

THE PALIVERSE PROJECT

The Universe of Buddha's Wisdom

Commentaries (Aṭṭhakathā)

The Canon of Discourses - Commentaries (Sutta
Piṭaka - Aṭṭhakathā)

2. The Collection of the Middle Length Discourses -
Commentaries (2. Majjhima Nikāya - Aṭṭhakathā)

1. Commentary on the First Fifty Discourses (1. Mūlapaṇṇāsa-
aṭṭhakathā)

4. The Greater Chapter on Pairs (4. Mahāyamakavaggo)



PaliVerse

2. The Collection of the Middle Length Discourses - Commentaries

1. Commentary on the First Fifty Discourses

4. The Greater Chapter on Pairs

1. Commentary on the Cūḷagosiṅga Sutta

325. "Thus have I heard" - this is the Cūḷagosiṅga Sutta (the Shorter Discourse on Gosiṅga). Therein, "was dwelling at Nātikā" means Nātikā is the name of two villages of the sons of two brothers - a younger uncle and an elder uncle - situated in dependence on one lake; in one of those villages. "Giṇḍakāvasatthe" means in a public rest-house made of bricks. At one time, it is said, the Blessed One, while caring for the welfare of the public, wandering on a journey in the Vajji country, arrived at Nātikā. The people dwelling at Nātikā, having given a great gift to the Blessed One, having heard a talk on the Teaching, with confident hearts, having consulted saying "We shall make a dwelling place for the Teacher," with bricks alone, making a mansion showing walls, staircases, pillars, figures of fierce animals and so on, having plastered it with lime, having completed garland-work, creeper-work and so on, having prepared ground coverings, beds, chairs and so on, they dedicated it to the Teacher. Furthermore, again and again the people had night-quarters, day-quarters, pavilions, walking paths and so on built for the community of monks. Thus that monastery was great. With reference to that it was said "in the brick house."

"Gosiṅgasālavanadāye" means there, from the trunk of one chief tree, a branch arose having the shape of a cow's horn; with reference to that tree, the entire wood came to be reckoned as the Gosiṅga Sal-tree Wood. "Dāya" is a name for forest without distinction. Therefore "Gosiṅgasālavanadāye" means the Gosiṅga Sal-tree Wood forest - this is the meaning. "Viharanti" means they dwell experiencing the flavour of concord. For the time when these sons of good family were worldlings was spoken of in the Uparipaṇṇāsaka; here, the time when they had eliminated the mental corruptions. For at that time, having found gratification, having found support, having attained the analytical knowledges, having become ones who had eliminated the mental corruptions, they dwelt there experiencing the flavour of concord. With reference to that, this was said.

"He went to the Gosiṅga Sal-tree Wood" means without addressing anyone - neither the Elder Mahāmoggallāna, the General of the Teaching, nor the eighty great disciples, nor even at least the Elder Ānanda, the Treasurer of the Teaching - taking his bowl and robe by himself, like an elephant departed from the military unit, like a dark lion departed from the herd, like a rain cloud broken off by the wind, he approached entirely alone. But why did the Blessed One go there himself? Three sons of good family were dwelling experiencing the flavour of concord; because of encouraging them, because of compassion for future generations, and because of his reverence for the Teaching. For thus it occurred to him - "I shall encourage these sons

of good family, exalt them, exchange friendly welcome with them, and expound to them the Teaching." Thus, for now, he went because of encouraging them. Furthermore, this occurred to him - "In the future, sons of good family, thinking 'The Perfectly Enlightened One himself went to the presence of those dwelling in harmonious living, exchanged friendly welcome, spoke the Teaching, and encouraged the three sons of good family - who indeed would not live in harmonious living?' considering that one should live in harmonious living, will quickly make an end of suffering." Thus he went also out of compassion for future generations. And Buddhas are indeed those who revere the Teaching, and that state of reverence for the Teaching of theirs is made manifest in the Rathavinīta Sutta itself. Thus, also because of this reverence for the Teaching, thinking "I shall uphold the Teaching," he went.

"Dāyapāla" means a forest-keeper. He, sitting at the fitted gate of that forest enclosed by a fence so that people do not enter at whatever spot they wish and carry away flowers, or fruits, or resin, or building materials from there, guards and protects that forest. Therefore he is called "grove-keeper." "Attakāmarūpā" means having the nature of desiring their own welfare, they dwell. For whoever, even having gone forth in this Dispensation, earns his livelihood by the twenty-one wrong means of livelihood by way of the practice of medicine, messenger duty, errand-going and so on, this one is not called one intent on his own welfare. But whoever, having gone forth in this Dispensation, having abandoned the twenty-one wrong means of livelihood, having become established in the fourfold purification morality, having learnt the word of the Buddha, having determined the suitable ascetic practices, having taken up a meditation subject agreeable to one's own mind among the thirty-eight objects, having abandoned the village boundary, having entered the forest, having produced meditative attainments, dwells doing the work of insight - this one is called one intent on his own welfare. Those three sons of good family too were of such a nature. Therefore it was said - "Dwelling intent on their own welfare."

"Do not cause them discomfort" means "do not make discomfort for them" - he obstructed the Blessed One. For thus it occurred to him - "These sons of good family dwell in unity, but in certain places where one has gone, quarrels, disputes, and contentions take place; like a fierce bull with sharp horns, he goes about goring; and along one path there is no going for two; perhaps this one too, doing thus, might break the harmonious dwelling of these sons of good family. Moreover, this one is pleasing, golden-coloured, greedy for liquor, methinks; from the time of his going, by speaking the praise of generous donors and of his own attendants and so on, he might break the diligent abiding of these sons of good family. And the dwelling places of these sons of good family are fixed and limited - three leaf-huts, three walking paths, three day-residences, and three beds and chairs. But this ascetic has a large body and is, methinks, rather senior. He will evict these sons of good family from their lodgings at an improper time. Thus in every way there will be discomfort for them." Not wishing that, he obstructed the Blessed One, saying "Do not cause them discomfort."

But did he obstruct knowing, or not knowing? Not knowing. For although indeed from the time of the Truth-finder's taking of conception, wonders such as the trembling of the ten-thousand world-systems and so on occurred, forest-dwelling people of weak understanding, occupied with their own work, are unable to observe them. For when

the Perfectly Enlightened One goes about surrounded by many thousands of monks, displaying the majestic power of the Buddha with the fathom-wide halo, the eighty minor marks, and the splendour of the thirty-two marks of a great man, then he is to be known without even asking "Who is this?" But at that time the Blessed One, having concealed all that majestic power of the Buddha within the folds of his robe, like a full moon concealed within the mass of clouds, taking his bowl and robes himself, went in the guise of an unknown person. Thus the grove-keeper obstructed him not knowing.

"He said this" means the Elder, it is said, having merely heard the grove-keeper's words "Do not, ascetic," thought - "We three persons dwell here; there are no other gone-forth ones; yet this grove-keeper speaks as if with one gone forth - who could it be?" Having emerged from the day-residence, standing at the door, looking along the road, he saw the Blessed One. The Blessed One too, with the very seeing of the Elder, released the radiance of his body; the fathom-wide halo resplendent with the eighty minor marks shone like an unrolled cloth of gold. The Elder, restraining him, thinking "This grove-keeper, like one stretching out his hand to seize a venomous snake with its hood spread, does not know that he is speaking with the foremost person in the world; he speaks as if with just some monk," spoke this utterance beginning with "Do not, friend grove-keeper."

"He approached" - why did he approach without going out to meet the Blessed One? For thus it occurred to him - "We three persons dwell in harmonious dwelling; if I alone go out to meet him, there will be no harmonious dwelling" - I shall go out to meet him only having taken my dear friends. "And just as the Blessed One is dear to me, so too he is dear to my companions" - wishing to go out to meet him together with them, without doing so himself, he approached. Some say, however, that the road of the Blessed One's coming was at the end of the walking path at the door of those Elders' leaf-huts; therefore the Elder went as if giving them a signal. "Come forth" means come here. "He washed the feet" means having taken crystal-coloured water with his webbed hands resembling blooming lotuses, having poured water on the golden-coloured upper parts of the feet, rubbing foot against foot, he washed them. Dust and dirt do not adhere to the body of the Buddhas - why then did he wash them? For the purpose of the body adjusting to the temperature, and for the purpose of gladdening their minds. "The Blessed One washed his feet with water brought by us, he made use of it" - the minds of those monks were gladdened by the power of strong joy; therefore he washed them. "The Blessed One said this to the Venerable Anuruddha" - he, it is said, was the most senior among them.

326. Since when support has been given to him, it has been given to the rest as well - thus he spoke to the Elder himself this utterance beginning with "Is it bearable for you, Anuruddha?" Therein, "kacci" is an indeclinable particle used in the sense of questioning. "Vo" is the genitive case. This is what is meant - Is it bearable for you, Anuruddha, does the deportment agree with you? Is it endurable, does your life sustain itself, does it get on? Are you not troubled about almsfood, is almsfood easily obtainable for you, do people, having seen you arrived, think that a ladle of rice gruel or a ladle of almsfood should be given - thus he asks about the duty of going for alms. Why? For indeed, when one is not troubled by requisites, it is possible to perform the ascetic duty, or this is simply the duty of those gone forth. Then, when the reply had been given by him, asking about the flavour of concord, thinking "Anuruddha, you

have gone forth from royalty, you are of great merit; if people do not give to you who are dwelling in the forest, to whom else would they think it should be given? But you, having eaten this, do you dwell clashing with one another like young deer, or is there a state of unity among you?" - he said beginning with "But do you, Anuruddha, dwell in unity?"

Therein, "blended like milk and water" means just as milk and water run together with each other, do not become separate, and come to unity as it were - he asks: do you thus dwell with inclinations of consciousness that have come to unity through the power of concord? "With eyes of affection" means the eyes of looking, having established a mind of friendliness, are called eyes of affection. He asks: do you dwell regarding one another with such eyes? "Truly" (taggha) is an indeclinable particle used in a definitive sense. This is what is meant: definitely we, venerable sir. In "but in what way" (yathā kathaṃ pana), here "yathā" is merely a particle. "Kathaṃ" is a question about the reason. This is what is meant: but how do you dwell thus, by what reason do you dwell, tell me that reason. "Bodily action of friendliness" means bodily action carried out through the influence of a mind of friendliness. "Both openly and in private" means face to face and in one's absence. The same method applies to the others as well.

Therein, bodily and verbal actions face to face are obtained when living together; the others when living apart. Mental action is obtained everywhere. For when among those living together, a bed and chair, or wooden goods, or clay goods have been badly placed outside by one of them, for one who, having seen that, without showing contempt thinking "By whom was this used?", having taken it as if badly placed by oneself, puts it in order, or else for one who tends a place that ought to be tended - this is called bodily action of friendliness face to face. When one has departed, for one who puts away the lodging requisite badly placed by him in the same way, or else for one who tends a place that ought to be tended - this is called bodily action of friendliness in one's absence. But for one living together with them, in such matters as sweet pleasant talk, friendly welcome talk, memorable talk, talk on the Teaching, melodic recital, discussion, asking of questions, and answering of questions - this is called verbal action of friendliness face to face. But when the elders have departed, speaking of qualities such as "My dear companion the Elder Nandiya, the Elder Kimila, is thus accomplished in morality, thus accomplished in good conduct" and so on - this is called verbal action of friendliness in one's absence. But for one who attends thus: "May my dear friend the Elder Nandiya, the Elder Kimila, be free from enmity, free from affliction, may he be happy" - both face to face and in one's absence, there is indeed mental action of friendliness.

"For our bodies are indeed different, venerable sir" means for the body, like flour and like clay, cannot be kneaded together and made into one. "But our minds, methinks, are one" shows that our mind is just one in the sense of welfare, in the sense of being without interval, in the sense of being without strife, and in the sense of being united. But how did they, having set aside their own mind, act according to the mind of the others? For one, stain arises on the bowl; for one, the robe becomes soiled; for one, there is plastering work to be done. Therein, when the one on whose bowl stain had arisen said "Friend, stain has arisen on my bowl; it is proper to cook it," the others, without saying "My robe is soiled and should be washed, my plastering should be

done," having entered the forest, having brought firewood, having chopped it, having done the plastering of the bowl-cauldron, after that they either wash a robe or do the plastering. Even when one announced first "Friend, my robe is soiled, it is proper to wash it; my leaf-hut is dirty, it is proper to do the plastering" - the same method applies.

327. "Good, good, Anuruddha" - the Blessed One, above, when it was said "and we, venerable sir, are not troubled about almsfood," did not give applause. Why? For this edible food is indeed something habitually practised by these beings both in the realm of misery and in the world of gods and humans. But this world community is for the most part plunging into contention; in the realm of misery and in the world of gods and humans too, these beings are indeed opposed to one another; the time of their unity is rare, it occurs only occasionally - because of the rarity of living in unity, here the Blessed One gave applause. Now, asking about the characteristic of their diligence, he said beginning with "But do you, Anuruddha?" Therein, "vo" is merely an indeclinable particle, or it is the reflexive case; the meaning is "do you?" "Among us" means among us three persons. "Returns from almsfood" means having walked for almsfood in the village, he comes back. "Slop basin" means he washes and sets out one casket-like bowl for the purpose of removing and placing aside the surplus almsfood.

"Whoever last" - it is said that those elders did not enter the alms round all together, for they were delighting in fruition attainment. Right early, having attended to their toilet, having fulfilled the duty practice, having entered the lodging, having determined the time limit, having attained fruition attainment, they sit down. Among them, whoever sat down earlier rises earlier according to his own time determination; he, having walked for almsfood and returned, having come to the place for taking meals, knows - "Two monks are behind; I have come first." Then, having covered the bowl, having prepared the seats and so on, if there is in the bowl just the right amount for a portion, having sat down, he eats. If there is surplus, having put it into the slop basin, having covered the basin, he eats. Having finished his meal, having washed the bowl, having dried it, having put it into the bag, having taken his bowl and robes, he enters his own dwelling place. The second one too, just upon arriving, knows - "One has come first, one is behind." If the food in the bowl is just the right measure, he eats. If it is little, having taken from the slop basin, he eats. If there is surplus, having put it into the slop basin, having eaten just the right measure, like the former elder, he enters his dwelling place. The third one too, just upon arriving, knows - "Two have come first; I am behind." He too, having eaten like the second elder, having finished his meal, having washed the bowl, having dried it, having put it into the bag, having picked up the seats, sets them in order; having thrown away the remaining water in the drinking water pot or the water pot for washing, having turned the pots upside down, if there is remaining food in the slop basin, having abandoned it in the manner stated, having washed the basin, he sets it in order; he sweeps the refectory. Then, having thrown away the rubbish, having picked up the broom, having placed it in a spot free from termites, having taken his bowl and robes, he enters his dwelling place. This is the duty of the elders in the refectory, the place for taking meals, in the forest outside the monastery. With reference to this, "whoever last" and so on was said.

"Whoever sees" and so on, however, should be understood as their duty within the dwelling. Therein, "toilet water pot" means the vessel for rinsing. "Empty" means void. "Hollow" is a synonym for that very thing. "Too heavy for him" means unable to lift, excessively heavy. "By hand gesture" means by a hand signal. It is said that they, having taken whichever one among the drinking water pots and so on that was hollow, having gone to the pond, having washed it inside and outside, having filtered the water, having placed it on the bank, they call another monk by hand gesture; they do not make a sound either specifically or indefinitely. Why do they not make a sound specifically? Because the sound might disturb that monk. Why do they not make a sound indefinitely? If a sound were given indefinitely, both might come out saying "I first, I first," and then, in a task to be done by two, there would be a cutting off of work for the third. But having become one with restrained footsteps, having gone near the daytime resting place of the other monk, having known that he has been seen by him, he makes a hand signal; by that signal the other comes, then the two persons, clasping hand with hand, having placed it on both hands, set it up. With reference to that he said - "Having called a second by hand gesture, we set it up by joining hands."

"Every five days" - the fourteenth, the fifteenth, and the eighth - this, for now, is just the regular hearing of the Teaching; having kept that unbroken, every fifth day two elders, having bathed not too late, go to the dwelling place of the Elder Anuruddha. There, all three having sat down, they ask each other questions on one of the three Canons, they answer each other; while they are thus doing, dawn rises. With reference to that, this was said. To this extent, by the Elder, when asked by the Blessed One about the characteristic of diligence, the characteristic of diligence was answered in the very grounds of heedlessness. For other monks, the time of entering for the alms round, the time of departing, the changing of the inner robe, the putting on of the robe, walking for almsfood within the village, expounding the Teaching, thanksgiving, having departed from the village the taking of the meal, the washing of the bowl, the putting away of the bowl, the storing of the bowl and robes - these are the grounds for making obsession. Therefore the Elder, showing that "apart from this much for us, there is no such thing as a time for heedlessness," answered the characteristic of diligence in the very grounds of heedlessness.

328. Then the Blessed One, having given him applause, asking about the first meditative absorption, again said beginning with "But is there for you." Therein, "super-human achievement" means beyond human achievement. "A distinction of knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones" means a distinction of knowledge capable of producing the noble state. "How could there not be, venerable sir" means why, venerable sir, would it not have been attained? It has indeed been attained. "Whenever" means just whenever.

329. When the attainment of the first meditative absorption had been thus answered, asking about the second meditative absorption and so on, he said beginning with "But for you, of this." Therein, "for the transcendence" means for the purpose of transcendence. "For the cessation" means for the purpose of cessation. The remainder should be understood by the method stated everywhere. But in the last question, asking about the attainment of cessation attained by means of supramundane knowledge and vision, he said "a distinction of knowledge and vision

worthy of the noble ones." The Elder too answered in accordance with the question. Therein, since bliss without feeling is more peaceful and more sublime than bliss with feeling, therefore he said "we do not perceive any other comfortable abiding more superior or more sublime."

330. "In talk on the Teaching" means with a talk on the Teaching connected with the benefit of the taste of concord. All of them too had completed their function regarding the four truths; therefore there was nothing to be spoken for the purpose of their penetration. But "through the taste of concord, this and this is the benefit" - the Blessed One spoke to them only about the benefit of the taste of concord. "Having accompanied the Blessed One" means having followed. It is said that they, having taken the Blessed One's bowl and robes, went a little way; then the Blessed One, when they had gone to the boundary of the monastery's residential area, said "Bring me my bowl and robes; you stay right here," and departed. "Having turned back from there" means having turned back from the place where they were standing. "Did we indeed report to the Venerable" - even though they had achieved the going forth and so on in dependence on the Blessed One, being distressed by the talk of their own virtues, they said this out of fewness of wishes regarding their achievement. "Of these and these" means of the mundane and supramundane beginning with the first meditative absorption and so on. "Known, having encompassed mind with mind" means "Today the venerable ones spent time in mundane attainment, today in supramundane" - thus it was known having discerned mind with mind. "Deities also reported to me" - the meaning is: "Venerable sir Anuruddha, today the noble Elder Nandiya, today the noble Elder Kimila spent time in this and this attainment" - thus they reported. "When asked a question" means that too, whether known by me myself or reported by deities - having raised the discussion "just by this much my mouth is ready" - it was not spoken by me without being asked. But when asked a question by the Blessed One, when a question was asked, it was declared by me mindfully; "what therein does not please you?" he said.

331. "Dīgha" means one king of gods among the twenty-eight demon generals, who has come thus: "Maṇi, Māṇivara, Dīgha, and also Serīsaka together." "Parajana" is the name of that very demon. "He approached the Blessed One" means he, it is said, having been sent by Vessavaṇa, while going to that place, saw the Blessed One in between the brick house and the Gosiṅga Sal Grove, having taken the bowl and robes himself. The Blessed One, having taken the bowl and robes himself, goes to the presence of the three sons of good family in the Gosiṅga Sal Grove. Today there will be a great proclamation of the Teaching. "I too should be a partaker of that teaching" - having gone with an invisible body, following step by step after the Teacher, having stood not far away, having heard the Teaching, even when the Teacher was leaving, he did not go - but stood right there for the purpose of seeing "What will these elders do?" Then, having seen those two elders pressing the Elder Anuruddha - having thought "These elders, having achieved all virtues beginning with the going forth in dependence on the Blessed One, are stingy towards the Blessed One himself, they do not endure it, they very much hide and conceal; I shall not now allow them to conceal, I shall make known their virtues from the earth up to the Brahma world," he approached the Blessed One.

"It is a gain indeed, venerable sir" means those who are inhabitants of the Vajji country who are able to see the Blessed One and these three sons of good family, who are able to pay homage, who are able to give gifts, who are able to hear the Teaching - it is a gain for them, venerable sir, for the Vajjis - this is the meaning. "Having heard the sound" means he, it is said, by his own power as a demon, having made a great sound, overwhelming the entire Vajji country, uttered that speech. And thereby the terrestrial deities dwelling in those trees, mountains, and so on heard the sound. With reference to that it was said - "having heard the sound." "Proclaimed" means having heard the great sound, they announced. This same method applies everywhere. "As far as the Brahma world" means as far as the Akaniṭṭha Brahma world. "If that family" - "Having gone forth from our family, these sons of good family who have gone forth are thus moral, virtuous, accomplished in good conduct, of good character" - thus if that family were to remember these three sons of good family with a gladdened mind - thus the meaning should be understood everywhere. Thus the Blessed One concluded the teaching according to the very same connection.

In the Papañcasūdanī, the commentary on the Majjhima Nikāya,

The commentary on the Cūḷagosiṅga Sutta is completed.

2. Commentary on the Mahāgosiṅga Sutta

332. "Thus have I heard" - this is the Mahāgosiṅga Discourse. Therein, "in the Gosiṅga Sal-tree Wood" - this was stated for the purpose of showing the dwelling place. For in other discourses, having first shown the village as food resort thus: "He dwells at Sāvattihī in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika's park," afterwards it shows the dwelling place. But in this Mahāgosiṅga Discourse, the Blessed One's village as food resort was not fixed; whatever village would have been the village as food resort. Therefore only the dwelling place was made clear. This discourse is indeed called one with a forest origin. "With many" means with numerous. "Well-known well-known" means renowned everywhere, famous. "Together with elder disciples" means elders because of being endowed with states that make one firm, such as Pātimokkha restraint and so on; together with disciples because of having been born at the end of hearing, together as one. Now, showing those elders in their own form, he said beginning with "with the Venerable Sāriputta." Therein, the Venerable Sāriputta was well-known in the Buddha's Dispensation through his own virtues such as morality and so on. He was famous and recognised like the sun standing in the midst of the sky for those with eyes, like the moon, and like the ocean for those standing on the seashore. And his greatness should not be understood only by means of the virtues mentioned in this discourse; the greatness of the elder should be understood also by means of these other discourses: the Dhammadāyāda Sutta, the Anaṅgaṇa Sutta, the Sammādiṭṭhi Sutta, the Sīhanāda Sutta, the Rathavinīta, the Mahāhatthipadopama, the Mahāvedalla, the Cātuma Sutta, the Dīghanakha, the Anupada Sutta, the Sevitaḍḍhasevitaḍḍha Sutta, the Saccavibhaṅga Sutta, the Piṇḍapātapārisuddhi, the Sampasādanīya, the Saṅgīti Sutta, the Dasuttara Sutta, the Pavāraṇā Sutta, the Susima Sutta, the Therapaṇha Sutta, the Mahāniddesa, the Paṭisambhidāmagga, the Therasīhanāda Sutta, the Renunciation, and the Foremost. For in the Foremost, it was said: "This is the foremost, monks, of my disciples who are monks of great wisdom, namely Sāriputta."

Mahāmoggallāna too, through virtues such as morality and so on and through the virtues mentioned in this discourse, was well-known, famous, and great, like the elder. Furthermore, his greatness should be understood also by means of these: the Anumāna Sutta, the Cūḷataṇhāsaṅkhaya Sutta, the Māratajjaniya Sutta, the shaking of the mansion, the entire Iddhipāda Saṃyutta, the taming of Nandopananda, the going to the world of the gods at the time of the Twin Wonder, the Vimānavatthu, the Petavatthu, the elder's renunciation, and the Foremost. For in the Foremost, it was said: "This is the foremost, monks, of my disciples who are monks possessing supernormal power, namely Mahāmoggallāna."

Mahākassapa too, through virtues such as morality and so on and through the virtues mentioned in this discourse, was well-known, famous, and great, like the elder. Furthermore, his greatness should be understood also by means of these: the Cīvaraparivattana Sutta, the Jijñacīvara Sutta, the Candopama, the entire Kassapa Saṃyutta, the Mahāariyavaṃsa Sutta, the elder's renunciation, and the Foremost. For in the Foremost, it was said: "This is the foremost, monks, of my disciples who are monks who advocate ascetic practices, namely Mahākassapa."

The Elder Anuruddha too, through virtues such as morality and so on and through the virtues mentioned in this discourse, was well-known, famous, and great, like the elder. Furthermore, his greatness should be understood also by means of these: the Cūḷagosiṅga Sutta, the Naḷakapāna Sutta, the Anuttariya Sutta, the Upakkilesa Sutta, the Anuruddha Saṃyutta, the Mahāpurisavittakka Sutta, the elder's renunciation, and the Foremost. For in the Foremost, it was said: "This is the foremost, monks, of my disciples who are monks possessing the divine eye, namely Anuruddha."

"And with the Venerable Revata" - here, however, there are two Revatas: Khadiravaniya Revata and Kaṅkhā Revata. Therein, Khadiravaniya Revata was the youngest brother of the Elder who was the General of the Teaching; he is not intended here. But the elder who was full of uncertainty thus: "Molasses is not allowable, green peas are not allowable" - he is intended here as Revata. He too, through virtues such as morality and so on and through the virtues mentioned in this discourse, was well-known, famous, and great, like the elder. Furthermore, his greatness should be understood also by means of his renunciation and the Foremost. For in the Foremost, it was said: "This is the foremost, monks, of my disciples who are monks who are meditators, namely Kaṅkhārevata."

The Elder Ānanda too, by virtues beginning with morality and by the virtues mentioned in this discourse, was well-known, renowned, and great, just like an elder. But further, his greatness should be understood by means of these too: the Sekha Sutta, the Bāhitika Sutta, the Āneñjasappāya, the Gopakamoggallāna, the Bahudhātuka, the Cūḷasuññata, the Mahāsuññata, the Acchariyabbhuta Sutta, the Bhaddekaratta, the Mahānidāna, the Mahāparinibbāna, the Subha Sutta, the Cūḷaniya Lokadhātu Sutta, the Renunciation, and the Foremost. For in the Foremost, it was said: "This is the foremost, monks, of my disciples who are monks who are very learned, namely Ānanda."

"And with other well-known well-known" means not only with these alone, but the meaning is that the Blessed One was dwelling in the Gosiṅga Sal-tree Wood together with many other elder disciples who were well-known, renowned for their great virtue.

For the Venerable Sāriputta, himself of great wisdom, having taken many other monks of great wisdom too, at that time surrounded the one of ten powers and dwelt there. The Venerable Mahāmoggallāna himself possessed supernormal power, the Venerable Mahākassapa himself was an advocate of austere practices, the Venerable Anuruddha himself possessed the divine eye, the Venerable Revata himself delighted in meditative absorption, the Venerable Ānanda himself was very learned and, having taken many other very learned monks too, at that time surrounded the one of ten powers and dwelt there. Thus it should be understood that at that time these and other well-known great elders, approximately thirty thousand monks, surrounded the one of ten powers and dwelt there.

"Having emerged from seclusion" means having emerged from the seclusion of fruition attainment. "He approached the Venerable Mahākassapa": the Elder, it is said, having emerged from seclusion, looking towards the western world system, saw the orb of the sun, a full fifty yojanas in extent, going to its setting - like an earring falling from the ear of an intoxicated warrior playing at the forest's edge, like a red woollen blanket being folded up and placed into a casket, and like a golden bowl worth a hundred thousand falling from an ivory peg. Immediately after that, looking towards the eastern world system, he saw the disc of the moon, forty-nine yojanas in extent, adorned with the hare-mark, having risen from the belly of the ocean of cloud-like colour and standing upon the summit of the eastern world-encircling mountain - like a silver wheel being turned by grasping its rim, like a stream of milk emerging from a silver peak, and like a white swan spreading its wings and springing forth across the expanse of the sky. Then he looked at the Sāla grove. For at that time the Sāla trees, from the root up to the top, entirely in full bloom, shone as if wrapped in fine cloth, and as if encircled with clusters of pearls. The ground surface was as if adorned with an offering of a carpet of flowers, and as if being sprinkled with lac-colouring by the flower pollen falling here and there. Swarms of wasps and bees, intoxicated by the pollen of the blossoms, wander through the forest glades as if singing. And at that time it was indeed an Observance day. Then the Elder thought: "With what delight shall I spend the night today?" And noble disciples are indeed lovers of hearing the Teaching. Then this occurred to him - "Today, having gone to the presence of the Elder who is the General of the Teaching, my eldest brother, I shall spend the night with delight in the Teaching." But while going, rather than going alone, thinking "I shall take my dear companion, the Elder Mahākassapa, and go," having risen from his seated place, having shaken out his piece of leather, he approached the Venerable Mahākassapa.

"Yes, friend," said the Venerable Mahākassapa: the Elder too, since a noble disciple is indeed a lover of hearing the Teaching, having heard his words, without making any slight excuse such as "Go, friend; my head aches or my back aches," with a delighted heart, said beginning with "Yes, friend." And having assented, having risen from his seated place, having shaken out his piece of leather, he followed Mahāmoggallāna. At that time the two great elders shone like two discs of the moon standing in succession, like two orbs of the sun, like two six-tusked elephant kings, like two lions, and like two tigers. The Elder Anuruddha too, at that time, seated at his daytime resting place, having seen the two great elders going to the presence of the Elder Sāriputta, looking towards the western world system as if seeing the sun entering the forest's edge, looking towards the eastern world system as if seeing the moon rising

from the forest's edge, looking at the Sāla grove and having seen the Sāla grove entirely in full bloom, thinking "Today is an Observance day, and these elder brothers of mine are going to the presence of the General of the Teaching; there will be a great hearing of the Teaching; I too shall be a partaker of the hearing of the Teaching," having risen from his seated place, having shaken out his piece of leather, following step by step after the great elders, he went forth. Therefore it was said - "Then the Venerable Mahāmoggallāna and the Venerable Mahākassapa and the Venerable Anuruddha approached the Venerable Sāriputta." "They approached": Standing in succession, shining like three moons, like three suns, and like three lions, they approached.

333. Now, when those great elders were thus approaching, the Venerable Ānanda, having seen them while still seated at his own daytime resting place, thought: "Today there will be a great hearing of the Teaching; I too should be a partaker of that. But I shall not go alone; I shall go taking also my dear companion the Elder Revata." The whole of this should be understood in detail in the same manner as stated regarding the approach of Mahāmoggallāna, Mahākassapa, and Anuruddha. Thus those two persons, standing in succession, shining like two moons, like two suns, and like two lions, approached. Therefore it was said - "The Venerable Sāriputta saw" and so on. "Having seen, he said this to the Venerable Ānanda" means having seen him from afar, when he had gradually arrived at the place of conversation, he spoke this statement beginning with "Let the Venerable come." As for "Delightful, friend" - here there is a twofold pleasantness: the pleasantness of the forest and the pleasantness of persons. Therein, a forest is one covered with ironwood trees, salaḥa trees, sāla trees, campaka trees, and so on, having dense shade, endowed with flowers and fruits, with various trees, well-supplied with water, separated from the village. This is called the pleasantness of the forest. With reference to which it was said -

"Delightful are the forests, where ordinary people do not delight;
Those without lust will delight there, they are not seekers of sensual pleasures."

But even if a forest is on barren ground, waterless, with sparse shade, strewn with thorns, noble ones beginning with Buddhas dwell here. This is called the pleasantness of persons. With reference to which it was said -

"Whether in a village or in the wilderness, in a low place or on high ground;
Wherever Worthy Ones dwell, that place is pleasant."

But here both kinds are found. For at that time the Gosiṅga Sāla-tree Grove was entirely in full bloom, fragrant with the scent of flowers, and here in the world including the gods, the foremost person, the Perfectly Enlightened One, dwells together with approximately thirty thousand well-known monks. With reference to that it was said - "Delightful, friend Ānanda, is the Gosiṅga Sāla-tree Grove."

"Moonlit" means free from faults; it is said to mean free from these five impurities, namely clouds, frost, smoke, dust, and Rāhu. "Entirely in full bloom" means in full bloom everywhere; from the root up to the top there is no place whatsoever that is not in flower. "Divine, methinks, are the odours wafting around" means they blow forth all around like the odours of mandāra flowers, koviḷāra flowers, coral tree

flowers, and sandalwood powder; it is said to mean they blow as if it were a place descended upon by Sakka, Suyāma, Santusita, Nimmānarati, Paranimmita, and Mahābrahmā.

As for "By what kind of monk, friend Ānanda" - the Elder Ānanda was the most junior in the community among those five elders. Why did the elder ask him first? Because of cherishing. For those two elders cherished each other. The Elder Sāriputta cherished the Elder Ānanda, thinking "He performs the attendance upon the Teacher that should be done by me." The Elder Ānanda cherished the Elder Sāriputta, thinking "He is the foremost among the Blessed One's disciples," and having given the going forth to sons of good families, he had them take the Elder Sāriputta as their preceptor. The Elder Sāriputta too did likewise. Thus, each one having given his own bowl and robes, having given the going forth, and having had them take a preceptor, there were five hundred monks each. The Venerable Ānanda, having obtained even superior robes and so on, gave them to the Elder himself.

It is said that a certain brahmin thought - "Veneration of the jewel of the Buddha and the jewel of the Community is apparent; but how is the jewel of the Teaching venerated?" He, having approached the Blessed One, asked about this matter. The Blessed One said - "If, brahmin, you wish to venerate the jewel of the Teaching, venerate one who is very learned." "Please point out one who is very learned, venerable sir" - he asks the community of monks. He, having approached the community of monks, said "Please point out one who is very learned, venerable sir." "The Elder Ānanda, brahmin." The brahmin venerated the Elder with a robe worth a thousand. The Elder, having taken it, went to the presence of the Blessed One. The Blessed One said "From where, Ānanda, was this obtained?" "It was given by a certain brahmin, venerable sir, but I wish to give this to the Venerable Sāriputta." "Give it, Ānanda." "He has departed on a journey, venerable sir." "Give it when he has arrived." "A training rule has been laid down, venerable sir." "But when will Sāriputta arrive?" "In about ten days, venerable sir." "I allow, Ānanda, an extra robe to be kept for ten days at most" - thus he laid down the training rule. The Elder Sāriputta likewise, whatever agreeable thing he obtains, he gives it to the Elder Ānanda. Thus those elders cherished each other; therefore, because of that cherishing, he asked him first.

Furthermore, this is called a question of approval, which should be asked beginning from the most junior. Therefore the Elder thought - "I shall first ask Ānanda; Ānanda will declare his own discernment. Then I shall ask Revata, Anuruddha, Mahākassapa, and Mahāmoggallāna. Mahāmoggallāna will declare his own discernment. Then all five elders will ask me, and I too shall declare my own discernment." Even to that extent, this proclamation of the Teaching will not have reached its crest and expansion; then we shall all approach the one of ten powers and ask, and the Teacher will declare it with the knowledge of omniscience. To that extent, this proclamation of the Teaching will have reached its crest and expansion. For just as a legal case arisen in a district reaches the village headman, when he is unable to judge it, it reaches the district headman, when he is unable, the chief minister of justice, when he is unable, the general, when he is unable, the viceroy, when he is unable to judge it, it reaches the king; from the time it is judged by the king, the case does not pass back and forth any further, but is settled by the word of the king alone. Just so, I shall first ask

Ānanda, etc. Then we shall all approach the one of ten powers and ask, and the Teacher will declare it with the knowledge of omniscience. To that extent, this proclamation of the Teaching will have reached its crest and expansion. Thus, asking the question of approval, the Elder first asked the Elder Ānanda.

"He is very learned" means he has much learning; the meaning is that the ninefold Teacher's instruction has been learnt by way of the Pāḷi, connection, and what precedes and follows. "Remembering what has been learnt" means one who is the support of learning. For whoever what is taken from here runs away from here, does not remain like water in a pot with holes, and is not able to speak or recite even a single discourse or birth story in the midst of the assembly, this one is not called one who remembers what has been learnt. But for whoever the teaching of the Buddha that has been learnt remains just as it was at the time of learning, and does not perish even for one not rehearsing for ten or twenty years, this one is called one who remembers what has been learnt. "Having great accumulation of learning" means one who is the accumulation of learning. For just as learning accumulated in the casket of the heart remains holding fast, like an inscription on stone, and like lion's fat placed in a golden pot, this one is called one having great accumulation of learning.

"Retained" means established and well-practised. For a certain person, the teaching of the Buddha that has been learnt is not retained, well-practised, and unmoved; when told "Speak such and such a discourse or birth story," he says "I shall know after having recited, compared, and questioned about it." For a certain person, what is retained and well-practised is like the stream of the life-continuum; when told "Speak such and such a discourse or birth story," he draws it out and speaks that very thing. With reference to that it was said "retained."

"Practised in speech" means recited by voice by way of groups of ten discourses, groups of ten chapters, and groups of ten sets of fifty. "Contemplated in mind" means contemplated by consciousness; for whoever, when thinking with the mind about the teaching of the Buddha that has been recited by voice, it becomes obvious here and there. It appears like material form to one standing having kindled a great lamp. With reference to that it was said - "practised in speech, contemplated in mind."

"Thoroughly penetrated by view" means thoroughly penetrated by wisdom as to meaning and as to reason. "With coherent phrases and sentences": herein, the term itself is the phrase and sentence because it expresses the meaning; when that is made complete in syllables and stated without omitting the tenfold understanding of phrasing, it is called coherent; the meaning is with phrases and sentences of such a kind. Furthermore, whatever monk, while expounding the Teaching to the assembly, having laid down a discourse or birth story, brings in another discourse that causes censure, speaks a simile for it, examines its meaning, thus having taken this up and casting it here, managing on one side only, having known the time, he rises. But the laid-down discourse remains merely laid down; his talk is called incoherent. But whoever, having laid down a discourse or birth story, without going even a single word outside, without obscuring the connection and what precedes and follows of the Pāḷi, standing on the method given by the teachers, goes like one marking out with a brush, like one sending water through a deep channel, like a thoroughbred Sindh horse striking the ground step by step, his talk is called coherent. With reference to such talk - "with coherent phrases and sentences" was said.

"Coherent": herein, whatever monk, while speaking the Teaching, having begun a discourse or birth story, from the very time of beginning, very hurriedly, like one churning a fire-stick, like one eating hot solid food, treating what is grasped in the connections and what precedes and follows of the Pāḷi as just grasped and what is not grasped as just not grasped, like one flushing out an iguana moving among old leaves, striking here and there, bringing to an end, goes leaving it behind. Also whoever, while speaking the Teaching, at times speaks quickly, at times slowly, at times with a loud voice, at times with a soft voice. Just as a ghost-fire at times burns and at times goes out, just so here one is called a ghost-fire Teaching-speaker; when the assembly wishes to rise, he begins again and again. Also whoever, while speaking, spreads out here and there, speaks as if groaning and crying, the talk of all these is called disconnected. But whoever, having begun a discourse, standing on the method given by the teachers, making an unbroken flow, sets it going like a river stream, sets the talk going continuously like water falling from the celestial Ganges, his talk is coherent. With reference to that it was said "coherent." "For the uprooting of the underlying tendencies" means for the purpose of uprooting the seven underlying tendencies. "By such a monk" means by such a very learned monk, or by a hundred monks or a thousand monks of such a kind, seated with the corner of one double robe touching the corner of another double robe, or with one cross-legged sitting touching another cross-legged sitting, the Gosiṅga Sāla-tree Grove would be adorned. By this method, the meaning should be understood in all instances.

334. "Seclusion is his delight" means "one who delights in seclusion." "Devoted to seclusion" means "one who is devoted to seclusion."

335. "A thousand worlds" means a thousand world systems. For this much is the elder's constant practice, dependent on advertizing; but if the elder wishes, he surveys even many thousands of world-systems. "Gone up to the upper terrace of an excellent mansion" means gone up to the upper part of an excellent mansion of seven stories or nine stories. "Might survey a thousand wheel-rims" means having opened the windows, he might look at a thousand wheel-rims in the mansion courtyard, established with their naves on the ground, standing with rim touching rim; for him the naves too are obvious, the spokes too, the spaces between the spokes too, and the rims too. "Just so indeed, friends" means: friends, thus this monk too, endowed with the divine eye, with the divine eye surpassing the human, surveys a thousand worlds. For him, just as the wheel-naves are to the man standing in the mansion, so in the thousand world-systems, a thousand Sinerus are obvious. Just as the spokes, the islands are obvious. Just as the spaces between the spokes, the human beings dwelling on the islands are obvious. Just as the rims, the world-encircling mountains are obvious.

336. "Forest-dweller" means one who has taken upon himself the ascetic practice of dwelling in the forest. The same method applies to the remaining terms as well.

337. "They do not falter" means they do not sink down. For indeed, one who, having made it with cause and with reason, is unable to ask or answer a question, is said to falter. The meaning is: they do not do thus. "Flows on" means it proceeds like the water of a river's current.

338. "Whatever dwelling attainment" means whatever mundane dwelling attainment, whatever supramundane dwelling attainment.

339. "Good, good, Sāriputta": this applause was given to the Elder Ānanda. But the Blessed One converses with the Elder Sāriputta. This same method applies everywhere. "As Ānanda himself would" means as Ānanda himself answering rightly would answer, so it was answered by Ānanda as befitting himself only, answered in conformity with his own disposition only: this is the meaning. For the Elder Ānanda was himself also very learned, and his disposition was thus - "Oh, would that fellow monks in the Dispensation might be very learned!" Why? For to one who is very learned, what is allowable and not allowable, what is blameworthy and blameless, what is heavy and light, what is curable and incurable, is obvious. One who is very learned, having reflected upon the word of the Buddha that has been learnt, thinking "In this passage morality is spoken of, in this concentration, in this insight, in this the path, the fruition, and Nibbāna," having fulfilled morality where morality should come, having fulfilled concentration where concentration should come, having caused the seed of insight to be taken up where insight should come, having developed the path, realises the fruition. Therefore the Elder's disposition was thus - "Oh, would that fellow monks, having learnt one or two or three or four or five collections, reflecting upon them, having fulfilled morality and so on in the passages where morality and so on should come, might gradually realise the path, the fruition, and Nibbāna!" In the remaining cases too, the same method applies.

340. For the Venerable Revata was one whose disposition was towards meditative absorption, one who delighted in meditative absorption, therefore it occurred to him thus - "Oh, would that fellow monks, having sat down alone, having performed the preliminary work on a circular meditation object, having produced the eight meditative attainments, having developed insight with meditative absorption as its proximate cause, might realise the supramundane state!" Therefore he answered thus.

341. The Venerable Anuruddha possesses the divine eye, and he thinks thus - "Oh, would that fellow monks, having increased the light, with the divine eye, having seen beings passing away and arising in many thousands of world-systems, having stirred the mind with fear of the round of rebirths, having developed insight, might realise the supramundane state!" Therefore he answered thus.

342. The Venerable Mahākassapa is an advocate of austere practices, and he thinks thus - "Oh, would that fellow monks, having become advocates of austere practices, having withered craving for requisites through the power of the ascetic practices, having shaken off also other various kinds of mental defilements, having developed insight, might realise the supramundane state!" Therefore he answered thus.

343. The Venerable Mahāmoggallāna reached the summit of the perfection of concentration, but the subtle difference of consciousness, difference of aggregates, difference of elements, difference of sense bases, the recurring of meditative absorptions, the recurring of objects, the defining of factors, the defining of objects, the transition of factors, the transition of objects, the one-sided increase, and the twofold increase are manifest only to one versed in the higher teaching who is speaker of the Teaching. For one not versed in the higher teaching, when expounding

the Teaching - does not know "this is one's own doctrine, this is another's doctrine." Thinking "I shall explain one's own doctrine," he explains another's doctrine; thinking "I shall explain another's doctrine," he explains one's own doctrine; he deceives regarding the distinction of the Teaching. One versed in the higher teaching explains one's own doctrine by the procedure of one's own doctrine only, and another's doctrine by the procedure of another's doctrine only; he does not deceive regarding the distinction of the Teaching. Therefore it occurs to the Elder thus - "Oh, would that fellow monks, having become versed in the higher teaching, having brought down knowledge into subtle matters, having developed insight, might realise the supramundane state!" Therefore he answered thus.

344. The Venerable Sāriputta reached the summit of the perfection of wisdom, and only one who is wise is able to wield mastery over the mind by oneself, not one who is unwise. For one who is unwise, having come under the control of the arisen mind, even though having struggled here and there, in just a few days, having reached the state of a householder, attains calamity and disaster. Therefore it occurs to the Elder thus - "Oh, would that fellow monks, not being subject to the mind, having wielded mastery over the mind by themselves, having destroyed all its wayward struggles, not allowing it to go outside even slightly, having developed insight, might realise the supramundane state!" Therefore he answered thus.

345. "All of yours, Sāriputta, was well spoken in a way" - Sāriputta, since a monastery is indeed adorned by very learned monks too, by those delighting in meditative absorption too, by those endowed with the divine eye too, by those who advocate austere practices too, by those versed in Abhidhamma too, by those who have mastery over the mind too - there is a reason for adorning. Therefore, all of yours was well spoken in a way; by each and every reason it was indeed well spoken, not badly spoken. "But listen to me too" means but listen to my word too. "I will not break this cross-legged posture" means I will not break this cross-legged posture folded having determined the fourfold energy; the meaning is I will not release it. This, it is said, the Blessed One spoke with reference to his own great seat of enlightenment, for when his knowledge had reached maturity, having abandoned the splendour of sovereignty, having made the renunciation, having gradually ascended the ground of enlightenment, having determined the fourfold energy, having folded his legs crosswise on the unconquered divan, having become firmly resolved, seated, having crushed the heads of the three Māras, towards the break of dawn, resounding throughout the ten-thousandfold world system, he penetrated the knowledge of omniscience; with reference to that, his own great seat of enlightenment, he spoke thus. But also, having compassion for future generations, showing the essence of practice for the good worldling, he spoke thus. For the Blessed One sees - "In the future, sons of good family of such disposition will consider thus: 'The Blessed One, while teaching the Mahāgosiṅga Discourse, said: Here, Sāriputta, a monk, after the meal, etc. By such a monk, Sāriputta, would the Gosiṅga Sāla-tree Grove be adorned - we shall grasp the Blessed One's intention,' and after the meal, having returned from their alms round, having determined the fourfold energy, having become firmly resolved, they will think the ascetic duty should be done thus: 'Without attaining arahantship, we will not break this cross-legged posture.' Those, having thus practised, in just a few days will make an end of birth, ageing and death" - having compassion for these future generations, showing the essence of practice for the

good worldling, he spoke thus. "By such a monk, Sāriputta, would the Gosiṅga Sāla-tree Grove be adorned" - Sāriputta, by such a monk, without qualification, would the Gosiṅga Sāla-tree Grove be adorned - thus he concluded the teaching according to the very same connection.

In the Papañcasūdanī, the commentary on the Majjhima Nikāya,

The commentary on the Mahāgosiṅga Sutta is completed.

3. Commentary on the Mahāgopālaka Sutta

346. "Thus have I heard" - this is the Discourse on the Greater Cowherd. Therein, there are three kinds of exposition: the single-stemmed, the four-sided, and the seated-cycle. Therein, having stated the canonical text and explaining the meaning of each term is called the single-stemmed. Having shown the unwise cowherd, having shown the unwise monk, having shown the wise cowherd, having shown the wise monk - thus combining a set of four and expounding is called the four-sided. Having shown the unwise cowherd and going to the conclusion, having shown the unwise monk and going to the conclusion, having shown the wise cowherd and going to the conclusion, having shown the wise monk and going to the conclusion - this is called the seated-cycle. This is here the habitual practice of all teachers.

"With eleven, monks, factors" means with eleven portions of non-virtuous qualities. "A herd of cattle" means a group of cattle. "To look after" means having taken charge of, to go about with. "To make it prosper" means to bring about increase. "Here" means in this world. "Does not know form" means he does not know form either by counting or by colour. "Does not know by counting" means he does not know the number of his own cattle, whether a hundred or a thousand. When cows have been stolen or have run away, he does not count the herd and, thinking "Today this many are not seen," search by going about through two or three neighbouring villages or the forest; even when his own herd has entered among the cows of others, he does not count the herd and, striking with a stick thinking "These so many cows are not ours," drive them out. His lost cows remain just lost. The owners of the cattle, having seen him going about having taken others' cows, having threatened him saying "This one has been taking our milch cow for so long a time," take their own cows and go. His herd of cattle also declines, and he is also excluded from the enjoyment of the five dairy products. "Does not know by colour" means - He does not know "so many cows are white, so many are red, so many are black, so many are spotted, so many are dark," and when cows have been stolen or etc. he is also excluded from the enjoyment of the five dairy products.

"Is not skilled in characteristics" means he does not know the characteristics of various kinds such as bow, spear, and trident marks made on the bodies of the cows. When cows have been stolen or have run away, "Today the cows with such and such a mark and such and such a mark are not seen" etc. he is also excluded from the enjoyment of the five dairy products.

"Does not remove fly eggs" means on the cattle, at places struck by stumps, thorns, and so on, there is a wound. There, blue flies lay eggs; those are called fly eggs. Those should be removed with a stick and medicine should be applied. A foolish cowherd does not do so; therefore it was said - "he does not remove fly eggs." His

cattle's wounds grow, become deep, insects enter the belly, and the cattle, overcome by sickness, are unable either to eat grass as much as they wish or to drink water. Therein, the milk of the cows dries up, the speed of the bulls diminishes, and there is danger to the life of both. Thus his herd of cattle also declines, and he is also excluded from the five dairy products.

"Does not dress wounds" means a wound that has arisen in the manner already stated for cattle should be dressed by applying medicine and binding it with bark strips or fibre strips to conceal it. A foolish cowherd does not do so, and then from the wounds of his cattle juices ooze forth, they rub against one another, and thereby wounds arise in others too. Thus the cattle, overpowered by sickness, are indeed not able to eat grass as much as they like, etc. he is an outsider.

"Does not make smoke" means during the rainy season, at the time when gadflies, mosquitoes, and so on are abundant, when the herd of cattle has entered the cattle pen, smoke should be made here and there; an unwise cowherd does not do that. The herd of cattle, troubled the whole night by gadflies and so on, not obtaining sleep, on the following day lies down and sleeps here and there in the forest at the roots of trees and so on, and is indeed not able to eat grass as much as it likes, etc. he is also excluded from the enjoyment of the five dairy products.

"Does not know the ford" means he does not know whether a ford is even or uneven, full of ferocious creatures or free from ferocious creatures; he leads the cows down by an unsuitable way. At an uneven ford, the feet of those treading upon stones and so on are broken; having descended into a deep ford full of ferocious creatures, crocodiles and so on seize them. He comes to the point where it must be said "Today this many cattle are lost, today this many." Thus his herd of cattle also declines, and he is also excluded from the five dairy products.

"Does not know what has been drunk" means he does not know what has been drunk and what has not been drunk. For by a cowherd it should be known what has been drunk and what has not been drunk thus: "This cow has drunk, this one has not drunk, this one obtained a place at the watering ford, this one did not obtain one." But this one, having guarded the herd of cattle in the forest for the daytime, thinking "I shall give them water to drink," takes them to a river or a lake. There the great bulls and the lesser bulls and the strong cows, having struck the weak and old cattle with horns or ribs, having made a place for themselves, having entered the water up to thigh-depth, drink as they please. The rest, not obtaining a place, standing on the bank, drink water mixed with mud, or they remain unwatered. Then the cowherd, having struck them on the back, drives them back into the forest; there the unwatered cows, drying up with thirst, are unable to eat grass as much as they like; there the milk of the cows is cut off, the speed of the oxen diminishes, etc. he is an outsider.

"Does not know the path" means he does not know "this path is even and secure, this one is uneven, dangerous, and perilous." He, having avoided the even and secure path, leads the herd of cattle along the other path; there the cattle, overpowered by the scent of lions, tigers, and so on, or by the danger of thieves, comparable to startled deer, stand with necks raised, they indeed do not eat grass as much as they like, they do not drink water; there the milk of the cows is cut off, etc. he is an outsider.

"Is not skilled in pastures" means a cowherd should be skilled in pastures; the five-day rotation or the seven-day rotation should be known; having pastured the herd of cattle in one direction, on the following day they should not be pastured there. For a place frequented by a large herd of cattle becomes clean like the surface of a drum, devoid of grass, and the water too becomes stirred up. Therefore it is proper to pasture there again on the fifth or seventh day, for by that much the grass too grows again and the water too becomes clear. But this one does not know this five-day rotation or seven-day rotation; day after day he guards in the very same guarding place. Then his herd of cattle does not obtain green grass; eating dry grass, it drinks water mixed with mud; there the milk of the cows is cut off, etc. he is an outsider.

"And is one who milks dry" means a wise cowherd, until the flesh and blood of the calf becomes established, should be one who milks with a remainder, leaving one or two teats. This one milks without leaving anything for the calf; the milk-sucking calf, drying up with thirst for milk, being unable to become established, trembling, having fallen before its mother, dies. The mother, having seen her little one, through sorrow for her offspring, thinking "My little one does not even obtain its own mother's milk to drink," is unable to eat grass as much as she likes or to drink water; the milk in the teats is cut off. Thus his herd of cattle also declines, and he is also excluded from the five dairy products.

"They perform the father's role for the cattle" - thus they are "fathers of the herd." "They lead the cattle, taking them wherever they please" - thus they are "leaders of the herd." "Does not honour with extra veneration" means: a wise cowherd honours such bulls with extra veneration, gives them superior cattle-food, decorates them with five-finger scented marks, adorns them with garlands, places gold and silver sheaths on their horns, and at night, having lit a lamp, makes them lie down underneath a cloth canopy. But this one does not make even a single act of honour towards them. The bulls, not receiving extra veneration, do not protect the herd of cattle and do not ward off dangers. Thus his herd of cattle declines, and he becomes an outsider to the five dairy products.

347. "Here" means in this Dispensation. "Does not know form" means he does not know in two ways the materiality stated thus as "the four primary elements and the derived materiality of the four primary elements" - either by counting or by origination. "Does not know by counting" means he does not know the twenty-five portions of materiality that have come in the Pāḷi thus: "the eye sense base, the ear-nose-tongue-body sense base, the visible form-sound-odour-flavour-touch sense base, the femininity faculty, the masculinity faculty, the life faculty, bodily intimation, verbal intimation, the space element, the liquid element, lightness of materiality, malleability, wieldiness, production, continuity, decay, impermanence of materiality, edible food." Just as that cowherd does not know the form of the cattle by counting, this monk is similar to that. He, not knowing materiality by counting, is unable to comprehend materiality, define the immaterial, comprehend materiality and immateriality, observe the conditions, apply the characteristics, and bring the meditation subject to its culmination. Just as that cowherd's herd of cattle does not grow, thus he does not grow in this Dispensation by morality, concentration, insight, path, fruition, and Nibbāna; and just as that cowherd is excluded from the five dairy products, thus he is excluded from the five aggregates of the Teaching - the

aggregate of morality of one beyond training, the aggregate of concentration of one beyond training, the aggregate of wisdom, the aggregate of liberation, and the aggregate of knowledge and vision of liberation of one beyond training.

"Does not know by origination" means he does not know: "This much materiality has one origination, this much has two originations, this much has three originations, this much has four originations, this much does not originate from any source." Just as that cowherd does not know the form of the cattle by colour, this monk is similar to that. He, not knowing materiality by origination, having comprehended materiality, having defined the immaterial, etc. he is an outsider.

"Is not skilled in characteristics" means he does not know that the wholesome and unwholesome action stated thus - "the fool is characterised by action, the wise one is characterised by action" - is the characteristic of the wise and the foolish. He, thus not knowing, having avoided the foolish, does not associate with the wise; not associating with the wise having avoided the foolish, he does not know what is allowable and not allowable, wholesome and unwholesome, blameworthy and blameless, heavy and light, curable and incurable, what has a reason and what has no reason. Not knowing that, he is unable to take up a meditation subject and develop it. Just as that cowherd's herd of cattle does not grow, thus he does not grow in this Dispensation by the aforesaid morality and so on; and like the cowherd with the five dairy products, he is an outsider to the five aggregates of the Teaching.

"Does not remove fly eggs" means he does not dispel sensual thoughts and the like when it is stated thus "an arisen sensual thought"; he, not having removed this unwholesome thought as a fly egg, having become subject to applied thought, going about, is unable to take up a meditation subject and develop it; he, just as that cowherd's, etc. he is an outsider.

"Does not dress wounds" means grasping the sign in all objects by the method beginning with "having seen a form with the eye, he is one who grasps at signs," just as that cowherd does not dress wounds, thus he does not accomplish restraint. He, going about with doors open, is unable to take up a meditation subject and develop it, etc. he is an outsider.

"Does not make smoke" means just as that cowherd does not make smoke, he does not make the smoke of expounding the Teaching; he does not give a talk on the Teaching, or melodic recital, or a talk to one sitting nearby, or thanksgiving. Because of that, people do not know him as very learned and virtuous; they, not knowing his virtue and fault, do not support him with the four requisites. He, being troubled by requisites, is unable to rehearse the word of the Buddha, to fulfil the duty practice, to take up a meditation subject and develop it, etc. he is an outsider.

"Does not know the ford" means he does not approach very learned monks who are fords; approaching, he does not question, does not inquire thus: "Venerable sir, how should this phrase be construed? What is the meaning of this statement? What does the Pāḷi say in this passage? What does the meaning indicate in this passage?" The meaning is: he does not cause them to make it known. For him, since he does not thus inquire, they do not open up what is not opened up, they do not show by analysing, they do not make clear what is not made clear, they do not make obvious what is not obvious. "Regarding the various phenomena that are grounds for doubt"

means among the various kinds of uncertainty, they do not dispel even a single doubt. For doubts themselves are called phenomena that are grounds for doubt. The meaning is: therein they do not remove even a single doubt. He, thus not having approached the ford of the very learned, with doubt, is unable to take up a meditation subject and develop it. And just as that cowherd does not know the ford, so too this monk does not know the ford of the Teaching; not knowing, he asks questions outside the domain - having approached an Abhidhamma specialist, he asks about what is allowable and not allowable; having approached an expert in monastic discipline, he asks about the distinction between materiality and immateriality. They, being asked outside their domain, are unable to explain; he himself, with doubt, is unable to take up a meditation subject and develop it, etc. he is an outsider.

"Does not know what has been drunk" means just as that cowherd does not know what has been drunk and what has not been drunk, so he does not know, does not obtain gladness connected with the Teaching, does not gain the benefit in dependence on the way of making merit consisting of hearing, having gone to the hall for hearing the Teaching he does not listen attentively, while seated he sleeps, he engages in talk, he is thinking about something else; he, not listening to the Teaching attentively, is unable to develop, having taken a meditation subject, etc. he is an outsider.

"Does not know the path" means just as that cowherd does not know the path and the non-path, - he does not understand as it really is the noble eightfold path as "this is mundane, this is supramundane." Not knowing, having clung to the mundane path, he is unable to produce the supramundane, etc. he is an outsider.

"Is not skilled in pastures" means just as that cowherd does not know the five-day rotation and the seven-day rotation, so he does not understand as it really is the four establishments of mindfulness as "these are mundane, these are supramundane." Not knowing, having applied his knowledge in subtle points, having clung to the mundane establishments of mindfulness, he is unable to produce the supramundane, etc. he is an outsider.

"And is one who milks dry" means not knowing moderation in accepting, he milks completely without remainder. "In the detailed exposition section, however, they invite him, bringing" means they invite having brought. Here there are two kinds of bringing: bringing by speech and bringing of requisites. Bringing by speech means people, having gone to the presence of a monk, invite him saying "Please say, venerable sir, whatever you need." Bringing of requisites means having taken cloth and so on, or oil and molasses and so on, having gone to the presence of a monk, they say "Take, venerable sir, as much as you need." "There the monk does not know moderation" means the monk does not know the measure regarding those requisites, - not having taken what is fitting in measure according to the method stated in the Rathavināsa - "the disposition of the donor should be understood, the disposition of the gift should be understood, one's own strength should be understood" - whatever they bring, he takes all of it. This is the meaning. People, being remorseful, do not again invite having brought. He, becoming exhausted with regard to requisites, is unable to develop, having taken a meditation subject, etc. he is an outsider.

"He does not honour them with extra veneration" means just as that cowherd does not honour the great bulls, so he does not honour those elder monks with this extra veneration consisting of bodily action and so on, of friendliness both openly and in private. Thereupon the elders, - thinking "These do not show respect and consideration towards us," do not treat the junior monks kindly with two kinds of support - not with material support, whether with a robe, or a bowl, or bowl and its contents, or a dwelling place. Even when they are becoming weary and withering, they do not look after them. They do not train them in the canonical text, or the commentary, or the traditional method of talk on the Teaching, or the abstruse texts. The juniors, not obtaining these two kinds of support in every way from the elders, are unable to become established in this Dispensation. Just as that cowherd's herd of cattle does not grow, so morality and so on do not grow. And just as that cowherd is an outsider to the five dairy products, so they are outsiders to the five aggregates of the Teaching. The bright side should be understood by connecting it by way of the reversal of what was stated in the dark side.

In the Papañcasūdanī, the commentary on the Majjhima Nikāya,

the Commentary on the Mahāgopālaka Sutta is finished.

4. Commentary on the Cūḷagopālaka Sutta

350. "Thus have I heard" - this is the Shorter Discourse on the Cowherd. Therein, "at Ukkacelā" means in the city so named. It is said that while it was being built, at night a fish came from the Ganges stream onto dry land. People, having soaked cloths in an oil dish, made torches and caught the fish. When the city was completed, while giving it a name, they gave it the name "Ukkacelā" thus: "On the day the site of the city was taken, a fish was caught by cloth-torches." "Addressed the monks" - having sat down at a sandy mound on the bank of the Ganges in the evening time, surrounded by the great community of monks, at a place where, for one seated there, the entire Ganges becomes visible and can be seen, looking at the great Ganges flowing full - Having reflected "Has anyone in the past, in dependence on this Ganges, met with growth or decline?" he saw that formerly, in dependence on a foolish cowherd, many hundreds of thousands of herds of cattle, having fallen into a whirlpool of this Ganges, entered right into the ocean; but in dependence on a wise cowherd, for many hundreds of thousands of herds of cattle, safety arose, growth arose, and health arose. Having seen this, having thought "In dependence on this reason I will expound the Teaching to the monks," he addressed the monks.

"Magadhan" means an inhabitant of the country of Magadha. "Lacking in wisdom" means one whose intrinsic nature is without wisdom, slow, a great fool. "Without examining" means without observing, without consideration. "Made cross over" means he began to make them cross. "To the northern shore towards the Videhas" - on the near shore of the Ganges is the country of Magadha, on the far shore is the country of Videha. Thinking "I will take the cattle from the country of Magadha to the country of Videha and protect them," he made them cross over to the northern shore. With reference to that it was said - "To the northern shore towards the Videhas." "Having gone round in circles" means having made a circular movement. "Fell into calamity and disaster" means they reached decline and destruction; they entered right into the great ocean. That cowherd, when making the cattle go down, should

have examined the even fords and uneven fords on the near shore of the Ganges; in the middle of the Ganges, two or three sandy dry grounds should have been observed for the purpose of resting places for the cattle. Likewise, on the far shore, three or four fords - "Those fallen from this ford will take this ford; those fallen from this one will take this one." But this foolish cowherd, without even looking at whether the ford for the cattle to descend on the near shore was even or uneven, without even observing two or three sandy dry grounds for the purpose of resting places for the cattle in the middle of the Ganges, without even examining four or five fords for ascending on the far shore, made the cattle go down at an unsuitable ford. Then his great leading bull, by virtue of his accomplishment in speed and his accomplishment in strength, having cut across the stream of the Ganges, having reached the far shore, and having seen the eroded bank and the dense thicket of thorny bushes, having known "This is a bad place to settle," and not even finding a place to establish a foothold at the front, turned back. The cattle, thinking "The great leading bull has turned back; we too shall turn back," turned back. At the place where the great herd of cattle turned back, the water was broken and raised up a whirlpool in the middle of the Ganges. The herd of cattle, having entered the whirlpool, reached right into the ocean. Not even a single ox remained healthy. Therefore he said - "Right there they fell into calamity and disaster."

"Unskilled regarding this world" means unskilled, inexpert regarding the aggregates, elements, and sense bases in this world; the same method applies regarding the other world too. "Māra's realm" is said to be the phenomena of the three planes. "What is not Māra's realm" is the nine supramundane states. "Death's realm" too is just the phenomena of the three planes. "What is not Death's realm" is the nine supramundane states. Therein, "unskilled" means inexpert. But as to the meaning of the word, the realm of Māra is Māra's realm. "Realm" means place, site, abode, resort. In the case of "Death's realm" too, the same method applies. "Of them" means of those ascetics and brahmins of such a kind. By this, it should be understood that the six teachers are indicated.

351. Having thus concluded the dark side, showing the bright side, he said beginning with "Once upon a time, monks." Therein, "strong cattle" means tamed bulls and cows. "Cattle to be tamed" means bulls that should be tamed and cows that have not yet given birth. "Big calves" means strong calves that have passed beyond the state of being calves. "Small calves" means young calves still suckling from the cow. "Lean and weak" means having little flesh and blood, of feeble strength. "Just born at that very moment" means born on that very day. "Floating along drawn by respect for its mother" means the mother goes in front, again and again making the sound "hum hum," showing respect and giving a signal, cutting through the water with her chest; the calf, going along in the water parted by the chest of the cow through that perception of respect, is called "floating along drawn by respect for its mother."

352. "Having cut the stream of Māra" means having cut Māra's stream of craving by the path of arahantship. "Have gone to the far shore" means just as the great bulls to the far shore of the river, they have gone to the far shore of the round of rebirths, to Nibbāna. "Went to the far shore" means at the moment when the great bulls had gone to the far shore, having surpassed three portions of the stream of the Ganges, those standing, having seen the great bulls that had reached the far shore, having

proceeded along the path traversed by them, went to the far shore. "Will go to the far shore" means those standing having exhausted three portions of the mental defilements to be destroyed by the four paths, now, by the path of arahantship, having cut the remaining stream of craving, like strong cattle to the far shore of the river, will go to the far shore of the round of rebirths, to Nibbāna. By this method, the meaning should be understood in all instances. "Followers of the Teaching" and "faith-followers" - these two are possessors of the first path.

"By one who knows" means by the Buddha who knows all phenomena. "Well proclaimed" means well spoken. "Opened" means uncovered. "The door to the Deathless" means the noble path. "For the attainment of Nibbāna" means opened for that purpose. "Rendered useless" means made with the reed of conceit removed. "Aspire to security" means aspire to arahantship with the desire to act; the meaning is be willing to act, be willing to produce. "Patta'tthā" is also a reading. The meaning is: having obtained such a Teacher, you have indeed attained. The remainder is clear everywhere. But the Blessed One concluded the teaching according to the very same connection.

In the Papañcasūdanī, the commentary on the Majjhima Nikāya,

the Commentary on the Cūḷagopālaka Sutta is finished.

5. Commentary on the Cūḷasaccaka Sutta

353. "Thus have I heard" - this is the Shorter Discourse to Saccaka. Therein, "in the Great Wood in the Pinnacled Hall" - the Great Wood is a naturally grown, unplanted, bounded, great forest. But in the vicinity of Kapilavatthu, the Great Wood, connected as one with the Himalayas, being without boundary, stood reaching the great ocean. This one is not like that. A bounded great forest is the Great Wood. But the Pinnacled Hall should be understood as the Perfumed Chamber of the Buddha, the Blessed One, made in a park built in dependence on the Great Wood, having a pinnacle building within, covered with a swan-and-quail covering, accomplished in every respect.

"Saccaka, the son of a Jain" - formerly, it is said, a certain Jain man and a Jain woman, having each learnt five hundred debating methods, wandering about the Indian subcontinent thinking "We will refute others in debate," came together at Vesālī. The Licchavi kings, having seen them - asked "Who are you, who are you?" The Jain man - said "I am wandering about the Indian subcontinent thinking 'I will refute others in debate.'" The Jain woman also said likewise. The Licchavis said "Right here, refute each other in debate." The Jain woman asked the five hundred debating methods learnt by herself; the Jain man answered. When questioned by the Jain man too, the Jain woman answered just the same. For neither was there victory nor defeat; both were exactly equal. The Licchavis - giving a house and establishing an offering, said "You are both exactly equal; having wandered about, what will you do? Dwell right here." In the course of their living together, four daughters were born - one named Saccā, one named Lolā, one named Paṭācārā, one named Ācāravatī. They too were wise indeed; they learnt the five hundred debating methods each learnt by their mother and father. They, having come of age, said to their mother and father - "In our mother's family, girls have never been sent to a family house having given unwrought gold, gold, and so on. But whatever householder is able to crush their debate, they

become his foot-attendant wives. Whatever one gone forth is able to crush them, they go forth in his presence. What will you do?" We too will do just so. All four, having assumed the appearance of female wandering ascetics, thinking "This Indian subcontinent is known by the rose-apple tree," having taken a rose-apple branch, set out on a journey. Whatever village they reached, at its entrance, having placed a rose-apple banner on a heap of dust or a heap of sand - having said "Whoever is able to refute in debate, let him trample this," they entered the village. Thus wandering from village to village, having reached Sāvattthī, having likewise placed a rose-apple banner at the village entrance, having announced to the people who had arrived, they entered the inner city.

At that time the Blessed One was dwelling in dependence on Sāvattthī in Jeta's Grove. Then the Venerable Sāriputta, asking after the sick, looking after places not looked after, because of the greatness of his own duties, entering the village for almsfood later in the day than the other monks, having seen a rose-apple flag at the village entrance - asked the boys "What is this?" They reported that matter to him. "If so, trample it." "We are unable, venerable sir, we are afraid." "Boys, do not be afraid. When it is said 'By whom was our rose-apple flag caused to be trampled?' you should say 'It was caused to be trampled by a disciple of the Buddha, the Elder Sāriputta. Those wishing to engage in debate, go to the Elder's presence in Jeta's Grove.'" Thus he said. They, having heard the Elder's word, having trampled the rose-apple flag, threw it away. The Elder, having walked for almsfood, went to the monastery. The female wandering ascetics too, having come out from the village, asked "By whom was our flag caused to be trampled?" The boys reported that matter to them. The female wandering ascetics, having entered the village again, having taken each street - announced "A disciple of the Buddha named Sāriputta, it is said, will engage in debate with us. Those wishing to hear, come out." The great multitude came out; together with them the female wandering ascetics went to Jeta's Grove.

The elder - thinking "The coming of womankind to our dwelling place is indeed uncomfortable," sat down in the middle of the monastery. The female wandering ascetics, having gone, asked the Elder - "Was our flag caused to be trampled by you?" "Yes, it was caused to be trampled by me." "We will engage in debate with you." "Good, do so. Whose shall be the questioning and whose the answering?" "The questioning has indeed fallen to us, but you, being women, ask first," he said. Those four, standing in the four directions, asked the thousand debating points learnt in the presence of their mother and father. The Elder, like one cutting a white water-lily stalk with a sword, spoke on each and every question asked, having made it disentangled and unknotted, and having spoken, said "Ask again." "This much only, venerable sir, do we know." The elder said - "A thousand debating points were asked by you and answered by me. But I shall ask just one single question; that you answer." They, having seen the Elder's domain, were unable to say "Ask, venerable sir, we shall answer." "Speak, venerable sir, if we know, we shall answer," they said again.

The Elder, having said "This is the question that should be taught first after giving the going forth to sons of good family" - asked "What is called one?" They saw neither the end nor the limit of it. The Elder said "Answer." "We do not see it, venerable sir." "A thousand debating points were asked by you and answered by me. You are not able

to answer even one question of mine. This being so, whose is the victory and whose the defeat?" "Yours, venerable sir, is the victory; ours is the defeat." "What will you do now?" They, having reported the words spoken by their mother and father, said "We shall go forth in your presence." "You, being women, it is not proper to go forth in our presence. But having taken our instruction, having gone to the nuns' dwelling, go forth there." They, saying "Very well," having taken the Elder's instruction, having gone to the presence of the community of nuns, went forth. And having gone forth, being heedful and ardent, before long they attained arahantship.

This Saccaka was the youngest brother of those four. He was of more superior wisdom than even those four, having learnt a thousand debating methods from the presence of his mother and father, and even more of the external doctrines beyond that, without going anywhere, teaching the craft to the royal princes, he dwells right there at Vesālī. Frightened that his belly might burst due to being overly filled with wisdom, he goes about having encircled his belly with an iron band. With reference to him it was said "Saccaka, the son of a Jain."

"A debater" means "bhassa" is called a narrative; he proclaims that, speaks it - thus he is a debater. "One who claimed to be wise" means one whose claim is thus: "I am wise." "Highly honoured by many people" means whatever he announces by the course of the constellations, that for the most part happens just so; therefore he is honoured by the public thus: "This one is fortunate, auspicious." "Having engaged in debate by debate" means a fault was imputed by means of a narrative. "The Venerable Assaji" means the Elder Assaji, the teacher of the Elder Sāriputta. "Walking up and down for leg exercise" means walking about from this and that Licchavi royal house for the purpose of going to this and that house. "He approached the Venerable Assaji" - why did he approach? For the purpose of learning the doctrine.

For thus it occurred to him - "I wander about thinking 'I will refute the ascetic Gotama's doctrine,' but thinking 'I do not know his doctrine,' I did not refute it. For a debate raised after having known another's doctrine is indeed called a well-raised debate. But this Elder Assaji is known as a disciple of the ascetic Gotama; he is skilled in the doctrine of his own Teacher; having questioned him and having established a line of argument, I will refute the ascetic Gotama's doctrine." Therefore he approached. "Trains" means he asks: how does he train, how does he instruct? But the Elder, since if "suffering" were stated there would be an occasion for reproof, and even the path and fruition have come as suffering in an indirect sense, and if this one, when "suffering" was stated, were to ask the Elder - "Friend Assaji, for what purpose have you gone forth?" Then, when it was said "For the purpose of the path and fruition" - "This, friend Assaji, is not your Dispensation by name; this is indeed a great slaughter-house by name; this is indeed abundant in hell by name; there is no hope of happiness for you; rising up again and again, wearing out nothing but suffering, you wander about" - he might impute a fault. Therefore it is not proper to give the opponent an indirect talk. Having thought "I shall speak to him a direct talk in such a way that he is without a foothold," he speaks the talk by way of impermanence and non-self only, namely "Materiality, monks, is impermanent." "Unfit to hear" means inappropriate to hear.

354. "In the assembly hall" means in the hall of the assembly for the instruction in affairs of the royal families. "He approached those Licchavis" - for thus it occurred to

him: "Previously, through not knowing his doctrine, I did not refute the ascetic Gotama's argument; but now I know the doctrine spoken by his great disciple, and these five hundred Licchavis, my pupils, are assembled. Having gone together with them, I will refute the ascetic Gotama's argument." Therefore he approached. "By a certain well-known one" means by a certain one among the well-known, renowned elders of the group of five. "Took a stand" means as he took a stand with him. "If he will take a stand in this way, but then he will say something quite different, and in that case what can be done by me?" - thus already turning his back, he said. "Might drag towards him" means he might drag towards himself. "Might drag away" means he might push forward away from himself. "Might drag back and forth" means at one time he might drag towards himself, at another time he might drag away. "Brewer's straining basket" means a back-straining basket in a liquor house. "Brewer's mixer" means a drunkard. "Having seized a strainer by the corners" means wishing to wash the bag used for straining liquor, having seized it at both corners for the purpose of shaking off the dregs. "Might shake down" means having turned it face downwards, he might shake it. "Might shake up" means having turned it face upwards, he might shake it. "Might beat out" means he might beat it out again and again. "The game called hemp-washing" - here, people, for the purpose of making hempen cloth, having taken hempen bark strips, having tied them fistful by fistful, throw them into water. On the third day they become thoroughly soaked. Then people, having taken sour gruel, liquor, and so on, having gone there, having taken a fistful of hemp, "from the right, from the left, and from the front" - on three boards, once striking on the right board, once on the left board, once on the front board, eating, drinking, and chewing sour gruel, liquor, and so on, they wash them. It is a great sport. The king's elephant, having seen that sport, having entered deep water, having taken water with its trunk, once throwing it on its head, once on its back, once on both sides, once between its thighs, played. Based on that, that type of game is called hemp-washing; with reference to that it was said: "Plays the game called hemp-washing." "What manner of being is this Saccaka, the son of a Jain, that he will refute the Blessed One?" - whatever Saccaka, the son of a Jain, will refute the Blessed One's argument, what manner of being is he? Is he a demon, or is he Inda, or is he Brahmā that he will refute the Blessed One's argument? For it is not possible for an ordinary human being to refute the Blessed One's argument - this is the intention here.

355. "Now at that time" means at the time when Saccaka entered the monastery. But at what time did he enter? At the time of the great midday heat. But why were they walking up and down at that time? For the purpose of dispelling sloth and torpor caused by sumptuous food. Or they were those exerting in meditation during the day. For when such persons, after the meal, having walked up and down, having bathed, having let the body become refreshed, sit down and practise the ascetic duty, their mind becomes fully focused. "Towards those monks" means it is said that he, looking around thinking "Where is the ascetic Gotama? I shall go from residential cell to residential cell, ask, and then enter," like a forest elephant, having seen rag-robe wearing monks walking up and down on the walking path, went to their presence. With reference to that, the passage beginning with "towards those monks" was said. "Where, good sirs" means the meaning is: in which residence or in which pavilion? "This, Aggivessana, is the Blessed One" - at that time, it is said, the Blessed One, towards the break of dawn, having entered upon the great compassion attainment,

having spread the net of omniscient knowledge over the ten-thousand world-systems, looking at beings capable of being enlightened, saw - "Tomorrow Saccaka, the son of a Jain, having taken a great assembly of Licchavis, wishing to refute my doctrine, will come." Therefore, right early, having attended to his toilet, surrounded by the Community of monks, having walked for almsfood in Vesālī, having returned from his alms round, thinking "I shall sit in a comfortable place to sit before a great assembly," without entering the perfumed chamber, he sat down for the day's abiding at the foot of a certain tree in the Great Wood. Those monks, having shown their duty to the Blessed One, had come; when asked by Saccaka, pointing out the Blessed One seated at a distance, they said "This, Aggivessana, is the Blessed One."

"Together with a great assembly of Licchavis" - below it was said that he was surrounded by about five hundred Licchavis. They were pupils of his; but within Vesālī, Saccaka, having taken about five hundred Licchavi princes, and having heard "One seeking debate is approaching the Blessed One," thinking "We shall hear the friendly conversation of two wise persons," for the most part the people came out; thus that assembly became great, of unlimited number. With reference to that, this was said. "Having extended joined palms in salutation" - these were those siding with both factions; they thought thus - "If those of wrong view accuse us, 'Why did you pay homage to the ascetic Gotama?' we shall say to them, 'Does merely making a salutation with joined palms constitute homage?' If those of right view accuse us, 'Why did you not pay homage to the Blessed One?' we shall say, 'Does homage only consist of striking the ground with one's head? Is not the act of salutation with joined palms also homage?'" "Name and clan" - those who, saying "Master Gotama, I am the son of so-and-so, named Datta, named Mitta, I have come here," announce their name. Those who, saying "Master Gotama, I am named Vāsiṭṭha, named Kaccāna, I have come here," announce their clan. These, it is said, were poor, aged sons of good family who acted thus thinking "We shall become well-known in the midst of the assembly by means of our name and clan." But those who sat silent were both deceitful and blindly foolish. Therein, the deceitful ones, thinking "Even one who engages in one or two friendly conversations becomes intimate, and when there is intimacy it is not proper not to give one or two almsfood" - thus freeing themselves from that, they sit in silence. The blindly foolish, through sheer ignorance, like a lump of clay thrown down, sit silent anywhere whatsoever.

356. "A certain point" means a certain matter, a certain reason. Then the Blessed One, generating in him enthusiasm for asking questions, said - "Ask, Aggivessana, whatever you wish." Its meaning is - "Ask if you wish; there is no burden for me in answering questions." Or alternatively, "Ask whatever you wish; I shall answer everything for you" - thus he made the invitation of the Omniscient One, not shared with Individually Enlightened Ones, chief disciples, and great disciples. For they do not say "whatever you wish," but say "having heard, we shall know." But Buddhas, either "Ask, friend, whatever you wish" or "Ask, great king, whatever you wish,"

"Ask me a question, Vāsava, whatever you wish in your mind;
For each and every question, I shall make an end of it for you."Or,

"If so, monk, having sat down on your own seat, ask whatever you wish" or,

"Whether for Bāvarī or for you, every doubt of all;

Having been given permission, ask whatever you wish in your mind."Or,

"Ask me a question, Sabhiya, whatever you wish in your mind;
For each and every question, I shall make an end of it for you."Or -

They make the invitation of the Omniscient One to those various demons, lords of men, gods, ascetics, brahmins, and wandering ascetics. And it is not wonderful that the Blessed One, having attained Buddhahood, should make this invitation. He who, while on the plane of a Bodhisatta, established even in limited knowledge -

"Koṇḍañña, answer the questions,
The sages of good dispositions request you;
Koṇḍañña, this is the nature among humans,
That to the senior this burden comes."

Thus requested by the sages for the benefit of Sakka and others -

"Having been given opportunity, let the venerable sirs ask
Whatever question is wished for in the mind;
For I shall explain each and every thing to you,
Having known by myself this world and the next."

Thus, at the time of Sarabhaṅga, and in the Sambhava Jātaka, by the brahmin named Sucirata, who having wandered thrice throughout the entire Indian subcontinent and not seeing one who could put an end to the questions, when permission was made to ask a question, being seven years old by birth, playing in the dust on the road, having folded his legs crosswise, while seated right there in the middle of the street -

"Truly I shall declare to you, just as the skilled one does;
And the king indeed knows that, whether he will do it or not."

He made the invitation of the Omniscient One.

Thus, when the Blessed One had invited with the omniscient's invitation to admonish, delighted, asking a question, he said beginning with "But how, Master Gotama."

Then the Blessed One, so that there would be no opportunity for the Jain's words - "Look, sirs, one thing was spoken by the disciple, another the Teacher speaks. Was it not said by me beforehand: 'If he will take a stand in the same way as his disciple took a stand with me, thus I will refute his doctrine.' But this one speaks something quite different; in that case what can be done by me?" - speaking in the very same manner as was spoken below by the Elder Assaji, said beginning with "Thus indeed, Aggivessana, I." "A simile occurs to me, Master Gotama" means "Master Gotama, one simile presents itself to me; I shall bring forth that simile" - thus he says. "Let it occur to you, Aggivessana" means "let it present itself to you, Aggivessana; bring forth that simile confidently" - thus the Blessed One said. "Requiring strength" means activities such as farming, trading, and so on, to be done by the strength of one's arms. "A person whose self is materiality" means "materiality would be self" - thus "whose self is materiality"; it explains the person who stands having grasped "materiality is self." "Established upon materiality" means having become established upon that materiality grasped as "self." "Generates merit or demerit" means obtains wholesome

or unwholesome. In the case of "whose self is feeling" and so on too, the same method applies. What does he explain by this? These five aggregates are the support of these beings, like the earth; they, established upon these five aggregates, strive in what is called wholesome and unwholesome action. "You, while denying such a self that actually exists, explain that the five aggregates are non-self" - thus having made it very much with reason, he brought forth the simile. And the simile brought by this Jain is certainly fixed; apart from the Omniscient Buddha, there is no one else able to cut his argument and give fault in the debate. For persons are twofold: those to be guided by a Buddha and those to be guided by disciples. Those to be guided by disciples, even disciples guide them, and Buddhas too. But those to be guided by a Buddha, disciples are unable to guide; only Buddhas guide them. This Jain too is one to be guided by a Buddha; therefore there is no one else able to cut his doctrine and give fault. Therefore the Blessed One himself, for the purpose of showing the fault in his doctrine, said beginning with "Do you not, Aggivessana."

Then the Jain thought - "The ascetic Gotama very much establishes my doctrine; if there will be any fault further on, he will rebuke me alone. Come, let me place this doctrine upon the head of the public as well." Therefore he spoke thus - "I too, Master Gotama, speak thus: 'Materiality is my self,' etc. 'Consciousness is my self,' and so does this great populace." But the Blessed One was more excellent among debaters than the Jain by a hundredfold, by a thousandfold, even by a hundred-thousandfold; therefore he thought - "This Jain, having freed himself, places the doctrine upon the head of the public. I shall not allow him to free himself; having turned away from the public, I shall rebuke him alone." Then he said to him beginning with "What will, Aggivessana." Its meaning is - This populace has not come to refute my doctrine; you yourself, having gathered together the whole of Vesālī, have come to refute my doctrine. Therefore you yourself unravel your own doctrine; do not place it upon the head of the public. He, acknowledging, said beginning with "Indeed, Master Gotama."

357. Thus the Blessed One, having established the Jain's doctrine, began the question "If so, Aggivessana." Therein, "if so" (tena hi) is an indeclinable particle in the sense of cause. Because you acknowledge the five aggregates as self, therefore - this is the meaning. "In his own kingdom" (sakasmim vijite) means in one's own country. "To execute those who deserve execution" (ghātetāyaṃ vā ghātetuṃ) means to execute those worthy of execution, those fit to be executed. "To fine those who deserve fining" (jāpetāyaṃ vā jāpetuṃ) means to fine those worthy of loss of wealth, those fit to be fined, to make them diminished in wealth. "To banish those who deserve banishment" (pabbājetāyaṃ vā pabbājetuṃ) means to banish those worthy of banishment from one's own country, to expel them. "And he deserves to have authority" (vattituñca arahati) means he both has authority and deserves to have authority. He makes clear that it means "fit to have authority." Thus the Jain, having distinguished and made clear the very reason brought forth for the purpose of breaking his own doctrine, is like one sharpening a weapon for his own destruction, as is fitting for a fool. "Let my materiality be thus" (evaṃ me rūpaṃ hotu) means let my materiality be of such a kind - pleasing, lovely, adorned and prepared, like a golden archway, like a well-decorated painted cloth, agreeable to behold. "Let my materiality not be thus" (evaṃ me rūpaṃ mā ahosi) means let my materiality not be of such a kind - discoloured, ill-formed, wrinkled and grey-haired, covered with freckles.

"He remained silent" (tuṇhī ahoṣi) means the Jain, having known his defeated state in this instance, thought: "The ascetic Gotama brought forth a reason for the purpose of breaking my doctrine; I, through foolishness, distinguished and made clear that very thing. Now I am ruined. If I say 'it has authority,' these kings, having risen up, will say: 'Aggivessana, you say that authority operates over my materiality; if authority operates over your materiality, why do you not shine as these Licchavi kings shine with individual existences resembling the Tāvatiṃsa gods, lovely and pleasing?' If I say 'it does not have authority,' the ascetic Gotama, having risen up, will refute my argument saying: 'Aggivessana, you previously said "authority operates over my materiality," and now you reject it.' Thus whether 'it has authority' is said there is one fault, and whether 'it does not have authority' is said there is one fault" - so he remained silent. For the second time the Blessed One asked; for the second time he remained silent. But since for one who does not answer when asked by the Blessed One up to the third time, his head splits into seven pieces, and since Buddhas, having fulfilled the perfections over four incalculable aeons plus a hundred thousand cosmic cycles for the welfare of beings alone, have powerful compassion towards beings. Therefore, without asking up to the third time, then the Blessed One said this to Saccaka, the son of a Jain - he spoke this statement beginning with "Answer now."

Therein, "reasonable" (sahadhammika) means with cause, with reason. "A thunderbolt (vajiraṃ) in the hand (pāṇimhi) there is (assa)" thus Vajirapāṇī. "Demon" (yakkho) means not just any demon; it should be understood as Sakka, the king of gods. "Blazing" (āditta) means having the colour of fire. "In flames" (sampajjalita) means well ablaze. "Aglow" (sajotibhūta) means luminous all around; the meaning is having become a single mass of fire-flame. "Stood" (ṭhito hoti) means having created a hideous form with a great head, fangs resembling banana buds, frightful eyes, nose and so on, he stood. But why did he come? For the purpose of making him relinquish his view. Furthermore, when the Blessed One had become disinclined towards expounding the Teaching, thinking "If I were to expound the Teaching, and others would not understand me," Sakka, having come together with the Great Brahmā, made the acknowledgment: "May the Blessed One expound the Teaching; when beings do not act according to your command, we shall make them act; let yours be the wheel of the Teaching, ours the wheel of command." Therefore he came thinking "Today, having frightened Saccaka, I shall make him answer the question."

"Both the Blessed One saw and Saccaka, the son of a Jain" means if others too were to see him, that matter would not be troublesome; they would say "The ascetic Gotama, having known that Saccaka was not conceding in his own argument, summoned a demon and showed him; thereupon Saccaka spoke out of fear." Therefore both the Blessed One saw and Saccaka. Upon seeing him, sweat was released from his entire body; his bowels churning inside, he cried out with a great roar. He, looking around thinking "Do others too see him?" did not see even so much as a hair standing on end in anyone. Thereupon - "This fear has arisen for me alone. If I say 'a demon,' they would say 'Do only you have eyes? Only you see the demon? Not having seen a demon before, having been thrown into a verbal clash by the ascetic Gotama, you now see a demon'" - having thought thus - thinking "Now there is no other refuge for me here, apart from the ascetic Gotama," then Saccaka, the son of a Jain, etc. said this to the Blessed One. "Sought shelter" means seeking shelter. "Sought a rock cell" means seeking a rock cell. "Sought refuge" means seeking

refuge. And here, "it protects, it guards" - thus it is "shelter." "They hide here" - thus it is "a rock cell." "It destroys" - thus it is "refuge"; it destroys fear, demolishes it - this is the meaning.

358. "Having paid attention" means having done so in the mind, having reviewed, having reflected upon. "Let my feeling be thus" means let it be wholesome only, let it be pleasant only. "Let my perception be thus" means let it be wholesome only, let it be pleasant only, let it be associated with pleasure only. The same method applies to activities and consciousness as well. "Let it not be thus" - here, however, the meaning should be understood by the reverse of what has been stated. "Is it proper" means is it fitting. "To regard" means to see thus by way of craving, conceit, and wrong view as "this is mine, this I am, this is my self." "No indeed, Master Gotama" means this is not proper, Master Gotama. Thus the Blessed One, just as a skilled snake-catcher would extract the venom bitten by a snake by having that very snake bite again, in just the same way, in that very assembly, made Saccaka, the son of a Jain, say with that very mouth that the five aggregates are impermanent, suffering, and non-self. "Clings to suffering" means one who clings to this suffering of the five aggregates through craving and wrong view. "Has reached" and "is attached" should also be understood by way of craving and wrong view itself. In the passage beginning with "suffering - this is mine," the meaning is that one regards the suffering of the five aggregates by way of craving, conceit, and wrong view. "Would fully understand" means would know completely through the full understanding as judgement as impermanent, suffering, and non-self. "Having utterly eliminated" means having brought to destruction, passing away, and non-arising.

359. "New" (navam) means young. "Without a fruit-bud core" (akukkukajātaṃ) means at the time of taking the flower, inside a compact stick the size of a thumb arises; the meaning is without that. "Empty" (ritto) means void, without substance inside. Because of being empty, it is hollow. "Defeated" (aparaddho) means vanquished. "But this speech was spoken by you" - this the Blessed One said making known his garrulous nature and rebuking him. He, it is said, formerly having approached the six teachers beginning with Pūraṇa, asked them questions. They were unable to answer. Then, having charged them with a great fault in the midst of their assembly, rising up and declaring victory, he departed. He, with the perception "I shall vex the Perfectly Enlightened One in the same way too," having approached -

"Hey, what is the name of this tree, with fine leaves, thorny;
Where by a single blow, the head was split."

This one, like a soft-beaked bird accustomed to pecking coreless trees, having struck against the acacia tree, having struck against the substance of omniscient knowledge, having reached the breaking of his knowledge-beak, understood the hardness of omniscient knowledge. Making that known in the midst of the assembly, he said beginning with "But this speech was spoken by you." "There is not at present" - it is not to be said that in the body that is clung to there is never sweat; but he says there is not at present. "He uncovered his golden-coloured body" - he did not uncover the whole body. Buddhas by name expound the Teaching to the assembly with their bodies covered, having fastened the knot. Then the Blessed One, having taken the robe at the place facing the bottom of the throat, lowered it by a measure of four

finger-breadths. But when that much was lowered, golden-coloured rays, having become heaps upon heaps, like streams of red gold liquid from a golden pot, and like lightning from a red-coloured rain cloud, having emerged, rushed through the sky, circumambulating the great trunk resembling a golden tambourine and the head, keeping them to the right. But why did the Blessed One do thus? For the purpose of dispelling the uncertainty of the public. For the public might think "The ascetic Gotama says 'There is no sweat for me'; yet for Saccaka, the son of a Jain, sweat pours forth as if mounted on a machine. But the ascetic Gotama, having wrapped himself in a compact double-fold robe, is seated; how can it be known whether there is or is not sweat inside?" - for the purpose of dispelling that uncertainty, he did thus. "Downcast" (mañkubhūto) means one who has become powerless. "With drooping shoulders" (pattakkhandho) means with fallen shoulders. "Without response" (appaṭibhāno) means not seeing anything further. "He sat down" (nisīdi) means he sat down scratching the ground with his big toe.

360. "Dummukha" does not mean one with an ugly face, for he was handsome and pleasing. But this was his name. "Incapable of descending again into that pond" means because all its claws were broken, with its movement cut off, it is incapable of descending; it shows that right there it becomes food for crows, hawks, and the like. "Wrigglings" means wriggings of views. "Contortions" means contortions of views. "Struggles" means struggles of views. "That is to say, with the intention of debate" - here "that is to say" is merely a particle; he is incapable of approaching with the disposition of having the intention of debate, thinking "I will refute him in debate"; but it shows that he might approach for hearing the Teaching. "Said this to Dummukha, the Licchavi's son" - why did he say this? It is said that at the time when Dummukha was bringing forth his simile, the remaining Licchavi youths too thought - "By this Jain, contempt has been shown to us for a long time at the place of learning our craft; now is the time to see the back of the enemy. We too, each bringing forth a simile, will do to him as one who strikes with a mallet one who has fallen by a blow of the hand, so that he will not be able to raise his head again in the midst of the assembly" - they, having prepared their similes, sat down waiting for the conclusion of Dummukha's talk. Saccaka, having known their intention, thought: "These all are standing with necks raised and lips moving; if they individually obtain the chance to bring forth similes, it will not be possible for me again to raise my head in the midst of the assembly; come, let me, having rebuked Dummukha, so that there is no opportunity for another, having thus cut off the turn of the discussion, ask the ascetic Gotama a question" - therefore he said this. Therein, "wait" means stop, do not speak again - this is the meaning.

361. "Let that stand, Master Gotama" means: Master Gotama, let that speech of ours and of the many other ascetics and brahmins stand. "Methinks it was mere idle talk" - for this statement is as if idle talk, the meaning is that it is merely nonsensical talk. Or alternatively, in "let that stand," the word "talk" should be brought in and stated. "Methinks it was mere idle talk of speech" - here, however, this uttering of speech is, methinks, merely idle talk - this is the meaning.

Now, asking a question, he said beginning with "in what respect." Therein, "one who has attained self-confidence" means one who has attained knowledge. "Not relying on others" means not dependent on others. Then the Blessed One, answering his

question, said beginning with "here, Aggivessana"; that is of clear meaning. But since here "sees" was stated, the trainee's plane was shown. Therefore, asking about the further plane of one beyond training, he asked a second question, and the Blessed One answered that for him too. Therein, in the passage beginning with "unsurpassed vision" and so on, "unsurpassed vision" means mundane and supramundane wisdom. "Unsurpassed practice" means mundane and supramundane practice. "Unsurpassed liberation" means mundane and supramundane liberation. Or, taking only the purely supramundane, "unsurpassed vision" means right view of the path of arahantship. "Unsurpassed practice" means the remaining path factors. "Unsurpassed liberation" means the liberation of the highest fruition. Or, the seeing of Nibbāna by one who has eliminated the mental corruptions is called unsurpassed vision. The path factors are the unsurpassed practice. The highest fruition should be understood as the unsurpassed liberation. "That Blessed One is enlightened" means that Blessed One himself too is enlightened in the four truths. "For enlightenment" means he expounds the Teaching for the enlightenment of others too in the four truths. In the passage beginning with "tamed" and so on, "tamed" means one who has ceased associating with defilements. "For taming" means for the purpose of ceasing to associate with defilements. "Peaceful" means peaceful through the appeasement of all mental defilements. "For peace" means for the appeasement of mental defilements. "One who has crossed over" means one who has crossed over the four mental floods. "For crossing over" means for crossing over the four mental floods. "Attained final Nibbāna" means attained final Nibbāna through the final extinguishment of the mental defilements. "For final Nibbāna" means for the purpose of the final extinguishment of the mental defilements.

362. "Destroyers of virtue" means those who destroy virtues. "Reckless" means endowed with recklessness of speech. "To be assailed" means to be struck against. "Having approached" means having struck against. "But never Master Gotama" shows that having approached Master Gotama, there is no strength for anyone to depart taking away one's own doctrine undamaged and whole. For the Blessed One does not cause danger to life for anyone, as elephants and the like do. But this Jain brought forth these three similes not for the purpose of exalting the Blessed One, but only for the purpose of exalting himself. Just as a king, having killed a certain enemy, even while praising the enemy saying "Such a hero, such a man endowed with strength he must have been," praises only himself. Just so, he too, even while exalting the Blessed One with such words as "For there might be, Master Gotama, a furious elephant" and so on, exalts only himself, thinking "We ourselves are courageous, we are wise, we are very learned indeed, who as seekers of debate approached the Perfectly Enlightened One, as if approaching a furious elephant, as if approaching a blazing mass of fire, and as if approaching a venomous snake with its hood spread." Having thus exalted himself, inviting the Blessed One, he said beginning with "May the Blessed One consent for me." Therein, "may he consent" means may he accept. "For the morrow" means for the purpose of the merit and the joy and gladness that will be mine tomorrow from making an offering to you. "The Blessed One consented by silence" means the Blessed One, without moving any bodily factor or verbal factor, maintaining acquiescence only internally, consented by silence. What is meant is that he accepted by mind alone for the purpose of assisting Saccaka.

363. "Whatever you would consider suitable" - it is said that those Licchavis brought

him five hundred dishes of boiled rice as a regular meal. With reference to that very thing, he says: "Tomorrow you should bring whatever you would consider allowable and suitable for the ascetic Gotama; for you are attendants of the ascetic Gotama and know what is allowable and not allowable, what is proper and improper." "Brought a food offering" means they brought the food that was to be brought. "Superior" means highest. "With own hand" means with his own hand. "Having satisfied" means having well satiated, having made fully replete, content, and as much as desired. "Having served" means having well invited to take more, having caused him to refuse by a hand signal indicating "enough, enough." "Bhuttāviṃ" means one who has finished eating. "With the hand removed from the bowl" means with the hand removed from the bowl; what is said is "with the hand taken away." "Onittapattapāṇi" is also a reading; its meaning is: the bowl has become separate, become different from the hand - thus "onittapattapāṇī." That one with the bowl removed from the hand - the meaning is: having washed both the hands and the bowl, having placed the bowl to one side, he sat down. "Sat down to one side" means having known the Blessed One to be thus, he sat down in a suitable place - this is the meaning. "And merit" means whatever merit there is in this gift, the meaning is resultant aggregates in the future. "Great merit" means the retinue of those very resultant aggregates. "May that be for the happiness of the donors" means may that be for the purpose of happiness of these Licchavis. This, it is said, he spoke thus while dedicating it to them, thinking "I am one gone forth, and it is not proper for one gone forth to dedicate one's own gift." Then the Blessed One, because it was given by the Licchavis to Saccaka, not to the Blessed One. But it was given by Saccaka to the Blessed One; therefore, making clear that matter, he said beginning with "Whatever, Aggivessana." Thus the Blessed One, without the Jain's consent itself, dedicated the offering given to himself to the Jain, and that will be a latent impression for him in the future.

In the Papañcasūdanī, the commentary on the Majjhima Nikāya,

the Commentary on the Cūḷasaccaka Sutta is finished.

6. Commentary on the Mahāsaccaka Sutta

364. "Thus have I heard" is the Greater Discourse on Saccaka. Therein, by the three terms "on one occasion" and "now at that time" and "in the earlier period of the day," one and the same time is stated. For monks, having performed the duty practice, having washed the face, having taken the bowl and robes, having paid homage to the shrine, the time of standing in the reflection hall thinking "Which village shall we enter?" is what is called that time. The Blessed One, at such a time, having put on the red double cloth, having tied the waistband, having put on the rag-robe on one shoulder, having come out from the Perfumed Chamber, surrounded by the Community of monks, stood at the entrance of the Perfumed Chamber. With reference to that - "On one occasion" and "now at that time" and "in the earlier period of the day" was said. "Wishing to enter" means one who had made the determination thus "I shall enter for almsfood." "He approached" - why did he approach? With the intention of raising a debate. For thus it occurred to him - "Formerly, through my lack of wisdom, having taken the entire assembly of Vesālī, having gone to the presence of the ascetic Gotama, I became downcast in the midst of the assembly. Now, not

doing so, having gone alone, I shall raise a debate. If I am able to defeat the ascetic Gotama, having made clear my own theory, I shall claim victory. If there will be victory for the ascetic Gotama, like dancing in the darkness, no one will know" - thus, having taken up what is called a sleep-question, with this intention of debate he approached.

"Out of compassion" means dependent on compassion for Saccaka, the son of a Jain. For thus it occurred to the Elder - "When the Blessed One is seated for a moment, he will obtain the sight of the Buddha and the hearing of the Teaching. That will conduce to his welfare and happiness for a long time." Therefore, having requested the Blessed One, having prepared the rag-robe folded in four, he said "May the Blessed One sit down." Having considered "Ānanda speaks reason," the Blessed One sat down on the prepared seat. "Said this to the Blessed One" means having set aside the question which he had come having made into a waist-pouch core, managing for the time being by the side, he spoke the words beginning with "There are, Master Gotama."

365. "For they, Master Gotama, experience" means those ascetics and brahmins experience, obtain, undergo the painful bodily feeling arisen in the body - this is the meaning. "Stiffening of the thighs" means the state of the thighs being made stiff; the meaning is rigidity of the thighs. But here "there would be" is a future tense expression made by way of the sense of astonishment. "Follows the body" means it follows along with the body, it is subject to the body's control. But "bodily development" is called insight; through that there is no one who reaches mental distraction. Thus the Jain spoke that which is non-existent, not factual, which does not exist - that very thing he said. "Mental development" too is called serenity; and for a person engaged in concentration, there is no such thing as stiffening of the thighs and so on. Thus the Jain said this which is indeed not factual. In the commentary, however, it is said - "Just as having said 'once in the past,' the future form in saying 'there would be stiffening of the thighs' and so on does not accord, so too the meaning does not accord; he speaks of what is non-existent, not factual, what does not exist."

"Not to bodily development" - he said this with reference to the pursuit of self-mortification such as the five-fold heat-torment and so on. For this is what is called their bodily development. But having seen what did he say thus? He, it is said, comes to the monastery in the middle of the day, and at that time the monks, having put away their bowls and robes, enter into seclusion in their own respective night-quarters and day-quarters. Having seen them in seclusion, imagining "these engage in merely mental development, but they have no bodily development," he spoke thus.

366. Then the Blessed One, questioning him, said "But how have you, Aggivessana, heard of bodily development?" He, expanding upon that, said beginning with "As follows - Nanda Vaccha." Therein, "Nanda" is his name. "Vaccha" is his clan. "Kisa" is his name. "Saṃkicca" is his clan. Makkhali Gosāla has already appeared above. "These" means these three persons; they, it is said, had reached the summit of defiling austerities. "Excellent excellent" means superior, superior. "They make gain" means they make it gain strength. "They make it grow" means they increase it. "They make it fat" means they make fat arise in it. "Having formerly abandoned" means

having abandoned the former practice of austerities. "They later accumulate" means they later satisfy and increase it with excellent solid foods and so on. "There is increase and decrease" means there is growth and decline. Thus, having explained that at one time there is growth of this body and at another time decline - only the mere growth and decline is discerned, but bodily development is not discerned - and asking about mental development, he said "But how have you, Aggivessana, heard of mental development?" "Could not answer properly" means he was not able to speak having accomplished it, as is fitting for a foolish worldling.

367. "How then will you" means you who do not know such gross and weak bodily development? How then will you know smooth and subtle mental development? But at this point, the Elder Codanāyana, having put down his fan, began to depart, saying "This passage is indeed not the word of the Buddha." Then the Elder Mahāsīva said to him - "There is seen, monks, the accumulation and diminution, the taking up and the laying down of this body made of the four primary elements." Having heard that, he considered - "It is proper to say that the insight arisen in one who is examining the gross body is gross."

368. "Passionate for pleasure" means possessed of passion for pleasure. "With the cessation of pleasant feeling, an unpleasant feeling arises" - it does not arise immediately after; for the proximity conditionality of pleasure and pain is rejected in the Paṭṭhāna. But since unpleasant feeling does not arise while pleasant feeling has not ceased, therefore it was stated thus here. "Remains obsessing" means having exhausted, having seized, it remains. "On both sides" means having been on both sides thus: pleasure is one side and pain is one side.

369. Even an arisen pleasant feeling does not remain obsessing the mind, because of development of body. Even an arisen unpleasant feeling does not remain obsessing the mind, because of development of mind - here, development of body is insight, development of mind is concentration. And insight is the adversary of pleasure, and near to pain. Concentration is the adversary of pain, and near to pleasure. How? For one who, having established insight, is seated, as time goes on and on, here and there it is as if fire arises, sweat emits from the armpits, from the head it is as if a column of heat arises - thus the mind is afflicted, is vexed, and struggles. Thus, for now, insight is the adversary of pleasure, and near to pain. But when bodily or mental pain has arisen, for one who, having suppressed that pain, has attained a meditative attainment, at the moment of attainment pain has gone far away, and no small pleasure enters. Thus concentration is the adversary of pain, and near to pleasure. Just as insight is the adversary of pleasure and near to pain, concentration is not so. Just as concentration is the adversary of pain and near to pleasure, insight is not so. Therefore it was said - "Even an arisen pleasant feeling does not remain obsessing the mind, because of development of body. Even an arisen unpleasant feeling does not remain obsessing the mind, because of development of mind."

370. "Having approached and accused" means having struck against the virtues and having brought near. "That indeed of me" means that indeed my mind.

371. "How could it not be, Aggivessana" means Aggivessana, why would it not be? It will indeed be. Do not have such a perception; both pleasant and unpleasant feeling do indeed arise in me, but when it has arisen, I do not allow it to remain obsessing

the mind. Now, wishing to make that meaning clear, desiring to teach above a proclamation of the Teaching that inspires confidence, he began with the great renunciation starting from the root. Therein, "Here, Aggivessana, before the enlightenment, etc. sat down right there - 'This is suitable for striving'" - all this should be understood by the method stated below in the Pāsarāsi Sutta. But this is the distinction: there, the sitting on the seat of enlightenment; here, the performance of austerities.

374. "Wet wood" means wet fig wood. "With sap" means with milk. "From sensual pleasures" means from objective sensual pleasures. "Not withdrawn" means not departed. In "sensual desire" and so on, it is just the defilement of sensual desire that is called "desire" by way of producing desire. "Affection" is by way of producing affection. "Infatuation" is by way of producing infatuation. "Thirst" is by way of producing thirst. "Fever" should be understood as by way of burning. "Caused by their own exertion" means produced by exertion. "Of knowledge, of vision, of unsurpassed enlightenment" - all this is simply a synonym for the supramundane path.

Now here is the comparison of the simile - For just as wet fig wood with milk, so are persons not escaped from objective sensual pleasures through the defilement of sensual desire. Just as the state of being placed in water, so is the state of being moistened by the defilement of sensual desire; Just as the non-production of fire even by rubbing, so is the non-achievement of the supramundane path through feelings caused by their own exertion for those not escaped from objective sensual pleasures through the defilement of sensual desire. Just as the non-production of fire even without rubbing, so is the non-achievement of the supramundane path for those persons even without feelings caused by their own exertion. The second simile too should be understood by this very method. But this is the distinction: the former is a simile for the going forth together with sons and wife; the latter is for the brahminical righteous going forth.

376. In the third simile, "a dead tree" means with sap cut off, without water. "Placed on dry ground" means placed on a mountain plateau or on level ground. Here too this is the correlation of the simile: For just as dry dead-tree wood, so are persons escaped from objective sensual pleasures through the defilement of sensual desire; just as the state of being placed far from water on dry ground, so is the state of not being moistened by the defilement of sensual desire. Just as the production of fire even by rubbing, so is the achievement of the supramundane path through feelings caused by their own exertion by way of the open-air dwelling practice, the sitting practice, and so on, for those escaped from objective sensual pleasures through the defilement of sensual desire. Just as the production of fire by merely rubbing against a dry branch of another tree, so is the achievement of the supramundane path through pleasant practice alone, even without feelings caused by their own exertion. This simile was brought by the Blessed One for his own purpose.

377. Now, showing his own performance of austerities, he said beginning with "To that one, to me." But was the Blessed One not able to become a Buddha without performing austerities? Whether having done them or not having done them, he was indeed able. Then why did he do them? "I shall show my own effort to the world including the gods. And that quality of energy-crushing will gladden me." For a warrior who, while seated in a mansion, obtains a kingdom come by tradition is not as greatly

delighted as one who, having taken an army, having delivered two or three strikes in battle, having crushed the enemies, has attained kingship. For when one who has thus attained kingship, while experiencing the sovereignty, having looked at his assembly and having recollected his own effort, reflects "At such and such a place, having done such and such a deed, having thus shot such and such an enemy, having thus struck, I have attained this sovereignty" - powerful pleasure arises. Just so indeed, the Blessed One too, thinking "I shall show my effort to the world including the gods, for that effort will gladden me very much, will give rise to pleasure," performed austerities.

But also, having compassion for future generations, he did them indeed, for future generations will think "The Perfectly Enlightened One, even having fulfilled the perfections over four incalculable aeons plus a hundred thousand cosmic cycles, attained the knowledge of omniscience only by striving in his striving - how much more so should we exert the energy of striving"; this being so, thinking "they will quickly make an end of birth, ageing, and death," having compassion for future generations, he did them indeed.

"With teeth clenched" means having placed the upper teeth upon the lower teeth. "The mind by the mind" means unwholesome consciousness by wholesome consciousness. "Were to restrain" means I would restrain. "Were to crush" means I would crush. "Were to torment" means having scorched, I would perform the crushing of energy. "Excited" means with disturbance. "Overwhelmed by striving" means overwhelmed by striving; the meaning is being one who is pierced.

378. "Breathless" means without breathing. "Blacksmith's bellows" means by the tube of the bellows of a blacksmith. "There are headaches" means there are powerful headaches produced by winds unable to escape from anywhere. "Were to bind one's head with a head-band" means were to give a head-wrapping. "Deities" means the deities dwelling at the end of the Bodhisatta's walking path and in the vicinity of the hermitage.

At that time, it is said, when an exceeding burning of the body arose in the Bodhisatta, fainting occurred. He, having sat down right on the walking path, fell down. Having seen that, the deities said thus - "Such is the dwelling of a Worthy One" - they say by their theory that "Worthy Ones are indeed of such a kind, resembling the dead." Therein, those deities who said "He is deceased," they, having gone, reported to the great King Suddhodana - "Your son is deceased." Has my son died having become a Buddha, or without having become one? He was not able to become a Buddha; having fallen right on the ground of striving, he is deceased. I do not believe it; for my son, there is no such thing as death without attaining enlightenment.

At a later time, when the Perfectly Enlightened One, having set in motion the wheel of the Teaching, having gone gradually to Rājagaha, had arrived at Kapilavatthu, the great King Suddhodana, having taken his bowl, having led him up to the mansion, having given rice gruel and hard food, at the interval between meals reported this matter - "When your Blessed One was making striving, deities came and said 'Your son, great king, is deceased.'" Did you believe it, great king? "No, Blessed One, I did not believe it." Now, great king, having seen marvels beginning from the acceptance

of the dream, would you believe it? I too have become a Buddha, you too have become the father of a Buddha; but formerly, when my knowledge was not yet fully matured, while I was practising the conduct for enlightenment, even at the time of the young prince Dhammapāla, when I had gone to learn a craft, they brought a goat's bone and showed it, saying "Your son, the young prince Dhammapāla, is deceased; this is his bone." Even then you said "There is no such thing as premature death for my son; I do not believe it," great king. From this occasion, the Blessed One related the Mahādharmapāla Jātaka.

379. "Do not, sir" - they said, treating kindly. For deities, it is said, this is a dear and agreeable conventional expression, that is to say "sir." "Non-eating" (ajajjitam) means without food. "I say 'halaṃ'" means I say "enough" - "enough with this, do not do thus, I shall sustain myself" - thus the meaning is "I refuse."

380-381. "Of golden-fish complexion" means the complexion of the golden fish. "This much at most" means for those feelings too, this itself is the supreme, the highest measure. "While his father the Sakyan was working, etc. having attained the first meditative absorption, dwelt" means it is said that the king has a day called the ploughing festival; then they prepare manifold solid and soft food. Having had the city streets cleaned, having had full pitchers placed, having had flags, banners and so on raised, they adorn the whole city like a heavenly mansion of the gods. All the slaves, workers and so on, dressed in new garments, adorned with scents, garlands and so on, gather at the royal palace. At the king's work, a hundred thousand ploughs are yoked. But on that day they yoke eight hundred minus one. All the ploughs together with the oxen's reins and yoke-strings are fenced with silver, like the chariot of Jāṇussoṇi. The king's ceremonial plough is fenced with red gold. The horns of the oxen too, and the reins and goads too, are fenced with gold. The king, going forth with a great retinue, took his son and went.

At the place of work there was a rose-apple tree with dense leaves and foliage, giving thick shade. Having prepared a bed for the prince beneath it, having had a canopy inlaid with golden stars tied above, having had it enclosed with a screen wall, having set up protection, the king, having adorned himself with all ornaments, surrounded by a company of ministers, went to the place of ploughing. There the king takes the golden plough. The ministers, having taken eight hundred minus one silver ploughs, plough here and there. But the king goes from this side to the far side, or from the far side to this side. At this place there is great splendour. The nurses who were seated surrounding the Bodhisatta, thinking "We shall see the king's splendour," went out from within the screen. The Bodhisatta, looking here and there, not seeing anyone, quickly rising, folding his legs crosswise, having taken hold of the breathing, produced the first meditative absorption. The nurses, wandering about amongst the solid and soft food, tarried a little. The shadows of the other trees had turned away, but the shadow of that tree, having become circular, stood still. The nurses, thinking "The master's son is alone," quickly lifting up the screen and entering inside, having seen the Bodhisatta seated cross-legged on the bed and that wonder, went and reported to the king - "The prince, Sire, is seated thus; the shadows of the other trees have turned away, but the shadow of the rose-apple tree has remained circular." The king, having come quickly and having seen the wonder, paid homage to his son, saying "This, dear son, is the second homage to you." With reference to this it was

said - "While his father the Sakyan was working, etc. having attained the first meditative absorption, dwelt." "Could this be the path to enlightenment" means could this first meditative absorption of mindfulness of breathing be the path for the purpose of awakening. "Consciousness following upon mindfulness" means the consciousness that arose immediately after the mindfulness that arose once or twice thus - "This will not be the path to enlightenment, but the first meditative absorption of mindfulness of breathing will be" - is called consciousness following upon mindfulness. "That happiness" means that happiness of the first meditative absorption of mindfulness of breathing.

382. "Were attending upon" means they were attending by performing duties such as sweeping the hermitage and residential cell and so on. "One given to luxurious living" means one given to abundance of requisites. "Has reverted to luxurious living" means having become greedy for flavours, he reverted for the purpose of superior almsfood and so on. "Disheartened, departed" means having become dissatisfied, they departed by the cosmic law of phenomena itself; they went by natural law for the purpose of giving opportunity for bodily seclusion at the time when the Bodhisatta was to attain the highest enlightenment. And going, without going to any other place, they went to Bārāṇasī itself. When they had gone, the Bodhisatta, having obtained bodily seclusion for a fortnight, having sat down on the unconquered divan at the seat of enlightenment, penetrated the knowledge of omniscience.

383. "Quite secluded from sensual pleasures" and so on should be understood in the very manner stated in the Bhayabherava.

387. "I directly know indeed" - this is a separate connection. The Jain, it is said, thought - "I asked the ascetic Gotama one question. The ascetic Gotama, saying 'Furthermore to me, Aggivessana, furthermore to me, Aggivessana,' just keeps on speaking without showing the conclusion. Is he angry indeed?" Then the Blessed One, Aggivessana, showing that when the Truth-finder expounds the Teaching to assemblies of many hundreds, there is not even one person to say "the ascetic Gotama is angry," and that the Truth-finder expounds the Teaching only for the purpose of awakening and penetrating by others, began this proclamation of the Teaching. Therein, "referring to" is with reference to that. "Only for" is a delimiting restriction of the purpose and method. This is what is meant - The purpose of the Truth-finder's proclamation of the Teaching is only the making others understand; therefore he does not teach to just one alone; however many there are who can understand, he teaches to all of them. "On that very same former" - what does he show by this? Saccaka, it is said, thought - "The ascetic Gotama is handsome, pleasing, with well-formed lips, a soft tongue, sweet conversation; he goes about, methinks, delighting the assembly, but internally he has no unified focus of mind." Then the Blessed One, Aggivessana, said thus to show that the Truth-finder does not go about delighting the assembly; the Truth-finder expounds the Teaching even to an assembly extending to the edge of the world-circle, not withdrawn, untainted, to this extent a lone dweller, devoted to the attainment of the fruition of emptiness.

"Internally" means within the resort of its own domain. "I settle it" means I cause it to settle. For the Truth-finder, at the moment when the assembly gives applause, at that moment, having determined by prior reflective attention, he attains fruition attainment; when the sound of the applause has not yet ceased, having emerged

from the attainment, he expounds the Teaching beginning from the place where he was standing. For the Buddhas' dwelling in the life-continuum is light, so they attain the attainment during the interval of an in-breath or an out-breath. "By which I constantly" shows that by which empty fruition concentration I constantly dwell, on that sign of concentration I steady the mind, I concentrate it.

"This is trustworthy" means this is worthy of belief. Having thus accepted the Blessed One's unified focus of mind, now asking the question brought as a waist-pouch core, he said "But does the venerable Gotama directly know sleeping by day?" For just as a dog, even though fed to a full belly with milk-rice cooked with unbroken milk mixed with ghee, having seen faeces, is unable to go without eating it; while eating, even having smelled it, he goes on; and it is said that for one who has gone without even smelling it, his head aches. Just so, for this one too, the Teacher teaches an inspiring proclamation of the Teaching, resembling milk-rice cooked with unbroken milk, beginning from the renunciation up to the elimination of mental corruptions. But for this one, having heard such a proclamation of the Teaching, not even a mere measure of confidence in the Teacher arose; therefore, being unable to go without asking the question brought as a waist-pouch core, he said thus. Therein, since sloth and torpor is abandoned for all those who have eliminated the mental corruptions by the path of arahantship alone, but bodily disturbance occurs in both the clung-to and the not clung-to. For thus lotuses, water lilies, and so on bloom at one time, and at another time they are buds; in the evening the leaves of certain trees too close up, and in the morning they spread out. Thus, the disturbance of the clung-to body itself, and by way of that disturbance the stream of the life-continuum too - here "sleep" is what is intended; that occurs even for those who have eliminated the mental corruptions. With reference to that, he said beginning with "I directly know." "Call an abiding in confusion" means they call it "an abiding in confusion."

389. "Repeatedly attacking" means having struck again and again. "With offensive" means with those spoken having brought forward. "Ways of speaking" means with words. "Having delighted in and given thanks" means having delighted in by receiving with a mind thinking "enough," and having given thanks by praising also with speech. Two discourses were spoken by the Blessed One to this Jain. The former discourse is one recitation section, this one is one and a half; thus even after hearing two and a half recitation sections, this Jain neither attained full realisation, nor went forth, nor became established in the refuges. Why did the Blessed One expound the Teaching to him? For the purpose of habituation in the future. For the Blessed One sees: "For this one there is now no decisive support, but after the passing of more than two hundred years from my final Nibbāna, the Dispensation will become established on the island of Tambapaṇṇi. There this one, having been reborn in a family house, having gone forth when the proper time has arrived, having learnt the three Canons, having developed insight, having attained arahantship together with the analytical knowledges, will become a great one who has eliminated the mental corruptions named Kālabuddharakkhita." Having seen this, he expounded the Teaching for the purpose of habituation in the future.

He too, right there, when the Dispensation had become established on the island of Tambapaṇṇi, having passed away from the heavenly world, was reborn in a certain minister's family in the alms-resort village of the Dakkhiṇagiri Monastery, and having

gone forth in his youth when he was capable of going forth, having learnt the three Canons of the Buddha's teaching, looking after a group, surrounded by the great community of monks, he went to see his preceptor. Then his preceptor, thinking "I shall reprove my co-resident pupil," did not give face to him who had come having learnt the three Canons of the Buddha's teaching, nor did he make even so much as a conversation with him. He, having risen towards the break of dawn, having gone to the Elder's presence - "You, venerable sir, having done the work of study upon me, when I came to your presence, having given face, did not make even so much as a conversation. What is my fault?" he asked. The elder said - "You, friend, Buddharakkhita, with just this much think 'the task of my going forth has reached its summit.'" "What should I do, venerable sir?" "Having dismissed your group, having cut off obsession, having gone to the Cetiyaṭṭhapaṭṭha Monastery, practise the ascetic duty." He, having stood firm in the preceptor's exhortation, having attained arahantship together with the analytical knowledges, being meritorious, honoured by the king, surrounded by the great community of monks, dwelt at the Cetiyaṭṭhapaṭṭha Monastery.

For at that time, the Great King Tissa, performing the Observance practice, was dwelling in the royal rock cell at Cetiyaṭṭhapaṭṭha. He gave a signal to the Elder's attendant monk - "When my noble one answers a question or expounds the Teaching, then you should give me a signal." The Elder too, on a certain day for hearing the Teaching, surrounded by the community of monks, having ascended the courtyard of the Kaṇṭhaka Shrine, having paid homage to the shrine, stood at the foot of a black timbaru tree. Then a certain elder who was an almsfood eater asked him a question in the Kāḷakārāma Discourse. The Elder said: "Is it not, friend, today a day for hearing the Teaching?" "Yes, venerable sir, it is a day for hearing the Teaching." "If so, bring a small chair; seated right here we shall do the hearing of the Teaching." Then, having prepared a seat for him at the foot of the tree, they gave it. The Elder, having recited the preliminary verses, began the Kāḷakārāma Discourse. His young attendant had a signal given to the king. The king arrived while the preliminary verses were still unfinished. And having arrived, standing at the edge of the assembly in the guise of an unrelated person, having listened to the Teaching while standing throughout the three watches of the night, at the time of the Elder's words "This the Blessed One said," he gave applause. The Elder, having known, asked: "When did you come, great king?" "At the very time of the recitation of the preliminary verses, venerable sir." "What is difficult to do has been done by you, great king." "This is not difficult, venerable sir; but if from the time the noble one began the talk on the Teaching, there was for me a state of being otherwise engaged even in a single word, may there not be for me lordship over even a place on the island of Tambapaṇṇi the size of a mere pricking by a goad stick" - thus he made an oath.

But in that discourse the virtues of the Buddha were illumined, therefore the king asked - "Are the virtues of the Buddha only this much, venerable sir, or are there others as well?" Compared to what was spoken by me, great king, what has not been spoken is indeed much, limitless. "Make a simile, venerable sir." Just as, great king, in a rice field measuring a thousand karīṣas, compared to a single ear of rice, the remaining rice plants are indeed many, so the virtues spoken by me are few, the remaining ones are many. "Make another simile too, venerable sir." Just as, great king, if one were to hold the eye of a needle facing the Great Ganges full of flood-

water, the water that passed through the eye of the needle would be little, the rest would be much, just so the virtues spoken by me are few, the remaining ones are many. "Make another simile too, venerable sir." Here, great king, birds called cātaka wander about playing in space. That is a small species of bird. Is the space for the spreading of that bird's wings much, or is the remaining space little? "What are you saying, venerable sir? The space for its wing-spreading is little, the remainder is indeed much." Just so, great king, the virtues of the Buddha spoken by me are few, the remaining ones are many, infinite, immeasurable. "Well spoken, venerable sir. The infinite virtues of the Buddha have been compared with infinite space itself." "We are devoted to the noble one, but we are not able to make a befitting offering." "This is my humble gift-offering: in this island of Tambapaṇṇi, I give this kingdom of three hundred yojanas to the noble one." "By you, great king, your own expression of devotion has been made. We, however, give back to you the kingdom given to us. Rule the kingdom righteously and impartially, great king."

In the Papañcasūdanī, the commentary on the Majjhima Nikāya,

the Commentary on the Mahāsaccaka Sutta is finished.

7. Commentary on the Cūḷataṇhāsāṅkhaya Sutta

390. "Thus have I heard" - this is the Shorter Discourse on the Elimination of Craving. Therein, "in the Eastern Park, in Migāramātā's mansion" means in the monastery termed the Eastern Park, in the mansion of Migāramātā. Herein this is the progressive discourse - in the past, at the summit of a hundred thousand cosmic cycles, a certain female lay follower, having invited the Blessed One Padumuttara, having given a hundred thousand gifts to the community of monks headed by the Buddha, having lain down at the feet of the Blessed One, made the aspiration "May I be the chief female attendant of a Buddha such as you in the future." She, having wandered in the round of rebirths among gods and human beings for a hundred thousand cosmic cycles, in the time of our Blessed One, took conception in the womb of Queen Sumanā in the house of the millionaire Dhanañjaya, the son of the millionaire Meṇḍaka, in the city of Bhaddiya. At the time of her birth they gave her the name Visākhā. When the Blessed One came to the city of Bhaddiya, she, together with five hundred girls, having gone out to meet the Blessed One, became a stream-enterer at the very first sight. Afterwards she went to the house of the prince Puṇṇavaḍḍhana, the son of the millionaire Migāra, in Sāvatthī. There the millionaire Migāra placed her in the position of mother. Therefore she is called Migāramātā.

When she was going to her husband's family, her father had an ornament called the Great Creeper Ornament made. In that ornament four measures of diamonds were used, eleven measures of pearls, twenty-two measures of coral, thirty-three measures of gems - thus it reached completion with these and other seven kinds of precious things. When fastened on the head, it falls down as far as the top of the feet. Only a woman bearing the strength of five elephants is able to wear it. Afterwards, having become the chief female attendant of the One of Ten Powers, having given up that ornament, while having a monastery built for the Blessed One with nine hundred million, she had a mansion built on a piece of land the size of a kaṇṇasa. On its upper storey there were five hundred inner rooms, and on the lower storey five hundred - thus it was adorned with a thousand inner rooms. She, thinking "A mere mansion

alone does not look splendid," having surrounded it, had five hundred two-peaked houses, five hundred small mansions, and five hundred long halls built. The monastery festival reached completion in four months.

There is no relinquishment of wealth in the Buddha's Dispensation by any other woman established in the state of womanhood like Visākhā, and there is no relinquishment of wealth in the Buddha's Dispensation by any other man established in the state of manhood like Anāthapiṇḍika. For he, having given up fifty-four hundred million, had the great monastery called Jetavana built in a place to the south of Sāvattihī, similar to the Mahāvihāra of Anurādhapura. Visākhā had the Eastern Park built in a place to the east of Sāvattihī, similar to the monastery of Queen Uttamā. The Blessed One, out of compassion for these two families, dwelling in dependence on Sāvattihī, dwelt in a permanent residence in these two monasteries. One rainy season he dwells in Jeta's Grove, one in the Eastern Park. At that time, however, the Blessed One was dwelling in the Eastern Park. Therefore it was said - "In the Eastern Park, in Migāramātā's mansion."

"In what respect, venerable sir" means to what extent, venerable sir. "In brief liberated by the elimination of craving" means in what respect is one called in brief liberated by the elimination of craving, by the state of having a liberated mind, having made as object the extinction of craving, which is Nibbāna? He asks: "By whatever practice one becomes liberated by the elimination of craving, teach me in brief the preliminary practice of a monk who has eliminated the mental corruptions." "Of absolute goal" - "absolute" means having gone beyond the end termed elimination and passing away. "The goal would be absolute for him" - thus "of absolute goal"; the meaning is of exclusive goal, of constant goal. "Absolutely secure from bondage" means of absolute security from bondage; the meaning is of permanent security from bondage. "Absolutely leading the holy life" means of absolute holy life; the meaning is of permanent holy life. "The final end would be absolute for him" - by the former method itself, of absolute final end. "Foremost among gods and humans" means foremost and highest among gods and humans. He requests the Blessed One: "In what respect does a monk of such kind exist? Quickly tell his practice in brief." But why does he hasten thus? Because of the desire to enjoy sport.

It is said that this one, having commanded amusement in the park, having caused the four great kings to take up protection in the four directions, surrounded by the host of gods in the two heavenly worlds, together with two and a half crores of dancers, having mounted Erāvaṇa, standing at the park gate, considered this question - "To what extent is the preliminary-part practice to be approached in brief for one who has eliminated the mental corruptions, who is liberated by the elimination of craving?" Then this occurred to him - "This question is exceedingly glorious. If I enter the park without having grasped this question, being churned by objects through the six doors, I shall not consider this question again. Let the amusement in the park stand for now; having gone to the Teacher's presence, having asked this question, with the question taken up, I shall play in the park" - having vanished from the elephant's back, he appeared in the presence of the Blessed One. Those four great kings too, having taken up protection, remained right at the place where they were standing; the host

of attendant gods too, the dancers too, and Erāvaṇa the king of serpents too stood right there at the park gate. Thus this one, being in haste out of desire to enjoy the amusement, spoke thus.

"All phenomena are not fit for adherence" - here "all phenomena" means the five aggregates, the twelve sense bases, and the eighteen elements. All of them too are not fit for adherence by way of craving and wrong view - not adequate, not able, not proper. Why? Because they do not remain in the manner in which they are grasped. For even though grasped as permanent, they turn out to be only impermanent; even though grasped as pleasant, they turn out to be only suffering; even though grasped as self, they turn out to be only non-self. Therefore they are not fit for adherence. "He directly knows" means he directly knows by way of full understanding as the known, as impermanent, suffering, and non-self. "He fully understands" means in the same way he fully understands by way of full understanding as judgement. "Whatever feeling" means he experiences whatever feeling, even the slightest, even that associated with the five sense consciousnesses. By this, the Blessed One shows the discernment of the immaterial, having turned to Sakka, the lord of the gods, by way of feeling. But if the meditation subject of feeling had not been spoken of below, it would have to be spoken of at this point. But it was spoken of below; therefore it should be understood by the method stated in the establishment of mindfulness. "Observing impermanence" - here impermanence should be known, observation of impermanence should be known, and the observer of impermanence should be known. Therein, "impermanent" means the five aggregates, for they are impermanent in the meaning of arising and passing away. "Observation of impermanence" means the knowledge of seeing the five aggregates in terms of elimination and passing away. "Observer of impermanence" means a person endowed with that knowledge. Therefore "he dwells observing impermanence" - the meaning here is: he dwells observing as impermanent.

"Observing dispassion" - here there are two kinds of dispassion: dispassion as elimination and absolute dispassion. Therein, the observation of the elimination and passing away of activities, and also the path-knowledge of seeing Nibbāna, which is absolute dispassion, as dispassion - this is observation of dispassion. A person endowed with both of those is called an observer of dispassion. With reference to that it was said "observing dispassion" - the meaning is: observing as dispassion. In the case of observing cessation too, the same method applies, for cessation too is just twofold: cessation as elimination and absolute cessation. "Observing relinquishment" - here relinquishment is called release, and that is twofold: release by relinquishment and release by springing forward. Therein, "release by relinquishment" is insight, for it releases mental defilements and aggregates by way of substitution of opposites. "Release by springing forward" is the path, for it springs forward towards Nibbāna as its object. Or by both reasons it is just release: because of releasing aggregates and mental defilements by way of eradication, and because of springing forward towards Nibbāna. Therefore, "it relinquishes mental defilements and aggregates" is release by relinquishment; "consciousness springs forward to the element of Nibbāna, to cessation" is release by springing forward - both of these come together in the path. A person endowed with both of those, because of being endowed with this observation of relinquishment, is called an observer of relinquishment. With reference to that it was said "observing relinquishment." "He does not cling to anything in the

world" means he does not cling to, does not grasp, does not adhere to anything, even a single thing pertaining to activities, by way of craving. "Not clinging, he is not agitated" means not grasping, he is not agitated by the agitation of craving. "He personally attains final nibbāna" means by himself he attains final nibbāna through the final extinguishment of the mental defilements. But by the passage beginning with "Birth is eliminated," only his reviewing was shown. Thus the Blessed One, when asked by Sakka, the lord of the gods, about the preliminary-part practice of one who has eliminated the mental corruptions in brief, making it light, spoke quickly in brief itself.

391. "Was seated not far" means he was seated in the adjacent pinnacle building. "Having thoroughly understood" means having approached with knowledge, having known - this is the meaning. This is what is meant - did he give thanks having known, or without knowing? But why did this occur to him? The Elder, it is said, did not hear the sound of the Blessed One's answering of the question, but he heard the sound of thanksgiving of Sakka, the king of gods, saying "So it is, Blessed One, so it is, Fortunate One." Sakka, the king of gods, it is said, gave thanks with a great sound. Then why did he not hear the sound of the Blessed One? Because of informing according to the assembly. For when the Buddhas are expounding the Teaching, the sound is heard by an assembly that is bound together even to the edge of the world-circle, but having passed the boundary, it does not go forth outside even by a finger's breadth. Why? So that such sweet talk should not go to waste. At that time the Blessed One was seated in the royal bedchamber in a pinnacle building made of seven precious things in Migāramātā's mansion; on his right side was the pinnacle building where the Elder Sāriputta dwelt, on his left side that of Mahāmoggallāna; in between there was no space of opening or gap. Therefore the Elder did not hear the sound of the Blessed One, but heard only that of Sakka.

"With five hundred musical instruments" means with five hundred of the five-part musical instruments. A five-part musical instrument is one possessed of these five factors: ātata, vitata, ātatavitata, susira, and ghana. Therein, "ātata" means a musical instrument with one face, among drums and so on covered with leather. "Vitata" means with both faces. "Ātatavitata" means small drums bound with strings and so on. "Susira" means bamboo flutes and so on. "Ghana" means cymbals and so on.

"Endowed" means approached. "Furnished" is a synonym for that very thing.

"Indulges himself" means while experiencing that success, he directs the faculties here and there. This is what is meant - having been surrounded by and endowed with five hundred musical instruments being played, he experiences divine success.

"Having dismissed" means having removed; the meaning is having caused them to be silent. For just as nowadays faithful kings, having seen a monk worthy of veneration and respect - dismiss the performers saying "The noble one named so-and-so is coming; do not sing, dear ones, do not play instruments, do not dance," Sakka too, having seen the Elder, did likewise. "It has been a long time, dear Moggallāna, since you made this occasion" - this is a word of affectionate address natural in the world. For worldly people, having seen an agreeable person who has come after a long time, or even one who has never come before, having arrived - say such things as "Where have you come from, sir? You have come after a long time, sir. How did you come to know the way here? Were you lost on the way?" But he said thus precisely because he had come before. For the Elder goes on a journey to the

gods from time to time indeed. Therein, "made this occasion" means he made this turn. "That is to say, for coming here" means this which is the turn for coming here, that, venerable sir, you have made after a long time - this is what is meant. "This seat is laid down" - having had a jewel divan of one yojana laid out, he said thus.

392. "Have much to do, have many duties": here, those who have many functions, they have much to do. "Many duties" is a synonym for that very thing. "Not only with our own duties" means one's own duties are only little, slight, not much; but the duties of the gods are much, for beginning from the earth, cases concerning wishing trees, women, and so on are decided in the presence of Sakka. Therefore, specifying, he said - "But also with the duties of the gods of the Thirty-three." For the daughters and sons of gods arise in their laps; the women who are foot-attendants arise on their beds; the goddesses who are their adorners and beautifiers arise surrounding the bed; the stewards arise within the mansion. For the sake of these, there is no making of a case. But those who arise in the boundary between, being unable to determine "They are mine, they are yours," they make a case and ask Sakka, the king of gods. He says "They belong to the one whose mansion is nearer." If both are in an equal location, he says "They belong to the one whose mansion he stands looking at." If she does not look at even one, he makes them his own property for the purpose of cutting off the dispute between the two. With reference to that, he said "with the duties of the gods of the Thirty-three." Furthermore, such amusement duties too are duties to be done for him.

"Which quickly disappears from us" means which, for us, quickly is not seen, as if gone into darkness. By this - he makes clear: "I, venerable sir, do not observe that answering of questions." The elder - reflecting "Why indeed does this demon make clear the state of not observing, avoids it by a side" - "Gods are indeed greatly confused. Being churned by objects through the six doors, they do not know even whether they have eaten or not eaten, whether they have drunk or not drunk; what here would they forget?" - thus he understood. Some, however, say - "The elder is venerable and esteemed by him, therefore out of fear that 'the elder might threaten me thus: just now he has come having learnt a question in the presence of the foremost person in the world, and just now he has entered amongst the dancers' - thus he spoke." But this is called deceit, and such deceit does not exist for a noble disciple. Therefore it should be understood that he did not observe due to the state of being confused. Why did he observe later? The elder, having aroused in him religious emotion born of pleasure, removed the darkness. Therefore he observed.

Now, in order to report to the elder the factual reason for his former state, Sakka spoke beginning with "Once upon a time." Therein, "fully engaged" means assembled, become a mass. "The titans were defeated" means the titans reached defeat. But when were they defeated? At the time of Sakka's arising. It is said that Sakka, in the immediately preceding individual existence, was a young man named Magha in the village of Macala in the country of Magadha, wise and experienced; his conduct was like the conduct of a Bodhisatta. He, having taken thirty-three men, did good. One day, having examined by his own wisdom, in the middle of the village, at the place where the public assembled, having swept away the rubbish on both sides, he made that place exceedingly delightful; again right there he had a pavilion built; again, as time went on, he had a hall built. And having departed from the village, having

wandered even a league, even half a yojana, even three leagues, even a yojana, together with those companions he made the uneven even. All of them too, of one desire, here and there building bridges at places suitable for bridges, and building pavilions and so on at places suitable for pavilions, halls, ponds, flower-plant planting, and so on, they performed much merit. Magha, having fulfilled seven vows, upon the collapse of the body, together with his companions, was reborn in the realm of the Thirty-three.

At that time the groups of titans were dwelling in the Tāvatiṃsa god realm. All of them had the same lifespan and the same beauty as the gods. They, having seen Sakka together with his following, prepared a great drinking feast, thinking "Newly reborn junior young gods have come." Sakka gave a signal to the young gods - "When we were performing wholesome deeds, we did not do so in common with others. Do not drink the strong liquor; merely pretend to have drunk." They did so. The foolish titans, having drunk the strong liquor, became intoxicated and fell into sleep. Sakka, having given a signal to the gods, having had them seized by the feet, had them thrown down to the foot of Sineru. On the lower level of Sineru there is what is called the titan realm, equal in extent to the Tāvatiṃsa god realm. There the titans dwell. They too have a tree named the Variegated Trumpet-flower. They know at the time of its flowering - "This is not the Tāvatiṃsa realm; we have been deceived by Sakka." They, having said "Seize them!" and surrounding Sineru, like ant-hill insects from the base of an ant-hill when the sky has rained, ascended. There sometimes the gods win, sometimes the titans. When there is victory for the gods, they pursue the titans as far as the surface of the ocean. When there is victory for the titans, they pursue the gods as far as the base of the railing. But in that battle there was victory for the gods; the gods pursued the titans as far as the surface of the ocean. Sakka, having put the titans to flight, established a guard at five places. Having thus given protection, he placed at the base of the railing images of Indra with thunderbolt in hand. The titans, rising up from time to time and seeing those images, thinking "Sakka stands diligent," turn back from that very place. "Having turned back from there" means having turned back from the conquered place. "Attendants" means those who perform the work of garlands, perfumes, and so on.

393. "And the great king Vessavaṇa": he, it is said, was Sakka's favourite, a very intimate confidant, therefore he went together with Sakka. "Having put in front" means having placed in front. "They entered": but having entered, they made the doors half-shut and stood looking. "See this too, dear Moggallāna, the loveliness of the Vejayanta mansion" means: dear Moggallāna, see this too, the loveliness of the Vejayanta mansion; see the golden pillars, see the silver pillars, the gem pillars, the coral pillars, the ruby pillars, the cat's-eye pillars, the pearl pillars, the pillars of the seven precious things; and see the capitals made of those very gold and other materials, and the figures of fierce animals - thus, making the rows of pillars the starting point, showing the loveliness, he spoke thus. "As is natural for one who has made merit in the past" means: just as it should shine by way of the place of enjoyment for one who has made merit in the past, just so it shines - this is the meaning. "This demon dwells too excessively heedless" means excessively intoxicated by the power of the success of the retinue of dancers in his own mansion.

"Performed a feat of supernormal power" means he performed supernormal power. Having attained the water kasiṇa, having determined the supernormal power thus "Let the place where the mansion is established become water," he struck the pinnacle of the mansion with his big toe. That mansion, just as a bowl placed on the surface of water, when struck with a finger on the rim, trembles back and forth, wavers, and does not remain still. Just so it trembled, quaked, and shook violently; the pillars, door frames, pinnacles, rafters, and so on, emitting a cracking sound, appeared as if about to fall. Therefore it was said - "He shook, made tremble, and made quake." "Filled with wonder and amazement" means: "Oh, how wonderful! Oh, how marvellous!" - thus they were those in whom wonder and amazement had arisen, and in whom delight had arisen, with powerful pleasure having arisen. "Stirred" means agitated. "With hair standing on end" means with bristling of the hair having arisen; the meaning is a body covered with hairs standing upward at the tips, like gem ivory pegs set in a golden wall. And this bristling of the hair occurs both through pleasure and through displeasure; but here it arose through pleasure. For the elder monk performed that wonder in order to stir Sakka through the force of pleasure. Therefore the meaning is: having understood that he was stirred with hair standing on end through the force of pleasure.

394. "Here I, dear sir" - now, since the darkness had been dispelled by the elder having aroused in him religious emotion born of pleasure, therefore having observed this, he spoke thus. "Is this, sir, that Blessed One, your Teacher?" - "Sir, when asked 'Where have you gone?' you say 'To the presence of my Teacher,' you stand in this heavenly world as if on one foot; since you speak thus, 'Is this, sir, that Blessed One, your Teacher?'" - they asked. "This one is my fellow in the holy life" - here, although the elder is a homeless one, accomplished in resolution, a chief disciple, and Sakka is a householder, yet by virtue of the path and the holy life, these are fellows in the holy life; therefore he spoke thus. "Ah, surely that Blessed One must be your Teacher" - your fellow in the holy life is of such great supernormal power, but that Blessed One, your Teacher, must surely be of great supernormal power - having become those whose speech arose from the desire to see the Teacher's wonder of supernormal power, they spoke thus.

395. "A certain well-known one" means a certain renowned one, for Sakka is a certain one among the renowned. The remainder is obvious everywhere; but the Blessed One concluded the teaching according to the very same connection.

In the Papañcasūdanī, the commentary on the Majjhima Nikāya,

the Commentary on the Cūḷataṇhāsaṅkhaya Sutta is finished.

8. Commentary on the Mahātaṇhāsaṅkhaya Sutta

396. "Thus have I heard" - this is the Discourse on the Greater Extinction of Craving. Therein, "wrong view" - in the Discourse on the Simile of the Water-Snake, it is said to be merely a belief as a wrong view; here it is the eternalist view. That monk was very learned, but this one was of little learning, a reciter of Jātakas, who hears the Blessed One, having told a Jātaka, making the connection thus: "I, monks, at that time was Vessantara, Mahosadha, Vidhura the wise, Senaka the wise, King Mahājanaka." Then this occurred to him - "These materiality, feeling, perception, and activities cease

right there in each existence, but consciousness transmigrates and wanders on from this world to the world beyond, from the world beyond to this world" - thus the eternalist vision arose. Therefore he said - "It is this same consciousness that transmigrates and wanders on, not another."

But by the Perfectly Enlightened One it was said: "Consciousness is of conditional origination; when there is a condition it arises; without a condition there is no origination of consciousness." Therefore this monk speaks what was not spoken by the Buddha, strikes a blow at the wheel of the Conqueror, obstructs the knowledge of self-confidence, deceives people willing to hear, and having fallen across the noble path, has practised for the harm and suffering of the public. Just as a great thief arising in a king's kingdom arises for the harm and suffering of the public, so it should be understood that having become a thief in the Conqueror's Dispensation, he has arisen for the harm and suffering of the public. "Several monks" means almsfood-eating monks dwelling in the countryside. "They approached" means this one, having gained a following, might even cause the Dispensation to disappear; as long as he does not gain a faction, let us dissuade him from the wrong view right then - thus, having stood up from the very place where they heard it, without sitting down, they approached.

398. "What is that consciousness, Sāti" means Sāti, that which you say with reference to consciousness, what is that consciousness? "That, venerable sir, which speaks and experiences, which experiences here and there the result of good and bad actions" means, venerable sir, that which speaks and feels, and that which here and there experiences the result of wholesome and unwholesome actions. "This, venerable sir, is the consciousness that I say with reference to." "To whom indeed" means to which warrior, or brahmin, or merchant, worker, householder, one gone forth, god, or human being, or to any one of them.

399. "Then the Blessed One addressed the monks" - why did he address them? It is said that this thought occurred to Sāti: "The Teacher calls me 'foolish man,' but merely by being called 'foolish man' the decisive support for path and fruition is not absent. For the Blessed One exhorted even Upasena Vaṅgantaputta with the address 'foolish man,' saying 'Too quickly indeed, foolish man, you have reverted to luxurious living.' The Elder, at a later time, striving and endeavouring, realised the six direct knowledges. I too, having exerted such energy, shall produce the paths and fruitions." Then the Blessed One, showing that this one's condition had been cut off and that he was one subject to not growing in the Dispensation, addressed the monks. "A spark of warmth" and so on has the same intention as stated above. "Then the Blessed One" - this too is a separate connection. It is said that this occurred to Sāti: "The Blessed One says that there is no decisive support for path and fruition for me. What can be done when the decisive support is absent? For Truth-finders do not expound the Teaching only to one with decisive support; they teach to anyone whatsoever. I, having received the exhortation of the Fortunate One from the Buddha's presence, shall perform wholesome deeds leading to the attainment of heavenly success." Then the Blessed One, revoking the exhortation of the Fortunate One with the words "I do not give you, foolish man, either exhortation or instruction," began this teaching. Its

meaning should be understood by the method already stated above. Now, purifying the view of the assembly, he said beginning with "Here I will question the monks." All that too should be understood by the method already stated above.

400. Now, in order to show the state of consciousness as having conditions, he said beginning with "Whatever, monks." Therein, "dependent on the mind and mental phenomena" means dependent on the life-continuum mind together with adverting, and the phenomena of the three planes of existence. "Dependent on wood" and so on was stated for the purpose of illustrating by simile. What does he make clear by that? The absence of transference between doors. For just as fire burning dependent on wood burns only when the fuel-condition is present, and when that is absent, through deficiency of conditions, is extinguished right there, and does not pass over to splinters and so on and come to be reckoned as "splinter-fire" and so on, just so consciousness arisen dependent on the eye and forms arises only when the condition designated as eye, form, light, and attention is present at that door, and when that is absent, through deficiency of conditions, ceases right there, and does not pass over to the ear and so on and come to be reckoned as "ear-consciousness" and so on. This same method applies in all instances. Thus the Blessed One reproved Sāti: "I do not speak of even a mere transference between doors in the occurrence of consciousness, yet this foolish man Sāti speaks of transference between existences."

401. Having thus shown the state of consciousness as having conditions, now showing the state of having conditions of all five aggregates, he said beginning with "This has come to be." Therein, "This has come to be" means this fivefold group of aggregates is born, has come to be, has arisen; "Do you too, monks, see 'This has come to be'?" "It has originated from that nutriment" means but this fivefold group of aggregates has originated from nutriment, has originated from conditions; he asks "Do you see thus that when there is a condition it arises?" "From the cessation of that nutriment" means from the cessation of that condition. "Has this come to be or not" means "Has this indeed come to be, or has it indeed not come to be?" "Has it originated from that nutriment or not" means "Has that which has come to be, the fivefold group of aggregates, indeed originated from conditions, or indeed not?" "From the cessation of that nutriment" means from the cessation of that condition. "Has the nature of cessation or not" means "Does that phenomenon indeed have the nature of cessation, or indeed not?" "Seeing with right wisdom" means for one who sees rightly with insight wisdom, according to the actual intrinsic nature and individual characteristic, that this fivefold group of aggregates is born, has come to be, has arisen. "Well seen with wisdom" means well seen with insight wisdom in the very manner already stated. Thus, accepting the acknowledgment of each and every one of those who considered that question, he shows the state of having conditions of the five aggregates.

Now, asking about the state of being free from craving regarding that fivefold group of aggregates with conditions and with cessation, which was well seen by them through that wisdom, he said beginning with "If you, monks, this." Therein, "view" means insight right view. "Pure" through the seeing of intrinsic nature. "Bright" through the seeing of conditions. "Were to cling" means were to dwell having clung through craving and wrong view. "Were to cherish" means were to dwell playing with it through craving and wrong view. "Were to treasure" means were to become greedy,

desiring it as if it were wealth. "Were to treat it as mine" means were to generate selfish attachment through craving and wrong view. "For the purpose of crossing over, not for the purpose of grasping" means that Teaching like a raft which was taught by me for the purpose of crossing over the four floods, not for the purpose of grasping through attachment. "Would you then understand that?" The bright side should be understood by the reverse.

402. Now, showing the condition of those aggregates, he said beginning with "Monks, there are these four nutriments," and the meaning of that too has already been stated. But just as when one person is told "you know this one," one who knows by way of lineage thus: "Not only this one, I know his mother too, and his mother's mother too" - he is indeed said to know well. Just so the Blessed One knows not only the mere aggregates, but also the condition of the aggregates, and the condition of those conditions too - thus he knows the entire succession of all conditions. He, making clear that Buddha's power, now in order to show the succession of conditions, said beginning with "And these four nutriments, monks." The meaning of that has already been stated. "Thus indeed, monks, with ignorance as condition, activities, etc. there is the origin of the mass of suffering" - but here the discussion of dependent origination should be expanded; that has been explained in detail in the Visuddhimagga.

404. "When this exists, that comes to be" means when this condition beginning with ignorance exists, this result beginning with activities comes to be. "From the arising of this, that arises" means from the arising of this condition beginning with ignorance, this result beginning with activities arises; therefore he said - "That is to say, with ignorance as condition, activities, etc. there is the origin." Having thus shown the round of rebirths, now showing the end of the round of rebirths, he said beginning with "but with the remainderless fading away and cessation of ignorance." Therein, "avijjāya tveva" means "of ignorance, but indeed." "With the remainderless fading away and cessation" means by the remainderless cessation, the cessation of non-arising, through the path termed as fading away. "Cessation of activities" means there is the cessation of non-arising of activities. In order to show that from the cessation of activities thus ceased there is the cessation of consciousness, and from the cessation of consciousness and so on, mentality-materiality and so on are likewise ceased, having said beginning with "from the cessation of activities comes the cessation of consciousness," it was stated "thus is the cessation of this whole mass of suffering." Therein, "whole" means of the entire, or of the pure, or devoid of a being - this is the meaning. "Of the mass of suffering" means of the heap of suffering. "Cessation comes to be" means non-arising comes to be.

406. "When this is absent" and so on should be understood by the method opposite to what was stated.

407. Having thus spoken of the round of rebirths and its end, now, asking about the absence of that running back which is abandoned for one who knows this twelve-factored conditional round of rebirths together with insight through the path, he said beginning with "Would you, monks." Therein, "knowing thus" means knowing thus together with insight through the path. "Seeing thus" is a synonym for that very thing. "The past" means the former portion; the meaning is the past aggregates, elements, and sense bases. "Would run back" means would run back by way of

craving and wrong view. The remainder has been explained in detail in the Discourse on All Mental Corruptions.

Now, asking about their steadfastness therein, he said beginning with "Would you, monks, knowing thus, seeing thus, speak thus: 'The Teacher is our respected one.'" Therein, "respected" means weighty, one who should be conformed to unwillingly. "The ascetic" means the ascetic who is the Buddha. "Would you point to another teacher" means would you, having become of such perception that "This Teacher is not able to accomplish our function," point to another outside teacher. "Of the many ascetics and brahmins" means having become of such perception, of the many sectarian ascetics and brahmins. "Rites, curious practices, and auspicious signs" means the undertaking of ascetic practices, and curiosities of wrong views, and auspicious signs based on what is seen, heard, and sensed. "Would return to them as having substance" means having become of such perception that "these are the substance," would return to them. The meaning is: would you take up again what has thus been given up. "Oneself known" means known by oneself through knowledge. "Oneself seen" means seen by oneself with the eye of wisdom. "Oneself understood" means made clear by oneself, made obvious. "You have been guided by me" means: by me, monks, you have been guided, brought to Nibbāna through this Teaching having the intrinsic nature of being visible here and now and so on. This is the meaning. The meaning of "visible here and now" and so on has been expanded upon in the Visuddhimagga. "This was said dependent on that" means this statement was said by you dependent on the state of having oneself known and so on.

408. "Now, monks, from the coming together of three" - why did he begin? Was not the teaching already brought to its summit above by way of the round of rebirths and the end of the round of rebirths? Yes, it was brought to its summit. But this is a separate connection: "For this world community is deluded regarding conception; having destroyed the ground of its confusion, I will make it manifest" - thus he began this teaching. Furthermore, ignorance is the root of the round of rebirths, the arising of a Buddha is the root of the end of the round of rebirths; thus, even having shown ignorance as the root of the round of rebirths and the arising of a Buddha as the root of the end of the round of rebirths, he began this teaching thinking "I will once more bring the teaching to its summit by way of the round of rebirths and the end of the round of rebirths." Therein, "from the coming together" means by combination, by aggregation. "Of a womb" means of a being to be born in the womb. "There is a descent" means there is an arising. For somewhere "womb" refers to the mother's womb. As he said -

"From the first night that a young man dwells in the womb;
Having arisen, he goes on, and going does not turn back."

Somewhere it means the being to be born in the womb. As he said - "Now, Ānanda, while other women give birth after carrying the embryo in the womb for nine or ten months." Here a being is intended; with reference to that it was said "there is conception in a womb."

"Here" means in this world of beings. "And the mother is in her fertile period" - this was said with reference to the fertile time. It is said that in the place within a woman where a child is born, a large blood-blister having formed, having burst, flows forth;

the site becomes pure. When the site is pure, once the mother and father have come together, for up to seven days it is indeed a fertile field. At that time, even by the touching of a limb such as grasping the hand or grasping the braid of hair, a child is indeed born. "Gandhabba" means a being destined to arise there. "Is present" does not mean that he is called present by standing nearby watching the coming together of the mother and father. Rather, one being, driven by the mechanism of action, is to be born in that place - this is the intention here. "With anxiety" means with great danger to life thus: "Shall I be healthy, or my son?" "For this, monks, is blood" - at that time, it is said, the mother's blood, having reached that place, becomes white through affection for the child. Therefore he spoke thus. "Toy ploughs" means a small plough, a plaything for village boys. "Stick games" is called the game of striking a short stick with a long stick. "Somersaults" means the game of turning over; it means the game of turning upside down either by grasping a stick in the air or by placing the head on the ground. "Toy windmills" is called a revolving wheel made from palm leaves and the like, which spins by the force of the wind. "Toy measures" is called a leaf-tube; with it they play by measuring sand and the like. "Toy chariots" means a small chariot. "Toy bows" also means just a small bow.

409. "Is attached to" means gives rise to lust. "Is repelled by" means gives rise to anger. "With bodily mindfulness not established" means mindfulness regarding the body is bodily mindfulness; the meaning is not having established that. "With a limited mind" means with unwholesome consciousness. "Where those evil" means in whatever fruition attainment those cease, that he does not know, does not attain - this is the meaning. "Compliance and opposition" means lust and hate. "Delights in" means delights in through the influence of craving; through the influence of craving itself, saying such things as "Oh, what happiness!" he asserts. "Remains grasping" means by the grasping of craving's clamp, having swallowed and brought to completion, he takes hold. One may delight in pleasant or neither-unpleasant-nor-painful feeling, but how does one delight in painful feeling? One who grasps thus "I am afflicted, my suffering" is said to delight in it. "Delight arises" means craving arises. "That is clinging" means that very craving, in the sense of grasping, is called clinging. With that clinging as condition, existence, etc. "Thus is the origin" - for here the Blessed One has once again shown the round of the mode of dependent conditions with two connections and three summaries.

410-414. Now, in order to show the end of the round of rebirths, he said beginning with "Here, monks, a Truth-finder arises in the world." Therein, "with a limitless mind" means one whose mind is limitless and supramundane - thus "with a limitless mind"; the meaning is one who possesses the consciousness of the path. "Remember this, monks, in brief, as my teaching on liberation through the elimination of craving" means: monks, you should constantly keep this teaching on liberation through the elimination of craving, taught by me in brief; do not be negligent. For here the teaching is called "liberation" because it is the cause for the attainment of liberation. "Caught in the great net of craving, the tangle of craving" means: craving itself, in the sense of being entwined, is called "the great net of craving," and in the sense of being joined together, it is called "the tangle." Thus, remember this monk Sāti, the fisherman's son, as caught in this great net of craving and tangle of craving. "Entered into, included within" - the meaning is: remember him thus. The remainder is of manifest meaning everywhere.

9. Commentary on the Mahāassapura Sutta

415. "Thus have I heard" - this is the Mahāassapura Discourse. Therein, "among the Aṅgas" - the Aṅgas are princes who are provincial rulers; their abode, though a single province, is called "Aṅgas" by conventional usage; in that Aṅgan province. "A market town of the Aṅgas named Assapura" - "Assapura" is a market town that obtained its conventional expression from the name of the city, one market town of the province of the Aṅgas; the meaning is that he dwells making that his village as food resort. "The Blessed One said this" means he spoke this utterance beginning with "People perceive you, monks, as 'ascetics, ascetics.'"

But why did he speak thus? It is said that in that market town the people were faithful, devoted, devoted to the Buddha, devoted to the Dhamma, devoted to the Community, and they praised even a novice who had gone forth that very day, treating him as equal to an elder of a hundred rains; Having seen the community of monks entering for almsfood in the earlier period of the day, even those going to the fields having taken seeds, ploughs and so on, even those entering the forest having taken hatchets and so on, having put down those implements, having swept the sitting place of the community of monks - whether the hall with sitting accommodation, or a pavilion, or a tree-root - having prepared seats, having set out dust-free drinking water, having caused the community of monks to sit down, having given rice gruel, sweet-meats and so on, having dismissed the community of monks who had finished their meal duty, then having taken those implements, having gone to the fields or the forest, they do their own work; even at the place of business there was indeed no other talk for them. Four standing on the path and four standing in fruition - these eight persons are called the noble Community; They speak the praise of the community of monks alone, saying "They are endowed with such morality, with such good conduct, with such practice; they have shame, they are well-behaved, they have lofty qualities." Having come from the place of business, having eaten their supper, even while seated at the house-door, even having entered the sleeping-room and seated, they speak the praise of the community of monks alone. The Blessed One, having seen the humbleness of those people, having urged the community of monks to honour the almsfood, said this.

"Those qualities that make one an ascetic and that make one a brahmin" means those qualities which, having been accepted and fulfilled, make one an ascetic who has calmed evil and a brahmin who has warded off evil - this is the meaning. "There are, monks, these three things belonging to an ascetic, duties to be done by an ascetic. What three? The undertaking of the training in higher morality, the undertaking of the training in higher consciousness, the undertaking of the training in higher wisdom" - here, however, qualities to be accomplished by an ascetic are stated. And those too are indeed qualities that make one an ascetic. But here the teaching is expanded by way of shame and moral fear and so on. In "evaṃ no ayaṃ amhākaṃ," here "no" is merely an indeclinable particle. The meaning is "thus this of ours." "Of great fruit and great benefit" - both of these are one in meaning. "Not barren" means not futile. "Fruitful" - this is the meaning of that very same word. For

that which has no fruit is called barren. "Yielding growth" means with increase; this is a synonym for fruitfulness. "Thus indeed, monks, should you train" means monks, thus should you train. Thus the Blessed One spoke the praise of the qualities beginning with shame and moral fear by this much of a passage. Why? For the purpose of cutting off the way of speaking. For if some recently gone forth, foolish monk were to speak thus - "The Blessed One says to undertake and practise the qualities beginning with shame and moral fear; what indeed is the benefit of undertaking and practising them?" For the purpose of cutting off his way of speaking. And this is the benefit: for these qualities, having been accepted and fulfilled, make one an ascetic who has calmed evil, make one a brahmin who has warded off evil, produce the gain of the four requisites, accomplish the great fruitfulness for the donors of requisites, and make the going forth not barren, fruitful, and yielding growth - thus he spoke praise. This is the summary here. But in detail, the discussion of praise should be understood by the method stated in the establishment of mindfulness.

416. "With shame and moral fear" means by shame and moral fear expanded thus: "that by which one is ashamed of what one should be ashamed, one fears what one should fear." Furthermore, here shame is of internal origination, moral fear is of external origination. Shame takes oneself as authority, moral fear takes the world as authority. Shame is established in the intrinsic nature of bashfulness, moral fear is established in the intrinsic nature of fear. But the detailed discussion here has been stated in every way in the Visuddhimagga. Furthermore, these two qualities are called guardians of the world because they protect the world. As he said - "These two bright qualities, monks, protect the world. Which two? Shame and moral fear. These, monks, two bright qualities protect the world. If, monks, these two bright qualities did not protect the world, there would be no recognition here of 'mother' or 'mother's sister' or 'maternal uncle's wife' or 'teacher's wife' or 'wives of elders,' the world would fall into confusion like goats and sheep, chickens and pigs, dogs and jackals." These very same are called "divine qualities" in the Jātaka. As he said -

"Accomplished in shame and moral fear, established in bright qualities;
Peaceful good persons in the world are called 'those with divine qualities'."

But for the Elder Mahācunda, they were shown as the practice of detachment from mental defilements. As he said - "'Others will be shameless, we here will have shame' - thus detachment is to be done. 'Others will have no moral fear, we here will have moral fear' - thus detachment is to be done." These very same were shown as the exhortation-ordination for the Elder Mahākassapa. For this was said: "Therefore, Kassapa, you should train thus: 'Strong shame and moral fear will be established in me towards elders, juniors, and those of middle standing.' Thus indeed, Kassapa, should you train." But here they are shown as called the ascetic qualities.

But since the goal of asceticism is not reached its summit by just this much, therefore, in order to show further qualities that make one an ascetic, he said beginning with "Now, monks, you might think thus." Therein, "the goal of asceticism" - first, in the Saṃyutta: "And what, monks, is asceticism? It is just this noble eightfold path. As follows: right view, etc. right concentration. This is called, monks, asceticism. And what, monks, is the goal of asceticism? That which, monks, is the elimination of

lust, the elimination of hate, the elimination of delusion - this is called, monks, the goal of asceticism." Thus the path is called "asceticism," and fruition and Nibbāna are called "the goal of asceticism." But in this instance, it should be understood that the goal of asceticism is spoken of by combining both the path and the fruition together. "I inform" means I tell. "I announce" means I make known.

417. "Our bodily conduct is pure" - here bodily conduct is twofold: pure and impure. For whatever monk kills a living being, takes what is not given, engages in sexual misconduct, his bodily conduct is called impure; but this is prohibited only by way of the courses of action. But whoever strikes or vexes another with the hand or with a clod or with a stick or with a knife, his bodily conduct is called impure; this too is rejected only by what is bound by the training rules. In this discourse, without speaking of both of these, what is called the supreme detachment has been spoken of. For whatever monk raises a hand or a stick or a clod for the purpose of warding off crows that are drinking water from a water-pot or eating food from a bowl, his bodily conduct is impure. The opposite is called pure. "Manifest" means risen, obvious. "Unveiled" means uncovered, unconcealed. By both, it makes clear the state of purity itself. "Without faults" means always uniform, devoid of gaps in between. "Restrained" means closed by the shutting of the door to mental defilements, not for the purpose of concealing a fault.

418. Regarding verbal conduct too, whatever monk speaks falsely, speaks divisively, speaks harshly, engages in idle chatter, his verbal conduct is called impure. But this is prohibited only by way of the courses of action. But whoever speaks jeering at another with such terms as "householder" or "slave" or "servant" and so on, his verbal conduct is called impure. But this is rejected only by what is bound by the training rules. In this discourse, without speaking of both of these, what is called the supreme detachment has been spoken of. For whatever monk, when a young monk or a novice has said "I hope, venerable sir, do you see our preceptor?" speaks such talk even with the intention of laughter, by the method beginning with "Many monks and nuns, friend, were wandering about in one place; your preceptor must have gone having lifted up a bundle of vegetables for sale" - his verbal conduct is impure. The opposite is called pure.

419. Regarding mental conduct, whatever monk is covetous, has a mind of ill-will, and holds wrong view, his mental conduct is called impure. But this is prohibited only by way of the courses of action. But whoever consents to gold and silver placed in deposit, his mental conduct is called impure. This too is rejected only by what is bound by the training rules. In this discourse, without speaking of both of these, what is called the supreme detachment has been spoken of. But whatever monk thinks a sensual thought or a thought of anger or a thought of violence, his mental conduct is impure. The opposite is called pure.

420. Regarding livelihood, whatever monk, because of livelihood, performs medical treatment, going as a messenger, lancing of boils, gives anointing of sores, cooks oil - thus gets his living by means of the twenty-one wrong ways of earning. Or whoever, having asked for something, consumes it - his livelihood is called impure. But this is rejected only by what is bound by the training rules. In this discourse, without speaking of both of these, what is called the supreme detachment has been spoken of. For whatever monk, having obtained ghee, butter, oil, honey, molasses and so on,

consumes them stored thinking "it will be for tomorrow or the following day," or whoever, having seen neem sprouts and so on, says to the novices - "Eat the sprouts," the novices, thinking "the elder wishes to eat," make them allowable and give them; or he says to young novices "Drink water, friends," they, thinking "the elder wishes to drink water," having washed the drinking water conch, give it - for one who consumes even that, his livelihood is called impure. The opposite is called pure.

422. "Knowing moderation" means knowing moderation, knowing what is proper, knowing the measure in seeking, receiving, and consuming.

423. "Devoted to wakefulness" means having divided the night and day into six portions, having given opportunity for sleep in one portion, engaged and devoted to wakefulness in five portions. "Lion's posture" - here there are four sleeping places: the sleeping place of one who enjoys sensual pleasures, the sleeping place of ghosts, the lion's sleeping place, and the Truth-finder's sleeping place. Therein, "Mostly, monks, beings who enjoy sensual pleasures sleep on their left side" - this is the sleeping place of one who enjoys sensual pleasures; for among them, mostly there are none who sleep on their right side.

"Mostly, monks, ghosts sleep lying on their backs" - this is the sleeping place of ghosts; for because of having little flesh and blood, ghosts, entangled with a mass of bones, are unable to sleep on one side; they sleep only on their backs.

"Mostly, monks, the lion, the king of beasts, having inserted the tail between the thighs, sleeps on his right side" - this is the lion's sleeping place. For because of the abundance of energy, the lion, the king of beasts, having placed the two front paws in one place and the hind paws in one place, having inserted the tail between the thighs, having observed the position of the front paws, hind paws, and tail, having placed the head on top of the two front paws, sleeps. Even having slept during the day, when awakening he awakens without being startled. But having raised his head, he observes the position of the front paws. If anything has shifted from its position, "This is not suitable for your birth and valour," becoming displeased, he sleeps right there and does not depart for his food resort. But when they have remained without shifting, "This is suitable for your birth and valour," full of mirth, having risen, having stretched with a lion's stretch, having shaken off the mass of his mane, having roared the lion's roar three times, he departs for his food resort. The sleeping place of the fourth meditative absorption is called the Truth-finder's sleeping place. Among those, here the lion's sleeping place has come. For this is called the highest sleeping place because it is a posture abundant in energy. "Foot upon foot" means the left foot upon the right foot. "Overlapping" means placing over, having placed slightly beyond; for when ankle rubs against ankle, or knee against knee, feeling arises repeatedly, the mind does not become fully focused, and the sleeping place is uncomfortable. But when placed beyond so that they do not rub together, feeling does not arise, the mind becomes fully focused, and the sleeping place is comfortable; therefore he said thus.

425. "Covetousness in the world" and so on has been expanded upon in the Cūḷahatthipadopama.

426. Now, the simile stated as "just as, monks" - Therein, "having taken a loan" means having taken wealth on interest. "Would put an end to" means would make

them gone to their end. He would do so that not even a farthing's worth of remainder would be left over of them; the meaning is he would repay altogether. "On that account" means on account of freedom from debt. For he, reflecting "I am free from debt," obtains powerful gladness, attains powerful pleasure. Therefore it was said - "He would obtain gladness, he would attain pleasure."

Through the arising of disagreeable feeling, cutting through the four postures as if with a saw, it afflicts, thus it is "illness" (ābādha); that is present in him, thus he is "sick" (ābādhika). Afflicted by the suffering originating from that. "Severely ill" (adhimattagilāno) means gravely ill. "Would not be agreeable" (nacchādeyya) means it would not be pleasing due to being overcome by excessive illness. "A little strength" (balamattā) means just strength; the meaning is that there would be no strength in his body. "On that account" means on account of health; for when he reflects "I am healthy," both of those arise. Therefore it was said - "He would obtain gladness, he would attain pleasure." "And there would be no loss of his wealth" means there would be no loss of wealth even to the extent of a farthing. "On that account" means on account of release from bondage; the remainder should be construed by the method already stated in all terms. "Not self-dependent" means not dependent on oneself; one does not obtain the ability to do anything according to one's own preference. "Dependent on others" means dependent on others; one conducts oneself only according to another's preference. "Not able to go where he wishes" means in whichever direction he has the desire. The wish arises for going; he does not obtain the ability to go there. "From slavery" means from the state of being a slave. "A freeman" means one's own master. "On that account" means on account of being a freeman. "A wilderness highway" means a wilderness highway; the meaning is a waterless long road. "On that account" means on account of the secure ground.

"These five mental hindrances not abandoned": here the Blessed One shows the mental hindrance of sensual desire not abandoned as similar to a debt, and the remaining ones as similar to illness and so on. Herein this is the similarity - For whoever, having taken a debt from others, squanders it. He, even when told by them "give back the debt," even when spoken to harshly, even when being bound, even when being struck, is not able to ward off anything; he endures everything. For the cause of his endurance is that debt. Just so, whoever is attached by sensual desire to whatever, takes hold of that object by the grip of craving, he, even when spoken to harshly by that person, even when being bound, even when being struck, endures everything. For the cause of his endurance is that sensual desire, just as for women being beaten by their husbands. Thus sensual desire should be seen as like a debt.

But just as a person afflicted with a bile disease, even when given honey, sugar, and so on, due to being afflicted with a bile disease, does not experience their flavour, and merely belches "bitter, bitter." Just so one with a mind of ill-will, even when being exhorted even a little by teachers and preceptors who desire his welfare, does not accept the exhortation, and having said "You trouble me too much" and so on, leaves the monastic community. Just as that man, due to being afflicted with a bile disease, does not experience the flavour of honey, sugar, and so on, so due to being afflicted

with wrath, he does not experience the flavour of the Dispensation consisting of the happiness of meditative absorption and so on. Thus anger should be seen as like an illness.

But just as a man bound in a prison on a festival day sees neither the beginning nor the middle nor the end of the festival. He, released on the second day, even having heard such things as "Oh, yesterday's festival was agreeable, oh the dancing, oh the singing" and so on, does not give a reply. Why? Because of not having experienced the festival. Just so a monk overcome by sloth and torpor, even when a hearing of the Teaching is proceeding in a variegated manner, knows neither its beginning nor its middle nor its end. He, when the hearing of the Teaching has concluded, even having heard those speaking praise of the hearing of the Teaching - "Oh, the hearing of the Teaching, oh the reasoning, oh the simile" - does not give a reply. Why? Because of not having experienced the talk on the Teaching due to sloth and torpor. Thus sloth and torpor should be seen as like a prison.

But just as a slave, even while enjoying a festival - "There is such and such an urgent task to be done; go there quickly. If you do not go, I shall cut off your hands and feet or your ears and nose" - thus told, he goes quickly indeed; he does not get to experience the beginning, middle, and end of the festival. Why? Because of being dependent on others. Just so, even for one who, being unskilled in the monastic discipline, has entered the forest for the purpose of seclusion, when the perception of not allowable meat has arisen regarding even allowable meat in any matter whatsoever, even the least, having abandoned seclusion, he must go to the presence of an expert in monastic discipline for the purpose of purifying his morality. He does not get to experience the happiness of seclusion. Why? Because of being overcome by restlessness and remorse. Thus restlessness and remorse should be seen as like slavery.

But just as a man who has set out on a highway through a wilderness, having seen places where people have been plundered and places where people have been struck by thieves, even at the sound of a stick or the sound of a bird, becomes suspicious and apprehensive, thinking "thieves have come"; he goes and stands still and turns back, and the distance not covered is greater than the distance covered. He reaches the place of security with difficulty and hardship, or does not reach it. Just so, one in whom sceptical doubt has arisen regarding the eight grounds. He, doubting sceptically by the method "Is he a Buddha indeed, or is he not indeed a Buddha" and so on, is not able to resolve and accept with faith. Being unable, he does not attain either the path or the fruit. Just as on a highway through a wilderness, producing again and again trembling, crawling about, non-penetration, and trepidation of consciousness by thinking "Are there thieves or are there not," one creates an obstacle to reaching the place of security; thus sceptical doubt too, producing again and again trembling, crawling about, non-penetration, and trepidation of consciousness by the method "Is he a Buddha indeed, or not a Buddha" and so on, creates an obstacle to the attainment of the noble plane - thus it should be seen as like a highway through a wilderness.

Now, in "Just as, monks, freedom from debt," here the Blessed One shows the mental hindrance of sensual desire as abandoned as similar to freedom from debt, and the remaining ones as similar to health and so on. Herein this is the similarity - Just as a

man, having taken a loan, having engaged in business activities, having become successful in his business activities, having thought "This debt is the root of impediment," having paid back the debt with interest, might have the bond torn up. Then from that time onwards no one sends him a messenger, nor a bond. He, even having seen the creditors, if he wishes, rises from his seat; if not, he does not rise. Why? Because of non-attachment and non-clinging towards them. Just so a monk, having thought "This sensual desire is the root of impediment," having developed six qualities by the method stated in the establishment of mindfulness, abandons the mental hindrance of sensual desire. For one who has thus abandoned sensual desire, just as for a man freed from debt, having seen the creditors, there is indeed not fear nor trepidation. Just so there is indeed not attachment nor bondage regarding another's object. Even for one seeing divine forms, mental defilement does not occur. Therefore the Blessed One spoke of the abandoning of sensual desire as like freedom from debt.

But just as that man afflicted with a bile disease, having appeased that disease by medical treatment, from that time onwards experiences the flavour of honey, sugar, and so on. Just so a monk, having thought "This anger is a producer of harm," having developed six qualities, abandons the mental hindrance of anger. He, having thus abandoned anger, just as a man freed from a bile disease partakes of sweet things such as honey, sugar, and so on with delight. Just so, being trained in the regulations of good conduct and so on, having accepted them with bowed head, he trains with delight. Therefore the Blessed One spoke of the abandoning of anger as like health.

Just as that man who was put into a prison on a festival day, on another festival day, thinking "Previously too I was bound through the fault of negligence and did not experience that festival; now I shall be heedful" - so that his enemies do not get an opportunity. Having been thus heedful, having experienced the festival -he uttered the inspired utterance "Oh, the festival! Oh, the festival!" Just so a monk, having thought "This sloth and torpor is a great producer of harm," having developed six qualities, abandons the mental hindrance of sloth and torpor. He, having thus abandoned sloth and torpor, just as a man freed from bondage experiences the beginning, middle, and end of the festival even for seven days. Just so a monk, experiencing the beginning, middle, and end of the festival of the Dhamma, attains arahantship together with the analytical knowledges. Therefore the Blessed One spoke of the abandoning of sloth and torpor as like release from bondage.

But just as a slave, in dependence on some friend, having given wealth to the owners, having made himself a freeman, from that time onwards would do whatever he wishes. Just so a monk, having thought "This restlessness and remorse is a great producer of harm," having developed six qualities, abandons restlessness and remorse. He, having thus abandoned restlessness and remorse, just as a free man does whatever he wishes. No one turns him back from that by force. Just so a monk proceeds upon the practice of renunciation as he pleases, and restlessness and remorse does not turn him back from that by force. Therefore the Blessed One spoke of the abandoning of restlessness and remorse as like a freeman.

Just as a powerful man, having taken his most valuable possession, armed and ready, with his retinue, would set out through a wilderness. Thieves, having seen him from afar, would flee. He, having safely crossed over that wilderness, having reached a

place of security, would be full of mirth. Just so a monk, having thought "This sceptical doubt is a causer of harm," having developed six qualities, abandons sceptical doubt. He, having thus abandoned sceptical doubt, just as a powerful man, armed and ready, with his retinue, fearless, not counting the thieves as even grass, having departed safely, reaches a place of security. Just so, having crossed over the wilderness of misconduct, he reaches the supreme place of security, the Deathless, Nibbāna. Therefore the Blessed One spoke of the abandoning of sceptical doubt as like a place of security.

427. "This very body" means this body born of impurity. "Drenches" means moistens, steepens, makes rapture and happiness occur everywhere. "Steeps" means flows all around. "Fills" means fills as if filling a bellows with air. "Pervades" means touches all around. "Of his entire body" means of this monk's body with all its parts. There is no place whatsoever, even a spot as tiny as an atom, pervaded by skin, flesh, and blood at the place where the continuity of what is clung to occurs, that is not touched by the happiness of the first meditative absorption. "Skilled" means clever, competent to make, prepare, and knead bath powder. "In a bronze dish" means in a vessel made of whatever metal. But an earthenware vessel is not firm; it breaks when one kneads in it; therefore he does not show that. "Sprinkling again and again" means having sprinkled again and again. "Might knead" means having taken the bronze dish with the left hand, sprinkling again and again a proper measure of water with the right hand, while rubbing, he would make a ball. "Permeated with moisture" means permeated by the moisture of water. "Pervaded by moisture" means encompassed by the moisture of water. "Within and without" means together with the inner part and the outer part, pervaded by the moisture of water everywhere in every place - this is the meaning. "Does not drip" means water does not drip drop by drop; it is possible to take it up with the hand or with two or three fingers, and even to make it into a waist-pouch - this is the meaning.

428. In the simile of the happiness of the second meditative absorption, "a spring" means one whose water has sprung up, not water that has burst up from below and rises. But the meaning is water that springs up from within itself. "Inflow" means a channel of arrival. "Rain god" means a cloud. "From time to time" means at each time, the meaning is either fortnightly or every ten days. "Showers" means rain. "Were not to send down" means were not to let in, the meaning is were not to rain. "Cool streams of water having sprung up" means cool water, having sprung up while filling that lake. For water rising up from below, having risen up again and again, agitates the water as it breaks. Water entering from the four directions agitates the water with old leaves, grass, sticks, twigs, and so on. Rain water agitates the water with the falling of streams and water bubbles. But having become settled, the water arising as if created by supernormal power pervades this area - there is no such thing as "it does not pervade this area." Therefore there is no place called unpervaded. Therein, the lake is like the material body, the water is like the happiness of the second meditative absorption. The remainder should be understood by the former method.

429. In the simile of the happiness of the third meditative absorption, "a pond of water lilies" means water lilies are present here. In the remaining two terms also, the same method applies. And here, among white, red, and blue, whatever waterlily is

simply a waterlily. A white lotus has fewer than a hundred petals; a lotus has a hundred petals. Or, without the restriction on petals, a white one is a lotus, a red one is a white lotus - this is the judgment here. "Not risen above the water" means not risen from the water. "Nourished while submerged within" means having been submerged within the surface of the water, they are nourished; the meaning is they grow. The remainder should be understood by the former method.

430. In the simile of the happiness of the fourth meditative absorption, regarding "with a pure and bright mind" - here "pure" is in the sense of being free from impurities. "Bright" should be understood as in the sense of being luminous. "With a white cloth" - this is stated for the purpose of showing the pervading of temperature. For with a soiled cloth there is no pervading of temperature, but with one washed and purified at that very moment the pervading of temperature is powerful. For in this simile, the material body is like the cloth. The happiness of the fourth meditative absorption is like the pervading of temperature. Therefore, just as for a well-bathed man who has wrapped himself in a pure cloth up to the head and is seated, the temperature from the body pervades the entire cloth, and there is no part of the cloth unpervaded. So too, by the happiness of the fourth meditative absorption, there is no part of the monk's material body unpervaded - thus the meaning here should be understood. Or alternatively, the consciousness of the fourth meditative absorption itself is like the cloth, and the matter originating from it is like the pervading of temperature. For just as even when the white cloth does not touch the body at some place, the body is touched everywhere by the temperature originating from it. So too, by the subtle matter originated from the fourth meditative absorption, the monk's material body is pervaded everywhere - thus the meaning here should be understood.

431. In the simile for the knowledge of recollecting past lives, the statement "the activities done on that day are obvious" refers to just the three villages visited on that day. Therein, the man who has gone to the three villages should be regarded as like one who has obtained the knowledge of recollecting past lives. The three villages should be regarded as like the three existences. Just as the becoming manifest of the activities done by that man on that day in the three villages, so the becoming manifest of the activities done in the three existences should be regarded for a monk who, having directed the mind towards past lives, is seated.

432. In the simile of the divine eye, "two houses" means two dwellings. "With doors facing each other" means with doors opposite each other. "Walking back and forth" means moving about from one place to another. "Wandering about" means going about here and there; but it should also be seen in terms of leaving from this house and entering that house, or leaving from that one and entering this house. Therein, the two houses with doors facing each other are like death and conception; the man with eyes is like one who has obtained the knowledge of the divine eye; just as the time when people entering and leaving the two houses become obvious to the man with eyes standing between the two houses and looking, so is the time when beings passing away and arising become obvious to one who has obtained the divine eye, having increased the light and looking. But are they obvious to the knowledge or to the person? To the knowledge. But because they are obvious to that knowledge, they are indeed obvious to the person as well.

433. In the simile for the knowledge of the elimination of mental corruptions, "mountain top" means on the summit of the mountain. "Undisturbed" means free from mud. Oysters and shells are "oysters-and-shells." Gravel and potsherds are "gravel-and-potsherds." Clusters and crowds of fish are "shoals of fish." In "remaining still or moving about," here gravel-and-potsherds only remain still, while the others both move about and remain still. But just as when among cows that are standing here and there, sitting, and present, one says "these cows are moving about," with reference to those that are moving about, the others too are said to be "moving about." Thus, with reference to gravel-and-potsherds which only remain still, the other two also are said to be "remaining still." And with reference to the other two which are moving about, gravel-and-potsherds also are said to be "moving about." Therein, just as for a man with eyes standing on the bank and looking, there is the time of clear discernment of oysters, shells, and so on, so should be seen the time of clear discernment of the four truths for a monk who has directed the mind towards the elimination of mental corruptions and is seated.

434. Now, taking the name of one who has eliminated the mental corruptions by seven aspects, by his own characteristics and by his own qualities, he said beginning with "This is called, monks, a monk who is an 'ascetic' and also." Therein, in "Thus, monks, a monk is an ascetic" and so on, monks, thus a monk is an ascetic because of having calmed evil. He is a brahmin because of having warded off evil. He is one who has bathed because of having bathed away the mental defilements; the meaning is because of having washed away the mental defilements. He is one who has attained the highest knowledge because of having gone through the unwholesome mental states by means of the knowledges reckoned as the knowledge of the four paths; the meaning is because of having known them. For that very reason he said beginning with "for him they are known." He is a learned one because of the mental defilements having flowed out; the meaning is because of having flowed away, because of having been removed. He is a noble one because of being far from the mental defilements; the meaning is because of having destroyed them. He is a Worthy One because of being far from them; the meaning is because of having become distant. The remainder is obvious everywhere.

In the Papañcasūdanī, the commentary on the Majjhima Nikāya,

the Commentary on the Mahāassapura Sutta is finished.

10. Commentary on the Cūḷaassapura Sutta

435. "Thus have I heard" - this is the Shorter Discourse at Assapura. The reason for its teaching is just as in the former. "The practice proper for ascetics" means the practice befitting for ascetics, the practice conforming to ascetics.

436. In "stains of an ascetic" and so on, these mental states, when arising, make ascetics stained, seized by stain; therefore they are called "stains of an ascetic." By these, ascetics become corrupted, become defiled; therefore they are called "faults of an ascetic." These, having arisen, make ascetics worthless, sapless, and cause them to wither; therefore they are called "dregs of an ascetic." "States bound for the realm of misery" means of causes that bring about rebirth in the realms of misery. "To be experienced in an unfortunate destination" means of conditions for resultant feeling

in an unfortunate destination. "Called mataja" means people, having well rubbed sharp iron with iron, having kneaded that iron powder together with meat, cause heron birds to eat it. They, being unable to defecate, die. If they do not die, having struck them, they kill them. Then, having split open their bellies, having washed it with water, having taken the powder, having kneaded it together with meat, they cause them to eat it again - thus, having caused them to eat it seven times, they make a weapon with the iron powder obtained. And well-trained ironsmiths, having received a large fee for manual labour, make it. That, because of being produced from a dead bird, is called "mataja"; it is extremely sharp. "Tempered and sharpened" means both tempered in water and well rubbed on a stone. "In a double robe" means in a sheath. "Wrapped" means covered over. "Enveloped" means wrapped all around.

437. "Of one covered with dust and dirt" means of one who bears dust and dirt. "Of one who immerses in water" means of one who goes down into water three times a day. "Of a tree-root dweller" means of one who dwells at the root of a tree. "Of one who lives in the open air" means of one who dwells in the open air. "Of one who stands upright" means of one who stands upward. "Of one who eats periodically" means of one who eats at intervals of a month or a fortnight. All this is spoken of only with reference to external teachings. For in this Dispensation, a monk who wears robes is not called a double-robe wearer. Ascetic practices such as bearing dust and dirt and so on do not exist at all in this Dispensation. The Buddha's teaching is called just the Buddha's teaching, not incantations. However, only this much is found: "a tree-root dweller" and "one who lives in the open air." That too is spoken of only with reference to external teachings. "As soon as he was born" means him just newly born on that very day. "Would make him a double-robe wearer" means having dressed in and having put on the double-robe cloth, they would make him a double-robe wearer. This same method applies everywhere.

438. "He sees himself purified" means he sees himself becoming pure. But he should not yet be called "pure." "Gladness arises" means a state of satisfaction arises. "In one who is gladdened, rapture" means for one who is satisfied, rapture arises, agitating the entire body. "When the mind is filled with rapture, the body" means the mental body of the person whose consciousness is associated with rapture. "Becomes calm" means disturbance is gone. "Feels happiness" means one feels both bodily and mental happiness. "The mind becomes concentrated" means the mind of one who is happy with this happiness of renunciation becomes concentrated; it is as if it has reached absorption. "With a mind accompanied by friendliness" - the teaching begun above by way of mental defilements has descended into the meditation on the divine abidings according to the natural connection, like rain fallen on a mountain descending into a river. Therein, whatever should be said regarding this, all that has been stated in the Visuddhimagga itself. "Just as, monks, a pond" - it should be understood that in the Mahāsīhanāda Sutta the path is compared to the pond, while here the Dispensation is compared. "With the elimination of the mental corruptions, he is an ascetic" means through the calming of all mental defilements, he is an ascetic in the ultimate sense. The remainder is clear everywhere.

In the Papañcasūdanī, the commentary on the Majjhima Nikāya,

the Commentary on the Cūḷaassapura Sutta is finished.

The Commentary on the Fourth Chapter is finished.



ABOUT THIS TRANSLATION

This translation is part of the PaliVerse Project - the first complete, unified English translation of the Pāli Canon together with its Commentaries (Aṭṭhakathā) and Subcommentaries (Tīkā), accompanied by interactive study tools. PaliVerse is an ongoing project. The AI translations are continuously improved through experts' revisions and feedback. This text is the latest translation as of the date of download.

PDF Creation Date: 14 September 2026

HOW TO CITE

PaliVerse (2026). Commentaries. The Canon of Discourses - Commentaries. 2. The Collection of the Middle Length Discourses - Commentaries. 1. Commentary on the First Fifty Discourses. 4. The Greater Chapter on Pairs Retrieved from paliverse.org

© 2026 The PaliVerse Project · All Rights Reserved
Centre for Study and Practice of Theravāda Buddhism
Civic Non-Profit Company registered in Greece
This PDF may be freely distributed for study and practice.

PaliVerse.org