental defilements, and various evil thoughts there are, all of them, having encountered concentration, scatter, disperse, and are destroyed; they do not remain, they do not adhere. Just as, great king, water scatters, disperses, and is destroyed on a lotus leaf; it does not remain, it does not adhere. What is the reason for this? Because of the purity of the lotus. Just so indeed, great king, for a monk wearing the jewel of concentration, whatever thoughts of sensuality, thoughts of anger, thoughts of violence, conceit, restlessness, views, doubt, bases of mental defilements, and various evil thoughts there are, all of them, having encountered concentration, scatter, disperse, and are destroyed; they do not remain, they do not adhere. What is the reason for this? Because of the purity of concentration. This is called, great king, 'the Blessed One's jewel of concentration.' Such jewels of concentration, great king, have been spread out in the Blessed One's jewel shop.

"For one wearing the garland of the jewel of concentration, unwholesome thoughts do not arise;
And the mind is not distracted, this you should adorn yourselves with.'

"What, great king, is the Blessed One's jewel of wisdom? By which wisdom, great

king, a noble disciple understands as it really is 'this is wholesome,' understands as it really is 'this is unwholesome,' understands as it really is 'this is blameworthy, this is blameless, this should be cultivated, this should not be cultivated, this is inferior, this is superior, this is dark, this is bright, this partakes of both dark and bright,' understands as it really is 'this is suffering,' understands as it really is 'this is the origin of suffering,' understands as it really is 'this is the cessation of suffering,' understands as it really is 'this is the practice leading to the cessation of suffering.' This is called, great king, 'the Blessed One's jewel of wisdom.'

"For one wearing the garland of the jewel of wisdom, existence does not continue long;
He quickly touches the Deathless, and he does not delight in existence.'

"What, great king, is the Blessed One's jewel of liberation?" "The jewel of liberation, great king, is called arahantship; a monk who has attained arahantship, great king, is called 'one adorned with the jewel of liberation.' Just as, great king, a man adorned with ornaments of strings of pearls, strings of gems, and strings of coral, with body anointed with aloe, tagara, talisa, black sandalwood, and red sandalwood, decorated with nāga flowers, punnāga flowers, sāla flowers, salaḥa flowers, campaka flowers, jasmine, atimuttaka flowers, pāṭali flowers, lotuses, vassika flowers, and jasmine, having surpassed the rest of the people, shines, outshines, radiates, illuminates, fully illuminates, blazes, blazes forth, overcomes, and overwhelms with garlands, fragrances, jewels, and ornaments; even so, great king, one who has attained arahantship, one who has eliminated the mental corruptions, adorned with the jewel of liberation, having surpassed and transcended monks liberated again and again, shines, outshines, radiates, illuminates, fully illuminates, blazes, blazes forth, overcomes, and overwhelms by liberation. What is the reason for this? This, great king, is the highest adornment of all adornments, that is to say, the adornment of liberation. This is called, great king, 'the Blessed One's jewel of liberation.'

"In a house, people look up to the master wearing a garland of gems;
But those wearing the garland of the jewel of liberation, the world with its gods looks up to.'

"What, great king, is the Blessed One's jewel of knowledge and vision of liberation? Reviewing knowledge, great king, is called the Blessed One's jewel of knowledge and vision of liberation, by which knowledge a noble disciple reviews the path, fruition, Nibbāna, the abandoned defilements, and the remaining defilements.

"Those noble ones who understand through knowledge that the task is done;
To obtain that jewel of knowledge, strive, O sons of the Conqueror.'

"What, great king, is the Blessed One's jewel of analytical knowledge? There are, great king, four analytical knowledges: analytical knowledge of meaning, analytical knowledge of phenomena, analytical knowledge of language, and analytical knowledge of discernment. A monk adorned with these four jewels of analytical knowledge, great king, whatever assembly he approaches - whether an assembly of warriors, whether an assembly of brahmins, whether an assembly of householders, whether an assembly of ascetics - he approaches confident, unabashed, fearless, not terrified, not fearful, with terror gone, he approaches the assembly.

"Just as, great king, a warrior, a hero in battle, armed with five weapons, enters battle without fear, thinking 'If enemies are far away, I will strike them down with an arrow; if they are nearer than that, I will strike them with a spear; if they are nearer than that, I will strike them with a lance; if one has come close, I will cut him in two with the circular blade; if one has come upon my body, I will pierce him through with a dagger,' even so, great king, a monk adorned with the jewel of the four analytical knowledges approaches the assembly without fear. Whoever asks me a question about analytical knowledge of meaning, to him I will explain meaning by meaning, reason by reason, cause by cause, method by method; I will make it free from doubt, I will dispel uncertainty, I will satisfy him with the answering of questions.

"Whoever asks me a question about analytical knowledge of phenomena, to him I will explain phenomenon by phenomenon, the Deathless by the Deathless, the unconditioned by the unconditioned, Nibbāna by Nibbāna, emptiness by emptiness, the signless by the signless, the desireless by the desireless, the without longing by the without longing; I will make it free from doubt, I will dispel uncertainty, I will satisfy him with the answering of questions.

"Whoever asks me a question about analytical knowledge of language, to him I will explain language by language, term by term, word by word, syllable by syllable, connection by connection, phrase by phrase, feature by feature, letter by letter, vowel by vowel, concept by concept, conventional expression by conventional expression; I will make it free from doubt, I will dispel uncertainty, I will satisfy him with the answering of questions.

"Whoever asks me a question about analytical knowledge of discernment, to him I will explain discernment by discernment, simile by simile, characteristic by characteristic, function by function; I will make it free from doubt, I will dispel uncertainty, I will satisfy him with the answering of questions." This is called, great king, 'the Blessed One's jewel of analytical knowledge.'

"Having purchased analytical knowledge, whoever would touch it with knowledge;
Without fear, unagitated, outshines the world with its gods.'

"What, great king, is the Blessed One's jewel of the factors of enlightenment? There are these seven factors of enlightenment, great king: the enlightenment factor of mindfulness, the enlightenment factor of investigation of phenomena, the enlightenment factor of energy, the enlightenment factor of rapture, the enlightenment factor of tranquillity, the enlightenment factor of concentration, the enlightenment factor of equanimity. A monk adorned with these seven jewels of the factors of enlightenment, great king, having overcome all darkness, illuminates, radiates, and generates light for the world with its gods. This is called, great king, 'the Blessed One's jewel of the factors of enlightenment.'

"For one wearing the garland of the jewel of enlightenment factors, those together with the gods rise up;
Having bought that with action, adorn yourselves with the jewel."

"Venerable Nāgasena, what is the Buddha, the Blessed One's general store?" "The general store, great king, is the Blessed One's ninefold word of the Buddha, the bodily relics, the articles of use, the shrines, and the jewel of the Community. In the general store, great king, the Blessed One has displayed success in birth, success in wealth, success in life, success in health, success in beauty, success in wisdom, success in human existence, success in divine existence, success in Nibbāna. Therein, those who wish for this or that success, having given the root of action, buy whatever success they aspire for; some buy by undertaking morality, some buy by the Observance practice; even with a trifling root of action, taking again and again, they obtain successes. Just as, great king, in a shopkeeper's shop, with sesame, mung beans, and beans, even with a small amount of rice, mung beans, and beans, even with a small price, taking again and again, they take; even so, great king, in the Blessed One's general store, even with a trifling root of action, taking again and again, they obtain successes. This is called, great king, 'the Blessed One's general store.'

"Life, health, beauty, heaven, birth in a high family;
The unconditioned and the deathless, exist in the Conqueror's general store.

"With little or with much, by the root of action it is taken;
Having bought with the root of faith, be prosperous, monks."

"In the Blessed One's city of the Teaching, great king, such people dwell: experts in the discourses, experts in the discipline, experts in the Abhidhamma, speakers of the Teaching, reciters of the Jātakas, reciters of the Long Collection, reciters of the Middle Collection, reciters of the Collection of the Connected Discourses, reciters of the Numerical Collection, reciters of the Minor Collection, accomplished in morality, accomplished in concentration, accomplished in wisdom, delighting in the development of enlightenment factors, gifted with introspection, devoted to their own welfare, forest dwellers, tree-root dwellers, open-air dwellers, heap-of-straw dwellers, cemetery dwellers, those who remain in a sitting position, practitioners, those stationed in fruition, trainees, possessors of fruition, stream-enterers, once-returns, non-returns, Worthy Ones, possessors of the threefold true knowledge, possessors of the six higher knowledges, possessing supernormal power, having reached perfection in wisdom, skilled in the establishments of mindfulness, right strivings, bases for spiritual power, faculties, powers, enlightenment factors, path, excellent meditative absorptions, deliverances, matter, and peaceful, happy meditative attainments; with those Worthy Ones, crowded and thronged, filled and overfilled, the city of the Teaching was like a reed forest or a lake forest. Here it is said -

"Those without lust, without hate, without delusion, without mental corruptions;
Free from craving, without grasping, they dwell in the city of the Teaching.

"Forest dwellers, practitioners of ascetic practices, meditators with coarse robes;
The wise, delighting in seclusion, they dwell in the city of the Teaching.

"Those who remain in a sitting position, those who use any mat, and also

those standing and walking;
All wearers of rag robes, they dwell in the city of the Teaching.

"Wearers of the three robes, peaceful, with a piece of leather as the fourth;
The wise, delighting in one seat, they dwell in the city of the Teaching.

"Of few wishes, prudent, wise, eating little, not covetous;
Content with gain and loss, they dwell in the city of the Teaching.

"Meditators, delighting in meditative absorption, wise, with peaceful minds,
concentrated;
Aspiring for nothingness, they dwell in the city of the Teaching.

"Those practising and those stationed in fruition, trainees and possessors of
fruition;
Seekers of the highest good, they dwell in the city of the Teaching.

"Stream-enterers and spotless ones, and those who are once-returners;
Non-returners and Worthy Ones, they dwell in the city of the Teaching.

"Skilled in the establishments of mindfulness, delighting in the development of
enlightenment factors;
Gifted with introspection, bearers of the Teaching, they dwell in the city of the
Teaching.

"Skilled in the bases for spiritual power, delighting in the development of
concentration;
Engaged in right striving, they dwell in the city of the Teaching.

"Having attained the perfection of direct knowledge, delighted in the paternal
resort;
Walking in the sky, they dwell in the city of the Teaching.

"With eyes downcast, speaking moderately, with guarded doors, well-
restrained;
Well-tamed in the highest taming, they dwell in the city of the Teaching.

"Possessing the threefold true knowledge and the six higher knowledges,
having reached perfection in supernormal power;
Having attained perfection in wisdom, they dwell in the city of the Teaching."

"Those monks, great king, who bear unlimited excellent knowledge, without
attachment, of incomparable virtue, of incomparable fame, of incomparable strength,
of incomparable radiance, who set rolling the wheel of the Teaching, who have gone
to the perfection of wisdom, such monks, great king, in the Blessed One's city of the
Teaching are called 'generals of the Teaching'.

"But those monks, great king, who possess supernormal power, who have attained
the analytical knowledges and reached self-confidence, who walk in the sky, difficult
to approach, difficult to overcome, who walk without support, who shake the earth

with its ocean and mountains, who touch the moon and sun, skilled in transformation, determination, and resolution, who have gone to perfection in supernormal power, such monks, great king, in the Blessed One's city of the Teaching are called 'chaplains'.

"But those monks, great king, who follow the ascetic practices, of few wishes, content, disgusted with intimation, mind, and search, who walk for alms successively from house to house, who like bees, having smelled the fragrance, enter the secluded forest, indifferent to body and life, having attained arahantship, placed foremost in the virtues of ascetic practices, such monks, great king, in the Blessed One's city of the Teaching are called 'judges'.

"But those monks, great king, who are pure, spotless, free from mental defilements, skilled in death and rebirth, who have gone to perfection in the divine eye, such monks, great king, in the Blessed One's city of the Teaching are called 'city illuminators'.

"But those monks, great king, who are very learned, who have learnt the collections, bearers of the Teaching, bearers of the monastic discipline, bearers of the matrices, skilled in distinguishing soft and aspirated, long and short, heavy and light syllables, bearers of the ninefold Dispensation, such monks, great king, in the Blessed One's city of the Teaching are called 'guardians of the Teaching'.

"But those monks, great king, who are knowers of the monastic discipline, skilled in the monastic discipline, skilled in what is possible and impossible, skilled in offence and non-offence, heavy and light, curable and incurable, emergence, confession, refutation, atonement, reinstatement, sending away, and reconciliation, who have gone to perfection in the monastic discipline, such monks, great king, in the Blessed One's city of the Teaching are called 'guardians of form'.

"But those monks, great king, who are bound with garlands of excellent flowers of liberation, who have attained the excellent, most excellent, costly, and foremost state, desired and wished for by many people, such monks, great king, in the Blessed One's city of the Teaching are called 'flower merchants'.

"But those monks, great king, who have penetrated the full realisation of the four truths, who have seen the truth, who have cognised the teaching, who have crossed over doubt in the four fruits of asceticism, who have obtained the happiness of fruition, who share those fruits with others who are practising, such monks, great king, in the Blessed One's city of the Teaching are called 'fruit merchants'.

"But those monks, great king, who are anointed with the fragrance of restraint in morality, who bear many kinds of numerous virtues, who dispel the stench of the stain of mental defilements, such monks, great king, in the Blessed One's city of the Teaching are called 'perfume merchants'.

"But those monks, great king, who are lovers of the Teaching, of amiable conversation, having great gladness in the higher teaching and higher discipline, who whether gone to the forest, or gone to the root of a tree, or gone to an empty house, drink the excellent flavour of the Teaching, who are immersed in the excellent flavour of the Teaching by body, speech, and mind, of exceeding discernment, practising the search for the Teaching among teachings, from here or from there, wherever there is

talk about fewness of wishes, talk about contentment, talk about solitude, talk about aloofness from society, talk about arousal of energy, talk about morality, talk about concentration, talk about wisdom, talk about liberation, talk about knowledge and vision of liberation, having gone there and there, they drink that and that flavour of talk, such monks, great king, in the Blessed One's city of the Teaching are called 'drunkards and thirsty ones'.

"But those monks, great king, who are devoted to the pursuit of wakefulness in the first and last watches of the night, who spend the day and night by sitting, standing, and walking meditation, devoted to the pursuit of meditation, intent on their own welfare for the warding off of mental defilements, such monks, great king, in the Blessed One's city of the Teaching are called 'city guards'.

"But those monks, great king, who recite and teach, speak and expound the ninefold word of the Buddha according to meaning and phrasing, method and reason, cause and example, such monks, great king, in the Blessed One's city of the Teaching are called 'Teaching merchants'.

"But those monks, great king, who are wealthy and rich with the wealth of the jewel of the Teaching, with the wealth of learning the collections and scriptures, who have penetrated the characteristics of indicated sounds and phrases, who are intelligent and pervading, such monks, great king, in the Blessed One's city of the Teaching are called 'Teaching millionaires'.

"But those monks, great king, who have penetrated the lofty teaching, who have practised the classification of objects and exposition, who have attained perfection in the virtues of training, such monks, great king, in the Blessed One's city of the Teaching are called 'famous righteous ones'.

"Thus well-arranged indeed, great king, is the Blessed One's city of the Teaching, thus well-built, thus well-provided, thus well-filled, thus well-established, thus well-protected, thus well-guarded, thus difficult to overcome by adversaries and enemies. By this reason, great king, by this cause, by this method, by this inference, it should be known: 'There is that Blessed One.'

"Just as having seen a city, well-arranged and delightful;
By inference they know the greatness of the builder.

"So too having seen the excellent city of the Teaching of the Protector of the World;
By inference they know: 'There is that Blessed One.'

"By inference they know, having seen a wave in the ocean;
As this wave is seen, that will be great.

"So too the Buddha, dispeller of sorrow, unconquered in all respects;
Who has attained the elimination of craving, liberator from the wandering in existence.

"By inference it should be known, having seen the wave in the world with its gods;

As the spreading of the Dhamma-wave, the foremost Buddha will be.

"By inference they know, having seen a very lofty mountain;
As this one is very lofty, that will be the Himalaya.

"So too having seen the Dhamma-mountain, become cool, without clinging;
Very lofty of the Blessed One, unshakeable, firmly established.

"By inference it should be known, having seen the Dhamma-mountain;
For thus that great hero, the foremost Buddha will be.

"Just as indeed humans, having seen the footprint of the elephant king;
By inference they know, 'This is a great elephant.'

"So too having seen the footprint of the Buddha-elephant, of the intelligent one;
By inference they know, he will be eminent.

"By inference they know, having seen the frightened tortoises;
By the sound of the king of beasts, 'These tortoises are frightened.'

"So too having seen the sectarians, with minds spread out in fear;
By inference it should be known, the King of the Dhamma has thundered.

"Having seen the earth quenched, with green leaves, with much water;
By inference they know, quenched by a great cloud.

"So too having seen these people, rejoicing and delighting;
By inference it should be known, satisfied by the Dhamma-cloud.

"Having seen the clinging mud, the earth gone to wet clay;
By inference they know, a great mass of water has gone.

"So too having seen these people, covered with the mud of defilement;
Carried by the Dhamma-river, released into the Dhamma-ocean.

"Having seen this earth with its gods, gone to the Dhamma-deathless;
By inference it should be known, a great mass of Dhamma has gone.

"By inference they know, having smelled the highest fragrance;
As this fragrance blows, there will be flowering trees.

"So too this fragrance of morality, blows forth in the world with its gods;
By inference it should be known: there is the unsurpassed Buddha.'

"By such a hundred reasons, great king, by a thousand reasons, by a hundred causes, by a thousand causes, by a hundred methods, by a thousand methods, by a hundred similes, by a thousand similes, it is possible to show the Buddha's power. Just as, great king, a skilled garland-maker, from a heap of various flowers, by the teacher's instruction, by his own personal effort, might make a variegated heap of garland strings, just so indeed, great king, that Blessed One is like a variegated heap of

flowers, of infinite virtues, of immeasurable virtues. I now, like a garland-maker in the Conqueror's Dispensation, a flower-binder, by the path of the former teachers and also by my own power of higher intelligence and also by incalculable reasons, by inference, will illuminate the Buddha's power; and you, arouse desire here for hearing."

"It is difficult, Venerable Nāgasena, for others to show the Buddha's power by such a reason, by inference. I am satisfied, Venerable Nāgasena, by your supremely variegated answering of questions."

The question on inference is the first.

2. The Question on Ascetic Practices

"He sees the forest-dwelling monks, immersed in the virtues of ascetic practice;

Again the king, a householder, sees those established in the fruition of non-returning.

"Having looked at both of them, a great doubt arose;

If a householder were to awaken to the teachings, the ascetic practices would be fruitless.

"Skilled in crushing the doctrines of those holding other views, subtle in the three Piṭakas;

Come, let me ask the foremost in discussion, he will remove my uncertainty."

Then King Milinda approached the Venerable Nāgasena; having approached, having paid respect to the Venerable Nāgasena, he sat down to one side. Seated to one side, King Milinda said this to the Venerable Nāgasena: "Venerable Nāgasena, is there any householder, a layman, enjoying sensual pleasures, dwelling in the confinement of wife and children, enjoying Kāsi sandalwood, wearing garlands, scents, and cosmetics, accepting gold and silver, bound with a topknot decorated with jewels, pearls, and gold, by whom the peaceful, ultimate reality, Nibbāna, has been realised?"

"Not just one hundred, great king, nor two hundred, nor three, four, five hundred, nor a thousand, nor a hundred thousand, nor a hundred crores, nor a thousand crores, nor a hundred thousand crores. Let alone, great king, the full realisation of ten, twenty, a hundred, a thousand - by which method shall I give you the pursuit?"

"You yourself tell me that." "Well then, great king, I will tell you by a hundred or by a thousand or by a hundred thousand or by a crore or by a hundred crores or by a thousand crores or by a hundred thousand crores - whatever discussions there are in the ninefold word of the Buddha, based on the virtues of austere conduct, practice, and excellent ascetic factors, all of them will come together here. Just as, great king, water rained down on low, high, even, uneven, dry land, and wet land regions, all that, having flowed from there, comes together into the great ocean, the sea, just so indeed, great king, when there is one who accomplishes, whatever discussions there are in the ninefold word of the Buddha, based on the virtues of austere conduct, practice, and ascetic factors, all of them will come together here.

"For me too here, great king, the illumination of reasons will come together through the experience of higher intelligence; thereby this meaning will be well-divided, variegated, complete, pure, and brought together. Just as, great king, a skilled writing teacher, having been instructed, presenting a document, completes the document by the illumination of reasons through his own experience of higher intelligence, thus that document will be complete, perfect, and not deficient. Just so for me too here, the illumination of reasons will come together through the experience of higher intelligence; thereby this meaning will be well-divided, variegated, complete, pure, and brought together.

"In the city of Sāvattthī, great king, about fifty million noble disciples, male and female lay followers of the Blessed One, fifty-seven thousand and three hundred thousand were established in the fruition of non-returning; all of them were indeed householders, not gone forth. Furthermore, right there at the foot of the Kaṇḍamba tree, at the Twin Miracle, twenty crores of living beings fully realised; furthermore, at the Exhortation to Rāhula the Lesser, at the Great Blessing Discourse, at the Exposition of Even-mindedness, at the Downfall Discourse, at the Before the Break-up Discourse, at the Quarrel and Dispute Discourse, at the Lesser Array Discourse, at the Greater Array Discourse, at the Quick Discourse, at the Sāriputta Discourse, there was the full realisation of the Teaching by deities who had passed beyond the path of counting.

"In the city of Rājagaha there were fifty thousand and three hundred thousand noble disciples, male and female lay followers of the Blessed One; again right there at the taming of the large bull elephant Dhanapāla, ninety koṭis of living beings; at the assembly at the Pārāyana at the Stone Shrine, fourteen koṭis of living beings; again in the Indasāla cave, eighty koṭis of deities; again at Bārāṇasī at Isipatana in the Deer Park at the first proclamation of the Teaching, eighteen koṭis of Brahmās and immeasurable deities; again in the Tāvatiṃsa realm on the Paṇḍukambala stone at the teaching of the Higher Teaching, eighty koṭis of deities; at the descent of the god at the gate of the city of Saṅkassa at the wonder of the unveiling of the world, thirty koṭis of faithful humans and deities fully realised.

Again among the Sakyans at Kapilavatthu in the Nigrodha Monastery, at the teaching of the Chronicle of the Buddhas and at the teaching of the Great Assembly Discourse, there was the full realisation of the teaching by deities who had passed beyond the path of counting. Again at the assembly of the garland-maker Sumana, at the assembly of Gahadinna, at the assembly of the millionaire Ānanda, at the assembly of the ājīvaka Jambuka, at the assembly of the young god Maṇḍuka, at the assembly of the young god Maṭṭhakuṇḍali, at the assembly of the city-belle Sulasā, at the assembly of the city-belle Sirimā, at the assembly of the weaver's daughter, at the assembly of Cūḷasubhaddā, at the assembly of the seeing of the cremation ground of the brahmin of Sāketa, at the assembly of Sūnāparantaka, at the assembly of Sakka's questions, at the assembly of the Outside the Walls, at the assembly of the Jewel Discourse, for each there was the full realisation of the teaching by eighty-four thousand living beings. As long as, great king, the Blessed One stood in the world, so long in the three circles, in the sixteen great countries, wherever the Blessed One dwelt, there mostly two, three, four, five, a hundred, a thousand, a hundred thousand gods and humans realised the peaceful ultimate reality, Nibbāna. Those gods, great

king, were householders indeed, they were not gone forth; these indeed, great king, and many other hundreds of thousands of koṭis of deities, householders, living in houses, enjoying sensual pleasures, realised the peaceful ultimate reality, Nibbāna."

"If, Venerable Nāgasena, householders living in houses, enjoying sensual pleasures, realise the peaceful ultimate reality, Nibbāna, then for what purpose do these ascetic practices accomplish, by that reason the ascetic practices do not accomplish their function. If, Venerable Nāgasena, diseases are appeased without spells and medicines, what is the use of weakening the body by vomiting, purging, and so on? If the suppression of enemies is accomplished with fists, what is the use of swords, spears, arrows, bows, crossbows, clubs, and hammers? If climbing a tree is accomplished by holding onto knotted, crooked, hollow, thorny creeper branches, what is the use of seeking a long, strong ladder? If balance of the bodily elements is accomplished by sleeping on the bare ground, what is the use of seeking a great, magnificent royal bed with pleasant touch? If one alone is capable of crossing a dangerous, frightening, uneven wilderness, what is the use of seeking a great, mighty, armed and equipped caravan? If one is capable of crossing a river lake with one's arms, what is the use of seeking a permanent bridge or boat? If one is able to provide food and clothing with one's own property, what is the use of serving others, pleasant conversation, running before and after? If one obtains water in an unexcavated lake, what is the use of digging wells, lakes, and lotus ponds? Just so indeed, Venerable Nāgasena, if householders living in houses, enjoying sensual pleasures, realise the peaceful ultimate reality, Nibbāna, what is the use of undertaking the excellent virtues of ascetic practice?"

"There are, great king, these twenty-eight virtues of the ascetic practices, virtues in accordance with truth, by which virtues the ascetic practices are desired and wished for by all Buddhas. Which twenty-eight? Here, great king, the ascetic practice is pure livelihood, has happiness as its fruit, is blameless, does not cause suffering to others, is fearless, is without oppression, is exclusively for growth, is not subject to decline, is without deceit, is protection, gives what is wished for, is the taming of all beings, is beneficial for restraint, is proper, is independent, is liberated, is the elimination of lust, is the elimination of hate, is the elimination of delusion, is the abandoning of conceit, is the cutting off of wrong thoughts, is the overcoming of uncertainty, is the elimination of idleness, is the abandoning of discontent, is patience, is incomparable, is immeasurable, is the going to the elimination of all suffering. These, great king, are the twenty-eight virtues of the ascetic practices, virtues in accordance with truth, by which virtues the ascetic practices are desired and wished for by all Buddhas.

"Those, great king, who rightly cultivate the virtues of ascetic practice, they become endowed with eighteen virtues. With which eighteen? Their conduct is well purified, their practice is well fulfilled, their bodily and verbal conduct is well guarded, their mental conduct is well purified, their energy is well aroused, fear is appeased, the view of self is departed, resentment is ceased, friendliness is established, food is fully understood, they are respected by all beings, they know moderation in food, they are devoted to wakefulness, they are without abode, wherever is comfortable there they dwell, they are ones who detest evil, they delight in seclusion, they are constantly diligent. Those, great king, who rightly cultivate the virtues of ascetic practice, they become endowed with these eighteen virtues.

"These are the ten persons worthy of the virtues of ascetic practice, great king. What are the ten? He has faith, has shame, has resolution, is without deceit, is master of the meaning, is not covetous, is eager to train, is firmly resolved, is abundant in non-fault-finding, and abides in friendliness - these, great king, are the ten persons worthy of the virtues of ascetic practice.

"Those householders living in houses, enjoying sensual pleasures, who realise the peaceful ultimate reality, Nibbāna, great king - all of them in previous births were skilled in archery and had done the groundwork in the thirteen virtues of ascetic practice; having purified their conduct and practice there, now today, while still being householders, they realise the peaceful ultimate reality, Nibbāna.

"Just as, great king, a skilled archer, having first trained his pupils in the training hall in the breaking of the bow, stringing the bow, grasping, pressing with the fist, bending the fingers, placing the feet, grasping the arrow, putting on armour, drawing back, holding steady, aiming at the target, and shooting, in piercing a straw figure, a heap of dung, a heap of straw and clay, and a wooden target, having accomplished the training in the presence of the king, obtains thoroughbred horses, chariots, elephants, horses, wealth, grain, gold, silver, female slaves, male slaves, a wife, and an excellent village - just so, great king, those householders living in houses, enjoying sensual pleasures, who realise the peaceful ultimate reality, Nibbāna - all of them in previous births were skilled in archery and had done the groundwork in the thirteen virtues of ascetic practice; having purified their conduct and practice right there, now today, while still being householders, they realise the peaceful ultimate reality, Nibbāna. Without previous practice in the virtues of ascetic practice, great king, there is no realisation of arahantship in just one birth; but with the highest energy, with the highest practice, with such a teacher, with a good friend, there is realisation of arahantship.

"Or else, great king, just as a physician, a surgeon, having pleased his teacher with wealth or with the practice of duties, having learned the procedures of grasping instruments, cutting, incising, piercing, extracting darts, washing wounds, drying, applying medicinal ointments, administering emetics, purgatives, and enemas, trained in the sciences, skilled in archery, practised in hand, approaches the sick for treatment, just so indeed, great king, those householders living in houses, enjoying sensual pleasures, who realise the peaceful ultimate reality, Nibbāna, all of them in former births have been trained and have done the groundwork in the thirteen virtues of ascetic practice; having purified their conduct and practice right there, now today, while still being householders, they realise the peaceful ultimate reality, Nibbāna. For those impure in the virtues of ascetic practice, great king, there is no full realisation of the teaching.

"Just as, great king, without the watering of water there is no sprouting of seeds, just so indeed, great king, for those impure in the virtues of ascetic practice there is no full realisation of the teaching.

"Or else, great king, just as for those who have not done what is wholesome, who have not done what is good, there is no going to a fortunate world, just so indeed, great king, for those impure in the virtues of ascetic practice there is no full realisation of the teaching.

"Like the earth, great king, is the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification, in the meaning of being a support. Like water, great king, is the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification, in the meaning of washing away all the stains of mental defilements. Like fire, great king, is the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification, in the meaning of burning up the forest of all mental defilements. Like air, great king, is the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification, in the meaning of carrying away the dust and stains of all mental defilements. Like medicine, great king, is the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification, in the meaning of appeasing the disease of all mental defilements. Like the Deathless, great king, is the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification, in the meaning of destroying the poison of all mental defilements. Like a field, great king, is the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification, in the meaning of the growing of the crop of all the qualities of asceticism. Like a wish-fulfilling gem, great king, is the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification, in the meaning of giving the excellent boon of all wished-for and desired achievements. Like a boat, great king, is the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification, in the meaning of going to the far shore of the great ocean of the round of rebirths. Like a shelter for the fearful, great king, is the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification, in the meaning of giving comfort to those afraid of ageing and death. Like a mother, great king, is the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification, in the meaning of helping those oppressed by the suffering of mental defilements. Like a father, great king, is the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification, for those desiring the increase of what is wholesome, in the meaning of producing all the qualities of asceticism. Like a friend, great king, is the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification, in the meaning of not deceiving in the quest for all the qualities of asceticism. Like a lotus, great king, is the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification, in the meaning of being unstained by all the stains of mental defilements. Like the excellent fragrance of the four kinds, great king, is the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification, in the meaning of dispelling the bad odour of mental defilements. Like the excellent king of mountains, great king, is the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification, in the meaning of being unshakeable by the winds of the eight worldly conditions. Like space, great king, is the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification, in the meaning of being everywhere free from grasping, vast, extended, and great. Like a river, great king, is the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification, in the meaning of carrying away the stains of mental defilements. Like a good guide, great king, is the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification, in the meaning of crossing over the wilderness of birth and the thicket of the forest of mental defilements. Like a great caravan leader, great king, is the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification, in the meaning of leading to the city of Nibbāna, the excellent, noble, secure, fearless, empty of all fear. Like a well-polished spotless mirror, great king, is the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification, in the meaning of seeing the intrinsic nature of activities. Like a shield, great king, is the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification, in the meaning of warding off the cudgels, arrows, and spears of mental defilements. Like an umbrella, great king, is the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification, in the meaning of warding off the rain of mental defilements and the heat and burning of the three fires. Like the moon, great king, is the virtue of

ascetic practice for those desiring purification, in the meaning of being longed for and wished for. Like the sun, great king, is the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification, in the meaning of destroying the darkness and gloom of delusion. Like the ocean, great king, is the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification, in the meaning of being the source of the excellent jewels of the manifold qualities of asceticism, and in the meaning of being unlimited, incalculable, and immeasurable. Thus indeed, great king, the virtue of ascetic practice for those desiring purification is very helpful, dispelling all disturbance and fever, dispelling discontent, dispelling fear, dispelling becoming, dispelling barrenness, dispelling stain, dispelling sorrow, dispelling suffering, dispelling lust, dispelling hate, dispelling delusion, dispelling conceit, dispelling wrong view, dispelling all unwholesome mental states, bringing fame, bringing welfare, bringing happiness, making comfort, making joy, making freedom from bondage, blameless, having desirable and pleasant results, a heap of qualities, a mass of qualities, with unlimited, incalculable, immeasurable qualities, excellent, noble, supreme.

"Just as, great king, people use food for support, use medicine for welfare, use a friend for assistance, use a boat for crossing, use garlands and scents for fragrance, use a shelter for the fearful for safety, use the earth for foundation, use a teacher for craft, use a king for fame, use a jewel gem for granting desires, just so indeed, great king, the noble ones use the virtues of ascetic practice for bestowing all the qualities of asceticism.

"Or just as, great king, water is for the sprouting of seeds, fire is for burning, food is for bringing strength, a creeper is for binding, a knife is for cutting, drinking water is for removing thirst, a treasure is for giving comfort, a boat is for reaching the shore, medicine is for appeasing illness, a vehicle is for comfortable travel, a shelter for the fearful is for dispelling fear, a king is for the purpose of protection, a shield is for warding off sticks, clods, clubs, arrows and spears, a teacher is for instruction, a mother is for nurturing, a mirror is for looking, an ornament is for beautifying, cloth is for covering, a ladder is for ascending, a balance is for removing unevenness, a spell is for muttering, a weapon is for warding off threats, a lamp is for dispelling darkness, wind is for quenching fever, a craft is for producing livelihood, a drug is for protecting life, a mine is for producing jewels, a jewel is for adorning, a command is for not transgressing, sovereignty is for exercising control, just so indeed, great king, the virtues of ascetic practice are for the sprouting of the seed of asceticism, for burning the stain of defilements, for bringing the power of supernormal abilities, for binding the restraint of mindfulness, for eradicating doubt and uncertainty, for removing the thirst of craving, for giving comfort through full realisation, for crossing over the four floods, for appeasing the illness of defilements, for attaining the happiness of Nibbāna, for dispelling the fear of birth, ageing, illness, death, sorrow, lamentation, suffering, displeasure and anguish, for protecting the qualities of asceticism, for warding off discontent and evil thoughts, for instruction in the entire purpose of asceticism, for nurturing all the qualities of asceticism, for seeing serenity, insight, path, fruition and Nibbāna, for making greatly splendid what is praised and lauded by the entire world, for closing off all realms of misery, for ascending to the summit of the rock peak of the purpose of asceticism, for dispersing the crooked, bent and uneven mind, for making good recitation regarding what should and should not be practised, for threatening all defilements as enemies, for dispelling the darkness of

ignorance, for quenching the heat and fever of the threefold fire, for producing smooth, subtle and peaceful attainments, for protecting all the qualities of asceticism, for producing the excellent jewel of the factors of enlightenment, for adorning practitioners, for not transgressing the blameless, subtle, refined, peaceful happiness, for exercising control over all the noble teachings of asceticism. Thus, great king, for the achievement of these qualities, that is to say, each and every virtue of ascetic practice, thus, great king, the virtues of ascetic practice are incomparable, immeasurable, matchless, without equal, without counterpart, without superior, higher, excellent, distinguished, exceeding, extended, broad, spread out, extensive, weighty, serious, great.

"Whatever person, great king, has evil desires, is overcome by desire, is deceitful, greedy, gluttonous, desirous of gain, desirous of fame, desirous of renown, inappropriate, unattained, unsuitable, unworthy, unfit, undertakes the ascetic practices, he incurs a twofold punishment, incurs the destruction of all qualities, obtains in the present life disdain, mockery, reproach, ridicule, rejection, non-eating, sending away, expulsion, banishment, exile; and in the future too, in the great Avīci hell measuring a hundred yojanas, encircled by garlands of hot, burning, scorching, blazing flames, for many hundreds of thousands of millions of years, throwing up foam, rolling about, going up, down and across, he is cooked; having been released from there, with thin, rough, black limbs and minor limbs, with swollen, bloated, hollow head, hungry, thirsty, with uneven, frightful form and appearance, with broken ears and hearing, with eyes opening and closing, with sore-covered, decaying body, with the whole body covered with worms, like a mass of fire burning in the wind, burning and blazing within, without shelter, without refuge, lamenting with weeping, crying, pitiful sounds, being one consumed by thirst, having become a great ghost of an ascetic, wandering about, he makes a cry of distress on the earth.

"Just as, great king, someone inappropriate, unattained, unsuitable, unworthy, unfit, low, of bad birth, consecrates himself with the warrior consecration, he obtains cutting off of the hand, cutting off of the foot, cutting off of hand and foot, cutting off of the ear, cutting off of the nose, cutting off of ear and nose, the gruel-pot torture, the shell-tonsure torture, the Rāhu's mouth torture, the fire-garland torture, the hand-torch torture, the grass-strip torture, the bark-dress torture, the antelope torture, the flesh-hook torture, the coin-cutting torture, the lye-pickling torture, the pivot-turning torture, the straw-chair torture, being sprinkled with boiling oil, being made to be eaten by dogs, impalement alive, beheading with a sword, and experiences various kinds of torture and punishment. Why? Inappropriate, unattained, unsuitable, unworthy, unfit, low, of bad birth, he placed himself in a position of great sovereignty, he transgressed the boundary; just so indeed, great king, whatever person has evil desires, etc. he makes a cry of distress on the earth.

"But, great king, whatever person is proper, fit, suitable, worthy, befitting, of few wishes, content, secluded, not in company, putting forth strenuous energy, resolute, honest, without deceit, not gluttonous, not desiring material gain, not desiring fame, not desiring renown, faithful, gone forth through faith, wishing to be released from ageing and death, undertakes the ascetic practices thinking 'I will uphold the Dispensation,' he deserves twofold veneration and is dear to the gods, agreeable, desired, wished for, like flowers of jasmine, Arabian jasmine and such to one who has

bathed and anointed himself, like sumptuous food to one who is hungry, like cool, pure, fragrant drinking water to one who is thirsty, like excellent medicine to one afflicted by poison, like the finest excellent thoroughbred chariot to one wishing to travel swiftly, like a captivating gem jewel to one wishing for welfare, like a white, spotless, pure parasol to one wishing to be consecrated, like the unsurpassed achievement of the fruition of arahantship to one who loves the Teaching. For him the four establishments of mindfulness go to fulfilment through development, the four right strivings, the four bases for spiritual power, the five faculties, the five powers, the seven factors of enlightenment, the noble eightfold path go to fulfilment through development, serenity and insight meditation are attained, the practice of achievement matures, the four fruits of asceticism, the four analytical knowledges, the three true knowledges, the six higher knowledges, and the entire ascetic practice all become his domain, he is consecrated with the white, spotless, pure parasol of liberation.

"Just as, great king, when a king of the warrior caste, well-born of noble family, has been consecrated with the warrior consecration, soldiers and troops of his own country, market towns, and provinces attend upon him, and the thirty-eight royal retinues, dancers and actors, those who speak auspicious words at the face, those who speak blessings, groups of ascetics, brahmins, and all sectarians approach him, and whatever there is on earth - ports, jewel mines, cities, customs stations, foreign territories, punishments of cutting and breaking, and instruction of the people - everywhere he becomes the master, just so indeed, great king, whatever person is proper, fit, etc. he is consecrated with the white, spotless, pure parasol of liberation.

"There are these thirteen ascetic practices, great king, by which, having been purified, having entered the great ocean of Nibbāna, one sports in the manifold play of the Teaching, practises the eight attainments of the material and immaterial spheres, and attains the various kinds of supernormal power, the divine ear element, the knowledge of others' minds, the recollection of past lives, the divine eye, and the elimination of all mental corruptions. Which are the thirteen? The rag-robe wearer's practice, the three-robe wearer's practice, the almsfood eater's practice, the successive house-to-house alms goer's practice, the one-session eater's practice, the bowl-food eater's practice, the later-food-refuser's practice, the forest-dweller's practice, the tree-root dweller's practice, the open-air dweller's practice, the charnel-ground dweller's practice, the any-bed user's practice, the sitter's practice - by these thirteen virtues of ascetic practice, great king, previously cultivated, pursued, practised, thoroughly practised, followed, attended to, and fulfilled, one obtains the entire asceticism, and his domain are the entire peaceful and pleasant attainments.

"Just as, great king, a wealthy sailor, having properly paid the toll at the port, having entered the great ocean, goes to Vaṅga, Takkola, China, Sovīra, Suratt̥ha, Alasanda, Kolapaṭṭana, Suvāṇṇabhūmi, and to whatever other place boats travel, just so indeed, great king, by these thirteen virtues of ascetic practice previously cultivated, pursued, practised, thoroughly practised, followed, attended to, and fulfilled, one obtains the entire asceticism, and his domain are the entire peaceful and pleasant attainments.

"Just as, great king, a farmer, having first removed the field's defects - grass, sticks, and stones - having ploughed, having sown, having properly let in the water, having

guarded, having protected, by reaping and threshing becomes one with abundant grain, and his domain are whatever poor, wretched, destitute, and unfortunate people there may be, just so indeed, great king, by these thirteen virtues of ascetic practice previously cultivated, etc. the entire peaceful and pleasant attainments.

"Or just as, great king, a warrior noble anointed on the head, of noble birth, is the lord in the instruction of people regarding cutting off and breaking, wielding power, the master, doing as he wishes, and the entire great earth is his domain, just so indeed, great king, by these thirteen virtues of ascetic practice previously cultivated, pursued, practised, thoroughly practised, followed, attended to, and fulfilled, one is the lord in the excellent Dispensation of the Conqueror, wielding power, the master, doing as he wishes, and the entire qualities of an ascetic are his domain.

"Is it not so, great king, that the Elder Upasena Vaṅgantaputta, not heeding the agreement of the monastic community at Sāvattthī because of his fulfilment of the virtues of ascetic practice of detachment, together with his following, having approached the charioteer of men to be tamed who had gone into seclusion, having paid homage with his head at the Blessed One's feet, sat down to one side, and the Blessed One, having looked at that well-disciplined assembly, joyful, satisfied, delighted, elated, having conversed in friendly talk with the assembly, with unbroken divine voice said this: 'This following of yours, Upasena, is pleasing. How did you, Upasena, train your following?' He too, when asked by the Omniscient One, the one of ten powers, the god above gods, by virtue of his true intrinsic qualities, said this to the Blessed One -

"Whoever, venerable sir, having approached me, requests the going forth or guidance, to him I say thus: 'I, friend, am a forest-dweller, an almsfood eater, a wearer of rag-robles, a three-robe wearer. If you too will be a forest-dweller, an almsfood eater, a wearer of rag-robles, a three-robe wearer, thus I will give you the going forth, I will give guidance.' If he, venerable sir, having promised me, rejoices and desists, thus I give him the going forth, I give guidance; if he does not rejoice, does not desist, I do not give him the going forth, I do not give guidance. Thus, venerable sir, I train my following." Thus indeed, great king, one who has undertaken the excellent virtues of ascetic practice is the lord in the excellent Dispensation of the Conqueror. Wielding power, the master, doing as he wishes, his domain are the entire peaceful and pleasant attainments.

"Just as, great king, a lotus, grown and pure, arising from the noble eastern origin, smooth, soft, desirable, fragrant, dear, wished for, praised, untainted by water and mud, adorned with fine petals, filaments and pericarp, frequented by swarms of bees, nourished by cool water, just so indeed, great king, by these thirteen virtues of ascetic practice previously cultivated, pursued, practised, thoroughly practised, followed, attended to, and fulfilled, a noble disciple is endowed with thirty excellent qualities.

"With which thirty excellent qualities? He is one with a smooth, soft, gentle, and friendly mind; he is one whose mental defilements are slain, killed, and destroyed; he is one whose conceit is slain and struck down, who is capable; he is one of unshakeable, firm, established, undoubting faith; he is one who obtains complete, satisfied, delighted, desirable, peaceful, pleasant attainments; he is one pervaded by

the excellent, noble, incomparable, pure fragrance of morality; he is dear and agreeable to gods and humans; he is wished for by those who have eliminated the mental corruptions, by noble, excellent persons; he is saluted and venerated by gods and humans; he is praised, extolled, lauded, and commended by the wise, the learned, and the wise people; whether here or beyond, he is untainted by the world; he is one who sees danger even in the slightest fault; he is one who accomplishes the excellent purpose of path and fruition for those desiring abundant excellent achievements; he is one who partakes of requested, abundant, sublime requisites; he is one who sleeps without a home; he is one who dwells in the excellent abiding absorbed in meditative absorption; he is one whose basis of the net of mental defilements is unravelled; he is one whose hindrances to destinations are broken, shattered, shrivelled, and cut off; he is one of unshakeable nature; he is one whose dwelling is well-conducted; he is one who enjoys what is blameless; he is one liberated from destinations; he is one who has crossed over all doubt; he is one whose purpose is absorbed in liberation; he is one who has seen the Teaching; he is one who has reached the unshakeable, firm refuge for the fearful; he is one whose underlying tendencies are cut off; he has attained the elimination of all mental corruptions; he is one who dwells much in peaceful, pleasant attainment; he is endowed with all the qualities of an ascetic; he is endowed with these thirty excellent qualities.

"Is it not so, great king, that the Elder Sāriputta was the foremost person in the ten-thousand-fold world system, setting aside the one of ten powers, the teacher of the world? He too, having accumulated wholesome roots over immeasurable, incalculable aeons, of noble birth in a brahmin family, having abandoned agreeable sensual delight and wealth counted in many hundreds, having gone forth in the Conqueror's Dispensation, having tamed body, speech, and mind by these thirteen virtues of ascetic practice, has now today become one endowed with infinite qualities, one who keeps turning the wheel of the Teaching in the excellent Dispensation of the Blessed One Gotama. This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One, the god above gods, in the excellent seal of the Ekuttara Collection:

"I do not, monks, perceive any other single person who thus rightly keeps turning the unsurpassed wheel of the Teaching that was set in motion by the Truth-finder as does, monks, Sāriputta. Sāriputta, monks, rightly keeps turning the unsurpassed wheel of the Teaching that was set in motion by the Truth-finder."

"Good, venerable Nāgasena, whatever ninefold word of the Buddha there is, whatever supramundane function there is, whatever abundant excellent achievements there are in the world, all that is contained in the thirteen virtues of ascetic practice."

The question on ascetic practices is the second.

The Chapter on Inference is the fourth.



ABOUT THIS TRANSLATION

This translation is part of the PaliVerse Project - the first complete, unified English translation of the Pāli Canon together with its Commentaries (Aṭṭhakathā) and Subcommentaries (Tīkā), accompanied by interactive study tools. PaliVerse is an ongoing project. The AI translations are continuously improved through experts' revisions and feedback. This text is the latest translation as of the date of download.

PDF Creation Date: 14 September 2026

HOW TO CITE

PaliVerse (2026). The Triple Canon. The Canon of Discourses. 5. The Collection of Minor Texts. 20. The Questions of Milinda. 5. The Question of Inference Retrieved from paliverse.org

© 2026 The PaliVerse Project · All Rights Reserved
Centre for Study and Practice of Theravāda Buddhism
Civic Non-Profit Company registered in Greece
This PDF may be freely distributed for study and practice.

PaliVerse.org