

THE PALIVERSE PROJECT

The Universe of Buddha's Wisdom

The Triple Canon (Tipiṭaka)

The Canon of Discourses (Sutta Piṭaka)

5. The Collection of Minor Texts (5. Khuddaka Nikāya)

20. The Questions of Milinda (20. Milindapañhapāḷi)

4. The Dilemmas (4. Meṇḍakapañho)

[Mil 5.1.1-5.1.11, PTS 96-236]



PaliVerse

5. The Collection of Minor Texts

20. The Questions of Milinda

4. The Dilemmas

1. The Chapter on the Supernormal Power

1. The Question on the Fruitfulness of Aspiration Made

1. Then King Milinda, having been granted an opportunity, having bowed down and placed his joined palms on his head at the feet of the venerable one, said this: "Venerable Nāgasena, these sectarians speak thus: 'If the Buddha consents to veneration, the Buddha has not attained final Nibbāna, is connected with the world, is within existence in the world, is common to the world; therefore the aspiration made towards him is not barren but fruitful. If he has attained final Nibbāna, is unbound from the world, has escaped from all existences, veneration towards him does not arise, one who has attained final Nibbāna does not consent to anything, the aspiration made towards one who does not consent is barren and fruitless' - this is a question with two points, this is not the domain of those whose minds have not attained, this is only the domain of the great; break this net of wrong views, establish it on one side, this question has come to you, give vision to the future sons of the Conqueror for the refutation of the doctrines of others."

The elder said: "The Blessed One, great king, has attained final Nibbāna, and the Blessed One does not consent to veneration; at the very foot of the Bodhi tree the Truth-finder's consenting was abandoned, how much more so for one who has attained final Nibbāna through the Nibbāna element without residue of clinging. This too was spoken, great king, by the elder Sāriputta, the General of the Teaching -

"Being venerated, they who are equal to the matchless, by gods and humans; They do not consent to honour - this is the nature of the Buddhas."

The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, either a son praises his father, or a father praises his son; this is not a reason for the refutation of the doctrines of others, this is merely a declaration of confidence. Come, explain to me the reason there properly for the establishment of one's own doctrine and for the unravelling of the net of wrong views."

The elder said: "The Blessed One, great king, has attained final Nibbāna, and the Blessed One does not consent to veneration; yet even though the Truth-finder does not consent, gods and humans, having made the relic-jewel a basis, practising right practice with the knowledge-jewel of the Truth-finder as object, obtain the three successes.

"Just as, great king, a great, large mass of fire, having blazed up, might be quenched - does, great king, that great mass of fire consent to grass and wood as fuel?" "Even while burning, venerable sir, that great mass of fire does not consent to grass and

wood as fuel; how then would one quenched, at peace, without consciousness consent?" "But when, great king, that mass of fire has ceased and is at peace, is the world empty of fire?" "No indeed, venerable sir, wood is the basis and fuel for fire; whatever people desire fire, they, by their own strength, power and energy, by their own personal effort, having churned wood, having produced fire, with that fire perform tasks requiring fire." "Well then, great king, the word of the sectarians is wrong: 'The aspiration made towards one who does not consent is barren and fruitless.'

"Just as, great king, a great, large mass of fire blazed, just so the Blessed One blazed with the Buddha's glory in the ten-thousand-fold world system. Just as, great king, a great, large mass of fire, having blazed, was quenched, just so the Blessed One, having blazed with the Buddha's glory in the ten-thousand-fold world system, attained final Nibbāna through the Nibbāna element without residue of clinging. Just as, great king, a quenched mass of fire does not consent to grass and wood as fuel, just so indeed the consenting of the Benefactor of the World has been abandoned, is at peace. Just as, great king, people, when the mass of fire is quenched, without fuel, by their own strength, power and energy, by their own personal effort, having churned wood, having produced fire, with that fire perform tasks requiring fire, just so indeed gods and humans, having made the relic-jewel of the Truth-finder who has attained final Nibbāna, who does not consent, a basis, practising right practice with the knowledge-jewel of the Truth-finder as object, obtain the three successes. By this reason too, great king, the aspiration made towards the Truth-finder who has attained final Nibbāna, who does not consent, is not barren but fruitful.

"Furthermore, great king, listen to a reason by which reason the aspiration made towards the Truth-finder who has attained final Nibbāna, who does not consent, is not barren but fruitful. Just as, great king, a great, large wind, having blown, might cease - does, great king, that ceased wind consent to being reproduced?" "No indeed, venerable sir, for the ceased wind there is no reflective attention or attention for reproduction." "What is the reason?" "That air element is without consciousness." "Does, great king, the designation 'wind' depart from that ceased wind?" "No indeed, venerable sir, palm-leaf fans and fans are conditions for the arising of wind; whatever people are scorched by heat, oppressed by fever, they, with a palm-leaf fan or with a fan, by their own strength, power and energy, by their own personal effort, having produced that, with that wind extinguish the heat and appease the fever." "Well then, great king, the word of the sectarians is wrong: 'The aspiration made towards one who does not consent is barren and fruitless.'

"Just as, great king, a great mighty wind blew, just so the Blessed One blew towards the ten-thousand-fold world system with the cool, sweet, peaceful, subtle wind of friendliness. Just as, great king, a great mighty wind, having blown, ceased, just so the Blessed One, having blown towards with the cool, sweet, peaceful, subtle wind of friendliness, attained final Nibbāna through the Nibbāna element without residue of clinging. Just as, great king, the ceased wind does not consent to being reproduced, just so the consenting to the welfare of the world has been abandoned, is at peace. Just as, great king, those people are scorched by heat, oppressed by fever, just so gods and humans are oppressed by the fever of the heat of the threefold fire. Just as palm-leaf fans are conditions for the production of wind, just so the relic and the

knowledge-jewel of the Truth-finder are conditions for the attainment of the three successes. Just as people scorched by heat, oppressed by fever, having produced wind with a palm-leaf or a fan, extinguish the heat and appease the fever, just so gods and humans, having venerated the relic and the knowledge-jewel of the Truth-finder who has attained final Nibbāna, who does not consent, having produced wholesome, by that wholesome extinguish and appease the fever of the heat of the threefold fire. By this reason too, great king, the aspiration made towards the Truth-finder who has attained final Nibbāna, who does not consent, is not barren but fruitful.

"Furthermore, great king, listen to a reason for the refutation of the doctrines of others. Just as, great king, a man, having beaten a drum, might produce a sound, and that drum sound produced by the man, that sound might disappear, does that sound, great king, consent to being reproduced?" "No indeed, venerable sir, that sound has disappeared, there is no reflective attention or attention for its arising again; once the drum sound has arisen and disappeared, that drum sound is cut off. But the drum, venerable sir, is a condition for the production of sound; then a man, when the condition exists, having beaten the drum with self-produced effort, produces a sound." "Just so indeed, great king, the Blessed One, having established the relic-jewel and the Teaching and the discipline and the instruction, the Teacher developed in morality, concentration, wisdom, liberation, and knowledge and vision of liberation, himself attained final Nibbāna through the Nibbāna element without residue of clinging; and when the Blessed One has attained final Nibbāna, the attainment of success is not cut off; beings oppressed by the suffering of existence, having made the relic-jewel and the Teaching and the discipline and the instruction a condition, desiring success, obtain successes. By this reason too, great king, the aspiration made towards the Truth-finder who has attained final Nibbāna, who does not consent, is not barren but fruitful.

"And this was seen, great king, by the Blessed One regarding the future time. And it was spoken and said and declared: 'Now, Ānanda, you might think thus: "The Scriptures belong to a Teacher who has passed away, we have no Teacher." But this, Ānanda, should not be seen thus. The Teaching and the discipline that have been taught and laid down by me for you, Ānanda, they will be your Teacher after my passing.' That the aspiration made towards the Truth-finder who has attained final Nibbāna, who does not consent, is barren and fruitless - that word of those sectarians is wrong, not become, false, untrue, opposed, perverted, giving suffering, with painful results, leading to realms of misery.

"Furthermore, great king, listen to a reason by which reason the aspiration made towards the Truth-finder who has attained final Nibbāna, who does not consent, is not barren but fruitful. Does this great earth, great king, consent: 'Let all seeds grow in me'?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "But why then, great king, do those seeds, having grown in the great earth that does not consent, become established with firm roots and matted roots, spread out with trunk, substance, and branches, bearing flowers and fruit?" "Even though not consenting, venerable sir, the great earth is a site for those seeds, gives a condition for their growth; those seeds, in dependence on that site, by that condition, having grown, become established with firm roots and matted roots, spread out with trunk, substance, and branches, bearing flowers and fruit."

"Well then, great king, the sectarians are lost in their own doctrine, destroyed, opposed, if they say: 'The aspiration made towards one who does not consent is barren and fruitless.'

"Just as, great king, the great earth, so is the Truth-finder, the Worthy One, the Perfectly Enlightened One. Just as, great king, the great earth does not consent to anything, so the Truth-finder does not consent to anything. Just as, great king, those seeds, in dependence on the earth, having grown, become established with firm roots and matted roots, spread out with trunk, substance, and branches, bearing flowers and fruit, so gods and humans, in dependence on the relic and the knowledge-jewel of the Truth-finder who has attained final Nibbāna, who does not consent, become established with firm wholesome roots, spread out with the aggregate of concentration, the substance of the Teaching, and the branches of morality, bearing the flowers of liberation and the fruit of asceticism. By this reason too, great king, the aspiration made towards the Truth-finder who has attained final Nibbāna, who does not consent, is not barren but fruitful.

"Furthermore, great king, listen to a reason by which reason the aspiration made towards the Truth-finder who has attained final Nibbāna, who does not consent, is not barren but fruitful. Do these camels, cattle, donkeys, goats, livestock, and humans, great king, consent to the origination of families of worms in their bellies?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "But why then, great king, do those worms, having originated in the bellies of those who do not consent, reach full expansion through having many offspring?" "Because of the power of evil action, venerable sir, worms, having originated in the bellies of those beings who do not consent, reach full expansion through having many offspring." "Just so indeed, great king, because of the power of the relic and the knowledge-object of the Truth-finder who has attained final Nibbāna, who does not consent, the aspiration made towards the Truth-finder is not barren but fruitful.

"Furthermore, great king, listen to a reason by which reason the aspiration made towards the Truth-finder who has attained final Nibbāna, who does not consent, is not barren but fruitful. Do these humans, great king, consent: 'Let these ninety-eight diseases arise in the body'?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "But why then, great king, do those diseases fall upon the bodies of those who do not consent?" "Because of misconduct done before, venerable sir." "If, great king, unwholesome action done before is to be experienced here, then indeed, great king, whether done before or done here, wholesome-unwholesome action is not barren but fruitful. By this reason too, great king, the aspiration made towards the Truth-finder who has attained final Nibbāna, who does not consent, is not barren but fruitful.

"But have you heard before, great king, that the demon named Nandaka, having assailed the Elder Sāriputta, entered the earth?" "Yes, venerable sir, it is heard, this is well-known in the world." "Did the Elder Sāriputta, great king, consent to the demon Nandaka's swallowing by the great earth?" "Even if the world with its gods were overturned, venerable sir, even if the moon and sun were falling to the ground, even if Mount Sineru, the king of mountains, were scattered, the Elder Sāriputta would not consent to another's suffering. What is the reason for this? That cause by which the Elder Sāriputta might be angry or hostile, that cause has been removed and cut off for the Elder Sāriputta; because the cause has been uprooted, venerable sir, the Elder

Sāriputta would not become irritated even towards one who takes his life." "If, great king, the Elder Sāriputta did not consent to the demon Nandaka's swallowing by the earth, then why did the demon Nandaka enter the earth?" "Because of the power of unwholesome action, venerable sir." "If, great king, the demon Nandaka entered the earth because of the power of unwholesome action, then even for one not consenting, the offence committed is not barren but fruitful. Well then, great king, even because of the power of unwholesome action, the service done for one not consenting is not barren but fruitful. By this reason too, great king, the aspiration made towards the Truth-finder who has attained final Nibbāna, who does not consent, is not barren but fruitful.

"How many people, great king, are there who have entered the great earth at present? Have you heard about them?" "Yes, venerable sir, it is heard." "Come now, great king, tell me." "Ciñcamāṇavikā, venerable sir, and Suppabuddha the Sakyan, and the Elder Devadatta, and the demon Nandaka, and the young man Nanda. This has been heard, venerable sir, these five people entered the great earth." "Against whom, great king, did they offend?" "Against the Blessed One, venerable sir, and against the disciples." "Did the Blessed One or the disciples, great king, consent to their entering the great earth?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Well then, great king, the service done for the Truth-finder who has attained final Nibbāna, even though he does not consent, is not barren but fruitful." "Well explained, Venerable Nāgasena, the deep question has been made clear, the secret has been revealed, the knot has been cut, the thicket has been made not a thicket, the opposing doctrines are destroyed, the wrong views are broken, the heretics have become without lustre; you have approached the most excellent of the excellent leaders of groups."

The question on the fruitfulness of aspiration made is the first.

2. The Question on Omniscience

2. "Venerable Nāgasena, is the Buddha omniscient?" "Yes, great king, the Blessed One is omniscient, but knowledge and vision is not constantly and continuously present for the Blessed One; the Blessed One's omniscient knowledge is dependent on advertizing; having adverted, he knows whatever he wishes." "Well then, Venerable Nāgasena, the Buddha is not omniscient. If his omniscient knowledge requires searching." "A hundred cartloads of paddy, great king, and half a cartload more, seven measures of paddy and two tumbas - in a single finger-snap moment, for one whose mind is occurring, would so many grains of paddy, being placed as a mark, come to utter elimination and exhaustion?"

"Here these seven kinds of minds occur. Those, great king, who are with lust, with hate, with delusion, with mental defilements, with undeveloped body, with undeveloped morality, with undeveloped mind, with undeveloped wisdom - for them that mind arises heavily and proceeds slowly. Why? Because of the undeveloped mind. Just as, great king, when a bamboo stalk that is extended, large, spread out, entwined and intertwined, tangled with branches and matted hair, is being dragged, its coming is heavy and slow. Why? Because of the entwined and intertwined branches. Just so, great king, those who are with lust, with hate, with delusion, with mental defilements, with undeveloped body, with undeveloped morality, with

undeveloped mind, with undeveloped wisdom - for them that mind arises heavily and proceeds slowly. Why? Because of being entwined and intertwined by mental defilements. This is the first mind.

"Herein this second mind is to be distinguished - Those, great king, who are stream-enterers, with the realms of misery closed, ones attained to right view, who have cognised the Teacher's instruction - for them that mind arises lightly and proceeds lightly in three states. In the higher planes it arises heavily and proceeds slowly. Why? Because of the purity of mind in three states, and because of the mental defilements above not being eliminated. Just as, great king, when a bamboo stalk that is pure at three joints and knots, with branches and matted hair tangled above, is being dragged, as far as the three joints it goes lightly, above that it is stiff. Why? Because of purity below and because of being tangled with branches and matted hair above. Just so, great king, those who are stream-enterers, with the realms of misery closed, ones attained to right view, who have cognised the Teacher's instruction - for them that mind arises lightly and proceeds lightly in three states, in the higher planes it arises heavily and proceeds slowly. Why? Because of the purity of mind in three states, and because of the mental defilements above not being eliminated. This is the second mind.

"Herein this third mind is to be distinguished - Those, great king, who are once-returners, for whom lust, hate, and delusion have become reduced - for them that mind arises lightly and proceeds lightly in five states, in the higher planes it arises heavily and proceeds slowly. Why? Because of the purity of mind in five states, and because of the mental defilements above not being eliminated. Just as, great king, when a bamboo stalk that is pure at five joints and knots, with branches and matted hair tangled above, is being dragged, as far as the five joints it goes lightly, above that it is stiff. Why? Because of purity below and because of being tangled with branches and matted hair above. Just so, great king, those who are once-returners, for whom lust, hate, and delusion have become reduced - for them that mind arises lightly and proceeds lightly in five states, in the higher planes it arises heavily and proceeds slowly. Why? Because of the purity of mind in five states, and because of the mental defilements above not being eliminated. This is the third mind.

"Herein this fourth consciousness is classified - Those, great king, who are non-returners, for whom the five lower mental fetters have been abandoned, their consciousness arises lightly in ten states, proceeds lightly, arises heavily in the upper planes, proceeds slowly. Why? Because of the purity of consciousness in ten states, because of the non-abandonment of mental defilements above. Just as, great king, when a bamboo stalk that is pure in ten joint-knots, tangled with branches above, is being dragged, as far as the ten joints it goes lightly, beyond that above it is obstinate. Why? Because of purity below and because of being tangled with branches and matted hair above. Just so, great king, those who are non-returners, for whom the five lower mental fetters have been abandoned, their consciousness arises lightly in ten states, proceeds lightly, arises heavily in the upper planes, proceeds slowly. Why? Because of the purity of consciousness in ten states, because of the non-abandonment of mental defilements above - this is the fourth consciousness.

"Herein this fifth consciousness is classified - Those, great king, who are Worthy Ones, who have eliminated the mental corruptions, who have washed away stain, who have

vomited up mental defilements, who have lived the holy life, who have done what had to be done, who have laid down the burden, who have attained their own welfare, who have utterly eliminated the fetters of existence, who have attained the analytical knowledges, who are pure in the planes of disciples, their consciousness arises lightly in the domain of disciples, proceeds lightly, arises heavily in the planes of Individually Enlightened Ones, proceeds slowly. Why? Because of purity in the domain of disciples, because of impurity in the domain of Individually Enlightened Ones. Just as, great king, when a bamboo stalk that is pure in all joint-knots is being dragged, its coming is light, not slow. Why? Because of purity in all joint-knots, because of the bamboo being without thicket. Just so, great king, those who are Worthy Ones, who have eliminated the mental corruptions, who have washed away stain, who have vomited up mental defilements, who have lived the holy life, who have done what had to be done, who have laid down the burden, who have attained their own welfare, who have utterly eliminated the fetters of existence, who have attained the analytical knowledges, who are pure in the planes of disciples, their consciousness arises lightly in the domain of disciples, proceeds lightly, arises heavily in the planes of Individually Enlightened Ones, proceeds slowly. Why? Because of purity in the domain of disciples, because of impurity in the domain of Individually Enlightened Ones - this is the fifth consciousness.

"Herein this sixth consciousness is classified - Those, great king, who are Individually Enlightened Ones, self-become, without a teacher, wandering alone, like the horn of a rhinoceros, with pure and spotless consciousness in their own domain, their consciousness arises lightly in their own domain, proceeds lightly, arises heavily in the planes of omniscient Buddhas, proceeds slowly. Why? Because of purity in their own domain, because of the greatness of the domain of omniscient Buddhas. Just as, great king, a man might enter a small river in his own domain by night or by day, as he wishes, without fear; then having seen beyond the great ocean, deep, wide, unfathomable, without a further shore, he would be afraid, would hesitate, would not dare to enter. Why? Because of having crossed his own domain, and because of the greatness of the great ocean. Just so, great king, those who are Individually Enlightened Ones, self-become, without a teacher, wandering alone, like the horn of a rhinoceros, with pure and spotless consciousness in their own domain, their consciousness arises lightly in their own domain, proceeds lightly, arises heavily in the planes of omniscient Buddhas, proceeds slowly. Why? Because of purity in their own domain, because of the greatness of the domain of omniscient Buddhas - this is the sixth consciousness.

"Herein this seventh consciousness comes to be classified - Those, great king, who are Perfectly Enlightened Ones, omniscient, bearers of the ten powers, confident with the four grounds of self-confidence, endowed with the eighteen qualities of a Buddha, infinite conquerors, with unobstructed knowledge, their consciousness arises quickly everywhere, proceeds quickly. Why? Because of purity everywhere. Now, great king, would there be any hesitation or sticking for an iron bar that is well-washed, spotless, without knots, with a subtle edge, not crooked, not bent, not curved, mounted on a strong bow, when forcefully shot at fine linen or fine cotton or fine woollen cloth?" "No indeed, venerable sir. Why?" "Because of the subtleness of the cloths, because of the well-washed state of the iron bar, and because of the force of the shot." Just so indeed, great king, those who are Perfectly Enlightened Ones, omniscient, bearers of

the ten powers, confident with the four grounds of self-confidence, endowed with the eighteen qualities of a Buddha, infinite conquerors, with unobstructed knowledge, their consciousness arises quickly everywhere, proceeds quickly. Why? Because of purity everywhere. This is the seventh consciousness.

"Therein, great king, that which is the consciousness of omniscient Buddhas, having surpassed the reckoning of even the six consciousnesses, is pure and light by an incalculable factor. And because the Blessed One's consciousness is pure and light, therefore, great king, the Blessed One displays the twin miracle. By the twin miracle, great king, it should be known that the consciousness of the Buddhas, the Blessed Ones, turns around thus quickly; no further reason can be stated therein. Even those miracles, great king, taking the consciousness of omniscient Buddhas, do not amount to a reckoning, a term, a fraction, or a fraction of a fraction. The Blessed One's omniscient knowledge, great king, is dependent on adverting; having adverted, he knows whatever he wishes.

"Just as, great king, a man might place whatever is placed in one hand into the other hand, might utter speech with an open mouth, might swallow food that has gone into the mouth, having opened his eyes might close them, or having closed his eyes might open them, might extend a bent arm, or might bend an extended arm - this takes longer, great king; quicker is the Blessed One's omniscient knowledge, quicker is the adverting; having adverted, he knows whatever he wishes. By the mere deficiency of adverting, the Buddhas, the Blessed Ones, are not thereby called non-omniscient."

"Even adverting, Venerable Nāgasena, must be done through seeking. Come, convince me of this by a reason." "Just as, great king, if a wealthy man, of great riches, of great possessions, with abundant gold and silver, with abundant property and equipment, with abundant wealth and grain, had rice, paddy, barley, rice-grain, sesame, mung beans, beans, early crops, later crops, ghee, oil, butter, milk, curds, honey, molasses, and treacle stored in pots, jars, pitchers, granaries, and vessels, and a guest were to come to that man, worthy of a meal, desiring a meal, and whatever cooked food there was in his house, that would be finished, and having taken out rice-grain from a pot he would cook food - but would that man, great king, by that mere deficiency of food, be called poor, be called destitute?" "No indeed, venerable sir. Even in the house of a wheel-turning monarch, venerable sir, there is a deficiency of food at an improper time; how much more so for a householder?" "Just so indeed, great king, the Truth-finder's omniscient knowledge has a mere deficiency of adverting; having adverted, he knows whatever he wishes.

"Or else, great king, suppose there were a tree bearing fruit, bent down, bowed, laden with clusters of fruit, and no fruit had fallen there - would that tree, great king, by that mere deficiency of fallen fruit, be called fruitless?" "No indeed, venerable sir. Those tree fruits are dependent on falling; when fallen, one obtains whatever one wishes." "Just so indeed, great king, the Truth-finder's omniscient knowledge is dependent on adverting; having adverted, he knows whatever he wishes."

"Venerable Nāgasena, does the Buddha know whatever he wishes by adverting again and again?" "Yes, great king, the Blessed One knows whatever he wishes by adverting again and again."

"Just as, great king, when a wheel-turning monarch remembers the wheel treasure,

thinking 'May my wheel treasure come,' when remembered, the wheel treasure comes - just so indeed, great king, the Truth-finder knows whatever he wishes by adverting again and again." "The reason is firm, Venerable Nāgasena. The Buddha is omniscient. I accept that the Buddha is omniscient."

The question on the Buddha's omniscience is the second.

3. The Question on Devadatta's Going Forth

3. "Venerable Nāgasena, by whom was Devadatta given the going forth?" "These six, great king, were warrior princes - Bhaddiya and Anuruddha and Ānanda and Bhagu and Kimila and Devadatta, with Upāli the barber as seventh - when the Teacher had fully awakened, the one who brought joy to the Sakyan clan, going forth following the Blessed One, they departed; the Blessed One gave them the going forth." "Is it not so, venerable sir, that by Devadatta, having gone forth, the Community was broken?" "Yes, great king, by Devadatta, having gone forth, the Community was broken. A householder does not break the Community, nor a nun, nor a female trainee, nor a novice, nor a female novice breaks the Community; a monk who is regular, belonging to the same communion, standing within the same boundary, breaks the Community." "What action, venerable sir, does a schismatic person experience?" "An action lasting a cosmic cycle, great king, he experiences."

"But, Venerable Nāgasena, does the Buddha know: 'Devadatta, having gone forth, will break the Community, and having broken the Community, will be cooked in hell for a cosmic cycle?'" "Yes, great king, the Truth-finder knows: 'Devadatta, having gone forth, will break the Community, and having broken the Community, will be cooked in hell for a cosmic cycle.'" "If, Venerable Nāgasena, the Buddha knows: 'Devadatta, having gone forth, will break the Community, and having broken the Community, will be cooked in hell for a cosmic cycle,' then indeed, Venerable Nāgasena, the statement that the Buddha is compassionate, sympathetic, seeking welfare, removing harm and providing welfare for all beings - that statement is wrong. If he gave the going forth not knowing that, then indeed the Buddha is not omniscient. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; unravel this great tangle, break the opposing doctrines. In the future time, monks of intelligence like you will be rare; here show your power."

"The Blessed One, great king, is compassionate and omniscient. Out of compassion, great king, the Blessed One, looking at Devadatta's destination with the knowledge of omniscience, saw Devadatta, having accumulated action bound for the realm of misery, going from hell to hell, from nether world to nether world, for many hundreds of thousands of ten millions of cosmic cycles. The Blessed One, having known this with the knowledge of omniscience, thought: 'This one's unlimited action, having gone forth in my Dispensation, will become limited; with reference to the former, suffering will become limited; even not having gone forth, this foolish man will accumulate action lasting a cosmic cycle.' Out of compassion he gave the going forth to Devadatta."

"Well then, Venerable Nāgasena, the Buddha, having struck, anoints with oil; having made one fall into a precipice, gives a hand; having killed, seeks life - in that he first gives suffering and afterwards provides happiness?" "The Truth-finder, great king,

strikes for the sake of beings' welfare, makes fall for the sake of beings' welfare, kills for the sake of beings' welfare. Having struck too, great king, the Truth-finder provides only welfare for beings; having made fall too, he provides only welfare for beings; having killed too, he provides only welfare for beings. Just as, great king, mother and father, having struck and having made fall, provide only welfare for their sons, just so indeed, great king, the Truth-finder strikes for the sake of beings' welfare, makes fall for the sake of beings' welfare, kills for the sake of beings' welfare. Having struck too, great king, the Truth-finder provides only welfare for beings; having made fall too, he provides only welfare for beings; having killed too, he provides only welfare for beings. By whatever means there is growth of virtues for beings, by those means he provides only welfare for all beings. If, great king, Devadatta had not gone forth, being a householder, having done much evil action conducive to hell, going from hell to hell, from nether world to nether world, for many hundreds of thousands of ten millions of cosmic cycles, he would experience much suffering. The Blessed One, knowing that, out of compassion gave the going forth to Devadatta, thinking: 'For one gone forth in my Dispensation, suffering will become limited.' Out of compassion he made heavy suffering light.

"Or just as, great king, a powerful man, powerful through wealth, fame, glory, relatives and strength, made a heavy punishment light for his own relative or friend who was bearing a heavy punishment from the king, through his own great trustworthiness and ability - just so indeed, great king, the Blessed One, having given the going forth to Devadatta who was experiencing suffering for many hundreds of thousands of ten millions of cosmic cycles, made heavy suffering light through the power and ability of morality, concentration, wisdom and liberation.

"Or just as, great king, a skilled physician, a surgeon, makes a heavy disease light by the power of powerful medicine - just so indeed, great king, the Blessed One, having given the going forth to Devadatta who was experiencing suffering for many hundreds of thousands of ten millions of cosmic cycles, through knowledge of the disease, powerful in compassion, made heavy suffering light by the power of the firm medicine of the Teaching. Would the Blessed One, great king, making Devadatta who was to experience much into one to experience little, commit any demerit?" "Not any demerit, venerable sir, would he commit, not even as much as the time of milking a cow." "Accept this reason too, great king, according to its meaning, by which reason the Blessed One gave the going forth to Devadatta.

"Furthermore, great king, listen to a further reason by which reason the Blessed One gave the going forth to Devadatta. Just as, great king, having seized a thief, a criminal, they might show him to the king: 'This, Sire, is a thief, a criminal; impose on him whatever punishment you wish.' The king might say to him thus: 'Well then, my good men, having taken this thief outside the city, cut off his head at the place of execution.' 'Yes, Sire,' they, having assented to the king, having taken him outside the city, would lead him to the place of execution. Some man might see him, one who has obtained a boon from the king's presence, who has obtained fame, wealth and possessions, whose words are acceptable, who accomplishes what the powerful desire; he, having shown compassion to him, might say to those men thus: 'Enough, sirs, what is the use of cutting off this man's head? Well then, sirs, having cut off his hand or foot, protect his life; I will give an answer to the king on his behalf.' They, by

the word of that powerful one, having cut off that thief's hand or foot, would protect his life. Would that man, great king, acting thus, be doing what should be done for that thief?" "That man, venerable sir, is a giver of life to that thief; when life has been given, what is there that has not been done for him?" "But the feeling in the cutting off of hand and foot - would he commit any demerit on account of that feeling?" "By what was done by himself, venerable sir, that thief experiences unpleasant feeling; but the man who gives life would not commit any demerit." "Just so indeed, great king, the Blessed One out of compassion gave the going forth to Devadatta: 'For one gone forth in my Dispensation, suffering will be brought to an end.' And Devadatta's suffering was brought to an end, great king; Devadatta, great king, at the time of death -

"With these bones, to that foremost person, the god above gods, the charioteer of men to be tamed;
The all-seeing one, with the marks of a hundred merits, with my life I go for refuge to the Buddha.'

"He went for refuge for life. Devadatta, great king, when the cosmic cycle is divided into six portions and has passed, in the first portion he broke the Community, and having been cooked in hell for five portions, having been released from there, he will become an Individually Enlightened One named Aṭṭhissara. Was the Blessed One, great king, acting thus, doing what should be done for Devadatta?" "The Truth-finder, venerable Nāgasena, is a giver of all to Devadatta; since the Truth-finder will bring Devadatta to individual enlightenment, what is there that has not been done by the Truth-finder for Devadatta?" "But, great king, that Devadatta, having broken the Community, experiences unpleasant feeling in hell, would the Blessed One on that account commit any demerit?" "No indeed, venerable sir; by what was done by himself, venerable sir, Devadatta is cooked in hell for a cosmic cycle; the Teacher who makes an end of suffering does not commit any demerit." "Accept this reason too, great king, according to its meaning, by which reason the Blessed One gave the going forth to Devadatta.

"Furthermore, great king, listen to a further reason by which reason the Blessed One gave the going forth to Devadatta. Just as, great king, a skilled physician, a surgeon, appeasing a wound that has been attacked by wind, bile, phlegm, their combination, seasonal change, abnormal care, or external injury, covered with rotting corpse-like foul smell, with a dart inside, gone into a cavity, full of pus and blood, anoints the surface of the wound with medicine that is hard, sharp, alkaline and pungent for ripening; having ripened, having reached a soft state, having cut it open with a knife, he cauterizes it with a probe; when cauterized, he applies alkaline salt, he anoints it with medicine for the healing of the wound, for the attainment of well-being for the sick person - does that physician, that surgeon, great king, with a mind for harm, anoint with medicine, cut with a knife, cauterize with a probe, apply alkaline salt?" "No indeed, venerable sir; with a mind for welfare, wishing for well-being, he does those actions." "But whatever unpleasant feeling arose from the doing of the medical action, would that physician, that surgeon, on that account commit any demerit?" "With a mind for welfare, venerable sir, wishing for well-being, the physician, the surgeon does those actions; why would he on that account commit demerit? That

physician, that surgeon, venerable sir, is one going to heaven." "Just so indeed, great king, out of compassion the Blessed One gave the going forth to Devadatta for release from suffering.

"Furthermore, great king, listen to a further reason by which reason the Blessed One gave the going forth to Devadatta. Just as, great king, a man might be pierced by a thorn, and then another man, wishing for his welfare, wishing for his well-being, having cut all around with a sharp thorn or with the edge of a knife, with blood flowing, might remove that thorn - does that man, great king, wishing for his harm, remove that thorn?" "No indeed, venerable sir; wishing for his welfare, venerable sir, that man, wishing for his well-being, removes that thorn. If, venerable sir, he did not remove that thorn, he might undergo death or suffering like death on account of that." "Just so indeed, great king, the Truth-finder out of compassion gave the going forth to Devadatta for release from suffering. If, great king, the Blessed One had not given the going forth to Devadatta, Devadatta would have been cooked in hell for a hundred thousand million cosmic cycles in the succession of existences."

"Venerable Nāgasena, the Truth-finder brought Devadatta, who was going with the stream, against the stream; he established Devadatta, who had entered the wrong path, on the path; he gave support to Devadatta who had fallen into a precipice; the Truth-finder raised Devadatta, who had gone to unrighteousness, to righteousness. And these causes, venerable Nāgasena, and these reasons cannot be shown by another except by one wise like you."

The question on Devadatta's going forth is the third.

4. The Question on the Earth Trembling

4. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One - 'These eight causes, monks, eight conditions are for the manifestation of a great earthquake.' This is a statement without remainder, this is a statement without exception, this is a statement without qualification; there is no other ninth cause for the manifestation of a great earthquake. If, venerable Nāgasena, there were another ninth cause for the manifestation of a great earthquake, the Blessed One would have spoken of that cause too. But because, venerable Nāgasena, there is no other ninth cause for the manifestation of a great earthquake, therefore it was not declared by the Blessed One; yet this ninth cause is seen for the manifestation of a great earthquake, that when King Vessantara was giving the great gift, seven times the great earth trembled. If, venerable Nāgasena, there are only eight causes, eight conditions for the manifestation of a great earthquake, then the statement that when King Vessantara was giving the great gift, seven times the great earth trembled, is wrong. If when King Vessantara was giving the great gift, seven times the great earth trembled, then the statement that there are only eight causes, eight conditions for the manifestation of a great earthquake, that too is wrong. This too is a question with two points, subtle, hard to unravel, blinding and deep; it has come to you; it cannot be answered by another of inferior wisdom, except by one wise like you."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One - 'These eight causes, monks, eight conditions are for the manifestation of a great earthquake.' That when King Vessantara was giving the great gift, seven times the great earth trembled, that

however was untimely, arising only occasionally, free from the eight causes; therefore it was not counted among the eight causes.

"Just as, great king, in the world only three clouds are counted: the rainy season cloud, the winter cloud, and the monsoon cloud. If, apart from these, another cloud rains, that cloud is not counted among the recognised clouds; it goes by the term 'untimely cloud' only. Just so indeed, great king, that when King Vessantara was giving the great gift, seven times the great earth trembled, that was untimely, arising only occasionally, free from the eight causes; it is not counted among the eight causes.

"Or else, great king, from the Himalaya mountain five hundred rivers flow; of those five hundred rivers, great king, only ten rivers are counted in the counting of rivers. As follows: the Ganges, the Yamunā, the Aciravatī, the Sarabhū, the Mahī, the Sindhu, the Sarassatī, the Vetravatī, the Vītamsā, and the Candabhāgā; the remaining rivers are not counted in the counting of rivers. Why? Those rivers do not have permanent water. Just so indeed, great king, that when King Vessantara was giving the great gift, seven times the great earth trembled, that was untimely, arising only occasionally, free from the eight causes; it is not counted among the eight causes.

"Or else, great king, a king may have a hundred or two hundred or three hundred ministers; of them only six persons are counted in the counting of ministers. As follows: the general, the chaplain, the judge, the storekeeper, the umbrella-bearer, and the sword-bearer. Only these are counted in the counting of ministers. Why? Because of being connected with the king's qualities; the rest are not counted, they all go by the term 'ministers' only. Just so indeed, great king, that when King Vessantara was giving the great gift, seven times the great earth trembled, that was untimely, arising only occasionally, free from the eight causes; it is not counted among the eight causes.

"Is it heard, great king, nowadays of those who have made aspirations in the Conqueror's Dispensation, of action to be experienced as pleasant in the present life, and whose fame has risen up among gods and humans?" "Yes, venerable sir, it is heard nowadays of those who have made aspirations in the Conqueror's Dispensation, of action to be experienced as pleasant in the present life, and whose fame has risen up among gods and humans - seven persons." "And who are they, great king?" "Sumana the garland-maker, venerable sir, and the brahmin with one cloth, and Puṇṇa the hired servant, and Queen Mallikā, and Queen Gopālamātā, and the female lay follower Suppiyā, and Puṇṇā the slave-woman - these are the seven beings who experienced pleasant results in the present life, and their fame has risen up among gods and humans."

"Are others also heard of in the past who went to the abode of the devas with that very human bodily form?" "Yes, venerable sir, it is heard." "And who are they, great king?" "Guttila the gandhabba, and King Sādhīna, and King Nimi, and King Mandhātā - these four persons are heard of, who went to the abode of the devas with that very human bodily form." "Even what was done long ago is heard of, whether well done or wrongly done? But have you heard before, great king, in the past time or in the present time, that when a gift was being given by one of such and such a name, once or twice or thrice the great earth trembled?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "I have, great

king, tradition, achievement, learning, hearing, strength of training, desire to hear, inquiry, and attendance on teachers; yet I too have not heard before 'when a gift was being given by one of such and such a name, once or twice or thrice the great earth trembled' - except for the excellent gift of King Vessantara, the bull among kings. And, great king, between the Blessed One Kassapa and the Blessed One the Sage of the Sakyans, two Buddhas, ten million years have passed, surpassing the path of counting; even there I have no hearing 'when a gift was being given by one of such and such a name, once or twice or thrice the great earth trembled.' Not, great king, by just so much energy, by just so much effort does the great earth tremble; filled with the burden of virtue, great king, filled with the burden of the virtue of all purity practices, not being able to bear it, the great earth moves, trembles, and quakes.

"Just as, great king, when a cart is overloaded with too heavy a burden, the hubs and the rims split and the axle breaks, just so indeed, great king, the great earth, laden with the burden of the qualities of all purity and functional virtues, not being able to bear it, moves, trembles, and quakes.

"Or else, great king, just as the sky, covered by the force of wind and water, filled with the burden of abundant water, because of being burst by excessive wind, roars, resounds, and rumbles, just so indeed, great king, the great earth, laden with the burden of the abundant, vast power of King Vessantara's giving, not being able to bear it, moves, trembles, and quakes. For indeed, great king, the mind of King Vessantara does not proceed through the influence of lust, does not proceed through the influence of hate, does not proceed through the influence of delusion, does not proceed through the influence of conceit, does not proceed through the influence of wrong view, does not proceed through the influence of defilements, does not proceed through the influence of applied thought, does not proceed through the influence of discontent, but rather it proceeds frequently through the influence of giving: 'How might beggars who have not come, come to my presence, and beggars who have come, having obtained according to their wish, become delighted' - thus constantly, continuously, his mental state is established towards giving. The mental state of King Vessantara, great king, is constantly, continuously established in ten states: in taming, in righteousness, in patience, in restraint, in self-control, in procedure, in non-wrath, in non-violence, in truth, and in purity. For King Vessantara, great king, sensual seeking has been abandoned, seeking existence has been calmed, he has engaged in zeal only for seeking the holy life; for King Vessantara, great king, protection of self has been abandoned, he has engaged in zeal for the protection of all beings: 'How might these beings be united, healthy, wealthy, and long-lived' - thus his mental state frequently proceeds. And while giving, great king, King Vessantara does not give that gift for the sake of success in existence, does not give for the sake of wealth, does not give for the sake of a return gift, does not give for the sake of flattery, does not give for the sake of life span, does not give for the sake of beauty, does not give for the sake of happiness, does not give for the sake of power, does not give for the sake of fame, does not give for the sake of a son, does not give for the sake of a daughter, but rather for the sake of omniscient knowledge, for the sake of the jewel of omniscient knowledge, he gave such incomparable, vast, unsurpassed, excellent gifts, and having attained omniscience, he spoke this verse:

"Jālī, Kaṇhājinā my daughter, Queen Maddī the devoted wife;

Giving them away, I did not grieve, because of enlightenment itself.'

"King Vessantara, great king, conquers wrath by non-wrath, conquers the bad by good, conquers the miser by giving, conquers the speaker of falsehood by truth, conquers all unwholesome by wholesome. For him thus giving, following the Teaching, with the Teaching as his head, through the powerful, vast, extensive outflow of the result of giving and energy, below the great winds begin to stir, gently, gently, again and again, confusedly they blow, they bend down, they rise up, they bend aside, trees with broken leaves fall, cluster by cluster the rain clouds rush across the sky, the winds accumulated with dust become fierce, the winds pressed against the sky blow, suddenly they roar, a great fearful sound emanates, when those winds are agitated the water gently, gently moves, when the water moves the fish and turtles are disturbed, pair by pair the waves arise, the water-dwelling beings tremble, the water-wave proceeds in conjunction, the sound of the waves proceeds, terrible bubbles arise, garlands of foam appear, the great ocean overflows, the water rushes in all directions, the streams of water flow with mouths upstream and downstream, the titans, garuḷas, serpents, and demons tremble, they are alarmed: 'What indeed, how indeed, is the ocean overturning?' - with frightened minds they seek a path of escape, when the water-stream is disturbed and agitated the great earth trembles with its mountains and oceans, Mount Sineru revolves, the peak of the rocky summit bends, snakes, mongooses, cats, jackals, pigs, deer, and birds become displeased, the demons of little influence weep, the demons of great influence laugh as the great earth trembles.

"Just as, great king, in a large, great cooking pot, placed on a fireplace, filled with water, scattered with rice-grain, fire burning from below first heats the cooking pot, the cooking pot heated heats the water, the water heated heats the rice-grain, the rice-grain heated rises and sinks, bubbles are produced, garlands of foam rise up; just so indeed, great king, King Vessantara gave up what is hard to give up in the world; for him giving up what is hard to give up, through the natural outflow of the gift, the great winds below, not being able to bear it, became agitated; when the great winds became agitated, the water trembled; when the water trembled, the great earth trembled; thus then the great winds and the water and the great earth - these three were as if of one mind through the outflow of the great gift, through vast, powerful energy. There is no such, great king, power of giving of another, as the power of the great giving of King Vessantara. Just as, great king, on earth there are gems of many kinds. That is to say, sapphire, great sapphire, luminous essence, lapis lazuli, flax flower, sirīsa flower, captivating, sun-stone, moon-stone, diamond, fire-fly, topaz, ruby, and cat's eye gem - surpassing all these, the wheel-turning monarch's gem is declared the foremost; the wheel-turning monarch's gem, great king, illuminates all around for a yojana. Just so indeed, great king, whatever gift there is on earth, even the supreme incomparable gift, surpassing all that, the great gift of King Vessantara is declared the foremost; when the great gift of King Vessantara, great king, was being given, seven times the great earth trembled."

"Wonderful, Venerable Nāgasena, of the Buddhas! Marvellous, Venerable Nāgasena, of the Buddhas! That the Truth-finder, being a Bodhisatta, matchless in the world, was of such patience, of such mind, of such disposition, of such intention. The endeavour of Bodhisattas, Venerable Nāgasena, has been shown, and the perfections

of the Conquerors have been further illuminated; even while practising the practice, the Truth-finder's supreme state in the world with its gods has been demonstrated. Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, the Conqueror's Dispensation has been praised, the Conqueror's perfections have been illuminated, the knot of the sectarians' doctrine has been cut, the pot of the doctrines of others has been broken, the deep question has been made clear, the thicket has been made not a thicket, the explanation for the sons of the Conqueror has been rightly obtained; thus I accept this as true, O most excellent of excellent teachers."

The question on the earth trembling is the fourth.

5. The Question on King Sivi's Gift of Eyes

5. "Venerable Nāgasena, you say thus: 'Eyes were given by King Sivi to a beggar, and while he was blind, divine eyes arose again' - this statement too is faulty, with refutation, with defect. It is said in the discourse: 'When the cause is uprooted, without cause, without basis, there is no arising of the divine eye.' If, venerable Nāgasena, eyes were given by King Sivi to a beggar, then the statement 'divine eyes arose again' is wrong; if divine eyes arose, then the statement 'eyes were given by King Sivi to a beggar' is also wrong. This too is a question with two points, more knotted than knotted, more entangled than entangled, more impenetrable than impenetrable; it has come to you; therein generate desire for the removal of the doctrines of others, for their refutation."

"Eyes were given, great king, by King Sivi to a beggar; do not generate doubt there. And divine eyes arose again; do not generate doubt there either." "But indeed, venerable Nāgasena, when the cause is uprooted, without cause, without basis, does the divine eye arise?" "No indeed, great king." "But what, venerable sir, is the reason here, by which reason when the cause is uprooted, without cause, without basis, the divine eye arises? Come now, convince me by a reason."

"But then, great king, is there in the world something called truth, by which those who speak truth make a declaration of truth?" "Yes, venerable sir, there is in the world something called truth. By truth, venerable Nāgasena, those who speak truth, having made a declaration of truth, cause the god to rain, extinguish fire, ward off poison, and do various other things that should be done." "Well then, great king, it is fitting and proper that divine eyes arose for King Sivi by the power of truth. By the power of truth, great king, without basis, the divine eye arises; truth itself there becomes the basis for the arising of the divine eye."

"Just as, great king, whatever beings chant truth saying 'Let a great cloud rain!' - together with their chanting of truth, a great cloud rains. Is there, great king, in the sky an accumulated cause of rain by which cause a great cloud rains?" "No indeed, venerable sir, truth itself there becomes the cause for the raining of the great cloud." "Just so indeed, great king, there is no natural cause for that; truth itself here becomes the basis for the arising of the divine eye."

"Or else, great king, whatever beings chant truth saying 'Let the blazing, burning great mass of fire turn back!' - together with their chanting of truth, the blazing, burning great mass of fire turns back in a moment. Is there, great king, in that blazing, burning great mass of fire an accumulated cause by which cause the blazing,

burning great mass of fire turns back in a moment?" "No indeed, venerable sir, truth itself there becomes the basis for the turning back of that blazing, burning great mass of fire in a moment." "Just so indeed, great king, there is no natural cause for that; truth itself here becomes the basis for the arising of the divine eye.

"Or else, great king, whatever beings chant truth saying 'Let the deadly poison become medicine!' Together with their chanting of truth, the deadly poison becomes medicine in a moment. Is there, great king, in that deadly poison an accumulated cause by which cause the deadly poison becomes medicine in a moment?" "No indeed, venerable sir, truth itself there becomes the cause for the destruction of the deadly poison in a moment." "Just so indeed, great king, without the natural cause, truth itself here becomes the basis for the arising of the divine eye.

"For the penetration of the four noble truths too, great king, there is no other basis; having made truth the basis, they penetrate the four noble truths. There is, great king, in the Chinese territory a Chinese king. He, wishing to play in the great ocean, every four months, having made a declaration of truth, enters one yojana into the great ocean together with his chariot. Before the front of his chariot, the great mass of water recedes again and again; when he has departed, it covers over again. Is it possible, great king, for that great ocean to be made to recede by the world including gods and humans with ordinary bodily strength?" "Even in a very small lake, venerable sir, water cannot be made to recede by the world including gods and humans with ordinary bodily strength; how much less the water in the great ocean?" "By this reason too, great king, the power of truth should be known: 'There is no state that cannot be attained by truth.'

"In the city of Pāṭaliputta, great king, King Asoka, the righteous king, surrounded by townspeople, country folk, ministers, soldiers, troops, and great ministers, having seen the river Ganges flowing, full of fresh water, level with its banks, swollen, five hundred yojanas in length, one yojana in breadth, said thus to his ministers: 'Is there anyone, my good men, capable of making this great Ganges flow upstream?' The ministers said: 'It is difficult, Sire.'

"Standing right there on the bank of the Ganges, a courtesan named Bandhumatī heard that it was said thus by the king: 'Is it possible to make this great Ganges flow upstream?' She said thus: 'I am indeed a courtesan in the city of Pāṭaliputta, one who lives by her beauty, of the lowest livelihood. Let the king now see my declaration of truth.' Then she made a declaration of truth. Together with her declaration of truth, in a moment that great Ganges, roaring, flowed upstream while the great crowd of people watched.

Then the king, having heard the gurgling sound produced by the force of the whirling waves of the Ganges, astonished and filled with wonder and amazement, said thus to his ministers: 'Why, my good men, does this great Ganges flow against the stream?' 'Bandhumatī, great king, the courtesan, having heard your word, made a declaration of truth; by her declaration of truth the great Ganges flows upward.'

Then the king, with an agitated heart, very quickly going himself, asked that courtesan: 'Is it true, woman, that by your declaration of truth this Ganges was made to flow against the stream?' 'Yes, Sire.' The king said: 'What power do you have in that, or who not insane accepts your word, by what power did you make this great

Ganges flow against the stream?' She said: 'By the power of truth, great king, I made this great Ganges flow against the stream.' The king said: 'What power of truth do you have, being a thief, a cheat, unmindful, a cutter, a sinful one, one of broken morality, one who has transgressed shame, one who deceives blind people?' 'True, great king, I am such; yet even for one such as me, great king, there is a declaration of truth, by which, if I wished, I could overturn even the world with its gods.' The king said: 'But what is that declaration of truth? Come, tell me.' 'Whoever, great king, gives me wealth, whether a warrior or a brahmin or a merchant or a worker or anyone else, I attend to them equally; there is no distinction "he is a warrior," there is no contempt "he is a worker"; freed from favouritism and aversion, I serve the owner of the wealth. This, Sire, is my declaration of truth, by which I made this great Ganges flow against the stream.'

Thus indeed, great king, those established in truth do not fail to find any benefit. And, great king, the eyes were given by King Sivi to the beggar, and divine eyes arose, and that by a declaration of truth. But what was said in the discourse: 'When the physical eye is destroyed, without cause, without basis, there is no arising of the divine eye.' That was said with reference to the eye produced by meditation; thus, great king, remember this." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, the question has been well unravelled, the refutation well shown, the opposing doctrines well crushed; thus I accept this as true."

The question on King Sivi's gift of eyes is the fifth.

6. The Question on Conception in the Womb

6. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One: 'Now, monks, through the union of three things, there is conception in a womb. Here, there is the union of the mother and father, and the mother is in her fertile season, and a gandhabba (being-to-be-reborn) is present. Monks, it is through the union of these three things, that there is conception in a womb.' This is a statement without remainder, a statement without exception, a statement without qualification, a statement worthy of respect, spoken while seated in the midst of gods and humans. Yet conception in a womb from the union of two things is seen here: the ascetic Dukūla, touched the navel of the female ascetic Pārikā with the right thumb during her fertile season; by that touching of the navel, the boy Sāma was born. Also by the sage Mātaṅga, the navel of a brahmin maiden was touched with the right thumb during her fertile season; by that touching of the navel, a young man named Maṇḍabya was born. If, Venerable Nāgasena, it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'Now, monks, through the union of three things, there is conception in a womb.' Then the statement that both the boy Sāma and the young man Maṇḍabya were born by the touching of the navel is wrong. If, venerable sir, it was spoken by the Truth-finder: 'The boy Sāma and the young man Maṇḍabya were born by the touching of the navel,' then the statement 'Now, monks, through the union of three things, there is conception in a womb' is also wrong. This too is a question with two points, very profound, very subtle, a domain for the wise; it has come to you. Cut the path of doubt, hold up the lamp of the best knowledge."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'Now, monks, through the union of three things, there is conception in a womb. Here, there is the union of the mother and father, and the mother is in her fertile season, and a gandhabba (being-to-be-reborn) is present. It is thus, through the union of these three things, that there is conception in a womb.' And it was spoken: 'The boy Sāma and the young man Maṇḍabya were born by the touching of the navel.'" "Well then, Venerable Nāgasena, convince me by the reason by which the question is well determined."

"But have you heard before, great king, that the boy Saṃkicca and the ascetic Isisinga and the Elder Kumārakassapa were born by this means?" "Yes, venerable sir, it is heard; their birth is well-known. First, two female deer, during their fertile season, came to the urinal place of two ascetics and drank urine containing semen; by that semen in the urine, the boy Saṃkicca and the ascetic Isisinga were born. When the Elder Udāyī had gone to the nuns' quarters, while gazing upon the genitals of a nun with a lustful mind, semen was released onto his orange robe. Then the Venerable Udāyī said this to that nun: 'Go, sister, bring water, I will wash my inner robe.' 'Bring it, I myself will wash it.' Then that nun, during her fertile season, took a portion of that semen with her mouth, inserted a portion into her genitals; by that the Elder Kumārakassapa was born - thus people say."

"Do you, great king, believe that statement?" "Yes, venerable sir, we find a strong reason there, by which reason we believe: 'By this reason they were born.'" "But what, great king, is the reason here?" "When a seed falls into well-prepared soil, venerable sir, it quickly sprouts." "Yes, great king." "Just so indeed, venerable sir, that nun, being in her fertile season, when the soil was established, when the blood's flow had stopped, when the element was stable, having taken that semen, inserted it into that soil; by that an embryo was established in her. Thus we acknowledge the reason there for their birth." "So it is, great king, I accept it thus: by entry into the womb, an embryo comes into being. But do you, great king, accept the conception in a womb of the Elder Kumārakassapa?" "Yes, venerable sir." "Good, great king, you have come back to my domain. Speaking of conception in a womb even by one method, you will be my support. But those two female deer who, having drunk urine, obtained an embryo - do you believe in their conception in a womb?" "Yes, venerable sir, whatever is eaten, drunk, chewed, or licked, all that flows to the soil, and having reached its place, attains growth. Just as, Venerable Nāgasena, whatever rivers there are, all of them flow into the great ocean, and having reached their place, attain growth. Just so indeed, Venerable Nāgasena, whatever is eaten, drunk, chewed, or licked, all that flows to the soil, and having reached its place, attains growth. By that reason I believe that conception in a womb occurs even through what has gone into the mouth." "Good, great king, you have come more firmly into my domain. Even by drinking through the mouth, there is a union of two. Do you accept the conception in a womb of the boy Saṃkicca, the ascetic Isisinga, and the Elder Kumārakassapa?" "Yes, venerable sir, the union flows in."

"The boy Sāma also, great king, and the young man Maṇḍabya are included within the three unions, of one flavour indeed with the former; I will explain the reason there. The ascetic Dukūla, great king, and the female ascetic Pārikā, both of them were forest dwellers, inclined to solitude, seekers of the highest good; by the power of their austere asceticism they heated up to the Brahma world. To them at that time

Sakka, the lord of the gods, came to attend morning and evening. He, reflecting out of respect and friendliness towards them, saw the disappearance of both their eyes in the future; having seen, he said to them thus: 'Do one thing for me, sirs; it would be good if you would produce one son; he will be your attendant and support.' 'Enough, Kosiya, do not speak thus.' They did not accept that word of his. The compassionate, welfare-wishing Sakka, the lord of the gods, for the second time also, etc. for the third time also he said to them thus: 'Do one thing for me, sirs; it would be good if you would produce one son; he will be your attendant and support.' For the third time also they said: 'Enough, Kosiya, do not urge us to harm; when will this body not break up? Let this body break up, it is subject to breaking up; even if the earth were breaking up, even if the mountain peaks were falling, even if the sky were splitting, even if the moon and sun were falling, we will not mingle with worldly adversities. Do not approach our presence; this is your intimacy with one who has approached; you are one who works harm, I think.'

Then Sakka, the lord of the gods, not obtaining their consent, requested again with respect and joined palms: 'If you are not able to do my bidding, then, when the female ascetic is in her fertile season, after her menstrual flow, you, venerable sir, should touch her navel with your right thumb; by that she will conceive an embryo; this indeed is the union for conception in a womb.' 'I am able, Kosiya, to do that bidding; our austere asceticism is not broken by just that much; let it be so,' they accepted. But at that time in the heavenly abode there was a young god with abundant wholesome roots, whose life was exhausted, who had reached the exhaustion of his lifespan, able to descend at will even into a wheel-turning monarch's family. Then Sakka, the lord of the gods, having approached that young god, said thus: 'Come, dear sir, a well-dawned day for you, the accomplishment of welfare has arrived, since I have come to attend upon you; your dwelling will be in a delightful place, conception will be in a suitable family, to be raised by good mother and father; come, do my bidding,' he requested. For the second time, etc. for the third time also he requested with joined palms on his head.

Then that young god said thus: 'Which is that family, dear sir, that you praise constantly again and again?' 'The ascetic Dukūla and the female ascetic Pārikā.' He heard that word of his, and, being pleased, he accepted: 'Good, dear sir, let your wish be so; desiring, dear sir, I would be reborn in the wished-for family; in what kind of family shall I be reborn - egg-born or womb-born or moisture-born or spontaneously born?' 'Be reborn, dear sir, in a womb-born realm.' Then Sakka, the lord of the gods, calculated the day of rebirth and informed the ascetic Dukūla: 'On such and such a day the female ascetic will be in her fertile season, after her menstrual flow; then, venerable sir, you should touch her navel with your right thumb.' On that day, great king, the female ascetic was in her fertile season, after her menstrual flow, and the young god had arrived there and was present, and the ascetic touched the navel of the female ascetic with his right thumb; thus there were those three unions. By the touching of the navel, lust arose in the female ascetic; but that lust of hers was dependent on the touching of the navel. Do not think that the union is the transgression itself; smiling too is a union, talking too is a union, gazing too is a union; because of being a preliminary part, for the arising of lust, by touching a union is born; from the union there is descent.

"Even without transgression, great king, conception occurs through touching. Just as, great king, a burning fire, even without touching, dispels the cold of one who has approached, even so, great king, even without transgression, conception occurs through touching.

"By four means, great king, conception of beings occurs - by means of action, by means of mode of generation, by means of family, by means of request; but all these beings originate from action, arise from action.

"How, great king, does conception of beings occur by means of action? Beings with abundant wholesome roots, great king, arise at will in a wealthy warrior family or a wealthy brahmin family or a wealthy householder family or among the gods or in an egg-born womb or in a womb-born womb or in a moisture-born womb or in a spontaneously born womb. Just as, great king, a man who is rich, of great wealth, of great possessions, with abundant gold and silver, with abundant means and provisions, with abundant wealth and grain, with abundant relatives and supporters, whatever he desires in his mind - a female slave or a male slave or a field or a site or a village or a market town or a country - he buys at will, giving even double or triple the wealth, even so, great king, beings with abundant wholesome roots arise at will in a wealthy warrior family or a wealthy brahmin family or a wealthy householder family or among the gods or in an egg-born womb or in a womb-born womb or in a moisture-born womb or in a spontaneously born womb. Thus conception of beings occurs by means of action.

"How does conception of beings occur by means of mode of generation? For chickens, great king, conception occurs through wind. For herons, conception occurs through the sound of thunder. All gods too are beings not lying in a womb; for them conception occurs in various ways. Just as, great king, human beings move about on earth in various ways - some cover the front, some cover the back, some are naked, some are shaven wearing white cloth, some have topknots bound, some are shaven wearing orange robes, some wearing orange robes have topknots bound, some are matted-hair ascetics wearing bark garments, some wear leather garments, some wear rays of light - all these human beings move about on earth in various ways, even so, great king, they are all just beings; for them conception occurs in various ways. Thus conception of beings occurs by means of mode of generation.

"How does conception of beings occur by means of family? Family, great king, means there are four families - egg-born, womb-born, moisture-born, and spontaneously born. If therein a gandhabba, having come from wherever, arises in an egg-born family, he becomes egg-born there, etc. in a womb-born family, etc. in a moisture-born family, etc. arises in a spontaneously born family, he becomes spontaneously born there. In those various families, just such beings come to be. Just as, great king, whatever beasts and birds approach Mount Neru in the Himalayas, all of them, having abandoned their own colour, become gold-coloured, even so, great king, whatever gandhabba, having come from wherever, having approached an egg-born womb, having abandoned his intrinsic nature, becomes egg-born, etc. womb-born, etc. moisture-born, etc. having approached a spontaneously born womb, having abandoned his intrinsic nature, becomes spontaneously born. Thus conception of beings occurs by means of family.

"How does conception of beings occur by means of request? Here, great king, there is a family without a son, with much wealth, faithful, devoted, moral, of good character, devoted to asceticism, and a young god with abundant wholesome roots is subject to pass away. Then Sakka, the lord of the gods, out of compassion for that family, requests that young god: 'Direct your aspiration, dear sir, to the womb of the chief queen of such-and-such a family.' He, because of that request, directs his aspiration to that family. Just as, great king, people desiring merit, having requested an ascetic who is pleasing to the mind, bring him to their home, thinking 'This one, having come, will be a bringer of happiness to the whole family.' Even so, great king, Sakka, the lord of the gods, having requested that young god, brings him to that family. Thus conception of beings occurs by means of request.

"Sāma, great king, the boy, requested by Sakka, the lord of the gods, descended into the womb of the female ascetic Pārikā. Sāma, great king, the boy, was a doer of merit, his mother and father were moral, of good character, the requester was Sakka; by the mental aspiration of the three, the boy Sāma was born. Here, great king, suppose a man skilled in method were to plant a seed in well-tilled, watery ground; would there be any obstacle to the growth of that seed avoiding obstacles?" "No indeed, venerable sir, a seed without damage would quickly sprout." "Even so, great king, the boy Sāma, freed from arisen obstacles, was born by the mental aspiration of the three.

"Have you, great king, heard before that a prosperous, flourishing, great country with its people was completely destroyed through the ill-will of sages?" "Yes, venerable sir, it is heard. On the earth, the Daṇḍaka forest, the Majjha forest, the Kāliṅga forest, the Mātāṅga forest - all that forest became wilderness; all these countries went to destruction through the ill-will of sages." "If, great king, through their ill-will, well-prosperous countries are destroyed, would something be produced through their mental satisfaction?" "Yes, venerable sir." "Well then, great king, the boy Sāma was born through the mental satisfaction of three powerful ones - created by sages, created by gods, created by merit. Thus, great king, remember this.

"These three young gods, great king, requested by Sakka, the lord of the gods, were born into families. Which three? The prince Sāma, Mahāpanāda, King Kusa - these three were Bodhisattas." "Well shown, Venerable Nāgasena, is the conception, well explained is the reason, darkness has been made light, the tangle has been disentangled, the opposing doctrines have been cast out; thus I accept this as true."

The question on conception in the womb is the sixth.

7. The Question on the Disappearance of the Good Teaching

7. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One: 'Now, Ānanda, the Good Teaching will remain for only five hundred years.' And again, at the time of final Nibbāna, when asked a question by the wandering ascetic Subhadda, it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'And if, Subhadda, these monks were to dwell rightly, the world would not be empty of Worthy Ones' - this is a statement without remainder, a statement without exception, a statement without qualification. If, Venerable Nāgasena, it was spoken by the Truth-finder: 'Now, Ānanda, the Good Teaching will remain for only five hundred years,' then the statement 'the world would not be

empty of Worthy Ones' is wrong. If it was spoken by the Truth-finder: 'the world would not be empty of Worthy Ones,' then the statement 'Now, Ānanda, the Good Teaching will remain for only five hundred years' is also wrong. This too is a question with two points, more impenetrable than impenetrable, more powerful than powerful, more knotted than knotted; it has come to you; therein show the diffusion of the power of your knowledge, like a sea-monster gone into the midst of the ocean."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'Now, Ānanda, the Good Teaching will remain for only five hundred years.' And at the time of final Nibbāna, it was spoken to the wandering ascetic Subhadda: 'And if, Subhadda, these monks were to dwell rightly, the world would not be empty of Worthy Ones.' But, great king, that statement of the Blessed One is different in meaning and different in phrasing; this is a delimitation of the Dispensation, this is an elucidation of practice - those two are far removed from each other. Just as, great king, the sky is far removed from the earth, hell is far removed from heaven, the wholesome is far removed from the unwholesome, happiness is far removed from suffering. Just so indeed, great king, those two are far removed from each other.

"But moreover, great king, lest your question be in vain, I will explain to you by bringing together the essence. When the Blessed One said: 'Now, Ānanda, the Good Teaching will remain for only five hundred years,' he delimited the remainder while elucidating the destruction: 'Ānanda, the Good Teaching would remain for a thousand years, if nuns were not given the going forth. Now, Ānanda, the Good Teaching will remain for only five hundred years.' Does the Blessed One, great king, speaking thus, speak of the disappearance of the Good Teaching or protest against full realisation?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "He delimited the remainder, great king, while proclaiming what was lost and elucidating. Just as, great king, a man who has suffered loss, having taken all the remainder, might explain to people: 'This much of my goods is lost, this is the remainder.' Just so indeed, great king, the Blessed One, while elucidating what was lost, spoke of the remainder to gods and humans: 'Now, Ānanda, the Good Teaching will remain for only five hundred years.' But, great king, what was spoken by the Blessed One: 'Now, Ānanda, the Good Teaching will remain for only five hundred years' - this is a delimitation of the Dispensation.

"But what at the time of final Nibbāna, while proclaiming ascetics to the wandering ascetic Subhadda, he said: 'And if, Subhadda, these monks were to dwell rightly, the world would not be empty of Worthy Ones' - this is an elucidation of practice; but you make that delimitation and that elucidation into one flavour. If, however, you wish, I will explain having made it into one flavour; listen well and pay close attention with undistracted mind.

"Here, great king, suppose there were a lake, full of fresh water, overflowing at the brim, bounded and enclosed; and while that lake was not yet exhausted, a great cloud, continuously connected, were to rain down upon the water again and again - would the water in that lake, great king, come to utter elimination and exhaustion?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "For what reason, great king?" "Because of the continuity of the cloud, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, the lake of the Good Teaching of the excellent Dispensation of the Conqueror, full of the pure fresh water of the practice of good conduct, morality, virtue, and duty, overflowing, having overcome the highest existence, stands. If therein the sons of the Buddha were to cause the

rain-cloud of the practice of good conduct, morality, virtue, and duty to be continuously connected again and again, were to cause it to rain down. Thus this lake of the Good Teaching of the excellent Dispensation of the Conqueror would remain for a long time, for a long duration, the world would not be empty of Worthy Ones - with reference to this meaning it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'And if, Subhadda, these monks were to dwell rightly, the world would not be empty of Worthy Ones.'

"Here again, great king, suppose in a great, blazing mass of fire, they were to bring dry grass, sticks, and cow-dung again and again - would that mass of fire, great king, be extinguished?" "No indeed, venerable sir, that mass of fire would burn more and more, would blaze more and more." "Just so indeed, great king, in the ten-thousand-fold world system, the excellent Dispensation of the Conqueror too burns and blazes with the practice of good conduct, morality, virtue, and duty. If, moreover, great king, beyond that, the sons of the Buddha, possessed of the five factors for striving, constantly diligent, were to strive, were to train with desire arisen in the three trainings, were to fulfil completely the conduct and morality, thus this excellent Dispensation of the Conqueror would remain more and more for a long time, for a long duration, the world would not be empty of Worthy Ones - with reference to this meaning it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'And if, Subhadda, these monks were to dwell rightly, the world would not be empty of Worthy Ones.'

"But here, great king, if they were to polish again and again a smooth, evenly polished, radiant, spotless mirror with fine, subtle red chalk powder, would stain, mud, dust and dirt arise in that mirror?" "No indeed, venerable sir, on the contrary it would become even more spotless." "Just so, great king, the excellent Dispensation of the Conqueror is naturally pure, free from the stain, mud, dust and dirt of defilements. If the sons of the Buddha were to observe the excellent Dispensation of the Conqueror with the virtues of good conduct, morality, qualities, duties, practice, detachment and ascetic practices, thus this excellent Dispensation of the Conqueror would remain for a long time, for a long duration, and the world would not be empty of Worthy Ones - with reference to this meaning it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'And if, Subhadda, these monks were to dwell rightly, the world would not be empty of Worthy Ones.' The Teacher's instruction, great king, is rooted in practice, caused by practice, and remains when practice has not disappeared."

"Venerable Nāgasena, as for what you say 'disappearance of the Good Teaching', what is that disappearance of the Good Teaching?" "There are, great king, these three disappearances of the Dispensation. What three? The disappearance of achievement, the disappearance of practice, the disappearance of the outward sign. When achievement has disappeared, great king, even for one who practises well there is no full realisation of the teaching; when practice has disappeared, the regulation of training rules disappears, only the outward sign remains; when the outward sign has disappeared, there is the cutting off of the lineage. These, great king, are the three disappearances."

"Well explained, Venerable Nāgasena, the question has been made clear, the deep has been made shallow, the knot has been cut, the opposing doctrines are destroyed, broken, made without lustre; you have approached the excellent bull among leaders of groups."

8. The Question on Cutting Off the Unwholesome

8. "Venerable Nāgasena, did the Truth-finder attain omniscience having burnt up all unwholesome, or did he attain omniscience with some unwholesome remaining?" "Having burnt up all unwholesome, great king, the Blessed One attained omniscience; there is no remaining unwholesome for the Blessed One."

"But, venerable sir, had unpleasant feeling previously arisen in the Truth-finder's body?" "Yes, great king, at Rājagaha the Blessed One's foot was cut by a splinter, an illness of bloody diarrhoea arose, when the body was congested a purgative was administered by Jīvaka, when a wind illness arose hot water was requested by the attendant elder."

"If, venerable Nāgasena, the Truth-finder attained omniscience having burnt up all unwholesome, then the statement that the Blessed One's foot was cut by a splinter and an illness of bloody diarrhoea arose is wrong. If the Truth-finder's foot was cut by a splinter and an illness of bloody diarrhoea arose, then the statement that the Truth-finder attained omniscience having burnt up all unwholesome, that too is wrong. There is not, venerable sir, any feeling without action; all that feeling is rooted in action, one feels it by action alone. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"No indeed, great king, not all that feeling is rooted in action. By eight causes, great king, feelings arise, by which causes many beings feel feelings. Which eight? Indeed, great king, some feelings arise here originating from wind; indeed, great king, some feelings arise here originating from bile. Etc. Indeed, great king, some feelings arise here originating from phlegm. Etc. Indeed, great king, some feelings arise here from the combination of humours. Etc. Indeed, great king, some feelings arise here born from change of season. Etc. Indeed, great king, some feelings arise here born from improper care. Etc. Indeed, great king, some feelings arise here caused by external assault. Etc. Indeed, great king, some feelings arise here born from the result of action. By these eight causes, great king, many beings feel feelings. Therein, those persons who would say 'action afflicts beings,' those persons reject the seven causes. Their statement is wrong." "Venerable Nāgasena, whatever is caused by wind, whatever is caused by bile, whatever is caused by phlegm, whatever is from the combination of humours, whatever is born from change of season, whatever is born from improper care, whatever is caused by external assault - all these originate from action alone; they all come to be by action alone."

"If, great king, all those illnesses too were originating from action alone, there would be no distinguishing characteristics of them by their portions. Wind, great king, when disturbed, is disturbed in ten ways: by cold, by heat, by hunger, by thirst, by overeating, by standing, by striving, by rushing, by assault, by the result of action. Therein, those nine kinds do not arise in past, nor in future, but in the present existence; therefore it should not be said 'all feelings originate from action.' Bile, great king, when disturbed, is disturbed in three ways: by cold, by heat, by improper food. Phlegm, great king, when disturbed, is disturbed in three ways: by cold, by heat, by food and drink. And, great king, wind, bile, and phlegm, having been disturbed by

those various disturbances, becoming mixed, each draws its own feeling. Feeling born from change of season, great king, arises from change of season. Feeling born from improper care arises from improper care. Feeling caused by external assault, great king, there is function, there is result of action; feeling born from the result of action arises from action done before. Thus indeed, great king, little is born from the result of action, more is the remainder. Therein fools run beyond saying 'all is born from the result of action alone.' That action cannot be defined without the Buddha's knowledge.

"But, great king, that the Blessed One's foot was cut by a splinter, that feeling was indeed not originating from wind, not originating from bile, not originating from phlegm, not from the combination of humours, not born from change of season, not born from improper care, not born from the result of action, but caused by external assault only. For, great king, Devadatta bound resentment towards the Truth-finder for many hundreds of thousands of births; he, with that resentment, having taken up a great heavy stone, released it thinking 'I shall drop it on his head'; then two other rocks, having come, received that stone before it reached the Truth-finder; by the blow of those, a splinter having broken off and having fallen on the Blessed One's foot, drew blood. Either from the result of action, great king, or from function, this feeling arose for the Blessed One; beyond these there is no other feeling.

"Just as, great king, either due to the defectiveness of the field a seed does not come to be, or due to the defectiveness of the seed. Just so indeed, great king, either from the result of action or from function, this feeling arose for the Blessed One; beyond these there is no other feeling.

"Or else, great king, just as either due to the defectiveness of the stomach food is digested abnormally, or due to the defectiveness of the nutriment, just so indeed, great king, either from the result of action or from function, this feeling arose for the Blessed One; beyond these there is no other feeling. But moreover, great king, there is no feeling born from the result of action for the Blessed One, there is no feeling born from improper care; from the remaining origins feeling arises for the Blessed One, and yet by that feeling it is not possible to deprive the Blessed One of life.

"Desirable and undesirable, pleasant and unpleasant feelings fall, great king, upon this body made of the four primary elements. Here, great king, a clod of earth thrown into space falls upon the great earth; did that clod of earth, great king, fall upon the great earth because of what was done before?" "No indeed, venerable sir; there is not, venerable sir, that cause for the great earth by which cause the great earth would experience the result of wholesome and unwholesome action; by a present cause that is not action, venerable sir, that clod of earth falls upon the great earth. Just as, great king, the great earth, so should the Truth-finder be seen. Just as a clod of earth falls upon the great earth not because of what was done before, just so indeed, great king, that splinter fell upon the Truth-finder's foot not because of what was done before.

"But here, great king, people break and dig the great earth; do those people, great king, break and dig the great earth because of what was done before?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, that splinter which fell upon the Blessed One's foot, that splinter did not fall upon the Blessed One's foot because of what was

done before. Also, great king, the illness of bloody diarrhoea that arose for the Blessed One, that illness too did not arise because of what was done before, it arose only from the combination of humours; whatever bodily illnesses, great king, arose for the Blessed One, they were not produced by action, they arose from one or another of these six origins.

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One, the god above gods, in the explanation to Moliyasīvaka, the excellent seal of the Collection of the Connected Discourses:

"Indeed, Sīvaka, some feelings arise here originating from bile. This, Sīvaka, should be known by oneself, how some feelings arise here originating from bile. This, Sīvaka, is also accepted as truth by the world, how some feelings arise here originating from bile. Therein, Sīvaka, as to those ascetics and brahmins who hold such a doctrine and view: "Whatever this person experiences - whether pleasant or unpleasant or neither-unpleasant-nor-pleasant - all that is caused by what was done in the past." They pass over what is known by oneself, and they pass over what is accepted as truth in the world. Therefore I say it is wrong for those ascetics and brahmins.

"Indeed, Sīvaka, some feelings arise here originating from phlegm. Indeed, Sīvaka, some feelings arise here originating from wind. Etc. Indeed, Sīvaka, some feelings arise here from the combination of humours. Etc. Indeed, Sīvaka, some feelings arise here born from change of season. Etc. Indeed, Sīvaka, some feelings arise here born from improper care. Etc. Indeed, Sīvaka, some feelings arise here caused by external assault. Etc. Indeed, Sīvaka, some feelings arise here born from the result of action. This, Sīvaka, should be known by oneself, how some feelings arise here born from the result of action. This, Sīvaka, is also accepted as truth by the world, how some feelings arise here born from the result of action. Therein, Sīvaka, as to those ascetics and brahmins who hold such a doctrine and view: "Whatever this person experiences - whether pleasant or unpleasant or neither-unpleasant-nor-pleasant - all that is caused by what was done in the past." They pass over what is known by oneself, and they pass over what is accepted as truth in the world. Therefore I say it is wrong for those ascetics and brahmins."

"Thus indeed, great king, not all feelings are born of the result of action; having burnt all unwholesome, the Blessed One attained omniscience - thus remember this."

"Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on cutting off the unwholesome is the eighth.

9. The Question on What Further is to be Done

9. "Venerable Nāgasena, you say 'whatever was to be done by the Truth-finder, all that was fully accomplished at the very root of the Bodhi tree, there is nothing further to be done by the Truth-finder, or any adding to what has been done,' yet this three-month seclusion is seen. If, Venerable Nāgasena, whatever was to be done by the Truth-finder, all that was fully accomplished at the very root of the Bodhi tree, there is nothing further to be done by the Truth-finder, or any adding to what has been done, then the statement 'he was in seclusion for three months' is wrong. If he was in seclusion for three months, then the statement 'whatever was to be done by the Truth-finder, all that was fully accomplished at the very root of the Bodhi tree' is also

wrong. There is no seclusion for one who has done what had to be done; seclusion is only for one who still has something to do. Just as only one who is sick has something to be done with medicine; what has one who is not sick to do with medicine? Only one who is hungry has something to be done with food; what has one who is not hungry to do with food? Just so indeed, Venerable Nāgasena, there is no seclusion for one who has done what had to be done; seclusion is only for one who still has something to do. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"Whatever was to be done by the Truth-finder, great king, all that was fully accomplished at the very root of the Bodhi tree, there is nothing further to be done by the Truth-finder, or any adding to what has been done, and the Blessed One was in seclusion for three months. Seclusion indeed, great king, has many virtues; all Truth-finders too, having gone into seclusion, attained omniscience; recollecting the virtue of that well-done, they resort to seclusion. Just as, great king, a man who has obtained a boon from the king's presence, who has obtained wealth, recollecting the virtue of that well-done, goes again and again to attend upon the king. Just so indeed, great king, all Truth-finders too, having gone into seclusion, attained omniscience; recollecting the virtue of that well-done, they resort to seclusion.

"Or else, great king, just as a man who is sick, afflicted, severely ill, having attended upon a physician, having attained well-being, recollecting the virtue of that well-done, attends upon the physician again and again. Just so indeed, great king, all Truth-finders too, having gone into seclusion, attained omniscience; recollecting the virtue of that well-done, they resort to seclusion.

"And there are, great king, these twenty-eight virtues of seclusion, recollecting which virtues the Truth-finders resort to seclusion. Which twenty-eight? Here, great king, seclusion protects oneself while in seclusion, increases life span, gives strength, closes off faults, removes ill repute, brings fame, dispels discontent, establishes delight, removes fear, creates self-confidence, removes idleness, generates energy, removes lust, removes hate, removes delusion, strikes down conceit, breaks applied thought, makes the mind fully focused, softens the mental state, generates joy, makes one serious, produces material gain, makes one worthy of homage, causes one to attain rapture, creates gladness, shows the intrinsic nature of activities, uproots conception in existence, and gives complete asceticism. These, great king, are the twenty-eight virtues of seclusion, recollecting which virtues the Truth-finders resort to seclusion.

"And moreover, great king, the Truth-finders, wishing to experience the peaceful happiness and delight in attainment, resort to seclusion, with their intentions fulfilled. For four reasons, great king, the Truth-finders resort to seclusion. With which four? For comfortable abiding too, great king, the Truth-finders resort to seclusion; for the abundance of faultless virtues too, the Truth-finders resort to seclusion; because it is the complete noble path too, the Truth-finders resort to seclusion; because it is praised, extolled, commended, and approved by all Buddhas too, the Truth-finders resort to seclusion. For these four reasons, great king, the Truth-finders resort to seclusion. Thus indeed, great king, the Truth-finders resort to seclusion not because they still have something to do, nor for adding to what has been done, but because they see the distinction of virtues, the Truth-finders resort to seclusion." "Excellent,

Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on what further is to be done is the ninth.

10. The Question on the Display of Supernormal Power

10. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One: 'The Truth-finder, Ānanda, has developed, cultivated, mastered, made a basis of, practised, accumulated, and thoroughly undertaken the four bases for spiritual power; if he wishes, Ānanda, the Truth-finder could remain for a cosmic cycle or the remainder of a cosmic cycle.' And again it was said: 'After the elapse of three months from now, the Truth-finder will attain final Nibbāna.' If, Venerable Nāgasena, it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'The Truth-finder, Ānanda, has developed the four bases for spiritual power... etc. the remainder of a cosmic cycle,' then the delimitation of three months is wrong. If, venerable sir, it was spoken by the Truth-finder: 'After the elapse of three months from now, the Truth-finder will attain final Nibbāna,' then 'The Truth-finder, Ānanda, has developed the four bases for spiritual power... etc. the remainder of a cosmic cycle' - that statement too is wrong. There is no thundering in an impossibility by the Truth-finders. The Buddhas, the Blessed Ones, are of unfailing speech, of true speech, of unambiguous speech. This too is a question with two points, profound, very subtle, hard to make reflect upon, that has come to you; break this net of wrong views, establish it on one side, break the opposing doctrine."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'The Truth-finder, Ānanda, has developed the four bases for spiritual power... etc. the remainder of a cosmic cycle,' and the delimitation of three months was also spoken; but that cosmic cycle is called a life-span cosmic cycle. The Blessed One, great king, did not say this proclaiming his own power; but the Blessed One, great king, proclaiming his supernormal power, said thus: 'The Truth-finder, Ānanda, has developed the four bases for spiritual power... etc. the remainder of a cosmic cycle.'"

"Just as, great king, a king might have a thoroughbred horse, swift in gait, fast as the wind; the king, proclaiming its power of speed, in the midst of townspeople, countryfolk, soldiers, troops, brahmins, householders, ministers, and people, might say thus: 'If he wishes, my good man, this excellent horse, having traversed the earth bounded by the ocean waters, could come here in a moment'; yet he would not show that swift gait in that assembly; but that speed exists in it, and it is capable of traversing the earth bounded by the ocean waters in a moment. Just so indeed, great king, the Blessed One, proclaiming his own supernormal power, said thus; and that too was spoken while seated in the midst of those possessing the threefold true knowledge, those possessing the six higher knowledges, the Worthy Ones, the stainless ones who have eliminated the mental corruptions, and gods and humans: 'The Truth-finder, Ānanda, has developed, cultivated, mastered, made a basis of, practised, accumulated, and thoroughly undertaken the four bases for spiritual power; if he wishes, Ānanda, the Truth-finder could remain for a cosmic cycle or the remainder of a cosmic cycle.' And that supernormal power exists, great king, in the Blessed One; and the Blessed One is capable by supernormal power of remaining for a cosmic cycle or the remainder of a cosmic cycle; yet the Blessed One does not show that supernormal power in that assembly; the Blessed One, great king, is unconcerned with all existences, and all existences are blamed by the Truth-finder."

This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'Just as, monks, even a small amount of excrement is foul-smelling. Just so indeed, monks, I do not praise even a small amount of existence, even for a mere finger-snap.' Would the Blessed One, great king, having seen all existences, destinations, and modes of generation as equal to excrement, in dependence on supernormal power, create desire and lust for existences?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Well then, great king, the Blessed One, proclaiming his supernormal power, roared such a Buddha's lion's roar." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on the display of supernormal power is the tenth.

The Chapter on Supernormal Power is the first.

In this chapter there are ten questions.

2. The Chapter on the Unbreakable

1. The Question on the Lesser and Minor Rules

1. "Venerable Nāgasena, this was spoken by the Blessed One: 'I expound the Teaching having directly known, monks, not without having directly known.' And again in the regulation of the monastic discipline it was spoken thus: 'If it wishes, Ānanda, the monastic community may abolish the lesser and minor training rules after my passing.' Were indeed, venerable Nāgasena, the lesser and minor training rules badly laid down, or were they laid down without knowing the case, that the Blessed One has the lesser and minor training rules abolished after his passing? If, venerable Nāgasena, it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'I expound the Teaching having directly known, monks, not without having directly known,' then the statement 'If it wishes, Ānanda, the monastic community may abolish the lesser and minor training rules after my passing' is wrong. If by the Truth-finder in the regulation of the monastic discipline it was spoken thus: 'If it wishes, Ānanda, the monastic community may abolish the lesser and minor training rules after my passing,' then the statement 'I expound the Teaching having directly known, monks, not without having directly known' is also wrong. This too is a question with two points, subtle, skilful, profound, very profound, hard to make reflect upon; it has come to you; therein show the diffusion of the power of your knowledge."

"This was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'I expound the Teaching having directly known, monks, not without having directly known,' and in the regulation of the monastic discipline too it was spoken thus: 'If it wishes, Ānanda, the monastic community may abolish the lesser and minor training rules after my passing.' But that, great king, the Truth-finder said while testing the monks: 'Will my disciples, when released by me, exalt the lesser and minor training rules after my passing, or will they take them up?'

"Just as, great king, a wheel-turning monarch might say thus to his sons: 'This, dear sons, is a great country bounded by the ocean in all directions; it is difficult, dear sons, to maintain with just this much power. Come, dear sons, after my passing, abandon the borderland regions.' Would those princes, great king, after their father's passing, release all those borderland regions of the country that had come into their possession?" "No indeed, venerable sir. More greedy than the king, venerable sir, the

princes out of greed for the kingdom would take possession of double or triple the country beyond that; why would they release a country that had come into their possession?" "Just so indeed, great king, the Truth-finder, testing the monks, said thus: 'If it wishes, Ānanda, the monastic community may abolish the lesser and minor training rules after my passing.' For release from suffering, great king, the sons of the Buddha, out of greed for the Teaching, would guard even another one hundred and fifty training rules beyond that; why would they release a training rule that was originally laid down?"

"Venerable Nāgasena, as for what the Blessed One said: 'the lesser and minor training rules,' here people are confused, have become doubtful, are perplexed, have plunged into uncertainty. Which are those lesser training rules, which are the minor training rules?" "Wrong-doing, great king, is the lesser training rule; insulting speech is the minor training rule. These two are the lesser and minor training rules. Even by the great elders of old, great king, doubt was raised here; even by them it was not settled together. In the exposition of the stability of the Teaching, this question was pointed out by the Blessed One." "Long deposited, venerable Nāgasena, the secret of the Conqueror has now today been opened, made manifest, made known in the world."

The question on the lesser and minor rules is the first.

2. The Question on the Undeclared

2. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One: 'There is not, Ānanda, a closed fist of a teacher in the Truth-finder regarding the teachings,' yet when asked a question by the elder Mālukiya-putta, he did not answer. This, venerable Nāgasena, is a question with two points, exclusively based upon either not knowing or keeping secret. If, venerable Nāgasena, it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'There is not, Ānanda, a closed fist of a teacher in the Truth-finder regarding the teachings,' then it was not answered to the elder Mālukiya-putta by one not knowing. If it was not answered by one knowing, then there is a closed fist of a teacher in the Truth-finder regarding the teachings. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'There is not, Ānanda, a closed fist of a teacher in the Truth-finder regarding the teachings,' and the question asked by the elder Mālukiya-putta was not answered, but that was neither by not knowing nor by keeping secret. There are, great king, these four ways of answering questions. What are the four? A question to be answered definitively, a question to be answered analytically, a question to be answered with a counter-question, a question to be set aside.

"And what, great king, is a question to be answered definitively? 'Matter is impermanent' is a question to be answered definitively, 'feeling is impermanent', etc. 'Perception is impermanent', etc. 'Activities are impermanent', etc. 'Consciousness is impermanent' is a question to be answered definitively; this is a question to be answered definitively.

"What is a question to be answered analytically? 'But is matter impermanent?' is a question to be answered analytically, 'but is feeling impermanent?', etc. 'But is perception impermanent?', etc. 'But are activities impermanent?', etc. 'But is consciousness impermanent?' is a question to be answered analytically; this is a question to be answered analytically.

"What is a question to be answered with a counter-question? 'Does one cognise everything with the eye?' - this is a question to be answered with a counter-question.

"What is a question to be set aside? 'The world is eternal' is a question to be set aside, 'the world is non-eternal'. 'The world is finite'. 'The world is infinite'. 'The world is both finite and infinite'. 'The world is neither finite nor infinite'. 'The soul is the same as the body'. 'The soul is one thing and the body another'. 'The Truth-finder exists after death'. 'The Truth-finder does not exist after death'. 'The Truth-finder both exists and does not exist after death'. 'The Truth-finder neither exists nor does not exist after death' is a question to be set aside; this is a question to be set aside.

"The Blessed One, great king, did not answer that question requiring to be set aside for the Elder Mālukiya-putta. But why is that question to be set aside? There is no cause or reason for its explanation, therefore that question is to be set aside. There is no utterance of words without reason or cause for the Buddhas, the Blessed Ones." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on the undeclared is the second.

3. The Question on Fearing and Not Fearing Death

3. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One: 'All tremble at the stick, all fear Death,' and again it was said: 'A Worthy One has gone beyond all fear.' Does indeed, venerable Nāgasena, a Worthy One tremble from fear of punishment, or do beings doomed to hell, blazing, boiling, heated, scorched, passing away from that great hell with blazing fire-flames, fear Death? If, venerable Nāgasena, it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'All tremble at the stick, all fear Death,' then the statement 'A Worthy One has gone beyond all fear' is wrong. If it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'A Worthy One has gone beyond all fear,' then the statement 'All tremble at the stick, all fear Death' is also wrong. This question with two points has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This statement, great king, was not spoken by the Blessed One with reference to Worthy Ones: 'All tremble at the stick, all fear Death.' The Worthy One is set aside in this matter; the cause of fear has been uprooted for the Worthy One. Those beings, great king, who have mental defilements, and those for whom the view of self is excessive, and those who are elated and dejected in pleasures and pains - with reference to them the Blessed One spoke: 'All tremble at the stick, all fear Death.' For the Worthy One, great king, all destinations have been cut off, the mode of generation has been demolished, conception has been destroyed, the ribs have been broken, all attachments to existence have been uprooted, all activities have been cut off, the wholesome and unwholesome have been destroyed, ignorance has been dispelled, consciousness has been made seedless, all mental defilements have been burnt, worldly adversities have been overcome; therefore the Worthy One does not tremble at all fears.

"Here, great king, a king might have four chief ministers who are protectors, who have gained fame, who are trustworthy, placed in a position of great sovereignty. Then when some royal duty has arisen, the king might command all the people throughout his own realm: 'Let all pay tribute to me; you four chief ministers, accomplish that duty.' Would indeed, great king, fear of tribute arise as terror for those four chief ministers?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "For what reason, great king?" "They, venerable sir, have been placed by the king in the highest position; there is no tribute for them; they have gone beyond tribute; with reference to the rest, the king commanded: 'Let all pay tribute to me.'" "Just so indeed, great king, this statement was not spoken by the Blessed One with reference to Worthy Ones; the Worthy One is set aside in this matter; the cause of fear has been uprooted for the Worthy One. Those beings, great king, who have mental defilements, and those for whom the view of self is excessive, and those who are elated and dejected in pleasures and pains - with reference to them the Blessed One spoke: 'All tremble at the stick, all fear Death.' Therefore the Worthy One does not tremble at all fears."

"This statement, venerable Nāgasena, is not with a remainder; this is a statement without remainder: 'all.' Tell me a further reason in this matter to establish that statement."

"Here, great king, a village owner in a village might command a herald: 'Come, my good herald, as many as are the villagers in the village, assemble all of them quickly in my presence.' He, having received it saying 'Good, my lord,' standing in the middle of the village, would proclaim the announcement three times: 'As many as are the villagers in the village, let all of them assemble very quickly in the presence of the lord.' Then those villagers, by the word of the herald, having assembled very quickly, announce to the village owner: 'All the villagers have assembled, my lord; whatever is to be done by you, do that.' Thus, great king, the village owner, while assembling the householders, commands all the villagers, yet those commanded do not all assemble - only the householders assemble. 'Just this many are my villagers' - thus the village owner accepts it. Many others who have not come - women and men, female and male slaves, hired servants, labourers, villagers, the sick, cattle and buffaloes, goats and sheep, dogs - those who have not come, all of them are not counted; because the command 'Let all assemble' was given with reference to the householders only. Just so indeed, great king, this statement was not spoken by the Blessed One with reference to Worthy Ones; the Worthy One is set aside in this matter; the cause of fear has been uprooted for the Worthy One. Those beings, great king, who have mental defilements, and those for whom the view of self is excessive, and those who are elated and dejected in pleasures and pains - with reference to them the Blessed One spoke: 'All tremble at the stick, all fear Death.' Therefore the Worthy One does not tremble at all fears."

"There is, great king, a statement with a remainder and a meaning with a remainder; there is a statement with a remainder and a meaning without remainder; there is a statement without remainder and a meaning with a remainder; there is a statement without remainder and a meaning without remainder. The meaning should be accepted according to each case."

"By five kinds of reasons, great king, the meaning should be accepted: by the direct statement, by the function, by the teacher's lineage, by the intention, and by the

superiority of reason. Here 'direct statement' means the discourse is intended. 'Function' means conformity with the discourse. 'Teacher's lineage' means the teacher's tradition. 'Intention' means one's own understanding. 'Superiority of reason' means a reason that accords with these four. By these five reasons, great king, the meaning should be accepted. Thus this question is well determined."

"Let it be so, Venerable Nāgasena, I accept it thus. Let the Worthy One be set aside in this matter, let the remaining beings tremble, but do beings doomed to hell, experiencing painful, sharp, severe feelings, with all their limbs and minor limbs blazing and burning, with faces weeping, crying, wailing, lamenting and bewailing, overcome by unbearable sharp suffering, without shelter, without refuge, having become without refuge, afflicted with no small sorrow, having the final and last destination, heading for absolute sorrow, possessing the heat of hot, sharp, fierce, harsh, scorching fire, with dreadful, fear-producing roaring great sounds, entangled with sewn garlands of sixfold flames, with the speed of flames pervading a hundred yojanas all around, the miserly, scorching great hells - do they, passing away from there, fear Death?" "Yes, great king."

"Is it not so, Venerable Nāgasena, that hell is experienced as exclusively painful? Why then do those beings doomed to hell, passing away from hells experienced as exclusively painful, fear Death? Why do they delight in hell?" "Those beings doomed to hell, great king, do not delight in hell; they only wish to be released from hell. It is indeed the power of death, great king, by which fear arises in them." "This indeed, Venerable Nāgasena, I do not believe, that fear arises at death for those wishing to be released. It is laughable, Venerable Nāgasena, that state where they obtain what they wished for. Convince me by a reason."

"Death indeed, great king, is a state to be feared for those who have not seen the truth; here people tremble and are agitated. And whoever, great king, fears a black snake, he, fearing death, fears the black snake. And whoever fears an elephant, etc. of a lion, etc. of a tiger, etc. of a panther, etc. of a bear, etc. of a hyena, etc. of a buffalo, etc. of a gayal, etc. of fire, etc. of water, etc. of a stump, etc. fears a thorn. And whoever fears a spear, he, fearing death, fears the spear. That indeed, great king, is the heat of the intrinsic nature of death; by that heat of the intrinsic nature, beings with mental defilements tremble and fear death; even those wishing to be released, great king, beings doomed to hell, tremble and fear death.

"Here, great king, a fatty tumour might arise in a man's body. He, afflicted by that disease, wishing to be completely released from the affliction, might summon a physician, a surgeon. That physician, that surgeon, having accepted his word, might set up equipment for the removal of that disease, might sharpen a knife, might put twin probes into the fire, might have alkaline salt ground on a grindstone. Would fear arise, great king, in that sick person from the cutting with a sharp knife, from the burning with twin probes, from the application of alkaline salt?" "Yes, venerable sir." "Thus, great king, for that sick person, even though wishing to be released from the disease, fear arises from fear of the pain. Just so indeed, great king, for beings doomed to hell, even though wishing to be released from hell, fear arises from fear of death.

"Here, great king, a man who has offended against a lord, bound with bondage of chains, thrown into an inner room, might wish to be completely released; that lord, wishing to release him, might have him summoned. Would fear arise, great king, in that man who has offended against the lord, knowing 'I have committed an offence,' from seeing the lord?" "Yes, venerable sir." "Thus, great king, for that man who has offended against the lord, even though wishing to be completely released, fear arises from fear of the lord. Just so indeed, great king, for beings doomed to hell, even though wishing to be released from hell, fear arises from fear of death."

"Furthermore, venerable sir, tell me a further reason by which reason I might be convinced." "Here, great king, a man might be bitten by a venomous snake with poisonous fangs; he, by that change caused by the poison, might fall, jump up, roll about, and roll over; then a certain man, by a powerful spell, having brought that venomous snake with poisonous fangs, might make it suck back that poison. Would fear arise, great king, in that man from whom the poison has gone, when that venomous snake approaches for the purpose of his well-being?" "Yes, venerable sir." Thus, great king, even when such a snake approaches for the purpose of well-being, fear arises in him. Just so indeed, great king, for beings doomed to hell who wish to be released from hell, fear arises from the fear of death. Death is undesirable for all beings, great king; therefore beings doomed to hell, even though wishing to be released from hell, fear Death." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on fearing and not fearing death is the third.

4. The Question on Release from the Snare of Death

4. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One -

'Not in the sky, not in the middle of the ocean, not by entering a mountain cleft;
There is no spot on earth found, where standing one could be freed from the snare of Death.'

"And again protections were recited by the Blessed One. As follows: the Ratana Sutta, the Metta Sutta, the Khandha Protection, the Mora Protection, the Dhajagga Protection, the Āṭānāṭiya Protection, the Aṅgulimāla Protection. If, venerable Nāgasena, one gone to space, or gone to the middle of the ocean, or gone into a mansion, hut, rock cell, cave, cliff, cleft, hole, mountain opening, or mountain interior is not freed from the snare of Death, then the act of protection is wrong. If by the making of protection there is release from the snare of Death, then 'Not in the sky, etc. the snare of Death' - that statement too is wrong. This too is a question with two points, more knotted than knotted, that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'Not in the sky, etc. the snare of Death,' and protections were recited by the Blessed One; but that is for one with remaining life span, accomplished in vitality, free from the obstruction of action. There is not, great king, for one whose life span is exhausted, any function or means for duration.

"Just as, great king, for a dead tree, dry, hollow, without sap, with life obstructed, with life activities gone, even if a thousand jars of water were poured, there would be neither wetness nor the state of sprouting green. Just so indeed, great king, by the act of medicine and protection there is no function or means for duration for one whose life span is exhausted. Whatever medicines and remedies there are on earth, great king, they too do not accomplish their function for one whose life span is exhausted. Protection protects and guards one with remaining life span, great king, accomplished in vitality, free from the obstruction of action; for that purpose protections were recited by the Blessed One.

"Just as, great king, a farmer might prevent the entry of water when the grain is fully ripe, when the crop stalks are dead; but whatever crop is young, cloud-like, accomplished in vitality, that grows by the increase of water. Just so indeed, great king, the function of medicine and protection is set aside, rejected for one whose life span is exhausted; but for those people who have remaining life span, who are accomplished in vitality, for their benefit protections and medicines were spoken; they grow by protections and medicines."

"If, venerable Nāgasena, one whose life span is exhausted dies, and one with remaining life span lives, then protections and medicines are useless?" "But have you, great king, seen before any disease turned back by medicines?" "Yes, venerable sir, I have seen many hundreds." "Well then, great king, the statement 'the function of protection and medicine is useless' is wrong."

"The efforts of physicians are seen, venerable Nāgasena - medicine drinks and ointments; by those efforts of theirs disease is turned back." "Even when protections are being recited, great king, sound is heard, the tongue becomes dry, the heart is engaged, the throat becomes strained. By that recitation of theirs all diseases are appeased, all calamities depart."

"But have you, great king, seen before anyone bitten by a snake, with the poison being made to fall by a spell, vomiting the poison, rinsing above and below?" "Yes, venerable sir, even now that occurs in the world." "Well then, great king, the statement 'the function of protection and medicine is useless' is wrong. For, great king, a snake wishing to bite a man for whom protection has been made does not bite; it closes its opened mouth; even the raised cudgel of thieves does not come to be; they, having released the cudgel, show affection; even an enraged large bull elephant, having approached, desists; even a blazing great mass of fire, having approached, is extinguished; even deadly poison when eaten becomes medicine, or spreads for the purpose of nourishment; murderers wishing to kill, having approached, become like servants; even a snare stepped upon does not close.

"But have you heard before, great king, 'For seven hundred years a hunter was not able to bring a snare to a peacock for whom protection had been made; on the very day when protection was not made, he brought the snare'?" "Yes, venerable sir, it is heard; that sound has risen up in the world with its gods." "Well then, great king, the statement 'the function of protection and medicine is useless' is wrong.

"But have you heard before, great king, 'a Titan, guarding his wife, having put her in a casket, having swallowed it, carries it about in his belly; then a certain sorcerer, having entered through the mouth of that Titan, enjoys himself together with her;

when that Titan knew, then having vomited up the casket, he opened it; as soon as the casket was opened, the sorcerer departed as he wished'?" "Yes, venerable sir, it is heard; that sound too has risen up in the world with its gods." "Was not that sorcerer, great king, freed from seizure by the power of protection?" "Yes, venerable sir." "Well then, great king, there is the power of protection.

"But have you heard before, great king, 'another sorcerer also, having corrupted the chief queen in the inner palace of the king of Bārāṇasī, being one who had come to seizure, in a moment went to disappearance by the power of spells'?" "Yes, venerable sir, it is heard." "Was not that sorcerer, great king, freed from seizure by the power of protection?" "Yes, venerable sir." "Well then, great king, there is the power of protection."

"Venerable Nāgasena, 'does protection protect everyone indeed?'" "It protects some, great king, it does not protect some." "Well then, Venerable Nāgasena, protection is not universal?" "Does food, great king, protect the life of everyone?" "It protects some, venerable sir, it does not protect some." "Why?" "Because, venerable sir, some, having overeaten that very food, die of cholera." "Well then, great king, food does not protect the life of everyone?" "By two reasons, Venerable Nāgasena, food takes away life - either by overeating or by weakness of digestive heat; Venerable Nāgasena, food which gives life, by wrong use takes away life." "Just so indeed, great king, protection protects some, does not protect some.

"By three reasons, great king, protection does not protect - by obstruction by kamma, by obstruction by mental defilements, by lack of faith. Protection, great king, which guards beings, by what is done by oneself abandons the safeguarding; just as, great king, a mother nourishes a son gone to the womb, gives birth with beneficial care, having given birth, having removed impurity, stain, and mucus, anoints him with the highest excellent fragrance; he at a later time, when reviling or striking the sons of others, gives a blow. They, having become angry with him, having dragged him from the assembly, having seized him, bring him to the masters; if indeed her son has offended, has transgressed the limit. Then the master's men, dragging him, beat and strike him with sticks, clubs, knees, and fists. Is that mother, great king, able to prevent the dragging and pulling, the seizing, the bringing to the masters?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "For what reason, great king?" "By his own offence, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, protection which safeguards beings, by one's own offence makes it barren." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, the question has been well determined, the thicket has been made not a thicket, darkness has been made light, the net of wrong views has been disentangled; you have approached the most excellent of the excellent leaders of groups."

The question on release from the snare of death is the fourth.

5. The Question on Obstacles to Attaining Buddhahood

5. "Venerable Nāgasena, you say 'the Truth-finder is an obtainer of the requisites of robes, almsfood, lodging and medicine for the sick.' And yet the Truth-finder, having entered Pañcasālā, the brahmin village, for almsfood, not having obtained anything, departed with his bowl as washed. If, venerable Nāgasena, the Truth-finder is an obtainer of the requisites of robes, almsfood, lodging and medicine for the sick, then

the statement that having entered Pañcasālā, the brahmin village, for almsfood, not having obtained anything, he departed with his bowl as washed - that statement is wrong. If having entered Pañcasālā, the brahmin village, for almsfood, not having obtained anything, he departed with his bowl as washed, then the statement that the Truth-finder is an obtainer of the requisites of robes, almsfood, lodging and medicine for the sick - that statement too is wrong. This too is a question with two points, very great, hard to unravel, that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"The Truth-finder, great king, is an obtainer of the requisites of robes, almsfood, lodging and medicine for the sick, and having entered Pañcasālā, the brahmin village, for almsfood, not having obtained anything, he departed with his bowl as washed; but that was because of Māra the Evil One." "Well then, venerable Nāgasena, how was the wholesome prepared by the Blessed One during cosmic cycles surpassing the path of counting completed, how was the powerful force of that wholesome blocked by Māra the Evil One who had just arisen? Well then, venerable Nāgasena, in that matter blame comes in two places: unwholesome is more powerful than wholesome, Māra's power is more powerful than the Buddha's power; Well then, the top of a tree is heavier than the root, evil is more powerful than one endowed with virtues." "Not, great king, by just so much is unwholesome indeed more powerful than wholesome, not is Māra's power indeed more powerful than the Buddha's power. But here a reason should be sought.

"Just as, great king, a man might bring honey or a honey-ball or some other tribute to a wheel-turning monarch, and the king's gatekeeper might say to him thus: 'It is not the right time, sir, for seeing the king; well then, sir, having taken your tribute, return very quickly, lest the king impose punishment on you.' Then that man, trembling and agitated from fear of punishment, having taken that tribute, might return very quickly. Would that wheel-turning monarch, great king, by just that mere deficiency of tribute, be called weaker than the gatekeeper, or would he not obtain some other tribute?" "No indeed, venerable sir; out of jealousy, venerable sir, that gatekeeper prevented the tribute; but by another door, even a hundred thousand times as much tribute goes to the king." "Just so indeed, great king, out of jealousy Māra the Evil One took possession of the brahmin householders of Pañcasālā; but many other hundreds of thousands of deities, having taken the deathless divine nutriment, approached, thinking 'We will place nutriment in the Blessed One's body,' standing with joined palms, paying homage to the Blessed One."

"Let it be, venerable Nāgasena, the four requisites are easily obtained for the Blessed One, the highest person in the world; the Blessed One, being requested by gods and humans, uses the four requisites. But yet whatever was Māra's intention, that was accomplished by just so much, in that he created an obstacle to the Blessed One's food. Here, venerable sir, my uncertainty is not cut off; I have become one with doubt, plunged into perplexity. My mind does not spring forward there, that Māra created an obstacle to gain for the Truth-finder, the Worthy One, the Perfectly Enlightened One, the foremost excellent person in the world with its gods, one arisen from excellent wholesome merit, equal to the matchless, incomparable, without equal - something low, sinful, limited, evil, ignoble, failed."

"There are, great king, four obstacles: the obstacle of the unseen, the obstacle of what is designated, the obstacle of what is set aside, and the obstacle of what is

being used. Therein, what is the obstacle of the unseen? Without designating, without seeing, someone creates an obstacle to what is not prepared, thinking 'What is the use of what is given to another?' - this is called the obstacle of the unseen.

"What is the obstacle to what is specifically prepared? Here, having pointed out a certain person, food is prepared for him; someone creates an obstacle to that - this is called the obstacle to what is specifically prepared.

"What is the obstacle to what is set aside? Here, whatever is set aside but not yet accepted, someone creates an obstacle to that - this is called the obstacle to what is set aside.

"What is the obstacle to what is for use? Here, whatever is for use, someone creates an obstacle to that - this is called the obstacle to what is for use. These, great king, are the four obstacles.

"But when Māra the Evil One took possession of the brahmin householders of Pañcasālā, that was neither for the Blessed One's use, nor set aside, nor specifically prepared; it was an obstacle created unseen to what had not arrived, what had not reached; and that was not for the Blessed One alone, but rather all those who had gone forth and arrived at that time, all of them did not obtain food on that day. I do not see anyone, great king, in the world with its gods, with its Māras, with its Brahmās, among the generation with its ascetics and brahmins, with its gods and humans, who could create an obstacle to what was made for the Blessed One, what was set aside, what was for use. If anyone out of envy were to create an obstacle to what was specifically prepared, what was set aside, what was for use, his head would split into a hundred or a thousand pieces.

"There are, great king, these four qualities of the Truth-finder that cannot be obstructed by anyone. Which four? Material gain, great king, specifically prepared and set aside for the Blessed One cannot be obstructed by anyone; the fathom-wide radiance accompanying the body of the Blessed One, great king, cannot be obstructed by anyone; the jewel of omniscient knowledge of the Blessed One, great king, cannot be obstructed by anyone; the life of the Blessed One, great king, cannot be obstructed by anyone. These, great king, are the four qualities of the Truth-finder that cannot be obstructed by anyone; all these qualities, great king, are of one flavour, healthy, unshakable, not subject to attack by others, untouchable functions. Unseen, great king, Māra the Evil One, having hidden, took possession of the brahmin householders of Pañcasālā.

"Just as, great king, in a king's borderland region, in uneven terrain, having hidden unseen, thieves spoil the road. If the king were to see those thieves, would those thieves obtain safety?" "No indeed, venerable sir, he would have them split with a hatchet into a hundred or a thousand pieces." "Just so indeed, great king, unseen, Māra the Evil One, having hidden, took possession of the brahmin householders of Pañcasālā.

"Or else, great king, just as a married woman, unseen, having hidden, keeps company with another man, just so indeed, great king, unseen, Māra the Evil One, having hidden, took possession of the brahmin householders of Pañcasālā. If, great king, a woman were to keep company with another man in the presence of her

husband, would that woman obtain safety?" "No indeed, venerable sir, the husband might kill her, venerable sir, might slay her, might bind her, or might reduce her to slavery." "Just so indeed, great king, unseen, Māra the Evil One, having hidden, took possession of the brahmin householders of Pañcasālā. If, great king, Māra the Evil One were to create an obstacle to what was made for the Blessed One, what was set aside, what was for use, his head would split into a hundred or a thousand pieces." "Thus it is, Venerable Nāgasena, it was done by theft by Māra the Evil One; having hidden, Māra the Evil One took possession of the brahmin householders of Pañcasālā. If, venerable sir, that Māra the Evil One were to create an obstacle to what was made for the Blessed One, what was set aside, what was for use, either his head would split into a hundred or a thousand pieces, or his body would scatter like a handful of chaff. Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on obstacles to attaining Buddhahood is the fifth.

6. The Question on Demerit

6. "Venerable Nāgasena, you say 'one who not knowing commits killing of living beings, he generates more demerit.' And again it was spoken by the Blessed One in the regulation of the monastic discipline: 'There is no offence for one not knowing.' If, venerable Nāgasena, one not knowing committing killing of living beings generates more demerit, then the statement 'there is no offence for one not knowing' is wrong. If there is no offence for one not knowing, then the statement 'one not knowing committing killing of living beings generates more demerit' is also wrong. This too is a question with two points, difficult to answer, difficult to cross, that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'One who not knowing commits killing of living beings, he generates more demerit.' And again it was spoken by the Blessed One in the regulation of the monastic discipline: 'There is no offence for one not knowing.' Therein there is a difference in meaning. What is the difference in meaning? There is, great king, an offence with mitigation due to misperception; there is an offence with no mitigation due to misperception. That offence, great king, which has mitigation due to misperception - concerning that offence it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'There is no offence for one not knowing.'" "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on demerit is the sixth.

7. The Question on Caring for the Community of Monks

7. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One: 'The Truth-finder, Ānanda, does not think thus - "I will lead the Community of monks" or "The Community of monks is under my direction."' And again, while illuminating the intrinsic qualities of the Blessed One Metteyya, it was spoken thus by the Blessed One: 'He will look after a Community of monks numbering many thousands, just as I now look after a Community of monks numbering many hundreds.' If, Venerable Nāgasena, it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'The Truth-finder, Ānanda, does not think thus - "I will lead the Community of monks" or "The Community of monks is under my direction,"' then the statement 'I look after a Community of monks numbering many hundreds' is wrong. If it was spoken by the Truth-finder: 'He will look

after a Community of monks numbering many thousands, just as I now look after a Community of monks numbering many hundreds,' then the statement 'The Truth-finder, Ānanda, does not think thus - "I will lead the Community of monks" or "The Community of monks is under my direction"' is also wrong. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'The Truth-finder, Ānanda, does not think thus - "I will lead the Community of monks" or "The Community of monks is under my direction."' And again, while illuminating the intrinsic qualities of the Blessed One Metteyya, it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'He will look after a Community of monks numbering many thousands, just as I now look after a Community of monks numbering many hundreds.' And in this question, great king, one meaning is with a remainder, one meaning is without remainder. The Truth-finder, great king, is not a follower of the assembly; but the assembly is a follower of the Truth-finder. This is conventional, great king, 'I' and 'mine,' not ultimate reality. Love has departed from the Truth-finder, great king, affection has departed; there is no grasping of 'mine' for the Truth-finder, but with reference to clinging there is support.

"Just as, great king, the earth is a support and dwelling for beings standing on the ground, and these beings stand on the earth, yet the great earth has no expectation 'these are mine,' just so indeed, great king, the Truth-finder is a support and dwelling for all beings, and these beings stand on the Truth-finder, yet the Truth-finder has no expectation 'these are mine.' Or just as, great king, a great rain cloud raining down gives growth to grasses, trees, animals, and humans, and safeguards their continuity. All these beings live on the rain, yet the great cloud has no expectation 'these are mine.' Just so indeed, great king, the Truth-finder generates and safeguards wholesome mental states for all beings; all these beings live on the Teacher, yet the Truth-finder has no expectation 'these are mine.' What is the reason for this? Because the view of self has been abandoned."

"Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, the question has been well unravelled by many reasons, the deep has been made clear, the knot has been cut, the thicket has been made not a thicket, darkness has been made light, the opposing doctrines are broken, vision has been produced for the sons of the Conqueror."

The question on caring for the community of monks is the seventh.

8. The Question on the Undivided Assembly

8. "Venerable Nāgasena, you say 'the Truth-finder has an assembly that cannot be divided,' and again you say 'by Devadatta, all at once, five hundred monks were split off.' If, venerable Nāgasena, the Truth-finder has an assembly that cannot be divided, then the statement that by Devadatta, all at once, five hundred monks were split off is wrong. If by Devadatta, all at once, five hundred monks were split off, then the statement 'the Truth-finder has an assembly that cannot be divided' is also wrong. This too is a question with two points that has come to you, deep, hard to unravel, more knotted than knotted; here people are obstructed, hindered, enveloped, closed, covered up; here show the power of your knowledge in refuting the doctrines of others."

"The Truth-finder has an assembly that cannot be divided, great king, and by Devadatta, all at once, five hundred monks were split off; but that was by the power of the one who causes division. When there is one who causes division, great king, there is nothing called 'that which cannot be divided.' When there is one who causes division, even a mother is divided from her son, even a son is divided from his mother, even a father is divided from his son, even a son is divided from his father, even a brother is divided from his sister, even a sister is divided from her brother, even a friend is divided from his friend, even a boat joined together from various timbers is broken by the force of the impact of waves, even a tree with fruit full of honey is broken when struck by the force of the power of the wind, even gold of good birth is broken by copper. But moreover, great king, this is not the intention of the wise, this is not the disposition of the Buddhas, this is not the wish of the wise that 'the Truth-finder has an assembly that can be divided.' But there is a reason here, by which reason the Truth-finder is called 'one with an assembly that cannot be divided.' What is the reason here? It has never been heard before, great king, that the Truth-finder's assembly was split by any conduct he engaged in, whether by not giving, or by unpleasant speech, or by unbeneficial conduct, or by impartiality; for that reason the Truth-finder is called 'one with an assembly that cannot be divided.' This too should be known by you, great king: 'Is there anything in the ninefold word of the Buddha, come down in the discourses, that by this reason, by something done by the Bodhisatta, the Truth-finder's assembly was split?'" "There is not, venerable sir, and this is neither seen nor heard in the world. Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on the undivided assembly is the eighth.

The Undivided Chapter is the second.

In this chapter there are eight questions.

3. The Chapter on Dismissal

1. The Question on the Foremost Teaching

1. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One: 'For the Teaching, Vāsetṭha, is foremost among people, both in this present life and in the future life.' And again: 'A lay follower, a householder, a stream-enterer, with the realms of misery closed, one attained to right view, who has understood the teaching, pays respect to a monk or a novice who is a worldling, and rises up in respect.' If, venerable Nāgasena, it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'For the Teaching, Vāsetṭha, is foremost among people, both in this present life and in the future life,' then the statement 'A lay follower, a householder, a stream-enterer, with the realms of misery closed, one attained to right view, who has understood the teaching, pays respect to a monk or a novice who is a worldling, and rises up in respect' is wrong. If 'A lay follower, a householder, a stream-enterer, with the realms of misery closed, one attained to right view, who has understood the teaching, pays respect to a monk or a novice who is a worldling, and rises up in respect,' then the statement 'For the Teaching, Vāsetṭha, is foremost among people, both in this present life and in the future life' is also wrong. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'For the Teaching, Vāsetṭha, is foremost among people, both in this present life and in the future life,' and 'A lay follower, a householder, a stream-enterer, with the realms of misery closed, one attained to right view, who has understood the teaching, pays respect to a monk or a novice who is a worldling, and rises up in respect.' But there is a reason for this. What is that reason?

"There are, great king, these twenty qualities that make an ascetic an ascetic and two marks, by which an ascetic is worthy of paying respect, rising up in respect, honour and veneration. What are the twenty qualities that make an ascetic an ascetic and the two marks? Foremost delight in the Teaching, supreme restraint, conduct, abiding, self-control, restraint, patience, meekness, solitary practice, delight in solitude, seclusion, shame and moral fear, energy, diligence, undertaking of the training, recitation, interrogation, delight in morality and so on, freedom from attachment, fulfilment of the training rules, wearing of the orange robe, and the state of being shaven-headed. These, great king, are the twenty qualities that make an ascetic an ascetic and the two marks. A monk lives having undertaken these virtues; because of the non-deficiency, completeness, accomplishment, and endowment with those qualities, he enters the plane of one beyond training, the plane of a Worthy One, he enters the foremost intermediate plane, and because he has approached arahantship, it is proper for a lay follower who is a stream-enterer to pay respect to a monk who is a worldling and to rise up in respect.

""He has attained fellowship with those who have eliminated the mental corruptions; I do not have that opportunity' - thus it is proper for a lay follower who is a stream-enterer to pay respect to a monk who is a worldling and to rise up in respect.

""He has attained the foremost assembly; I have not attained that state' - thus it is proper for a lay follower who is a stream-enterer to pay respect to a monk who is a worldling and to rise up in respect.

""He is able to hear the recitation of the Pātimokkha; I am not able to hear it' - thus it is proper for a lay follower who is a stream-enterer to pay respect to a monk who is a worldling and to rise up in respect.

""He gives the going forth to others, gives full ordination, and increases the Conqueror's Dispensation; I am not able to do this' - thus it is proper for a lay follower who is a stream-enterer to pay respect to a monk who is a worldling and to rise up in respect.

""He is one who completely fulfils the immeasurable training rules; I do not practise in them' - thus it is proper for a lay follower who is a stream-enterer to pay respect to a monk who is a worldling and to rise up in respect.

""He has attained the mark of an ascetic, he stands in the Buddha's intention; I have gone far from that mark' - thus it is proper for a lay follower who is a stream-enterer to pay respect to a monk who is a worldling and to rise up in respect.

""He has grown hair in the armpits, is unanointed and unadorned, with the fragrance of morality unsmeared; but I delight in adornment and decoration' - thus it is proper for a lay follower who is a stream-enterer to pay respect to a monk who is a worldling

and to rise up in respect.

"Moreover, great king, 'Those twenty qualities that make an ascetic an ascetic and the two marks, all these qualities are found in a monk; he himself retains those qualities and also trains others in them; I do not have that approach and training' - thus it is proper for a lay follower who is a stream-enterer to pay respect to a monk who is a worldling and to rise up in respect.

"Just as, great king, a prince studies knowledge in the presence of a chaplain, learns the duties of a warrior, and at a later time, having been consecrated, pays respect to his teacher and rises up in respect, thinking 'This is my trainer,' just so indeed, great king, 'A monk is a trainer, a bearer of the lineage' - thus it is proper for a lay follower who is a stream-enterer to pay respect to a monk who is a worldling and to rise up in respect.

"Moreover, great king, by this method too know the greatness and unequalled vastness of the monk's plane. If, great king, a lay follower who is a stream-enterer realises arahantship, there are only two destinations for him, no other: on that very day he would either attain final Nibbāna or would attain the state of a monk. For that going forth, great king, is immovable, great and very lofty, namely the monk's plane." "The question has gone to knowledge, venerable Nāgasena, well unravelled by you who are powerful and of superior intelligence; no other is competent to unravel this question thus except one wise like you."

The question on the foremost teaching is the first.

2. The Question on Pervading All Beings with Welfare

2. "Venerable Nāgasena, you say 'the Truth-finder, having removed harm, provides welfare for all beings.' And again you say that when the exposition of the Teaching on the Simile of the Mass of Fire was being spoken, 'hot blood gushed from the mouths of about sixty monks.' Venerable sir, by the Truth-finder teaching the exposition of the Teaching on the Simile of the Mass of Fire, welfare was removed and harm was provided for about sixty monks. If, venerable Nāgasena, the Truth-finder, having removed harm, provides welfare for all beings, then the statement that when the exposition of the Teaching on the Simile of the Mass of Fire was being spoken, hot blood gushed from the mouths of about sixty monks - that statement is wrong. If when the exposition of the Teaching on the Simile of the Mass of Fire was being spoken, hot blood gushed from the mouths of about sixty monks, then the statement that the Truth-finder, having removed harm, provides welfare for all beings - that statement too is wrong. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"The Truth-finder, great king, having removed harm, provides welfare for all beings; when the exposition of the Teaching on the Simile of the Mass of Fire was being spoken, hot blood gushed from the mouths of about sixty monks, but that was not by the Truth-finder's doing, but by their own doing."

"If, venerable Nāgasena, the Truth-finder had not spoken the exposition of the Teaching on the Simile of the Mass of Fire, would hot blood have gushed from their mouths?" "No indeed, great king, for those who were wrongly practised, having heard

the Blessed One's exposition of the Teaching, fever arose in their bodies; by that fever of theirs, hot blood gushed from their mouths." "Well then, venerable Nāgasena, it was by the Truth-finder's doing that hot blood gushed from their mouths; the Truth-finder alone was the cause there for their destruction. Just as, venerable Nāgasena, a snake might enter an ant-hill, and then a certain man wanting dust, having broken the ant-hill, might carry away the dust, and by his carrying away the dust, the hole of the ant-hill might be blocked, and then right there, not getting breath, it might die - is not that snake, venerable sir, brought to death by that man's doing?" "Yes, great king." "Just so indeed, venerable Nāgasena, the Truth-finder alone was the cause there for their destruction."

"The Truth-finder, great king, while expounding the Teaching, does not create attraction and aversion; free from attraction and aversion, he expounds the Teaching. Thus when the Teaching is being taught, those there who are rightly practised, they understand fully. But those who are wrongly practised, they fall. Just as, great king, when a man is shaking a mango or a rose-apple or a honey tree, whatever fruits there are substantial and firmly attached, they remain there unfallen, but whatever fruits there have rotten stalks and roots and are weakly attached, they fall. Just so indeed, great king, the Truth-finder, while expounding the Teaching, does not create attraction and aversion; free from attraction and aversion, he expounds the Teaching. Thus when the Teaching is being taught, those there who are rightly practised, they understand fully. But those who are wrongly practised, they fall.

"Or else, great king, a farmer wishing to plant grain ploughs the field; as he ploughs, many hundreds of thousands of grasses die. Just so indeed, great king, the Truth-finder, awakening beings whose minds are mature, free from attraction and aversion, expounds the Teaching. Thus when the Teaching is being taught, those there who are rightly practised, they understand fully. But those who are wrongly practised, they die like grasses.

"Or just as, great king, human beings for the sake of flavour crush sugar-cane with a machine, and as they are crushing the sugar-cane, whatever worms have entered the mouth of the machine, they are crushed. Just so indeed, great king, the Truth-finder, awakening beings whose minds are mature, presses the machine of the Teaching, and those who are wrongly practised there, they die like worms."

"Is it not so, Venerable Nāgasena, that those monks fell by that proclamation of the Teaching?" "Does a carpenter, great king, planing a tree, make it straight and pure?" "No indeed, venerable sir, having removed what is to be avoided, the carpenter makes the tree straight and pure." "Just so indeed, great king, the Truth-finder, protecting the assembly, is not able to awaken beings capable of being awakened; but having removed beings who are wrongly practised, he awakens beings capable of being awakened; but by their own doing, great king, those wrongly practised fall.

"Just as, great king, the plantain, the bamboo, and the mule are destroyed by what is self-produced, just so indeed, great king, those who are wrongly practised, they are destroyed by their own doing and fall.

"Just as, great king, thieves by their own doing receive the gouging out of eyes, impalement, and beheading, just so indeed, great king, those who are wrongly practised, they are destroyed by their own doing and fall. For those about sixty

monks, great king, from whose mouths hot blood gushed forth, that was neither by the doing of the Blessed One, nor by the doing of others, but indeed by their own doing.

"Just as, great king, a man might give the deathless to all people, and they, having consumed that deathless, healthy and long-lived, might be released from all calamities; then a certain man, through wrong use, having consumed that, might reach death - would that man who gave the deathless, great king, commit any demerit on that account?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, the Truth-finder gives the deathless gift of the Teaching to gods and humans in the ten-thousand-fold world system; those beings who are capable, they are awakened by the deathless Teaching. But those beings who are incapable, they are destroyed and fall by the deathless Teaching. Food, great king, protects the life of all beings; some, having eaten it, die of cholera - would that man who gave the food, great king, commit any demerit on that account?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, the Truth-finder gives the deathless gift of the Teaching to gods and humans in the ten-thousand-fold world system; those beings who are capable, they are awakened by the deathless Teaching. But those beings who are incapable, they are destroyed and fall by the deathless Teaching." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on pervading all beings with welfare is the second.

3. The Question on Showing What is Concealed by Cloth

3. "Venerable Nāgasena, this was said by the Truth-finder:

'Restraint by body is good, good is restraint by speech;
Restraint by mind is good, good is restraint everywhere.'

"And yet the Truth-finder, having sat down in the midst of the four assemblies, in front of gods and humans, showed to the brahmin Sela his private parts sheathed in a cloth. If, venerable Nāgasena, it was said by the Blessed One 'Restraint by body is good,' then the statement that he showed to the brahmin Sela his private parts sheathed in a cloth is wrong. If he shows to the brahmin Sela his private parts sheathed in a cloth, then that statement 'Restraint by body is good' is also wrong. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This was said, great king, by the Blessed One 'Restraint by body is good,' and his private parts sheathed in a cloth were shown to the brahmin Sela. For whoever, great king, has uncertainty arisen regarding the Truth-finder, for his awakening the Blessed One shows by supernatural power a corresponding body, he alone sees that wonder."

"But who would believe this, venerable Nāgasena, that one who has gone to an assembly alone sees that secret, while the rest remaining right there do not see it? Come now, point out to me the reason for this, convince me by means of reason." "But have you, great king, previously seen any sick man surrounded by relatives and friends?" "Yes, venerable sir." "Does that assembly, great king, see that feeling by which that man feels the feeling?" "No indeed, venerable sir, that man, venerable sir,

feels it only by himself." "Just so, great king, for whoever has uncertainty arisen regarding the Truth-finder, for him alone the Truth-finder shows by supernormal power a corresponding body for his awakening, he alone sees that wonder.

"Or just as, great king, if a spirit were to possess some man, does that assembly, great king, see that coming of the spirit?" "No indeed, venerable sir, only that afflicted one sees the coming of that spirit." "Just so, great king, for whoever has uncertainty arisen regarding the Truth-finder, for him alone the Truth-finder shows by supernormal power a corresponding body for his awakening, he alone sees that wonder."

"A difficult thing, venerable Nāgasena, was done by the Blessed One, in showing that which should not be shown even to one." "The Blessed One, great king, did not show the secret, but by supernormal power he showed a shadow." "Even when a shadow is seen, venerable sir, the secret is indeed seen, having seen which he came to a conclusion." "Even what is difficult to do, great king, the Truth-finder does to awaken beings capable of being awakened. If, great king, the Truth-finder were to neglect the action, beings capable of being awakened would not awaken. But because, great king, the Truth-finder knows the means to awaken beings capable of being awakened, therefore the Truth-finder awakens those capable of being awakened by whatever means they awaken.

"Just as, great king, a physician, a surgeon, approaches the sick with whatever medicine makes the sick healthy, with that medicine he approaches the sick, he administers an emetic, he administers a purgative, he applies an ointment, he administers an enema. Just so, great king, the Truth-finder awakens by whatever means beings capable of being awakened awaken.

"Or just as, great king, a woman with an obstructed womb shows to a physician her secret that should not be shown, just so, great king, the Truth-finder, to awaken beings capable of being awakened, showed by supernormal power a shadow of the secret that should not be shown. There is no place, great king, called 'not to be shown' with reference to a person. If, great king, anyone would awaken by seeing the Blessed One's heart, the Blessed One would show his heart by means, the Truth-finder, great king, knows the means, is skilled in teaching.

"Surely, great king, the Truth-finder, having known the disposition of the elder Nanda, led him to that divine abode and showed him the heavenly maidens, thinking 'by this means this son of good family will understand,' and by that means that son of good family understood. Thus indeed, great king, the Truth-finder, while in many ways scorning, censuring, and loathing the sign of the beautiful, showed the dove-footed nymphs for the sake of his awakening. Thus too the Truth-finder is one who knows the appropriate means, skilled in teaching.

"Furthermore, great king, the Truth-finder, having approached the elder Cūḷapanthaka who had been expelled by his brother, who was distressed and dejected, gave him a fine piece of cloth, thinking 'by this means this son of good family will understand,' and that son of good family by that means attained mastery in the Conqueror's Dispensation. Thus too, great king, the Truth-finder is one who knows the appropriate means, skilled in teaching.

"Furthermore, great king, the Truth-finder, when asked a question by the brahmin Mogharāja up to the third time, did not answer, thinking 'thus this son of good family's conceit will subside, and through the subsiding of conceit there will be full realisation,' and by that means that son of good family's conceit subsided, and through the subsiding of conceit that brahmin attained mastery in the six direct knowledges. Thus too, great king, the Truth-finder is one who knows the appropriate means, skilled in teaching."

"Excellent, venerable Nāgasena, the question has been well unravelled by manifold reasons, the thicket has been made a non-thicket, darkness has been made light, the knot has been broken, the opposing doctrines have been shattered, vision has been produced by you for the sons of the Conqueror, the sectarians are without discernment, you have approached the most excellent of the excellent leaders."

The question on showing what is concealed by cloth is the third.

4. The Question on the Existence of Harsh Speech

4. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the elder Sāriputta, the General of the Teaching: 'The Truth-finder, friends, is of pure verbal conduct; there is no verbal misconduct of the Truth-finder that the Truth-finder should guard against, thinking: "Let not another know this of me."' And yet the Truth-finder, when laying down the offence involving expulsion regarding the offence of the elder Sudinna the Kalanda's son, behaved with harsh speech, with the address 'foolish man,' and because of that, that elder, being obstructed by a dejected mind through the address 'foolish man,' became remorseful and was not able to penetrate the noble path. If, Venerable Nāgasena, the Truth-finder is of pure verbal conduct, there is no verbal misconduct of the Truth-finder, then the statement that the Truth-finder behaved with the address 'foolish man' regarding the offence of the elder Sudinna the Kalanda's son is wrong. If the Blessed One behaved with the address 'foolish man' regarding the offence of the elder Sudinna the Kalanda's son, then the statement that the Truth-finder is of pure verbal conduct, there is no verbal misconduct of the Truth-finder, that too is wrong. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the elder Sāriputta, the General of the Teaching: 'The Truth-finder, friends, is of pure verbal conduct; there is no verbal misconduct of the Truth-finder that the Truth-finder should guard against, thinking: "Let not another know this of me."' And regarding the offence of the Venerable Sudinna the Kalanda's son, when laying down the offence involving expulsion, the Blessed One behaved with the address 'foolish man,' but that was with an uncorrupted mind, without vehemence, with an exact characteristic. And what is the exact characteristic there? For whatever person, great king, there is no full realisation of the four truths in this individual existence, his masculinity is empty; one thing being done, another comes to be by another; therefore he is called 'a foolish man.' Thus, great king, the Blessed One behaved towards the Venerable Sudinna the Kalanda's son with a truthful statement, not with a false statement."

"Even regarding the intrinsic nature, Venerable Nāgasena, whoever speaks while reviling, we impose a fine of a coin on him; that is indeed an offence - he reviles while practising a separate convention in dependence on a matter." "But have you, great king, heard before of paying respect or rising up in respect or honour or giving of gifts to one who has stumbled?" "No indeed, venerable sir, from wherever, wherever one has stumbled, he is worthy of censure, worthy of reproof; they even cut off his head, they also strike, they also bind, they also kill, they also burn." "Well then, great king, a function was indeed performed by the Blessed One, not non-function."

"Even a function, Venerable Nāgasena, should be done by one doing it in a fitting manner, in a suitable manner. Even by hearing, Venerable Nāgasena, the world with its gods has moral fear and shame towards the Truth-finder; more so by seeing, even more by approaching, by attending upon." "Does a physician, great king, when the body is congested, when the disorder is aggravated, give softening medicines?" "No indeed, venerable sir, he gives sharp, scraping medicines." "Just so indeed, great king, the Truth-finder gives instruction for the appeasement of all the diseases of mental defilements. Even the harsh speech of the Truth-finder, great king, softens beings, makes them gentle. Just as, great king, even hot water softens whatever is to be softened, makes it soft, just so indeed, great king, even the harsh speech of the Truth-finder is full of meaning, accompanied by compassion. Just as, great king, a father's word is full of meaning for his sons, accompanied by compassion, just so indeed, great king, even the harsh speech of the Truth-finder is full of meaning, accompanied by compassion. Even the harsh speech of the Truth-finder, great king, is for the abandoning of mental defilements of beings. Just as, great king, even foul-smelling cow's urine when drunk, even tasteless medicine when chewed, destroys the disease of beings, just so indeed, great king, even the harsh speech of the Truth-finder is full of meaning, accompanied by compassion. Just as, great king, even a large heap of cotton, having fallen on another's body, does not cause pain, just so indeed, great king, even the harsh speech of the Truth-finder does not produce suffering for anyone." "Well determined, Venerable Nāgasena, is the question by many reasons. Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on the existence of harsh speech is the fourth.

5. The Question on the Existence of Non-Sentience in Trees

5. "Venerable Nāgasena, this was said by the Truth-finder:

'Brahmin, knowing this foliage to be without consciousness, not hearing, not knowing;
You who are strenuous in energy, constantly heedful, ask about sleeping happily - for what reason?'

And again it was said:

'Thus the Phandana tree too, at that very moment, spoke;
I too have a word, Bhāradvāja, listen to me.'

"If, Venerable Nāgasena, a tree is without consciousness, then the statement that the Phandana tree conversed with Bhāradvāja is wrong. If the Phandana tree conversed with Bhāradvāja, then the statement that a tree is without consciousness, that too is

wrong. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'A tree is without consciousness,' and the Phandana tree conversed with Bhāradvāja; but that statement was spoken according to popular convention. There is not, great king, any conversation of a tree without consciousness; but, great king, this is a designation for the deity dwelling in that tree as 'tree,' and 'the tree converses' - this is a popular designation. Just as, great king, people call a cart filled with grain a 'grain cart,' yet that cart is not made of grain, the cart is made of wood; but because grain is heaped in that cart, people call it a 'grain cart.' Just so indeed, great king, a tree does not converse, a tree is without consciousness; but the deity dwelling in that tree - that is just a designation for her as 'tree,' and 'the tree converses' - this is a popular designation.

"Or else, great king, one churning curds says 'I am churning buttermilk,' yet it is not buttermilk that he churns; churning just curds, he says 'I am churning buttermilk.' Just so indeed, great king, a tree does not converse, a tree is without consciousness. But the deity dwelling in that tree - that is just a designation for her as 'tree,' and 'the tree converses' - this is a popular designation.

"Or else, great king, one wishing to accomplish what is not yet present says 'I am accomplishing what is present,' one says 'accomplished' of what is not accomplished - thus this is popular convention. Just so indeed, great king, a tree does not converse, a tree is without consciousness. But the deity dwelling in that tree - that is just a designation for her as 'tree,' and 'the tree converses' - this is a popular designation. By whatever popular convention, great king, people express themselves, by that very popular convention the Truth-finder too expounds the Teaching to beings." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on the existence of non-sentience in trees is the fifth.

6. The Question on the Great Fruit of Almsfood

6. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the elder monks who held the recital of sacred scriptures -

"'Having eaten the meal of Cunda, the smith's son, thus have I heard;
The wise one experienced an illness, severe, bordering on death.'

"And again it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'These two, Ānanda, almsfoods are of equal fruit, of equal result, far greater in fruit and far greater in benefit than other almsfoods. Which two? The almsfood having eaten which the Truth-finder fully awakens to the unsurpassed perfect enlightenment, and the almsfood having eaten which the Truth-finder attains final Nibbāna through the Nibbāna element without residue of clinging. These two almsfoods are of equal fruit, of equal result, far greater in fruit and far greater in benefit than other almsfoods.' If, venerable Nāgasena, a severe illness arose in the Blessed One who had finished eating the meal of Cunda, and painful feelings occurred bordering on death, then the statement 'These two, Ānanda, almsfoods are of equal fruit, of equal result, far greater in fruit and far greater in benefit than other almsfoods' is wrong. If these two almsfoods are of equal

fruit, of equal result, far greater in fruit and far greater in benefit than other almsfoods, then the statement that a severe illness arose in the Blessed One who had finished eating the meal of Cunda, and painful feelings occurred bordering on death, that too is wrong. Is that almsfood indeed, venerable Nāgasena, of great fruit because of going to poison, of great fruit because of producing disease, of great fruit because of destroying life, of great fruit because of taking the Blessed One's life? Tell me the reason for this, for the refutation of the doctrines of others; here people are deluded, thinking that bloody diarrhoea arose through eating too much under the influence of greed. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the elder monks who held the recital of sacred scriptures -

""Having eaten the meal of Cunda, the smith's son, thus have I heard;
The wise one experienced an illness, severe, bordering on death.'

"And it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'These two, Ānanda, almsfoods are of equal fruit, of equal result, far greater in fruit and far greater in benefit than other almsfoods. Which two? The almsfood having eaten which the Truth-finder fully awakens to the unsurpassed perfect enlightenment, and the almsfood having eaten which the Truth-finder attains final Nibbāna through the Nibbāna element without residue of clinging - these two almsfoods are of equal fruit, of equal result, far greater in fruit and far greater in benefit than other almsfoods.'

"That almsfood, however, was of many virtues and many benefits. The deities, great king, joyful, with devoted minds, thinking 'This is the Blessed One's last almsfood,' sprinkled divine nutriment on the pig's delight. And that was properly cooked, easily digestible, delightful, of many flavours, beneficial for the fire of the stomach. Not, great king, on that account did any unarisen disease arise in the Blessed One; but rather, great king, in the Blessed One's body which was naturally weak, with the life principle exhausted, the arisen disease increased further.

"Just as, great king, a fire burning naturally, when other fuel is given, blazes up more, even so indeed, great king, in the Blessed One's body which was naturally weak, with the life principle exhausted, the arisen disease increased further.

"Or just as, great king, a stream flowing naturally, when a great rain cloud has emerged, becomes a great flood carrying water, even so indeed, great king, in the Blessed One's body which was naturally weak, with the life principle exhausted, the arisen disease increased further.

"Or just as, great king, a belly naturally full of humours, when something else is swallowed, would extend further, even so indeed, great king, in the Blessed One's body which was naturally weak, with the life principle exhausted, the arisen disease increased further. There is not, great king, any fault in that almsfood, nor is it possible to attribute fault to it."

"Venerable Nāgasena, for what reason are those two almsfoods of equal fruit, of equal result, far greater in fruit and far greater in benefit than other almsfoods?" "By the power of attainment through reviewing the mental states, great king, those two

almsfoods are of equal fruit, of equal result, far greater in fruit and far greater in benefit than other almsfoods."

"Venerable Nāgasena, by the power of attainment through reviewing which mental states are those two almsfoods of equal fruit, of equal result, far greater in fruit and far greater in benefit than other almsfoods?" "By the power of attaining the nine progressive abiding attainments in forward and reverse order, great king, those two almsfoods are of equal fruit, of equal result, far greater in fruit and far greater in benefit than other almsfoods."

"Venerable Nāgasena, did the Truth-finder exceedingly attain the nine progressive abiding attainments in forward and reverse order in just two days?" "Yes, great king." "Wonderful, Venerable Nāgasena, marvellous, Venerable Nāgasena. That which is the incomparable supreme gift in this Buddha-field, even that is not counted among these two almsfoods. Wonderful, Venerable Nāgasena, marvellous, Venerable Nāgasena. How great are the nine progressive abiding attainments, inasmuch as by the power of the nine progressive abiding attainments a gift becomes of greater fruit and greater benefit. Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on the great fruit of almsfood is the sixth.

7. The Question on Honouring the Buddha

7. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Truth-finder: 'You, Ānanda, should not be occupied with the veneration of the Truth-finder's body.' And again it was said:

'Venerate the relic of one worthy of veneration;
Thus indeed you will go from here to heaven.'

"If, Venerable Nāgasena, it was spoken by the Truth-finder: 'You, Ānanda, should not be occupied with the veneration of the Truth-finder's body,' then the statement 'Venerate the relic of one worthy of veneration, thus doing you will go from here to heaven' is wrong. If it was spoken by the Truth-finder: 'Venerate the relic of one worthy of veneration, thus doing you will go from here to heaven,' then the statement 'You, Ānanda, should not be occupied with the veneration of the Truth-finder's body' is also wrong. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'You, Ānanda, should not be occupied with the veneration of the Truth-finder's body,' and again it was said: 'Venerate the relic of one worthy of veneration, thus doing you will go from here to heaven,' but that was not spoken concerning all the sons of the Conqueror: 'You, Ānanda, should not be occupied with the veneration of the Truth-finder's body.' For this, great king, is an invalid act for the sons of the Conqueror, that is to say, veneration; exploration of activities, wise attention, observation of the establishments of mindfulness, grasping the essence of the object, warfare against defilements, pursuit of one's own welfare - this is to be done by the sons of the Conqueror; veneration is to be done by the remaining gods and humans.

"Just as, great king, on earth for princes, training in elephants, horses, chariots, bows, sword-hilts, writing, seals, swords, sacred hymns, the Vedas, convention, warfare, and

military tactics is to be done, while for the remaining various merchants and workers, farming, trade, and cow-keeping is to be done, even so, great king, this is an invalid act for the sons of the Conqueror, that is to say, veneration; exploration of activities, wise attention, observation of the establishments of mindfulness, grasping the essence of the object, warfare against defilements, pursuit of one's own welfare - this is to be done by the sons of the Conqueror; veneration is to be done by the remaining gods and humans.

"Or else, great king, just as for brahmin students, training in the Rig Veda, Yajur Veda, Sāma Veda, Atharva Veda, marks, history, ancient texts, glossary, ritual, phonetics, terms, grammar, linguistics, omens, dreams, signs, the six factors, lunar eclipses, solar eclipses, the course of Venus and Rāhu, planetary warfare, divine thunder, descent, meteor falls, earthquakes, burning of directions, terrestrial and atmospheric phenomena, astrology, sophistry, the cart-wheel, the deer-wheel, the intermediate wheel, mixed arising, and bird calls and cries is to be done, while for the remaining various merchants and workers, farming, trade, and cow-keeping is to be done, even so, great king, this is an invalid act for the sons of the Conqueror, that is to say, veneration; exploration of activities, wise attention, observation of the establishments of mindfulness, grasping the essence of the object, warfare against defilements, pursuit of one's own welfare - this is to be done by the sons of the Conqueror; veneration is to be done by the remaining gods and humans. Therefore, great king, the Truth-finder said 'You, Ānanda, should not be occupied with the veneration of the Truth-finder's body,' thinking 'Let these not engage in an invalid act, let these engage in a valid act.' If, great king, the Truth-finder had not spoken this, monks would even use up their own bowls and robes and just make offerings to the Buddha." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on honouring the Buddha is the seventh.

8. The Question on the Foot Struck by a Splinter

8. "Venerable Nāgasena, you say 'when the Blessed One was walking, this senseless great earth rises up where it is low, and bends down where it is high,' and again you say 'the Blessed One's foot was cut by a splinter.' That splinter which fell upon the Blessed One's foot, why then did that splinter not turn back from the Blessed One's foot? If, venerable Nāgasena, when the Blessed One was walking, this senseless great earth rises up where it is low, and bends down where it is high, then the statement 'the Blessed One's foot was cut by a splinter' is wrong. If the Blessed One's foot was cut by a splinter, then the statement 'when the Blessed One was walking, this senseless great earth rises up where it is low, and bends down where it is high' is also wrong. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"True, great king, it is so that when the Blessed One was walking, this senseless great earth rises up where it is low, and bends down where it is high, and the Blessed One's foot was cut by a splinter; but that splinter did not fall by its own nature, it fell by Devadatta's assault. Devadatta, great king, bound resentment towards the Blessed One for many hundreds of thousands of births; he, with that resentment, released a great stone the size of a pinnacle building, thinking 'I shall drop it upon the Blessed

One.' Then two rocks, having risen up from the earth, received that stone; then by the blow of those, a splinter having broken off from the stone, falling here and there, fell upon the Blessed One's foot."

"But just as, venerable Nāgasena, the two rocks received the stone, so too the splinter should have been received?" "Even when received, great king, something here trickles through and flows away and does not stay in place; just as, great king, water held in the hand trickles through the spaces between the fingers and flows away and does not stay in place; milk, buttermilk, honey, ghee, fish sauce, meat sauce held in the hand trickles through the spaces between the fingers and flows away and does not stay in place; just so indeed, great king, by the blow of the two rocks that had come for the purpose of receiving, a splinter having broken off from the stone, falling here and there, fell upon the Blessed One's foot.

"Or else, great king, just as sand equal to smooth, fine, minute dust, held in the fist, trickles through the spaces between the fingers and flows away and does not stay in place; just so indeed, great king, by the blow of the two rocks that had come for the purpose of receiving, a splinter having broken off from the stone, falling here and there, fell upon the Blessed One's foot.

"Or else, great king, just as a mouthful held in the mouth, having slipped from someone's mouth, trickles through and flows away and does not stay in place; just so indeed, great king, by the blow of the two rocks that had come for the purpose of receiving, a splinter having broken off from the stone, falling here and there, fell upon the Blessed One's foot."

"Let it be, venerable Nāgasena, that the stone was received by the rocks; then should not esteem have been shown by the splinter too, just as by the great earth?" "These twelve, great king, do not show esteem. Which twelve? One lustful does not show esteem through the influence of lust; one corrupt through the influence of hate; one deluded through the influence of delusion; one conceited through the influence of conceit; one without virtue through lack of distinction; one obstinate through inability to be restrained; one inferior through inferior nature; one obedient through lack of independence; one evil through miserliness; one made to suffer through causing suffering in return; one greedy through being overcome by greed; one striving does not show esteem through accomplishing one's own purpose. These, great king, are the twelve that do not show esteem. But that splinter, having broken off by the blow of the stone, with direction made signless, falling here and there, fell upon the Blessed One's foot.

"Or else, great king, just as smooth, fine, minute dust, struck by the force of the wind, with direction made signless, scatters here and there; just so indeed, great king, that splinter, having broken off by the blow of the stone, with direction made signless, falling here and there, fell upon the Blessed One's foot. If, moreover, great king, that splinter had not become separate from the stone, those rocks, having flown up, would have seized even the stone with its splinter. But this splinter, great king, was neither situated on the ground nor situated in the sky; having broken off by the force of the blow of the stone, with direction made signless, falling here and there, it fell upon the Blessed One's foot.

"Or else, great king, just as an old leaf lifted up by a whirlwind, with direction made

signless, falls here and there; just so indeed, great king, this splinter, with direction made signless by the force of the blow of the stone, falling here and there, fell upon the Blessed One's foot. But moreover, great king, for the ungrateful, miserly Devadatta's experiencing of suffering, the splinter fell upon the Blessed One's foot." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on the foot struck by a splinter is the eighth.

9. The Question on the Foremost of the Foremost Ascetics

9. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One: 'With the elimination of the mental corruptions, he is an ascetic.' And again it was said:

'Endowed with four qualities, him indeed they call an ascetic in the world.'

Here these are the four qualities: patience, eating little, abandoning of delight, and nothingness. But all these exist for one whose mental corruptions are not eliminated, for one with mental defilements. If, Venerable Nāgasena, with the elimination of the mental corruptions he is an ascetic, then the statement 'Endowed with four qualities, him indeed they call an ascetic in the world' is wrong. If one endowed with four qualities is an ascetic, then the statement 'With the elimination of the mental corruptions, he is an ascetic' is also wrong. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'With the elimination of the mental corruptions, he is an ascetic.' And again it was said: 'Endowed with four qualities, him indeed they call an ascetic in the world.' That statement, great king, was spoken with reference to the qualities of those various persons: 'Endowed with four qualities, him indeed they call an ascetic in the world'; but this is a statement without remainder: 'With the elimination of the mental corruptions, he is an ascetic.'

"Moreover, great king, whoever are practising for the peace of mental defilements, all of them, taking again and again, one who has eliminated the mental corruptions is declared the foremost ascetic. Just as, great king, whatever water-born and land-born flowers there are, jasmine is declared the foremost among them; whatever remaining various kinds of flowers there are, all of them are indeed flowers, but taking again and again, jasmine alone is the flower wished for and desired by people. Just so, great king, whoever are practising for the peace of mental defilements, all of them, taking again and again, one who has eliminated the mental corruptions is declared the foremost ascetic.

"Or else, great king, among all grains, rice is declared the foremost; whatever remaining various kinds of grains there are, all of them, taking again and again, are foods for the sustenance of the body, but rice alone is declared the foremost among them. Just so, great king, whoever are practising for the peace of mental defilements, all of them, taking again and again, one who has eliminated the mental corruptions is declared the foremost ascetic." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on the foremost of the foremost ascetics is the ninth.

10. The Question on Speaking Praise

10. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One: 'Monks, if others speak in praise of me, or in praise of the Teaching, or in praise of the Community, therein you should not feel joy, pleasure, or mental elation.' And yet the Truth-finder, when the brahmin Sela was speaking praise in conformity with the truth, delighted, glad, elated, spoke highly of his own qualities even more and further -

"I am a king, Sela,' said the Blessed One, 'the unsurpassed king of righteousness;
By righteousness I turn the wheel, the wheel that cannot be turned back.'

"If, Venerable Nāgasena, it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'Monks, if others speak in praise of me, or in praise of the Teaching, or in praise of the Community, therein you should not feel joy, pleasure, or mental elation,' then the statement that when the brahmin Sela was speaking praise in conformity with the truth, he, delighted, glad, elated, spoke highly of his own qualities even more and further, is wrong. If when the brahmin Sela was speaking praise in conformity with the truth, he, delighted, glad, elated, spoke highly of his own qualities even more and further, then that statement 'Monks, if others speak in praise of me, or in praise of the Teaching, or in praise of the Community, therein you should not feel joy, pleasure, or mental elation' is also wrong. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'Monks, if others speak in praise of me, or in praise of the Teaching, or in praise of the Community, therein you should not feel joy, pleasure, or mental elation.' And when the brahmin Sela was speaking praise in conformity with the truth, his own qualities were spoken highly of even more and further -

"I am a king, Sela,' said the Blessed One, 'the unsurpassed king of righteousness;
By righteousness I turn the wheel, the wheel that cannot be turned back.'

"First, great king, by the Blessed One, while illuminating the Teaching's characteristic of intrinsic nature and function, its intrinsic nature, unerring, factual, true, and true in meaning, it was spoken: 'Monks, if others speak in praise of me, or in praise of the Teaching, or in praise of the Community, therein you should not feel joy, pleasure, or mental elation.' But that which was spoken highly of by the Blessed One as his own qualities even more and further, when the brahmin Sela was speaking praise in conformity with the truth - 'I am a king, Sela,' said the Blessed One, 'the unsurpassed king of righteousness' - that was not because of material gain, not because of fame, not for one's own sake, not because of faction, not from desire for pupils, but rather out of compassion, out of pity, for the sake of welfare, thinking 'Thus there will be full realisation of the teaching for this one and for three hundred young men'; thus his own qualities were spoken of even more and further - 'I am a king, Sela,' said the Blessed One, 'the unsurpassed king of righteousness.' "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on speaking praise is the tenth.

11. The Question on Restraining through Non-Violence

11. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One: 'Not harming another in the world, you will become dear, devoted to me.' And again it was said: 'One should restrain one deserving restraint, one should encourage one deserving encouragement.' Restraint, Venerable Nāgasena, means cutting off of hands, cutting off of feet, murder, imprisonment, torture, killing, disruption of continuity; this statement is not fitting for the Blessed One, nor is the Blessed One worthy to speak this statement. If, Venerable Nāgasena, it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'Not harming another in the world, you will become dear, devoted to me,' then the statement 'One should restrain one deserving restraint, one should encourage one deserving encouragement' is wrong. If it was spoken by the Truth-finder: 'One should restrain one deserving restraint, one should encourage one deserving encouragement,' then the statement 'Not harming another in the world, you will become dear, devoted to me' is also wrong. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'Not harming another in the world, you will become dear, devoted to me,' and it was said: 'One should restrain one deserving restraint, one should encourage one deserving encouragement.' 'Not harming another in the world, you will become dear, devoted to me' - this, great king, is approved by all Truth-finders; this is the instruction, this is the proclamation of the Teaching; for the Teaching, great king, has the characteristic of non-violence; this is a statement of intrinsic nature. But that which, great king, the Truth-finder said: 'One should restrain one deserving restraint, one should encourage one deserving encouragement' - this is a manner of speaking; the agitated mind, great king, should be restrained; the sluggish mind should be encouraged. Unwholesome consciousness should be restrained; wholesome consciousness should be encouraged. Unwise attention should be restrained; wise attention should be encouraged. One wrongly practising should be restrained; one rightly practising should be encouraged. The ignoble one should be restrained; the noble one should be encouraged. A thief should be restrained; a non-thief should be encouraged."

"Let it be so, Venerable Nāgasena, now you have come back to my domain; what I ask, that purpose has been attained by me. But, Venerable Nāgasena, how should a thief be restrained by one who restrains?" "A thief, great king, should be restrained by one who restrains thus: one deserving rebuke should be rebuked, one deserving punishment should be punished, one deserving banishment should be banished, one deserving imprisonment should be imprisoned, one deserving execution should be executed." "But, Venerable Nāgasena, is the execution of thieves approved by the Truth-finders?" "No indeed, great king." "But why is a thief to be instructed approved by the Truth-finders?" "He who, great king, is executed, is not executed by the approval of the Truth-finders; he is executed by what was done by himself; but he is instructed by the instruction of the Teaching. But is it possible, great king, for you to seize and execute an innocent man who has committed no offence, walking along the street?" "It is not possible, venerable sir." "For what reason, great king?" "Because of his innocence, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, a thief is not killed by the approval of the Truth-finders; he is killed by what was done by himself. But does the instructor here commit any fault?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Well then, great king, the instruction of the Truth-finders is right instruction." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

12. The Question on the Dismissal of a Monk

12. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One: 'I am without wrath, free from barrenness,' yet the Truth-finder dismissed the elders Sāriputta and Moggallāna together with their following. Did indeed, venerable Nāgasena, the Truth-finder dismiss the assembly being angry, or did he dismiss them being satisfied? Know this much, this is the name of it. If, venerable Nāgasena, he dismissed the assembly being angry, then the Truth-finder's wrath was not turned back; if he dismissed them being satisfied, then they were dismissed without grounds by one not knowing. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'I am without wrath, free from barrenness,' and the elders Sāriputta and Moggallāna together with their following were dismissed, but that was not by irritation. Here, great king, some man, having stumbled on a root or a stump or a stone or a potsherd or an uneven piece of ground of the great earth, falls. Does indeed, great king, the great earth, being angry, cause him to fall?" "No indeed, venerable sir, there is no irritation or confidence in the great earth; the great earth is free from favouritism and aversion; he himself, being lazy, having stumbled, fell." "Just so indeed, great king, there is no irritation or confidence in the Truth-finders; the Truth-finders, Worthy Ones, Perfectly Enlightened Ones are free from favouritism and aversion; but they were dismissed by their own deed, by their own offence.

"But here, great king, the great ocean does not associate with a dead corpse; whatever dead corpse there is in the great ocean, it quickly throws it out, pushes it onto dry land. Does indeed, great king, the great ocean, being angry, throw out that corpse?" "No indeed, venerable sir, there is no irritation or confidence in the great ocean; the great ocean is free from favouritism and aversion." "Just so indeed, great king, there is no irritation or confidence in the Truth-finders; the Truth-finders, Worthy Ones, Perfectly Enlightened Ones are free from favouritism and aversion; but they were dismissed by their own deed, by their own offence.

"Just as, great king, one who has stumbled on the earth falls, so one who has stumbled in the excellent Dispensation of the Conqueror is dismissed. Just as, great king, a dead corpse is thrown out in the ocean, so one who has stumbled in the excellent Dispensation of the Conqueror is dismissed. But those whom, great king, the Truth-finder dismissed, wishing for their welfare, wishing for their benefit, wishing for their happiness, wishing for their purification, thinking 'thus these will be released from birth, ageing, disease, and death,' he dismissed them." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on the dismissal of a monk is the twelfth.

The Dismissal Chapter is the third.

In this chapter there are twelve questions.

4. The Chapter on Omniscient Knowledge

1. The Question on Supernormal Power and the Result of Action

1. "Venerable Nāgasena, this was spoken by the Blessed One: 'This is the foremost, monks, of my disciples who are monks possessing supernormal power, namely Mahāmoggallāna.' And yet, it is said, he was beaten all over with cudgels, his head broken, his bones and flesh crushed, his veins severed, his limbs destroyed, and attained final Nibbāna. If, Venerable Nāgasena, the Elder Mahāmoggallāna had reached the summit of supernormal power, then the statement that he was beaten with cudgels and attained final Nibbāna is wrong. If he was beaten all over with cudgels and attained final Nibbāna, then the statement that he had reached the summit of supernormal power is also wrong. Was he not able to remove harm to himself by supernormal power, and worthy to become a refuge for the world including the gods? This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'This is the foremost, monks, of my disciples who are monks possessing supernormal power, namely Mahāmoggallāna.' And the Venerable Mahāmoggallāna, struck by cudgels, attained final Nibbāna; but that was because he was seized by kamma."

"Is it not so, Venerable Nāgasena, that for one possessing supernormal power, both the domain of supernormal power and the result of kamma are two inconceivables; should not the inconceivable be removed by the inconceivable? Just as, venerable sir, some desiring fruit knock down a wood-apple with a wood-apple, knock down a mango with a mango, even so, Venerable Nāgasena, having struck the inconceivable with the inconceivable, should it not be removed?" "Even among the inconceivables, great king, one is exceeding, more powerful. Just as, great king, on earth there are kings of equal birth, yet among those of equal birth, one, having overcome all, wields authority. Just so indeed, great king, among those inconceivables, the result of kamma alone is exceeding, more powerful; the result of kamma alone, having overcome all, wields authority; for one seized by kamma, the remaining functions do not obtain opportunity."

"But here, great king, some man commits an offence in some matter; neither his mother nor father nor sister nor brothers nor friend nor companions protect him; then the king alone, having overcome there, wields authority. What is the reason there? The state of being an offender. Just so indeed, great king, among those inconceivables, the result of kamma alone is exceeding, more powerful; the result of kamma alone, having overcome all, wields authority; for one seized by kamma, the remaining functions do not obtain opportunity."

"Or else, great king, when a forest fire has arisen on earth, even a thousand pots of water cannot extinguish it; then the fire alone, having overcome there, wields authority. What is the reason there? Because of the power of the heat. Just so indeed, great king, among those inconceivables, the result of kamma alone is exceeding, more powerful; the result of kamma alone, having overcome all, wields authority; for one seized by kamma, the remaining functions do not obtain opportunity. Therefore, great king, for the Venerable Mahāmoggallāna, seized by kamma, being beaten with cudgels, there was no attentiveness to supernormal power." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

2. The Question on What is Concealed and Not Concealed in the Teaching and Discipline

2. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One: 'The Teaching and discipline proclaimed by the Truth-finder, monks, shines when unveiled, not when concealed.' And yet the recitation of the principal monastic code (Pātimokkha) and the entire Canon of monastic discipline are closed and concealed. If, venerable Nāgasena, in the Conqueror's Dispensation one who is fit or proper should obtain the right time, the regulation of monastic discipline when unveiled would shine. For what reason? Only therein is training, self-control, restraint, the regulation of morality, virtue, and good conduct, the flavour of meaning, the flavour of the teaching, the flavour of liberation. If, venerable Nāgasena, it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'The Teaching and discipline proclaimed by the Truth-finder, monks, shines when unveiled, not when concealed,' then the statement 'the recitation of the principal monastic code (Pātimokkha) and the entire Canon of monastic discipline are closed and concealed' is wrong. If the recitation of the principal monastic code (Pātimokkha) and the entire Canon of monastic discipline are closed and concealed, then the statement 'The Teaching and discipline proclaimed by the Truth-finder, monks, shines when unveiled, not when concealed' is also wrong. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'The Teaching and discipline proclaimed by the Truth-finder, monks, shines when unveiled, not when concealed.' And yet the recitation of the principal monastic code (Pātimokkha) and the entire Canon of monastic discipline are closed and concealed, but that is not for everyone; having made a boundary, it is closed.

"In three ways, great king, the recitation of the principal monastic code (Pātimokkha) was closed by the Blessed One having made a boundary: by the lineage of the former Truth-finders the recitation of the principal monastic code (Pātimokkha) was closed having made a boundary, closed due to the weightiness of the Teaching, closed due to the weightiness of the monk's plane.

"How was the recitation of the principal monastic code (Pātimokkha) closed having made a boundary by the lineage of the former Truth-finders? This is the lineage, great king, of all the former Truth-finders, that is to say, the recitation of the principal monastic code (Pātimokkha) in the midst of monks is closed to the rest. Just as, great king, the special knowledge of the warriors circulates only among the warriors, thus this tradition of the warriors of the world is closed to the rest. Just so indeed, great king, this is the lineage of all the former Truth-finders, that is to say, the recitation of the principal monastic code (Pātimokkha) in the midst of monks is closed to the rest.

"Or else, great king, groups exist on earth, as follows: the Mallas, the Atoṇas, the Pabbatas, the Dhammagiriyas, the Brahmagiriyas, the performers, the dancers, the acrobats, the goblins, the Maṇibhaddas, the Puṇṇabaddhas, the moon-and-sun worshippers, the Siri-deity worshippers, the Kāli-deity worshippers, the Sivas, the Vasudevas, the Ghaṇikas, the sword-and-snare performers, the Bhaddiputtās - the secret of each of those circulates only in those respective groups, closed to the rest.

Just so indeed, great king, this is the lineage of all the former Truth-finders, that is to say, the recitation of the principal monastic code (Pātimokkha) in the midst of monks is closed to the rest. Thus by the lineage of the former Truth-finders the recitation of the principal monastic code (Pātimokkha) was closed having made a boundary.

"How was the recitation of the principal monastic code (Pātimokkha) closed having made a boundary due to the weightiness of the Teaching? The Teaching, great king, is weighty and heavy; therein one who practises the right course pleases another, one attains that therein through successive practice of the right course, one does not attain that therein without successive practice of the right course; may this essential Teaching, this excellent Teaching, having come into the hands of those who do not practise the right course, not be looked down upon, despised, scorned, mocked, and blamed; may this essential Teaching, this excellent Teaching, having gone to bad people, not be looked down upon, despised, scorned, mocked, and blamed. Thus due to the weightiness of the Teaching the recitation of the principal monastic code (Pātimokkha) was closed having made a boundary.

"Just as, great king, the essential, excellent, noble, well-born, genuine, red sandalwood, when it has gone to an inferior city, becomes looked down upon, despised, scorned, mocked, and blamed, just so indeed, great king, may this essential Teaching, this excellent Teaching, having come into the hands of those who successively do not practise the right course, not be looked down upon, despised, scorned, mocked, and blamed; may this essential Teaching, this excellent Teaching, having gone to bad people, not be looked down upon, despised, scorned, mocked, and blamed. Thus due to the weightiness of the Teaching the recitation of the principal monastic code (Pātimokkha) was closed having made a boundary.

"How was the recitation of the principal monastic code (Pātimokkha) closed having made a boundary due to the weightiness of the monk's plane? The state of being a monk, great king, is incomparable in the world, immeasurable, priceless; it is not possible for anyone to value it, to weigh it, to measure it; thinking 'May one standing in such a state of being a monk not become equal to the world,' the recitation of the principal monastic code (Pātimokkha) circulates only among monks. Just as, great king, in the world excellent and noble goods - whether cloth or bed-sheets, or elephants, horses, chariots, gold, silver, gems, pearls, women-jewels and so on, or heroes victorious in battle - all of them go to the king, just so indeed, great king, as far as in the world there are virtues of the Fortunate One's teaching, learning, good conduct, self-control, morality, and restraint, all of them have gone to the community of monks. Thus due to the weightiness of the monk's plane the recitation of the principal monastic code (Pātimokkha) was closed having made a boundary."

"Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on what is concealed and not concealed in the Teaching and discipline is the second.

3. The Question on the Heavy and Light Nature of Lying

3. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One: 'For conscious lying he is expelled.' And again it was said: 'For conscious lying he commits a light offence, having its ground in confession in the presence of one.' Venerable Nāgasena, what then is the distinction here, what is the reason, that by one lie one is cut off, and

by one lie one is curable? If, venerable Nāgasena, it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'For conscious lying he is expelled,' then the statement 'For conscious lying he commits a light offence, having its ground in confession in the presence of one' is wrong. If it was spoken by the Truth-finder: 'For conscious lying he commits a light offence, having its ground in confession in the presence of one,' then the statement 'For conscious lying he is expelled' is also wrong. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'For conscious lying he is expelled.' And it was said: 'For conscious lying he commits a light offence, having its ground in confession in the presence of one,' but that is heavy or light by way of subject matter. What do you think, great king, suppose here some man were to strike another with the hand, what punishment would you impose on him?" "If he, venerable sir, says 'I do not accept,' we would have a coin taken from him when he does not accept." "But here, great king, if that same man were to strike you with the hand, what then would be the punishment?" "We would have his hand cut off, venerable sir, we would have his foot cut off, we would have him cut off up to the head at the soft part, we would have all that household plundered, we would have both sides uprooted up to the seventh generation." "What then is the distinction here, great king, what is the reason, that for a blow with the hand to one person there is a subtle punishment of a coin, but for a blow with the hand to you there is cutting off of the hand, cutting off of the foot, up to cutting off at the soft part, taking of all household property, uprooting on both sides up to the seventh generation?" "Because of the difference in persons, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, conscious lying is heavy or light by way of subject matter." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on the heavy and light nature of lying is the third.

4. The Question on the Nature of a Bodhisatta

4. "Venerable Nāgasena, this was spoken by the Blessed One in the exposition on the natural order of things: 'From the very beginning, the mother and father of Bodhisattas are fixed in destiny, the enlightenment is fixed in destiny, the chief disciples are fixed in destiny, the son is fixed in destiny, the attendant is fixed in destiny.' And again you say: 'The Bodhisatta, standing in the Tusita realm, looks at the eight great investigations: he looks at the time, he looks at the continent, he looks at the region, he looks at the family, he looks at the mother, he looks at the life span, he looks at the month, he looks at the renunciation.' Venerable Nāgasena, when knowledge is not fully matured, there is no awakening; when knowledge is fully matured, it is not possible to wait even for the interval of a wink; a fully matured mind cannot be transgressed. Why did the Bodhisatta look at the time, thinking 'At what time shall I arise?' When knowledge is not fully matured, there is no awakening; when knowledge is fully matured, it is not possible to wait even for the interval of a wink; why does the Bodhisatta look at the family, thinking 'In what family shall I arise?' If, Venerable Nāgasena, the mother and father of the Bodhisatta are fixed in destiny from the very beginning, then the statement 'he looks at the family' is wrong. If he

looks at the family, then the statement 'the mother and father of the Bodhisatta are fixed in destiny from the very beginning' is also wrong. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"The mother and father of the Bodhisatta are fixed in destiny from the very beginning, great king, and the Bodhisatta also looks at the family. But how does he look at the family? 'Are my mother and father of the warrior caste or are they brahmins?' Thus he looks at the family.

"For eight, great king, the future should be looked at beforehand. Which eight? For a merchant, great king, the goods for sale should be looked at beforehand; for a large bull elephant, the path ahead should be looked at with the trunk beforehand; for a carter, the ford ahead should be looked at beforehand; for a helmsman, having looked at the shore ahead, the boat should be sent beforehand; for a physician, having looked at the life span, the sick person should be approached beforehand; for a northern bridge, having known whether it is firm or not firm, it should be ascended beforehand; for a monk, having reviewed the time ahead, food should be eaten beforehand; for Bodhisattas, the family should be looked at beforehand - 'whether a family of the warrior caste or a brahmin family.' For these eight, great king, the future should be looked at beforehand." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on the nature of a Bodhisatta is the fourth.

5. The Question on Self-Destruction

5. "Venerable Nāgasena, this was spoken by the Blessed One: 'Monks, one should not throw oneself down; whoever should throw himself down, should be dealt with according to the rule.' And again you say: 'Wherever the Blessed One, while expounding the Teaching to disciples, in many ways expounds the Teaching for the eradication of birth, ageing, illness, and death; whoever transcends birth, ageing, illness, and death, him he praises with the highest praise.' If, Venerable Nāgasena, it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'Monks, one should not throw oneself down; whoever should throw himself down, should be dealt with according to the rule,' then the statement 'he expounds the Teaching for the eradication of birth, ageing, illness, and death' is wrong. If he expounds the Teaching for the eradication of birth, ageing, illness, and death, then the statement 'Monks, one should not throw oneself down; whoever should throw himself down, should be dealt with according to the rule' is also wrong. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'Monks, one should not throw oneself down; whoever should throw himself down, should be dealt with according to the rule.' And wherever the Teaching was expounded by the Blessed One while expounding the Teaching to disciples in many ways for the eradication of birth, ageing, illness, and death, there is a reason for this, by which reason the Blessed One rejected and encouraged."

"But what, Venerable Nāgasena, is the reason here, by which reason the Blessed One rejected and encouraged?" "One who is moral, great king, accomplished in morality, is like an antidote in the destruction of the poison of defilements for beings, like

medicine in the appeasement of the illness of defilements for beings, like water in the removal of the dust and dirt of defilements for beings, like a gem-jewel in the giving of all success for beings, like a boat in the crossing to the far shore of the four floods for beings, like a caravan leader in the crossing of the wilderness of birth for beings, like wind in the quenching of the heat of the threefold fire for beings, like a great rain cloud in the fulfilment of the mind for beings, like a teacher in the training in the wholesome for beings, like a good guide in the pointing out of the secure path for beings. Such a one, great king, of many virtues, of various virtues, of immeasurable virtues, a heap of virtues, a mass of virtues, one who brings growth to beings, one who is moral - 'May he not perish' - out of compassion for beings, the Blessed One laid down the training rule: 'Monks, one should not throw oneself down; whoever should throw himself down, should be dealt with according to the rule.' This, great king, is the reason here, by which reason the Blessed One rejected. This too was spoken, great king, by the elder Kumārakassapa, the varied speaker, while explaining the world beyond to the chieftain Pāyāsi: 'In whatever way, chieftain, ascetics and brahmins who are moral, of good character, remain for a long time, for a long duration, in that way they generate much merit, and they proceed for the welfare of many people, for the happiness of many people, out of compassion for the world, for the good, welfare, and happiness of gods and humans.'

"But for what reason did the Blessed One encourage? Birth, great king, is suffering, ageing is suffering, illness is suffering, death is suffering, sorrow is suffering, lamentation is suffering, suffering is suffering, displeasure is suffering, anguish is suffering, association with what is not dear is suffering, separation from what is dear is suffering, the death of a mother is suffering, the death of a father is suffering, the death of a brother is suffering, the death of a sister is suffering, the death of a son is suffering, the death of a wife is suffering, the death of a slave is suffering, the death of a relative is suffering, disaster to relatives is suffering, disaster through illness is suffering, disaster to wealth is suffering, disaster to morality is suffering, disaster to views is suffering, fear of kings is suffering, fear of thieves is suffering, fear of enemies is suffering, fear of famine is suffering, fear of fire is suffering, fear of water is suffering, fear of waves is suffering, fear of whirlpools is suffering, fear of crocodiles is suffering, fear of sharks is suffering, fear of self-censure is suffering, fear of censure by others is suffering, fear of punishment is suffering, fear of unfortunate realms is suffering, fear of timidity in assemblies is suffering, fear concerning livelihood is suffering, fear of death is suffering, being flogged with canes is suffering, being flogged with whips is suffering, being flogged with half-clubs is suffering, cutting off of the hand is suffering, cutting off of the foot is suffering, cutting off of hand and foot is suffering, cutting off of the ear is suffering, cutting off of the nose is suffering, cutting off of ear and nose is suffering, the gruel pot torture is suffering, the shell-tonsure torture is suffering, the Rāhu's mouth torture is suffering, the fire garland torture is suffering, the hand torch torture is suffering, the grass-strip torture is suffering, the bark-dress torture is suffering, the antelope torture is suffering, the flesh-hook torture is suffering, the coin-cutting torture is suffering, the lye-pickling torture is suffering, the pivot-turning torture is suffering, the straw-chair torture is suffering, being sprinkled with boiling oil is suffering, being eaten by dogs is suffering,

being impaled alive on a stake is suffering, cutting off of the head with a sword is suffering; such manifold, various sufferings, great king, one gone into the round of rebirths experiences.

"Just as, great king, water rained down on the Himalaya mountain, flowing in the river Ganges, spreads over stones, gravel, pebbles, sand, whirlpools, rapids, waves, bends, obstacles, obstructions, roots, and branches, even so indeed, great king, such manifold, various sufferings, one gone into the round of rebirths experiences.

Occurrence, great king, is suffering; non-occurrence is happiness. While explaining the virtue of non-occurrence and the danger of occurrence, great king, the Blessed One encouraged for the realisation of non-occurrence, for the transcendence of birth, ageing, illness, and death; this, great king, is the reason here, by which reason the Blessed One encouraged." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, the question has been well unravelled, the reason well explained; thus I accept this as true."

The question on self-destruction is the fifth.

6. The Question on the Benefits of Developing Friendliness

6. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One: 'Monks, when the liberation of mind through friendliness has been practised, developed, cultivated, mastered, made a basis of, practised, accumulated, and thoroughly undertaken, eleven benefits are to be expected. What are the eleven? One sleeps pleasantly, one wakes up pleasantly, one does not see evil dreams, one is dear to human beings, one is dear to non-human beings, deities protect one, neither fire nor poison nor weapon affects one, the mind quickly becomes concentrated, one's complexion becomes bright, one dies undeluded, if not penetrating further one is reborn in the Brahma world.' And again you say: 'The boy Sāma, abiding in friendliness, surrounded by a herd of deer, wandering in the forest wilds, was shot by King Piṇḍiyakkha with a poisoned arrow, and right there he fainted and fell.'

"If, Venerable Nāgasena, it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'Monks, when the liberation of mind through friendliness, etc. one is reborn in the Brahma world,' then the statement 'The boy Sāma, abiding in friendliness, surrounded by a herd of deer, wandering in the forest wilds, was shot by King Piṇḍiyakkha with a poisoned arrow, and right there he fainted and fell' is wrong. If the boy Sāma, abiding in friendliness, surrounded by a herd of deer, wandering in the forest wilds, was shot by King Piṇḍiyakkha with a poisoned arrow, and right there he fainted and fell, then 'Monks, when the liberation of mind through friendliness, etc. neither weapon affects one' - that statement too is wrong. This too is a question with two points, very subtle, smooth, refined, and deep; it might cause sweat to break out on the bodies of even very subtle men. It has come to you; unravel that great tangle of tangles, give vision to the future sons of the Conqueror for their guidance."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'Monks, when the liberation of mind through friendliness, etc. neither weapon affects one.' And the boy Sāma, abiding in friendliness, surrounded by a herd of deer, wandering in the forest wilds, was shot by King Piṇḍiyakkha with a poisoned arrow, and right there he fainted and fell; but there, great king, there is a reason. What is the reason there? These, great king,

are not qualities of the person; these are qualities of the development of friendliness. The boy Sāma, great king, while lifting up a water pot, at that moment was heedless of the development of friendliness.

"At whatever moment, great king, a person has attained friendliness, at that moment neither fire nor poison nor weapon affects that person. Whatever ill-wishers, having approached him, do not see him, do not get an opportunity against him. These, great king, are not qualities of the person; these are qualities of the development of friendliness. Here, great king, a man, a hero in battle, having fastened on an impenetrable coat of mail armour, might enter battle; arrows shot at him, having approached, fall and scatter, they do not get an opportunity against him. This, great king, is not a quality of the hero in battle; this is a quality of the impenetrable coat of mail armour, against which arrows shot, having approached, fall and scatter. Just so indeed, great king, these are not qualities of the person; these are qualities of the development of friendliness.

"At whatever moment, great king, a person has attained friendliness, at that moment neither fire nor poison nor weapon affects that person. Whatever ill-wishers, having approached him, do not see him, do not get an opportunity against him; these, great king, are not qualities of the person; these are qualities of the development of friendliness. But here, great king, a man might place a divine root of disappearance in his hand; as long as that root is in his hand, so long no other ordinary human being sees that man. This, great king, is not a quality of the man; this is a quality of the root of disappearance, that he is not seen in the range of vision of ordinary human beings. Just so indeed, great king, these are not qualities of the person; these are qualities of the development of friendliness.

"At whatever moment, great king, a person has attained friendliness, at that moment neither fire nor poison nor weapon affects that person. Whatever ill-wishers, having approached him, do not see him, do not get an opportunity against him. These, great king, are not qualities of the person; these are qualities of the development of friendliness. Or else, great king, just as a great rain cloud raining down is not able to wet a man who has entered a well-made great cave, this, great king, is not a quality of the man; this is a quality of the great cave, that the great rain cloud raining down does not wet him. Just so indeed, great king, these are not qualities of the person; these are qualities of the development of friendliness.

"At whatever moment, great king, a person has attained friendliness, at that moment neither fire nor poison nor weapon affects that person. Whatever ill-wishers, having approached, do not see him, they are unable to do him harm. These, great king, are not the virtues of the person; these are the virtues of the development of friendliness." "Wonderful, Venerable Nāgasena, marvellous, Venerable Nāgasena, the development of friendliness is the warding off of all evil." "The development of friendliness brings all wholesome virtues, great king; to both the friendly and the unfriendly, to whatever beings are bound by consciousness, the development of friendliness of great benefit should be shared with all."

The question on the benefits of developing friendliness is the sixth.

7. The Question on Wholesome-Unwholesome and Righteous-Unrighteous

7. "Venerable Nāgasena, is the result the same for one who does wholesome and one who does unwholesome, or is there some distinction?" "There is, great king, a distinction between wholesome and unwholesome. Wholesome, great king, has pleasant results and leads to heaven; unwholesome has painful results and leads to hell."

"Venerable Nāgasena, you say 'Devadatta is exclusively dark, endowed with exclusively dark qualities; the Bodhisatta is exclusively pure, endowed with exclusively pure qualities.' And yet Devadatta in existence after existence was equal to the Bodhisatta in fame and following, sometimes even superior. When Devadatta was the son of the royal chaplain of King Brahmadatta in the city of Bārāṇasī, then the Bodhisatta was an outcast corpse-handler, a knower of charms; having recited a charm, he produced mango fruits out of season. Here at least the Bodhisatta was inferior to Devadatta in birth and inferior in fame.

"Furthermore, when Devadatta was a king, a great lord of the earth, endowed with all sensual pleasures, then the Bodhisatta was his possession, a large bull elephant endowed with all auspicious marks. Not enduring his graceful gait and charm, the king, wishing to kill him, said this to the elephant trainer: 'Your elephant is untrained, teacher; perform on him the procedure called walking through the sky.' There too the Bodhisatta was inferior to Devadatta in birth, lowly, gone to the animal realm.

"Furthermore, when Devadatta was a human being, one who had suffered loss in the forest wilds, then the Bodhisatta was a monkey named Mahāpathavī. Here too is seen the distinction between a human being and one gone to the animal realm; there too the Bodhisatta was inferior to Devadatta in birth.

"Furthermore, when Devadatta was a human being, a hunter named Soṇuttara, powerful, more powerful, with the strength of an elephant, then the Bodhisatta was a king of elephants named Chaddanta. Then that hunter killed that large bull elephant; there too Devadatta was superior.

"Furthermore, when Devadatta was a human being, a forester dwelling without abode, then the Bodhisatta was a bird, a partridge, a reciter of charms. Then too that forester killed that bird; there too Devadatta was superior in birth.

"Furthermore, when Devadatta was the King of Kāśi named Kalābu, then the Bodhisatta was an ascetic, a preacher of patience. Then that king, angry at that ascetic, had his hands and feet cut off like bamboo shoots; there too Devadatta was superior in birth and in fame.

"Furthermore, when Devadatta was a human being, a forester, then the Bodhisatta was a monkey king named Nandiya. Then too that forester killed that monkey king together with his mother and younger brother; there too Devadatta was superior in birth.

"Furthermore, when Devadatta was a human being, a naked ascetic named Kārambhiya, then the Bodhisatta was a king of serpents named Paṇḍaraka; there too Devadatta was superior in birth.

"Furthermore, when Devadatta was a human being, a matted-hair ascetic in the forest wilds, then the Bodhisatta was a great boar named Tacchaka; there too Devadatta was superior in birth.

"Furthermore, when Devadatta was a king named Sūraparicara among the Cetis, able to travel through the sky at the height of a man above, then the Bodhisatta was a brahmin named Kapila; there too Devadatta was superior in birth and in fame.

"Furthermore, when Devadatta was a human being named Sāma, then the Bodhisatta was a king of deer named Ruru; there too Devadatta was superior in birth.

"Furthermore, when Devadatta was a human being, a hunter roaming the forest wilds, then the Bodhisatta was a large bull elephant. That hunter, having cut off the tusks of that large bull elephant seven times, carried them away; there too Devadatta was superior in realm.

"Furthermore, when Devadatta was a jackal with the nature of a warrior, he made all the sub-kings throughout the Indian subcontinent his vassals; then the Bodhisatta was a wise man named Vidhura; there too Devadatta was superior in fame.

"Furthermore, when Devadatta, having become a large bull elephant, killed the young ones of the quail bird, then the Bodhisatta too was a large bull elephant, a leader of the herd; there, so far, both of them were exactly equal.

"Furthermore, when Devadatta was a demon named Adhammo, then the Bodhisatta too was a demon named Dhammo; there too, so far, both were exactly equal.

"Furthermore, when Devadatta was a sailor, lord of five hundred families, then the Bodhisatta too was a sailor, lord of five hundred families; there too, so far, both were exactly equal.

"Furthermore, when Devadatta was a caravan leader, lord of five hundred carts, then the Bodhisatta too was a caravan leader, lord of five hundred carts; there too, so far, both were exactly equal.

"Furthermore, when Devadatta was a king of deer named Sākha, then the Bodhisatta too was a king of deer named Nigrodha; there too, so far, both were exactly equal.

"Furthermore, when Devadatta was a general named Sākha, then the Bodhisatta too was a king named Nigrodha; there too, so far, both were exactly equal.

"Furthermore, when Devadatta was a brahmin named Khaṇḍahāla, then the Bodhisatta was a prince named Canda; then that Khaṇḍahāla was indeed superior.

"Furthermore, when Devadatta was a king named Brahmadatta, then the Bodhisatta was his son, a prince named Mahāpaduma; then that king had his own son thrown into the Thieves' Precipice, since from whatever source a father is superior to his sons, being distinguished; there too, so far, Devadatta was indeed superior.

"Furthermore, when Devadatta was a king named Mahāpatāpa, then the Bodhisatta was his son, a prince named Dhammapāla; then that king had his own son's hands, feet, and head cut off; there too, so far, Devadatta was indeed higher, superior.

Now today both were born in the Sakyan clan. The Bodhisatta became the Buddha, the Omniscient One, the leader of the world; Devadatta, having gone forth in the Dispensation of that god of gods, having produced supernormal power, made an assault on the Buddha. What then, venerable Nāgasena, is all that spoken by me true or false?"

"What you, great king, have expounded as manifold reasons, all that is just so, not otherwise." "If, Venerable Nāgasena, both the dark and the bright have the same destination, then indeed both the wholesome and the unwholesome have the same result?" "No indeed, great king, the wholesome and the unwholesome do not have the same result; no indeed, great king, Devadatta was not opposed to all people, he was opposed only to the Bodhisatta. That which was his opposition to the Bodhisatta, that is cooked and gives fruit in each and every existence. Devadatta too, great king, standing in sovereignty, gives protection in the districts, has bridges, assembly halls, and merit halls built, and gives gifts as aspired to ascetics and brahmins, to the poor, travellers, and beggars, to those with protectors and the destitute. By that result he obtains successes in existence after existence. Who, great king, could say that without giving, self-control, restraint, and Observance practice one will experience success?"

"But as for what you, great king, say thus: 'Devadatta and the Bodhisatta keep moving round together,' that meeting did not occur after the passing of a hundred births, nor after the passing of a thousand births, nor after the passing of a hundred thousand births; at some time, seldom, after the passing of many days and nights, a meeting occurred. But that simile of the blind turtle shown by the Blessed One for the obtaining of human existence, great king, remember the meeting of these as being like that simile."

"Not only with Devadatta, great king, did the Bodhisatta have a meeting; the Elder Sāriputta too, great king, in many hundreds of thousands of births was the Bodhisatta's father, was his grandfather, was his uncle, was his brother, was his son, was his nephew, was his friend."

"The Bodhisatta too, great king, in many hundreds of thousands of births was the Elder Sāriputta's father, was his grandfather, was his uncle, was his brother, was his son, was his nephew, was his friend; all, great king, who are included in the orders of beings, who follow the stream of the round of rebirths, being swept along by the stream of the round of rebirths, meet with both the unpleasant and the pleasant. Just as, great king, water being swept along by a stream meets with the clean and unclean, the good and the bad, even so indeed, great king, all who are included in the orders of beings, who follow the stream of the round of rebirths, being swept along by the stream of the round of rebirths, meet with both the unpleasant and the pleasant. Devadatta, great king, being a demon, himself not according to the Teaching, having urged others to what is not according to the Teaching, was cooked in the great hell for fifty-seven ten million years and sixty hundred thousand years; the Bodhisatta too, great king, being a demon, himself according to the Teaching, having urged others to the Teaching, rejoiced in heaven for fifty-seven ten million years and sixty hundred thousand years, endowed with all sensual pleasures; but moreover, great king, Devadatta in this existence, having assailed the Buddha who should not be assailed and having split the united Community, entered the earth; the Truth-finder,

having awakened, attained final Nibbāna regarding all phenomena in the extinction of clinging." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on wholesome-unwholesome and righteous-unrighteous is the seventh.

8. The Question on Queen Amarā

8. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One -

'If she should obtain a moment or a secret place, or should obtain such an inviter;

All women would indeed do evil, not having obtained another, even with a cripple.'

And again it is said: 'Mahosadha's wife, a woman named Amarā, placed in a small village, whose husband was away from home, seated in a secret place, secluded, having made her husband equal to a king, being invited with a thousand, did not do evil.' If, Venerable Nāgasena, it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'If, etc. with a cripple,' then 'Mahosadha's wife, etc. did not do evil' - that statement is wrong. If Mahosadha's wife, etc. did not do evil, then 'If, etc. with a cripple' - that statement too is wrong. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'If, etc. with a cripple.' And it is said: 'Mahosadha's wife, etc. did not do evil.' That woman, great king, receiving a thousand, would do an evil deed with such a man; she would not do it if she should obtain a moment or a secret place or such an inviter. Searching, great king, that woman Amarā did not see a moment or a secret place or such an inviter.

"Here in this world, through fear of blame, she did not see a moment; in the world beyond, through fear of hell, she did not see a moment; thinking 'evil has bitter result,' she did not see a moment; not wishing to let go of her beloved, she did not see a moment; through respect for her husband, she did not see a moment; honouring the Teaching, she did not see a moment; censuring the ignoble, she did not see a moment; not wishing to break the action, she did not see a moment. By many such reasons she did not see a moment.

"And searching in the world, not seeing a secret place, she did not do evil. If she should obtain a secret place from humans, then she would not obtain a secret place from non-humans. If she should obtain a secret place from non-humans, then she would not obtain a secret place from those gone forth who know others' minds. If she should obtain a secret place from those gone forth who know others' minds, then she would not obtain a secret place from deities who know others' minds. If she should obtain a secret place from deities who know others' minds, she would not obtain a secret place from her own evil deeds. If she should obtain a secret place from her own evil deeds, then she would not obtain a secret place from what is not the Teaching. By many such various reasons, not having obtained a secret place, she did not do evil.

"And searching in the world, not obtaining such an inviter, she did not do evil. Mahosadha, great king, the wise one, was endowed with twenty-eight qualities. With which twenty-eight qualities was he endowed? Mahosadha, great king, was heroic,

modest, conscientious, having supporters, accomplished in friends, patient, moral, a truth-speaker, accomplished in purity, without wrath, not arrogant, not envious, energetic, striving, treating kindly, generous, kindly in speech, humble in conduct, smooth, not fraudulent, not deceitful, accomplished in higher intelligence, famous, accomplished in true knowledge, seeking welfare, wished for by dependents, by all people, wealthy, and glorious. Mahosadha, great king, the wise one, was endowed with these twenty-eight qualities. She, not having obtained another such inviter, did not do evil." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on Queen Amarā is the eighth.

9. The Question on the Worthy One's Fearlessness

9. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One: 'Worthy Ones are free from fear and trembling.' And again, in the city of Rājagaha, having seen the elephant Dhanapālaka rushing at the Blessed One, five hundred who had eliminated the mental corruptions, having abandoned the excellent conqueror, departed in all directions, except for one, the elder Ānanda. What indeed, venerable Nāgasena, did those Worthy Ones depart out of fear, or did they depart wishing to fell the one of ten powers, thinking 'it will become known through his own action,' or did they depart wishing to see the incomparable, vast, matchless wonder of the Truth-finder? If, venerable Nāgasena, it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'Worthy Ones are free from fear and trembling,' then 'in the city, etc. Ānanda' - that statement is wrong. If in the city of Rājagaha, having seen the elephant Dhanapālaka rushing at the Blessed One, five hundred who had eliminated the mental corruptions, having abandoned the excellent conqueror, departed in all directions, except for one, the elder Ānanda, then the statement 'Worthy Ones are free from fear and trembling' is also wrong. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'Worthy Ones are free from fear and trembling,' and in the city of Rājagaha, having seen the elephant Dhanapālaka rushing at the Blessed One, five hundred who had eliminated the mental corruptions, having abandoned the excellent conqueror, departed in all directions, except for one, the elder Ānanda; but that was not out of fear, nor out of wishing to fell the Blessed One.

"But, great king, that cause by which Worthy Ones might fear or tremble, that cause has been cut off for Worthy Ones; therefore Worthy Ones are free from fear and trembling. Does, great king, the great earth fear when being dug or broken or supported by the ocean, mountains, and mountain peaks?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "For what reason, great king?" "There is not, venerable sir, that cause for the great earth by which cause the great earth might fear or tremble." "Just so, great king, there is not that cause for Worthy Ones by which cause Worthy Ones might fear or tremble.

"Does, great king, a mountain peak fear when being cut or broken or falling or being burnt by fire?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "For what reason, great king?" "There is not, venerable sir, that cause for a mountain peak by which cause a mountain peak might fear or tremble." "Just so, great king, there is not that cause for Worthy Ones by which cause Worthy Ones might fear or tremble.

"Even if, great king, in a hundred thousand world systems, all those included in the orders of beings, all of them with spears in hand, having run up to one Worthy One, were to try to frighten him, there would not be any alteration of the Worthy One's consciousness. What is the reason? Because it is impossible and without opportunity.

"But moreover, great king, this reflection arose in the minds of those who had eliminated the mental corruptions: 'Today, when the most excellent of men, the excellent conqueror, the bull among men, has entered the excellent city, the elephant Dhanapālaka will rush at him on the street; without doubt the attendant will not abandon the god of gods; if we all do not abandon the Blessed One, the virtue of Ānanda will not become known, and the large bull elephant will not approach the Truth-finder; come, let us depart; thus there will be release from the bondage of mental defilements for a great crowd of people, and the virtue of Ānanda will become known.' Thus those Worthy Ones, having seen the benefit, departed in all directions." "Well analysed, venerable Nāgasena, is the question; thus there is no fear or trembling for Worthy Ones; having seen the benefit, the Worthy Ones departed in all directions."

The question on the Worthy One's fearlessness is the ninth.

10. The Question on the Buddha's Omniscience

10. "Venerable Nāgasena, you say 'the Truth-finder is omniscient.' And again you say 'when the community of monks headed by Sāriputta and Moggallāna was dismissed by the Truth-finder, the Sakyans of Cātumā and Brahmā Sahampati, having shown the simile of the seed and the simile of the young calf, inspired confidence in the Blessed One, asked his forgiveness, and brought him to acceptance.' Were those similes, venerable Nāgasena, unknown to the Truth-finder, by which similes the Truth-finder was brought to forgiveness, was calmed, and came to acceptance? If, venerable Nāgasena, those similes were unknown to the Truth-finder, then the Buddha is not omniscient; if they were known, then he dismissed them forcibly, expecting investigation, and thus his lack of compassion arises. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"The Truth-finder is omniscient, great king, and by those similes the Blessed One was pleased, was brought to forgiveness, was calmed, and came to acceptance. The Truth-finder is the lord of the Teaching, great king; by those very similes made known by the Truth-finder they pleased, satisfied, and inspired confidence in the Truth-finder, and the Truth-finder, being pleased with them, gave thanks saying 'Good!'

"Just as, great king, a wife pleases, satisfies, and inspires confidence in her husband with wealth that is her husband's own, and the husband gives thanks saying 'Good!' - just so indeed, great king, the Sakyans of Cātumā and Brahmā Sahampati, by those very similes made known by the Truth-finder, pleased, satisfied, and inspired confidence in the Truth-finder, and the Truth-finder, being pleased with them, gave thanks saying 'Good!'

"Or else, great king, just as a barber, adorning the king's head with the king's own golden comb, pleases, satisfies, and inspires confidence in the king, and the king, being pleased with him, gives thanks saying 'Good!' and grants whatever he wishes - just so indeed, great king, the Sakyans of Cātumā and Brahmā Sahampati, by those

very similes made known by the Truth-finder, pleased, satisfied, and inspired confidence in the Truth-finder, and the Truth-finder, being pleased with them, gave thanks saying 'Good!'

"Or else, great king, just as a co-resident pupil, having taken almsfood brought by his preceptor, offering it to his preceptor, pleases, satisfies, and inspires confidence in his preceptor, and the preceptor, being pleased with him, gives thanks saying 'Good!' - just so indeed, great king, the Sakyans of Cātumā and Brahmā Sahampati, by those very similes made known by the Truth-finder, pleased, satisfied, and inspired confidence in the Truth-finder, and the Truth-finder, being pleased with them, having given thanks saying 'Good!', expounded the Teaching for complete release from all suffering." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on the Buddha's omniscience is the tenth.

The Chapter on Omniscient Knowledge is the fourth.

In this chapter there are ten questions.

5. The Chapter on Association

1. The Question on Intimacy

1. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One -

'From intimacy fear is born, from abode arises dust;
Without abode, without intimacy - this indeed is the sage's vision.'

"And again it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'Should have charming dwellings built, and lodge the very learned there.' If, Venerable Nāgasena, it was spoken by the Truth-finder: 'From intimacy fear is born, from abode arises dust. Without abode, without intimacy - this indeed is the sage's vision,' then the statement 'Should have charming dwellings built, and lodge the very learned there' is wrong. If it was spoken by the Truth-finder: 'Should have charming dwellings built, and lodge the very learned there,' then 'From intimacy fear is born, from abode arises dust. Without abode, without intimacy - this indeed is the sage's vision' - that statement too is wrong. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'From intimacy fear is born, from abode arises dust. Without abode, without intimacy - this indeed is the sage's vision.' And it was spoken: 'Should have charming dwellings built, and lodge the very learned there.' That which, great king, was spoken by the Blessed One: 'From intimacy fear is born, from abode arises dust. Without abode, without intimacy - this indeed is the sage's vision' - that is a statement of intrinsic nature, a statement without remainder, a statement without exception, a statement without qualification, befitting an ascetic, suitable for an ascetic, proper for an ascetic, worthy of an ascetic, the resort of an ascetic, the practice of an ascetic, the conduct of an ascetic. Just as, great king, a forest deer, roaming in the forest wilds, without attachment, without abode, lies down wherever he wishes, even so, great king, by a monk 'From intimacy fear is born, from abode arises dust. Without abode, without intimacy - this indeed is the sage's vision' - thus should it be considered.

"But, great king, what was spoken by the Blessed One: 'Should have charming dwellings built, and lodge the very learned there' - that was spoken by the Blessed One considering two reasons. Which two? The gift of a dwelling is praised, approved, extolled, and commended by all Buddhas; having given that gift of a dwelling, they will be released from birth, ageing, and death. This is the first benefit in the gift of a dwelling.

"Furthermore, when a dwelling exists, nuns will be at a known meeting place, easy to see for those wishing to see them; without an abode they will be difficult to see. This is the second benefit in the gift of a dwelling. Considering these two reasons, it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'Should have charming dwellings built, and lodge the very learned there'; therein attachment should not be made by a son of the Buddha to an abode." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on intimacy is the first.

2. The Question on Stomach Restraint

2. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One -

'One should not be negligent in what is to be undertaken, one should be restrained in the belly.'

"And again it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'But I, Udāyī, sometimes eat from this bowl filled level to the brim, and even more.' If, venerable Nāgasena, it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'One should not be negligent in what is to be undertaken, one should be restrained in the belly,' then the statement 'But I, Udāyī, sometimes eat from this bowl filled level to the brim, and even more' is wrong. If it was spoken by the Truth-finder: 'But I, Udāyī, sometimes eat from this bowl filled level to the brim, and even more,' then the statement 'One should not be negligent in what is to be undertaken, one should be restrained in the belly' is also wrong. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'One should not be negligent in what is to be undertaken, one should be restrained in the belly,' and it was said: 'But I, Udāyī, sometimes eat from this bowl filled level to the brim, and even more.' That which, great king, was spoken by the Blessed One: 'One should not be negligent in what is to be undertaken, one should be restrained in the belly' - that is a statement of intrinsic nature, a statement without remainder, a statement without exception, a statement without qualification, a factual statement, a true statement, an exact statement, an unreversed statement, a statement of a seer, a statement of a sage, a statement of a Blessed One, a statement of a Worthy One, a statement of an Individually Enlightened One, a statement of a Conqueror, a statement of an Omniscient One, a statement of the Truth-finder, the Worthy One, the Perfectly Enlightened One.

"One unrestrained in the belly, great king, kills living beings, takes what is not given, goes to another's wife, speaks falsely, drinks intoxicants, deprives one's mother of life, deprives one's father of life, deprives a Worthy One of life, splits the monastic community, and with a malicious mind draws blood from a Truth-finder. Is it not, great king, that Devadatta, unrestrained in the belly, having split the monastic community,

accumulated action lasting for a cosmic cycle? Having seen such manifold reasons, great king, it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'One should not be negligent in what is to be undertaken, one should be restrained in the belly.'

"One restrained in the belly, great king, fully realises the full realisation of the four truths, realises the four fruits of asceticism, attains mastery in the four analytical knowledges, in the eight attainments, in the six direct knowledges, and fulfils the entire ascetic practice. Is it not, great king, that the young parrot, having become restrained in the belly, having shaken even the realm of the Thirty-three, brought Sakka, the lord of the gods, into attendance? Having seen such manifold reasons, great king, it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'One should not be negligent in what is to be undertaken, one should be restrained in the belly.'

"But, great king, what was spoken by the Blessed One: 'But I, Udāyī, sometimes eat from this bowl filled level to the brim, and even more' - that was spoken by the Truth-finder with reference to himself, by one whose task is done, whose function is finished, whose purpose is accomplished, who has reached the end of the holy life, who is without obstruction, who is omniscient, who is self-become.

"Just as, great king, for one who has vomited, who has been purged, who has been given an enema, who is sick, doing what is suitable is to be desired, just so indeed, great king, for one with mental defilements, who has not seen the truth, restraint in the belly is to be done. Just as, great king, for a jewel gem that is radiant, that has genuine qualities, that is pure by nature, there is nothing to be done by polishing, rubbing, and cleansing, just so indeed, great king, for the Truth-finder who has gone to perfection in the domain of a Buddha, there is no obstruction in functional activities." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on stomach restraint is the second.

3. The Question on the Buddha's Freedom from Illness

3. "Venerable Nāgasena, this was spoken by the Blessed One: 'I am, monks, a brahmin, accessible to requests, always with purified hands, bearing my final body, an unsurpassed physician, a surgeon.' And again it was said by the Blessed One: 'This is the foremost, monks, of my disciples who are monks with few illnesses, namely Bākula.' And illness is seen to have arisen many times in the Blessed One's body. If, venerable Nāgasena, the Truth-finder is unsurpassed, then 'This is the foremost... etc. Bākula' - that statement is wrong. If the Elder Bākula is the foremost of those with few illnesses, then 'I am... etc. a surgeon' - that statement too is wrong. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'I am... etc. a surgeon,' and it was said: 'This is the foremost... etc. Bākula' - but that was spoken with reference to the existence in oneself of external traditions, attainments, and scriptural learning.

"Now there are, great king, disciples of the Blessed One who practise standing and walking meditation; they spend the day and night by standing and walking. But the Blessed One, great king, spends the day and night by standing, walking, sitting, and lying down. Those monks, great king, who practise standing and walking meditation, they are superior in that factor.

"Now there are, great king, disciples of the Blessed One who are one-session eaters; they do not eat a second meal even for the sake of their life. But the Blessed One, great king, eats a second and even a third meal. Those monks, great king, who are one-session eaters, they are superior in that factor. Those various reasons, great king, were spoken with reference to those various persons. But the Blessed One, great king, is unsurpassed in morality, concentration, wisdom, liberation, knowledge and vision of liberation, the ten powers, the four grounds of self-confidence, the eighteen qualities of a Buddha, and the six kinds of knowledge not shared with others; with reference to the entire domain of a Buddha, it was spoken: 'I am... etc. a surgeon.'

"Here, great king, among human beings, one is of noble birth, one is wealthy, one possesses true knowledge, one is skilled in crafts, one is a hero, one is discerning; having overcome all these, the king alone is the highest among them. Just so indeed, great king, the Blessed One is the foremost, the eldest, the best of all beings.

"But that the Venerable Bākula was one with few illnesses was by the power of his resolution. For he, great king, when a wind illness of the stomach arose in the Blessed One Anomadassī, and when a grass-flower disease arose in the Blessed One Vipassī and in sixty-eight hundred thousand monks, being himself an ascetic, having removed that disease with various medicines, attained the state of having few illnesses, and it was said: 'This is the foremost... etc. Bākula.'

"Whether illness arises or does not arise in the Blessed One, great king, whether ascetic practices are undertaken or not undertaken, there is no being equal to the Blessed One. This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One, the god above gods, in the excellent seal of the Collection of the Connected Discourses:

"'As far as there are beings, monks, whether footless or two-footed or four-footed or many-footed, whether material or immaterial, whether percipient or non-percipient or neither-percipient-nor-non-percipient, the Truth-finder is declared the foremost among them, the Worthy One, the Perfectly Enlightened One.' "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on the Buddha's freedom from illness is the third.

4. The Question on the Arising of the Path

4. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One: 'The Truth-finder, monks, the Worthy One, the Perfectly Enlightened One, is the producer of the unarisen path.' And again it was said: 'I saw, monks, an ancient path, an ancient road, followed by the Perfectly Enlightened Ones of former times.' If, Venerable Nāgasena, the Truth-finder is the producer of the unarisen path, then the statement 'I saw, monks, an ancient path, an ancient road, followed by the Perfectly Enlightened Ones of former times' is wrong. If it was spoken by the Truth-finder: 'I saw, monks, an ancient path, an ancient road, followed by the Perfectly Enlightened Ones of former times,' then the statement 'The Truth-finder, monks, the Worthy One, the Perfectly Enlightened One, is the producer of the unarisen path' is also wrong. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'The Truth-finder, monks, the Worthy One, the Perfectly Enlightened One, is the producer of the unarisen path.' And it was said: 'I saw, monks, an ancient path, an ancient road, followed by the Perfectly Enlightened Ones of former times' - both of these are statements of intrinsic nature. With the disappearance of the former Truth-finders, great king, when there was no instructor, the path disappeared. That path, broken down, crumbling, hidden, closed, concealed, not traversed - the Truth-finder, seeing it with the eye of wisdom, saw it as followed by the Perfectly Enlightened Ones of former times. For that reason he said: 'I saw, monks, an ancient path, an ancient road, followed by the Perfectly Enlightened Ones of former times.'

"With the disappearance of the former Truth-finders, great king, when there was no instructor, the path that was broken down, crumbling, hidden, closed, concealed, not traversed - that the Truth-finder now made traversable. For that reason he said: 'The Truth-finder, monks, the Worthy One, the Perfectly Enlightened One, is the producer of the unarisen path.'

"Here, great king, with the disappearance of a wheel-turning monarch, the jewel gem hides between mountain peaks; with the right practice of another wheel-turning monarch, it approaches him. Is that jewel gem, great king, made by him?" "No indeed, venerable sir, that jewel gem is just natural; but it was produced by him." "Just so indeed, great king, the natural eightfold safe path practised by the former Truth-finders, when there was no instructor, broken down, crumbling, hidden, closed, concealed, not traversed - the Blessed One, seeing it with the eye of wisdom, produced it, made it traversable. For that reason he said: 'The Truth-finder, monks, the Worthy One, the Perfectly Enlightened One, is the producer of the unarisen path.'

"Or else, great king, just as a mother, having given birth from the womb to a son who already exists, is called 'the one who gave birth,' just so indeed, great king, the Truth-finder, seeing with the eye of wisdom the path that already exists, broken down, crumbling, hidden, closed, concealed, not traversed, produced it, made it traversable. For that reason he said: 'The Truth-finder, monks, the Worthy One, the Perfectly Enlightened One, is the producer of the unarisen path.'

"Or else, great king, when some man sees something that was lost, people say 'that article was produced by him.' Just so indeed, great king, the Truth-finder, seeing with the eye of wisdom the path that already exists, broken down, crumbling, hidden, closed, concealed, not traversed, produced it, made it traversable. For that reason he said: 'The Truth-finder, monks, the Worthy One, the Perfectly Enlightened One, is the producer of the unarisen path.'

"Or else, great king, when some man, having cleared a forest, brings forth land, people say 'that land is his,' yet that land was not created by him; having made that land the cause, he is called the owner of the land. Just so indeed, great king, the Truth-finder, seeing with wisdom the path that already exists, broken down, crumbling, hidden, closed, concealed, not traversed, produced it, made it traversable. For that reason he said: 'The Truth-finder, monks, the Worthy One, the Perfectly Enlightened One, is the producer of the unarisen path.'" "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on the arising of the path is the fourth.

5. The Question on the Buddha Not Harassing

5. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One: 'Formerly, when I was a human being, I was one who did not harass beings.' And again it was said: 'The sage named Lomasakassapa, having killed many hundreds of living beings, performed the vājapeyya, the great sacrifice.' If, Venerable Nāgasena, it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'Formerly, when I was a human being, I was one who did not harass beings,' then the statement 'The sage Lomasakassapa, having killed many hundreds of living beings, performed the vājapeyya, the great sacrifice' is wrong. If 'The sage Lomasakassapa, having killed many hundreds of living beings, performed the vājapeyya, the great sacrifice,' then the statement 'Formerly, when I was a human being, I was one who did not harass beings' is also wrong. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'Formerly, when I was a human being, I was one who did not harass beings'; 'The sage Lomasakassapa, having killed many hundreds of living beings, performed the vājapeyya, the great sacrifice' - but that was by one unconscious through the influence of lust, not by one with intention."

"There are these eight persons, Venerable Nāgasena, who kill living beings. What are the eight? One lustful kills living beings through the influence of lust; one corrupt kills living beings through the influence of hate; one deluded kills living beings through the influence of delusion; one conceited kills living beings through the influence of conceit; one greedy kills living beings through the influence of greed; one who owns nothing kills living beings for the sake of livelihood; a fool kills living beings through the influence of jest; a king kills living beings through the influence of discipline. These, Venerable Nāgasena, are the eight persons who kill living beings. It was just natural, Venerable Nāgasena, what was done by the Bodhisatta." "No, great king, it was not natural what was done by the Bodhisatta. If, great king, the Bodhisatta in his natural state would bend down to perform the great sacrifice, he would not have spoken this verse:

'The earth with its surrounding ocean, girdled by the sea;
I would not wish for it together with blame, thus, Seyha, understand.'

"Speaking thus, great king, the Bodhisatta, together with seeing the princess Candavatī, became unconscious, mentally deranged, lustful, become unconscious, confused and bewildered, very quickly; with that distracted, swaying, agitated mind, he performed the vājapeyya, the great sacrifice, with a great accumulation of blood from the throats of many slaughtered animals.

"Just as, great king, a mad man, mentally deranged, treads upon blazing fire, grasps an angry venomous snake, approaches an intoxicated elephant, plunges into the ocean where no shore is seen, tramples upon a bathing tank and a cesspool, climbs upon a thorny hedge, falls into a precipice, eats impure things, walks naked on the road, and does various other improper things. Just so indeed, great king, the Bodhisatta, together with seeing the princess Candavatī, became unconscious, mentally deranged, lustful, become unconscious, confused and bewildered, very

quickly; with that distracted, swaying, agitated mind, he performed the vājapeyya, the great sacrifice, with a great accumulation of blood from the throats of many slaughtered animals.

"Evil done by one mentally deranged, great king, is not greatly blameworthy even in this present life, nor so in the future state by way of result. Here, great king, suppose some mad man were to commit a capital offence, what punishment would you impose on him?" "What punishment, venerable sir, would there be for a mad man? We would have him beaten and expelled; that itself is his punishment." "Thus indeed, great king, for the offence of a mad man there is not even punishment; therefore for what is done by a mad man there is no fault, it is curable. Just so indeed, great king, the sage Lomasakassapa, together with seeing the princess Candavatī, became unconscious, mentally deranged, lustful, become unconscious, with effort spread out, confused and bewildered, very quickly; with that distracted, swaying, agitated mind, he performed the vājapeyya, the great sacrifice, with a great accumulation of blood from the throats of many slaughtered animals. But when he became of normal mind, having regained mindfulness, then having gone forth again, having developed the five direct knowledges, he became one destined for the Brahma world." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on the Buddha not harassing is the fifth.

6. The Question Concerning Chaddanta and Jotipāla

6. "Venerable Nāgasena, this was spoken by the Blessed One about Chaddanta the king of elephants -

'Thinking "I shall kill him," while fondling, he saw the ochre robe, the banner of the sages;

Though touched by suffering, perception arose: "The arahant's banner is not to be harmed by the virtuous."

"And again it was said: 'The young man Jotipāla, being such, reviled and abused the Blessed One Kassapa, the Worthy One, the Perfectly Enlightened One, with the term "shaveling," with the term "little ascetic," with vulgar and harsh speech.' If, Venerable Nāgasena, the Bodhisatta, being an animal, venerated the ochre robe, then the statement 'The Blessed One Kassapa, the Worthy One, the Perfectly Enlightened One, was reviled and abused by the young man Jotipāla with the term "shaveling," with the term "little ascetic," with vulgar and harsh speech' is wrong. If the Blessed One Kassapa, the Worthy One, the Perfectly Enlightened One, was reviled and abused by the young man Jotipāla with the term "shaveling," with the term "little ascetic," with vulgar and harsh speech, then the statement 'The ochre robe was venerated by Chaddanta the king of elephants' is also wrong. If the ochre robe worn by the hunter was venerated by the Bodhisatta who was an animal, experiencing hard, rough, and sharp painful feeling, why did he, having become a human being, with mature knowledge, with mature enlightenment, having seen the Blessed One Kassapa, the Worthy One, the Perfectly Enlightened One, the one of ten powers, the leader of the world, risen and exalted, blazing with the radiance of a fathom, the noble and excellent one, wrapped in the noble, beautiful Kāsi ochre robe, not venerate him? This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One about Chaddanta the king of elephants: 'Thinking "I shall kill him"' etc. 'not to be harmed by the virtuous.'" And the Blessed One Kassapa, the Worthy One, the Perfectly Enlightened One, was reviled and abused by the young man Jotipāla with the term "shaveling," with the term "little ascetic," with vulgar and harsh speech; but that was by reason of birth, by reason of family. The young man Jotipāla, great king, was reborn in a faithless, unbelieving family; his mother and father, sisters and brothers, female and male slaves, servants, attendants and people had Brahmā as their deity, had Brahmā as their authority. They, thinking 'Brahmins alone are the highest, the noble,' censure and despise the rest who have gone forth. Having heard that word of theirs, the young man Jotipāla, when called by Ghaṭikāra the potter to see the Teacher, said thus: 'What is the use of seeing that bald-headed little ascetic?'

"Just as, great king, the deathless, having come into contact with poison, becomes bitter, and just as cool water, having come into contact with fire, becomes hot, even so, great king, the young man Jotipāla, having been reborn in a faithless, unbelieving family, being blind by reason of family, reviled and abused the Truth-finder.

"Just as, great king, a great mass of fire, burning and blazing, radiant, having come into contact with water, becomes one whose radiance and heat are destroyed, cool and black, like a ripe vitex negundo fruit, even so, great king, the young man Jotipāla, meritorious, faithful, radiant with vast knowledge, having been reborn in a faithless, unbelieving family, being blind by reason of family, reviled and abused the Truth-finder; but having approached and having understood the virtues of the Buddha, he became like a servant, and having gone forth in the Conqueror's Dispensation, having developed the direct knowledges and the attainments, he became one destined for the Brahma world." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question concerning Chaddanta and Jotipāla is the sixth.

7. The Question on Ghaṭikāra

7. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One: 'The entire workshop of the potter Ghaṭikāra stood with the sky as its roof for three months, and the rain did not fall upon it.' And again it was said: 'The hut of the Truth-finder Kassapa is being rained upon.' But why, Venerable Nāgasena, is the hut of the Truth-finder, one with such abundant wholesome roots, rained upon? Should not that be the power of the Truth-finder? If, Venerable Nāgasena, the workshop of the potter Ghaṭikāra was sheltered from the rain with the sky as its roof, then the statement 'the hut of the Truth-finder is being rained upon' is wrong. If the hut of the Truth-finder is being rained upon, then the statement 'the workshop of the potter Ghaṭikāra was sheltered from the rain with the sky as its roof' is also wrong. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'The entire workshop of the potter Ghaṭikāra stood with the sky as its roof for three months, and the rain did not fall upon it.' And it was said: 'The hut of the Truth-finder Kassapa is being rained upon.' The potter Ghaṭikāra, great king, was moral, of good character, with abundant wholesome roots, and he supported his blind and aged mother and father. Without his presence, without asking his permission, they took grass from his house and covered

the hut of the Blessed One. He, by that taking of grass, obtained unshaken, unwavering, well-established, vast, incomparable rapture, and he produced even more immeasurable pleasure, thinking 'Oh indeed, the Blessed One is supramundane, well trusted by me!' By that, a result pertaining to the present life arose for him. Indeed, great king, the Truth-finder does not waver by such a change.

"Just as, great king, Sineru, the king of mountains, does not tremble or waver even by many hundreds of thousands of wind blows, and the great ocean, the excellent and supreme sea, is not filled and does not undergo change even by many hundreds of thousands of great Ganges rivers, just so indeed, great king, the Truth-finder does not waver by such a change.

"But, great king, that the hut of the Truth-finder is being rained upon is out of compassion for the great crowd of people. Seeing these two reasons, great king, Truth-finders do not use requisites created by themselves: 'This Teacher is the foremost worthy of offerings' - having given requisites to the Blessed One, gods and humans will be released from all unfortunate realms; and showing that they seek livelihood, 'lest others should blame them.' Seeing these two reasons, Truth-finders do not use requisites created by themselves. If, great king, Sakka or Brahmā or he himself were to make that hut sheltered from the rain, that very action would be blameworthy, faulty, with refutation, thinking 'these, having made it manifest, delude the world, making it excessive'; therefore that action is to be avoided. Truth-finders, great king, do not request material things; by that non-requesting of material things, they become beyond reproach." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on Ghaṭikāra is the seventh.

8. The Question on the Brahmin-King Statement

8. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Truth-finder: 'I am, monks, a brahmin, accessible to requests.' And again it was said: 'I am a king, Sela.' If, Venerable Nāgasena, it was spoken by the Blessed One: 'I am, monks, a brahmin, accessible to requests,' then the statement 'I am a king, Sela' is wrong. If it was spoken by the Truth-finder: 'I am a king, Sela,' then the statement 'I am, monks, a brahmin, accessible to requests' is also wrong. For one would be either a warrior or a brahmin; there are not two castes in one birth. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'I am, monks, a brahmin, accessible to requests,' and again it was said: 'I am a king, Sela.' There is a reason here, by which reason the Truth-finder is both a brahmin and a king."

"But what, Venerable Nāgasena, is that reason, by which reason the Truth-finder is both a brahmin and a king?" "All evil unwholesome mental states, great king, have been warded off, abandoned, departed, gone away, cut off, eliminated, reached destruction, quenched, and calmed by the Truth-finder; therefore the Truth-finder is called 'a brahmin.'"

"A brahmin is one who has passed beyond doubt, uncertainty, and the path of perplexity; the Blessed One too, great king, has passed beyond doubt, uncertainty, and the path of perplexity; for that reason the Truth-finder is called 'a brahmin.'

"A brahmin is one who has escaped from all existences, destinations, and modes of generation, who is freed from the stain and dust of defilements, who is without companion; the Blessed One too, great king, has escaped from all existences, destinations, and modes of generation, is freed from the stain and dust of defilements, is without companion; for that reason the Truth-finder is called 'a brahmin.'

"A brahmin is one who abounds in the highest, best, excellent, supreme divine abidings; the Blessed One too, great king, abounds in the highest, best, excellent, supreme divine abidings; for that reason too the Truth-finder is called 'a brahmin.'

"A brahmin is one who upholds the tradition and lineage of the instruction of former times regarding study, teaching, giving and receiving, self-control, restraint, and observance; the Blessed One too, great king, upholds the tradition and lineage of the instruction practised by former Conquerors regarding study, teaching, giving and receiving, self-control, restraint, and observance; for that reason too the Truth-finder is called 'a brahmin.'

"A brahmin is a meditator on the meditative absorption of the sublime pleasant abiding; the Blessed One too, great king, is a meditator on the meditative absorption of the sublime pleasant abiding; for that reason too the Truth-finder is called 'a brahmin.'

"A brahmin knows the conduct and behaviour of noble birth in all existences, non-existences, and destinations; the Blessed One too, great king, knows the conduct and behaviour of noble birth in all existences, non-existences, and destinations; for that reason too the Truth-finder is called 'a brahmin.'

"'Brahmin,' great king, this name of the Blessed One was not made by his mother, not made by his father, not made by his brother, not made by his sister, not made by friends and colleagues, not made by relatives and blood-relations, not made by ascetics and brahmins, not made by deities; this is a designation at the end of liberation for the Buddhas, the Blessed Ones, a designation realised at the very root of the Bodhi tree, having scattered Māra's army, having expelled evil unwholesome mental states of the past, future, and present, together with the attainment of omniscient knowledge, at the very moment of obtaining, manifesting, and arising, that is to say 'brahmin'; for that reason the Truth-finder is called 'a brahmin.'"

"But for what reason, Venerable Nāgasena, is the Truth-finder called 'a king'?" "A king, great king, is whoever exercises kingship and governs the world; the Blessed One too, great king, exercises kingship by righteousness in the ten-thousand-fold world system, and instructs the world with its gods, with its Māras, with its Brahmās, the generation with its ascetics and brahmins, with its gods and humans; for that reason too the Truth-finder is called 'a king.'

"A king, great king, having overcome all people, delighting the congregation of kinsmen, causing grief to the congregation of enemies, raises the white, spotless, pure parasol with a pole of great fame, glory, and splendour, firm and substantial, decorated with a hundred complete ribs; the Blessed One too, great king, causing grief to Māra's army that is wrongly practising, delighting gods and humans who are rightly practising, raises in the ten-thousand-fold world system the white, spotless, pure parasol of the highest, excellent liberation, with a pole of great fame, glory, and splendour, firm and substantial with patience, decorated with a hundred ribs of excellent knowledge; for that reason too the Truth-finder is called 'a king.'

"A king is one to be venerated by many people who have attained prosperity; the Blessed One too, great king, is to be venerated by many gods and humans who have attained prosperity; for that reason too the Truth-finder is called 'a king.'

"A king, having been pleased with whoever pleases him, having given the boon that was requested, satisfies him with sensual pleasures; the Blessed One too, great king, having been pleased with whoever pleases him by body, speech, and mind, having given the unsurpassed boon that was requested, the complete release from all suffering, satisfies him with the complete boon of sensual pleasures; for that reason too the Truth-finder is called 'a king.'

"A king censures, burns, and destroys one who transgresses his command; in the excellent Dispensation of the Blessed One too, great king, one who is shameless and transgresses the command, having become looked down upon, scorned, and blamed with a state of dejection, is expelled from the excellent Dispensation of the Conqueror; for that reason too the Truth-finder is called 'a king.'

"A king, having illuminated what is righteous and unrighteous according to the traditional instruction of former righteous kings, exercising kingship by righteousness, becomes desired, dear, and wished for by people; he establishes the royal family lineage for a long time by the power of the virtue of righteousness; the Blessed One too, great king, having illuminated what is righteous and unrighteous according to the traditional instruction of former Self-awakened Ones, governing the world by righteousness, becomes desired, dear, and wished for by gods and humans; he keeps the Dispensation going for a long time by the power of the virtue of righteousness; for that reason too the Truth-finder is called 'a king.' Thus manifold, great king, is the reason, by which reason the Truth-finder would be both a brahmin and a king; even a very subtle monk could not accomplish it in a cosmic cycle. Why say too much? It should be accepted in brief." "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on the brahmin-king statement is the eighth.

9. The Question on the Discussion of Food Gained by Reciting Verses

9. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One -

"What is gained by reciting verses is not to be eaten by me, brahmin, this is not the principle for those who see clearly;
The Buddhas reject what is gained by reciting verses, brahmin, when the Teaching exists, this is the way of living.'

"And further, the Blessed One, teaching and speaking the Teaching to an assembly, giving a progressive discourse, first speaks a talk on giving, afterwards a talk on morality; having heard what was spoken by that Blessed One, the lord of all the world, gods and humans, having prepared, give gifts; his disciples consume that gift which was urged. If, venerable Nāgasena, it was spoken by the Blessed One 'What is gained by reciting verses is not to be eaten by me,' then the statement 'The Blessed One first speaks a talk on giving' is wrong. If he first speaks a talk on giving, then the statement 'What is gained by reciting verses is not to be eaten by me' is also wrong. What is the reason? That one, venerable sir, who is worthy of offerings, who speaks of the result of giving almsfood to householders - having heard his talk on the Teaching, with confident minds they give gifts again and again; whoever consumes that gift, all of them consume what is gained by reciting verses. This too is a question with two points, subtle, profound, reached by austere asceticism; it should be resolved by you."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One: 'What is gained by reciting verses is not to be eaten by me, brahmin, this is not the principle for those who see clearly. The Buddhas reject what is gained by reciting verses, brahmin, when the Teaching exists, this is the way of living,' and the Blessed One first speaks a talk on giving; and this is the practice of all Truth-finders - first by a talk on giving, having caused the mind to delight therein, afterwards they urge towards morality. Just as, great king, people first give toys to young children. As follows: toy ploughs, stick games, toy windmills, toy measures, toy chariots, toy bows; afterwards they urge them in their own respective work. Just so indeed, great king, the Truth-finder, having first caused the mind to delight by a talk on giving, afterwards urges towards morality."

"Or else, great king, a physician first gives oil to the sick for four or five days for strengthening and softening, afterwards he administers a purgative. Just so indeed, great king, the Truth-finder, having first caused the mind to delight by a talk on giving, afterwards urges towards morality. The mind of donors, great king, of masters of giving, is soft, gentle, smooth; by that, by the bridge of giving, by the boat of giving, they go to the far shore of the ocean of the round of rebirths; therefore he first instructs them in the field of action, and does not commit any intimation."

"Venerable Nāgasena, as for what you say 'intimation', how many are those intimations?" "There are these two, great king, intimations: bodily intimation and verbal intimation. Therein there is bodily intimation that is blameworthy, there is blameless. There is verbal intimation that is blameworthy, there is blameless."

"Which is blameworthy bodily intimation? Here a certain monk, having approached families, standing in an unsuitable place, breaks his standing position; this is blameworthy bodily intimation. And what is intimated by that, the noble ones do not consume; and that person, in the time of the noble ones, is looked down upon, scorned, mocked, blamed, despised, disrespected, and is reckoned as one of broken livelihood."

"Furthermore, great king, here a certain monk, having approached families, standing in an unsuitable place, having stretched out his neck, looks with a peacock's gaze, thinking 'thus these will see me,' and by that they see him. This too is blameworthy

bodily intimation. And what is intimated by that, the noble ones do not consume; and that person, in the time of the noble ones, is looked down upon, scorned, mocked, blamed, despised, disrespected, and is reckoned as one of broken livelihood.

"Furthermore, great king, here a certain monk intimates by the jaw or by the eyebrow or by the thumb; this too is blameworthy bodily intimation; and what is intimated by that, the noble ones do not consume; and that person, in the time of the noble ones, is looked down upon, scorned, mocked, blamed, despised, disrespected, and is reckoned as one of broken livelihood.

"Which is blameless bodily intimation? Here a monk, having approached families, mindful, concentrated, fully aware, whether in a suitable place or an unsuitable place, having gone according to instruction, stands in a suitable place; he stands among those wishing to give, he departs from those not wishing to give. This is blameless bodily intimation; and what is intimated by that, the noble ones consume; and that person, in the time of the noble ones, is praised, extolled, commended, of austere conduct, and is reckoned as one of pure livelihood. This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One, the god above gods -

'The wise indeed do not request, and the wise one deserves to know;
Noble ones stand with a purpose, this is the request of noble ones.'

"What is blameworthy verbal intimation? Here, great king, a monk by speech asks for in many ways the requisites of robes, almsfood, lodging and medicine for the sick; this is blameworthy verbal intimation, and what is obtained by that intimation noble ones do not consume, and that person at the time of the noble ones is looked down upon, scorned, mocked, blamed, despised, disregarded, and is reckoned as one of broken livelihood.

"Furthermore, great king, here a certain monk, making others hear, speaks thus: 'I have need of this,' and by that speech made heard by others, gain arises for him; this too is blameworthy verbal intimation, and what is obtained by that intimation noble ones do not consume, and that person at the time of the noble ones is looked down upon, scorned, mocked, blamed, despised, disregarded, and is reckoned as one of broken livelihood.

"Furthermore, great king, here a certain monk by verbal expression makes the assembly hear: 'Such and such should be given to the monks,' and they, having heard that word, bring what was proclaimed; this too is blameworthy verbal intimation, and what is obtained by that intimation noble ones do not consume, and that person at the time of the noble ones is looked down upon, scorned, mocked, blamed, despised, disregarded, and is reckoned as one of broken livelihood.

"Is it not, great king, that the Elder Sāriputta too, when the sun had set, in the night-time, being ill, when asked about medicine by the Elder Mahāmoggallāna, broke into speech, and by that verbal expression medicine arose for him. Then the Elder Sāriputta, thinking 'This medicine has arisen for me by verbal expression, may my livelihood not be broken,' out of fear of breaking his livelihood, abandoned that medicine and did not live on it. Thus too verbal intimation is blameworthy, and what

is obtained by that intimation noble ones do not consume. And that person at the time of the noble ones is looked down upon, scorned, mocked, blamed, despised, disregarded, and is reckoned as one of broken livelihood.

"What is blameless verbal intimation? Here, great king, a monk, when there is a reason, asks for medicine from families who are relatives or who have invited him; this is blameless verbal intimation, and what is obtained by that intimation noble ones consume, and that person at the time of the noble ones is praised, extolled, commended, and is reckoned as one of pure livelihood, approved by the Truth-finders, the Worthy Ones, the Perfectly Enlightened Ones.

"But that, great king, which the Truth-finder abandoned - the food of the brahmin Kasibhāradvāja - that arose through winding, unwinding, pulling, refutation, and counter-action; therefore the Truth-finder rejected that almsfood and did not live on it."

"At all times, Venerable Nāgasena, when the Truth-finder was eating, did the deities sprinkle divine nutriment in the bowl, or did they sprinkle it only in the two almsfoods of the pig's delight and the milk-rice?" "At all times, great king, when the Truth-finder was eating, the deities, having taken divine nutriment, standing close, sprinkled it on each and every morsel that was lifted up.

"Just as, great king, a king's cook, having taken curry, standing close to the king while he is eating, sprinkles curry on each and every mouthful, just so, great king, at all times when the Truth-finder was eating, the deities, having taken divine nutriment, standing close, sprinkled divine nutriment on each and every morsel that was lifted up. Even at Verañjā, great king, when the Truth-finder was eating dried barley grains, the deities, having moistened them again and again with divine nutriment, brought them near; thereby the Truth-finder's body was nourished." "It is a gain indeed, Venerable Nāgasena, for those deities who were constantly and continuously engaged in zeal for attending to the Truth-finder's body. Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on the discussion of food gained by reciting verses is the ninth.

10. The Question on Living at Ease Regarding Expounding the Teaching

10. "Venerable Nāgasena, you say 'the knowledge of omniscience was developed by the Truth-finder during four incalculable periods and a hundred thousand cosmic cycles in between, for the salvation of a great crowd of people.' And again 'the mind of one who had attained omniscience inclined to living at ease, not to expounding the Teaching.'

Just as, venerable Nāgasena, an archer or an archer's apprentice, having trained in archery for many days for the purpose of battle, might draw back when a great war has arrived, just so indeed, venerable Nāgasena, having developed the knowledge of omniscience during four incalculable periods and a hundred thousand cosmic cycles in between for the salvation of a great crowd of people, by one who had attained omniscience there was drawing back from expounding the Teaching.

Or else, venerable Nāgasena, just as a wrestler or a wrestler's apprentice, having trained in wrestling for many days, might draw back when a wrestling contest has arrived, just so indeed, venerable Nāgasena, having developed the knowledge of omniscience during four incalculable periods and a hundred thousand cosmic cycles in between for the salvation of a great crowd of people, by one who had attained omniscience there was drawing back from expounding the Teaching.

What indeed, venerable Nāgasena, did the Truth-finder draw back out of fear, or did he draw back out of obscurity, or did he draw back out of weakness, or did he draw back out of non-omniscience? What is the reason there? Come now, tell me the reason for overcoming uncertainty. If, venerable Nāgasena, the knowledge of omniscience was developed by the Truth-finder during four incalculable periods and a hundred thousand cosmic cycles in between for the salvation of a great crowd of people, then the statement 'the mind of one who had attained omniscience inclined to living at ease, not to expounding the Teaching' is wrong. If the mind of one who had attained omniscience inclined to living at ease, not to expounding the Teaching, then the statement 'the knowledge of omniscience was developed by the Truth-finder during four incalculable periods and a hundred thousand cosmic cycles in between for the salvation of a great crowd of people' is also wrong. This too is a question with two points, profound, hard to unravel, that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"The knowledge of omniscience was developed, great king, by the Truth-finder during four incalculable periods and a hundred thousand cosmic cycles in between for the salvation of a great crowd of people, and the mind of one who had attained omniscience inclined to living at ease, not to expounding the Teaching. But having seen the profundity, subtlety, difficulty to see, difficulty to understand, subtleness, and difficulty to penetrate of the Teaching, and the attachment and delight of beings, and their being firmly grasped by identity view, thinking 'how indeed, in what way indeed,' the mind inclined to living at ease, not to expounding the Teaching; this was just the mental reflection on the penetration of beings.

Just as, great king, a physician, a surgeon, having approached a man afflicted by many diseases, thinks thus: 'By what method indeed, or by which medicine, might this disease be appeased,' just so indeed, great king, having seen the people afflicted by the disease of all mental defilements, and the profundity, subtlety, difficulty to see, difficulty to understand, subtleness, and difficulty to penetrate of the Teaching, the Truth-finder's mind, thinking 'how indeed, in what way indeed,' inclined to living at ease, not to expounding the Teaching; this was just the mental reflection on the penetration of beings.

Just as, great king, for a king of the warrior caste anointed on the head, having seen people who are doorkeepers, military officers, councillors, townsmen, soldiers, troops, ministers, nobles, and those dependent on the king, this thought might arise: 'How indeed, in what way indeed, shall I treat these kindly,' just so indeed, great king, having seen the profundity, subtlety, difficulty to see, difficulty to understand, subtleness, and difficulty to penetrate of the Teaching, and the attachment and delight of beings, and their being firmly grasped by identity view, the Truth-finder's mind, thinking 'how indeed, in what way indeed,' inclined to living at ease, not to expounding the Teaching; this was just the mental reflection on the penetration of

beings.

But moreover, great king, this is the nature of all Truth-finders, that being requested by Brahmā, they expound the Teaching. But what is the reason there? Those who at that time were humans, hermits, wandering ascetics, ascetics and brahmins, all of them had Brahmā as their deity, had Brahmā as their authority, had Brahmā as their goal; therefore, by the bowing down of that powerful, famous, known, renowned, higher, very exalted one, the world with its gods will bow down, will be convinced, will be resolved - by this reason too, great king, the Truth-finders, being requested by Brahmā, expound the Teaching.

Just as, great king, whoever, whether a king or a king's chief minister, bows down to someone, shows esteem, by the bowing down of that more powerful one, the remaining populace bows down, shows esteem, just so indeed, great king, when Brahmā has bowed down, the world with its gods will bow down to the Truth-finders. The world, great king, venerates one who is venerated; therefore that Brahmā requests all Truth-finders for the proclamation of the Teaching, and by that reason the Truth-finders, being requested by Brahmā, expound the Teaching." "Excellent, venerable Nāgasena, the question has been well unravelled, the explanation is very good; thus I accept this as true."

The question on living at ease regarding expounding the Teaching is the tenth.

11. The Question on Teacher and Non-Teacher

11. "Venerable Nāgasena, this too was spoken by the Blessed One -

"I have no teacher, no one equal to me is found;
In the world including the gods, there is no one who is my match."

"And again it was said: 'Thus indeed, monks, Āḷāra Kālāma, being my teacher, placed me, being his pupil, on an equal footing with himself, and honoured me with the highest honour.' If, Venerable Nāgasena, it was spoken by the Truth-finder: 'I have no teacher, no one equal to me is found. In the world including the gods, there is no one who is my match,' then the statement 'Thus indeed, monks, Āḷāra Kālāma, being my teacher, placed me, being his pupil, on an equal footing with himself' is wrong. If it was spoken by the Truth-finder: 'Thus indeed, monks, Āḷāra Kālāma, being my teacher, placed me, being his pupil, on an equal footing with himself,' then 'I have no teacher, no one equal to me is found. In the world including the gods, there is no one who is my match' - that statement too is wrong. This too is a question with two points that has come to you; it should be resolved by you."

"This too was spoken, great king, by the Truth-finder: 'I have no teacher, no one equal to me is found. In the world including the gods, there is no one who is my match,' and it was said: 'Thus indeed, monks, Āḷāra Kālāma, being my teacher, placed me, being his pupil, on an equal footing with himself, and honoured me with the highest honour.'"

"But that statement was spoken with reference to the state of having a teacher, before the enlightenment, while still unenlightened, being just a Bodhisatta.

"There are, great king, these five teachers of the Bodhisatta before the enlightenment, while still unenlightened, being mindful, by whom instructed the Bodhisatta spent the day here and there. Which five? Those eight brahmins, great king, who examined the characteristics of the Bodhisatta when he was just born, as follows: Rāma, Dhaja, Lakkhaṇa, Mantī, Yañña, Suyāma, Subhoja, and Sudatta. They, having declared his welfare, performed a protective ceremony, and they were the first teachers.

"Furthermore, great king, the Bodhisatta's father, King Suddhodana, having brought a brahmin named Sabbamittā, who at that time was well-born, of northern birth with mantras, versed in terms, grammar, and the six factors, having poured water with a golden pitcher, gave him saying 'Train this boy' - this was the second teacher.

"Furthermore, great king, that deity who stirred the Bodhisatta, having heard whose word the Bodhisatta, stirred and agitated, at that very moment went forth into renunciation and became a monk - this was the third teacher.

"Furthermore, great king, Āḷāra Kālāma taught the preliminary work for the plane of nothingness - this was the fourth teacher.

"Furthermore, great king, Udaka Rāmaputta taught the preliminary work for the plane of neither-perception-nor-non-perception - this was the fifth teacher. These indeed, great king, are the five teachers of the Bodhisatta before the enlightenment, while still unenlightened, being mindful. But those teachers were in mundane states. But in this supramundane state, great king, for the penetration of omniscient knowledge, there is no unsurpassed instructor for the Truth-finder. The Truth-finder, great king, is self-become, without a teacher. Therefore, for this reason, it was spoken by the Truth-finder: 'I have no teacher, no one equal to me is found. In the world including the gods, there is no one who is my match.' "Excellent, Venerable Nāgasena, thus I accept this as true."

The question on teacher and non-teacher is the eleventh.

The Chapter on Intimacy is the fifth.

In this chapter there are eleven questions.

The Meṇḍaka Questions are concluded.



ABOUT THIS TRANSLATION

This translation is part of the PaliVerse Project - the first complete, unified English translation of the Pāli Canon together with its Commentaries (Aṭṭhakathā) and Subcommentaries (Tīkā), accompanied by interactive study tools. PaliVerse is an ongoing project. The AI translations are continuously improved through experts' revisions and feedback. This text is the latest translation as of the date of download.

PDF Creation Date: 14 September 2026

HOW TO CITE

PaliVerse (2026). The Triple Canon. The Canon of Discourses. 5. The Collection of Minor Texts. 20. The Questions of Milinda. 4. The Dilemmas Retrieved from paliverse.org

© 2026 The PaliVerse Project · All Rights Reserved
Centre for Study and Practice of Theravāda Buddhism
Civic Non-Profit Company registered in Greece
This PDF may be freely distributed for study and practice.

PaliVerse.org