

THE PALIVERSE PROJECT

The Universe of Buddha's Wisdom

The Triple Canon (Tipiṭaka)

3. The Canon of Higher Teaching (3. Abhidhamma Piṭaka)

05. Points of Controversy (05. Kathāvatthupāḷi)

2. Discussion on Falling Away (2. Parihānikathā)

[Kv 1.2, PTS 70-93]



PaliVerse

05. Points of Controversy

2. Discussion on Falling Away

1. Decline in Logical Consistency of the Argument

239. Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship everywhere? That should not be said. Etc. Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship everywhere? Yes. Is there decline of a Worthy One everywhere? That should not be said. Etc.

Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship always? That should not be said. Etc. Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship always? Yes. Is there decline of a Worthy One always? That should not be said. Etc.

Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Do all Worthy Ones fall away from arahantship? That should not be said. Etc. Do all Worthy Ones fall away from arahantship? Yes. Is there decline of all Worthy Ones? That should not be said. Etc.

Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Does a Worthy One falling away from arahantship fall away from the four fruits? That should not be said. Etc.

When a millionaire holding the position of millionaire with four hundred thousand, having lost one hundred thousand, has he fallen away from the position of millionaire? Yes. Has he fallen away from all his wealth? That should not be said. Etc.

Is a millionaire who holds his position of millionaire with four hundred thousand, when a hundred thousand has declined, capable of falling away from all his wealth? Yes. Is a Worthy One falling away from arahantship capable of falling away from the four fruits? That should not be said. Etc.

2. Decline in Comparison with Noble Persons

240. Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said. Etc.

Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Does a once-returner fall away from the fruition of once-returning? That should not be said. Etc.

Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Does a non-returner fall away from the fruition of non-returning? That should not be said. Etc.

Does a non-returner fall away from the fruition of non-returning? Yes. Does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said. Etc.

Does a non-returner fall away from the fruition of non-returning? Yes. Does a once-returner fall away from the fruition of once-returning? That should not be said. Etc.

Does a once-returner fall away from the fruition of once-returning? Yes. Does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said. Etc.

Does a stream-enterer not fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? Yes. Does a Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? That should not be said. Etc.

Does a once-returner not fall away from the fruition of once-returning? Yes. Does a Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? That should not be said. Etc.

Does a non-returner not fall away from the fruition of non-returning? Yes. Does a Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? That should not be said. Etc.

Does a stream-enterer not fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? Yes. Does a non-returner not fall away from the fruition of non-returning? That should not be said. Etc.

Does a once-returner not fall away from the fruition of once-returning? Yes. Does a non-returner not fall away from the fruition of non-returning? That should not be said. Etc.

Does a stream-enterer not fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? Yes. Does a once-returner not fall away from the fruition of once-returning? That should not be said. Etc.

241. Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Where does a Worthy One falling away from arahantship remain? In the fruition of non-returning. Where does a non-returner falling away from the fruition of non-returning remain? In the fruition of once-returning. Where does a once-returner falling away from the fruition of once-returning remain? In the fruition of stream-entry. Does a stream-enterer falling away from the fruition of stream-entry remain on the plane of the worldlings? That should not be said.

Acknowledge the refutation. If a Worthy One falling away from arahantship remains in the fruition of non-returning, a non-returner falling away from the fruition of non-returning remains in the fruition of once-returning, a once-returner falling away from the fruition of once-returning remains in the fruition of stream-entry; then indeed sir, it should be said - "a stream-enterer falling away from the fruition of stream-entry remains on the plane of the worldlings."

Does a Worthy One falling away from arahantship remain in the fruition of stream-entry? Yes. Does one realise arahantship immediately after the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said. Etc.

242. Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said. Etc. For whom have more mental defilements been abandoned, for the Worthy One or for the stream-enterer? For the Worthy One. If more mental defilements have been abandoned for the Worthy One, and a Worthy One falls away from arahantship; then indeed sir, it should be said - "a stream-enterer falls away from the fruition of stream-entry."

Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Does a once-returner fall away from the fruition of once-returning? That should not be said. Etc. For whom have more mental defilements been abandoned, for the Worthy One or for the once-returner? For the Worthy One. If more mental defilements have been abandoned for the Worthy One, and a Worthy One falls away from arahantship; then indeed sir, it should be said - "a once-returner falls away from the fruition of once-returning."

Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Does a non-returner fall away from the fruition of non-returning? That should not be said. Etc. For whom have more mental defilements been abandoned, for the Worthy One or for the non-returner? For the Worthy One. If more mental defilements have been abandoned for the Worthy One, and a Worthy One falls away from arahantship; then indeed sir, it should be said - "a non-returner falls away from the fruition of non-returning."

Does a non-returner fall away from the fruition of non-returning? Yes. Does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said. Etc. For whom have more mental defilements been abandoned, for the non-returner or for the stream-enterer? For the non-returner. If more mental defilements have been abandoned for the non-returner, and a non-returner falls away from the fruition of non-returning; then indeed sir, it should be said - "a stream-enterer falls away from the fruition of stream-entry."

243. Does a non-returner fall away from the fruition of non-returning? Yes. Does a once-returner fall away from the fruition of once-returning? That should not be said. Etc. For whom have more mental defilements been abandoned, for the non-returner or for the once-returner? For the non-returner. If more mental defilements have been abandoned for the non-returner, and a non-returner falls away from the fruition of non-returning; then indeed sir, it should be said - "a once-returner falls away from the fruition of once-returning."

Does a once-returner fall away from the fruition of once-returning? Yes. Does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said. Etc. For whom have more mental defilements been abandoned, for the once-returner or for the stream-enterer? For the once-returner. If more mental defilements have been abandoned for the once-returner, and a once-returner falls away from the fruition of once-returning; then indeed sir, it should be said - "a stream-enterer falls away from the fruition of stream-entry."

244. Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said. Etc. For whom is there exceeding path development, for the Worthy One or for the stream-enterer? For the Worthy One. If there is exceeding path development for the Worthy One, and a Worthy One falls away from arahantship; then indeed sir, it should be said - "a stream-enterer falls away from the fruition of stream-entry."

Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said. Etc. For whom is there exceeding development of establishment of mindfulness? Etc. development of right striving... development of bases for spiritual power... development of the faculties... development of the powers... development of enlightenment factors, for the Worthy One or for the stream-enterer? For the Worthy One. If there is exceeding development

of enlightenment factors for the Worthy One, and a Worthy One falls away from arahantship; then indeed sir, it should be said - "a stream-enterer falls away from the fruition of stream-entry."

Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Does a once-returner fall away from the fruition of once-returning? That should not be said. Etc. For whom is there exceeding path development? Etc. development of enlightenment factors, for the Worthy One or for the once-returner? For the Worthy One. If there is exceeding development of enlightenment factors for the Worthy One, and a Worthy One falls away from arahantship; then indeed sir, it should be said - "a once-returner falls away from the fruition of once-returning."

Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Does a non-returner fall away from the fruition of non-returning? That should not be said. Etc. For whom is there exceeding path development? Etc. development of enlightenment factors, for the Worthy One or for the non-returner? For the Worthy One. If there is exceeding development of enlightenment factors for the Worthy One, and a Worthy One falls away from arahantship; then indeed sir, it should be said - "a non-returner falls away from the fruition of non-returning."

245. Does a non-returner fall away from the fruition of non-returning? Yes. Does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said. Etc. For whom is there exceeding path development? Etc. development of enlightenment factors, for the non-returner or for the stream-enterer? For the non-returner. If there is exceeding development of enlightenment factors for the non-returner, and a non-returner falls away from the fruition of non-returning; then indeed sir, it should be said - "a stream-enterer falls away from the fruition of stream-entry."

Does a non-returner fall away from the fruition of non-returning? Yes. Does a once-returner fall away from the fruition of once-returning? That should not be said. Etc. For whom is there exceeding path development? Etc. development of enlightenment factors, for the non-returner or for the once-returner? For the non-returner. If there is exceeding development of enlightenment factors for the non-returner, and a non-returner falls away from the fruition of non-returning; then indeed sir, it should be said - "a once-returner falls away from the fruition of once-returning."

246. Does a once-returner fall away from the fruition of once-returning? Yes. Does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said. Etc. For whom is there exceeding path development? Etc. development of enlightenment factors, for the once-returner or for the stream-enterer? For the once-returner. If there is exceeding development of enlightenment factors for the once-returner, and a once-returner falls away from the fruition of once-returning; then indeed sir, it should be said - "a stream-enterer falls away from the fruition of stream-entry." Etc.

247. Suffering has been seen by a Worthy One; does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Suffering has been seen by a stream-enterer; does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said. Etc.

The origin has been seen by a Worthy One; does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. The origin has been seen by a stream-enterer; does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said. Etc.

Cessation has been seen by a Worthy One; does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Cessation has been seen by a stream-enterer; does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said. Etc.

The path has been seen by a Worthy One; does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. The path has been seen by a stream-enterer; does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said. Etc.

The four truths have been seen by a Worthy One; does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. The four truths have been seen by a stream-enterer; does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said. Etc.

Suffering has been seen by a Worthy One; does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Suffering has been seen by a once-returner; does a once-returner fall away from the fruition of once-returning? That should not be said. Etc.

The origin has been seen by a Worthy One, etc. cessation has been seen, etc. the path has been seen, etc. the four truths have been seen; does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. The four truths have been seen by a once-returner; does a once-returner fall away from the fruition of once-returning? That should not be said. Etc.

Suffering has been seen by a Worthy One; does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Suffering has been seen by a non-returner, does a non-returner fall away from the fruition of non-returning? That should not be said. Etc.

The origin has been seen by a Worthy One, etc. cessation has been seen, etc. the path has been seen, etc. the four truths have been seen; does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. The four truths have been seen by a non-returner, does a non-returner fall away from the fruition of non-returning? That should not be said. Etc.

248. Suffering has been seen by a non-returner, does a non-returner fall away from the fruition of non-returning? Yes. Suffering has been seen by a stream-enterer; does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said. Etc.

The origin has been seen by a non-returner, etc. cessation has been seen, etc. the path has been seen, etc. The four truths have been seen, does a non-returner fall away from the fruition of non-returning? Yes. The four truths have been seen by a stream-enterer; does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said. Etc.

Suffering has been seen by a non-returner, does a non-returner fall away from the fruition of non-returning? Yes. Suffering has been seen by a once-returner; does a once-returner fall away from the fruition of once-returning? That should not be said. Etc.

The origin has been seen by a non-returner, etc. cessation has been seen, etc. the path has been seen, etc. The four truths have been seen, does a non-returner fall away from the fruition of non-returning? Yes. The four truths have been seen by a once-returner; does a once-returner fall away from the fruition of once-returning? That should not be said. Etc.

249. Suffering has been seen by a once-returner; does a once-returner fall away from the fruition of once-returning? Yes. Suffering has been seen by a stream-enterer; does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said. Etc.

The origin has been seen by a once-returner, etc. cessation has been seen, etc. the path has been seen, etc. The four truths have been seen; does a once-returner fall away from the fruition of once-returning? Yes. The four truths have been seen by a stream-enterer; does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said. Etc.

250. Suffering has been seen by a stream-enterer; does a stream-enterer not fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? Yes. Suffering has been seen by a Worthy One; does a Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? That should not be said. Etc.

The origin has been seen by a stream-enterer, etc. cessation has been seen, etc. the path has been seen, etc. The four truths have been seen; does a stream-enterer not fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? Yes. The four truths have been seen by a Worthy One; does a Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? That should not be said. Etc.

Suffering has been seen by a once-returner, etc. The four truths have been seen; does a once-returner not fall away from the fruition of once-returning? Yes. The four truths have been seen by a Worthy One; does a Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? That should not be said. Etc.

Suffering has been seen by a non-returner, etc. The four truths have been seen; does a non-returner not fall away from the fruition of non-returning? Yes. The four truths have been seen by a Worthy One; does a Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? That should not be said. Etc.

Suffering has been seen by a stream-enterer, etc. The four truths have been seen; does a stream-enterer not fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? Yes.

Suffering has been seen by a non-returner, etc. The four truths have been seen; does a non-returner not fall away from the fruition of non-returning? That should not be said. Etc.

Suffering has been seen by a once-returner, etc. The four truths have been seen; does a once-returner not fall away from the fruition of once-returning? Yes. Suffering has been seen by a non-returner, etc. The four truths have been seen; does a non-returner not fall away from the fruition of non-returning? That should not be said. Etc.

Suffering has been seen by a stream-enterer, etc. The four truths have been seen; does a stream-enterer not fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? Yes. Suffering has been seen by a once-returner, etc. The four truths have been seen; does a once-

returner not fall away from the fruition of once-returning? That should not be said. Etc.

251. For a Worthy One, lust has been abandoned; does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. For a stream-enterer, identity view has been abandoned; does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said. Etc.

For a Worthy One, lust has been abandoned; does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. For a stream-enterer, sceptical doubt has been abandoned, etc. adherence to moral rules and austerities has been abandoned, etc. lust leading to the realms of misery has been abandoned, etc. hate leading to the realms of misery has been abandoned, etc. delusion leading to the realms of misery has been abandoned; does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said. Etc.

For a Worthy One, hate has been abandoned, etc. delusion has been abandoned... conceit has been abandoned... wrong view has been abandoned... sceptical doubt has been abandoned... sloth has been abandoned... restlessness has been abandoned... shamelessness has been abandoned, etc. moral fearlessness has been abandoned; does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. For a stream-enterer, identity view has been abandoned; does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said. Etc.

For a Worthy One, moral fearlessness has been abandoned; does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. For a stream-enterer, sceptical doubt has been abandoned, etc. adherence to moral rules and austerities has been abandoned, etc. lust leading to the realms of misery has been abandoned, etc. hate leading to the realms of misery has been abandoned, etc. delusion leading to the realms of misery has been abandoned; does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said. Etc.

For a Worthy One, lust has been abandoned; does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. For a once-returner, identity view has been abandoned; does a once-returner fall away from the fruition of once-returning? That should not be said.

For a Worthy One, lust has been abandoned; does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. For a once-returner, sceptical doubt has been abandoned, etc. adherence to moral rules and austerities has been abandoned, etc. gross sensual lust has been abandoned, gross anger has been abandoned; does a once-returner fall away from the fruition of once-returning? That should not be said. Etc.

For a Worthy One, hate has been abandoned, etc. moral fearlessness has been abandoned; does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. For a once-returner, identity view has been abandoned, etc. gross anger has been abandoned; does a once-returner fall away from the fruition of once-returning? That should not be said.

For a Worthy One, lust has been abandoned; does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. For a non-returner, identity view has been abandoned; does a non-returner fall away from the fruition of non-returning? That should not be said. Etc.

For a Worthy One, lust has been abandoned; does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. For a non-returner, sceptical doubt has been abandoned, etc. adherence to moral rules and austerities has been abandoned, residual sensual lust has been abandoned, residual anger has been abandoned; does a non-returner fall away from the fruition of non-returning? That should not be said.

For a Worthy One, hate has been abandoned, etc. moral fearlessness has been abandoned; does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. For a non-returner, identity view has been abandoned, etc. residual anger has been abandoned; does a non-returner fall away from the fruition of non-returning? That should not be said.

252. For a non-returner, identity view has been abandoned; does a non-returner fall away from the fruition of non-returning? Yes. For a stream-enterer, identity view has been abandoned; does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said.

For a non-returner, identity view has been abandoned; does a non-returner fall away from the fruition of non-returning? Yes. For a stream-enterer, sceptical doubt has been abandoned, etc. delusion leading to the realms of misery has been abandoned; does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said.

For a non-returner, sceptical doubt has been abandoned, etc. residual anger has been abandoned; does a non-returner fall away from the fruition of non-returning? Yes. For a stream-enterer, identity view has been abandoned, etc. delusion leading to the realms of misery has been abandoned; does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said.

For a non-returner, identity view has been abandoned; does a non-returner fall away from the fruition of non-returning? Yes. For a once-returner, identity view has been abandoned; does a once-returner fall away from the fruition of once-returning? That should not be said.

For a non-returner, identity view has been abandoned; does a non-returner fall away from the fruition of non-returning? Yes. For a once-returner, sceptical doubt has been abandoned, etc. adherence to moral rules and austerities has been abandoned, gross sensual lust has been abandoned, gross anger has been abandoned; does a once-returner fall away from the fruition of once-returning? That should not be said.

For a non-returner, sceptical doubt has been abandoned, etc. residual anger has been abandoned; does a non-returner fall away from the fruition of non-returning? Yes. For a once-returner, identity view has been abandoned, etc. gross anger has been abandoned; does a once-returner fall away from the fruition of once-returning? That should not be said.

253. For a once-returner, identity view has been abandoned; does a once-returner fall away from the fruition of once-returning? Yes. For a stream-enterer, identity view has been abandoned; does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said.

For a once-returner, identity view has been abandoned; does a once-returner fall away from the fruition of once-returning? Yes. For a stream-enterer, sceptical doubt has been abandoned, etc. delusion leading to the realms of misery has been abandoned; does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said.

For a once-returner, sceptical doubt has been abandoned, etc. gross sensual lust has been abandoned, gross anger has been abandoned; does a once-returner fall away from the fruition of once-returning? Yes. For a stream-enterer, identity view has been abandoned, etc. delusion leading to the realms of misery has been abandoned; does a stream-enterer fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? That should not be said.

254. For a stream-enterer, identity view has been abandoned; does a stream-enterer not fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? Yes. For a Worthy One, lust has been abandoned; does a Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? That should not be said.

For a stream-enterer, identity view has been abandoned; does a stream-enterer not fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? Yes. For a Worthy One, hate has been abandoned, etc. moral fearlessness has been abandoned; does a Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? That should not be said.

For a stream-enterer, sceptical doubt has been abandoned, etc. delusion leading to the realms of misery has been abandoned; does a stream-enterer not fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? Yes. For a Worthy One, lust has been abandoned, etc. moral fearlessness has been abandoned; does a Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? That should not be said.

255. For a once-returner, identity view has been abandoned; does a once-returner not fall away from the fruition of once-returning? Yes. For a Worthy One, lust has been abandoned, etc. moral fearlessness has been abandoned; does a Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? That should not be said.

For a once-returner, sceptical doubt has been abandoned, etc. gross anger has been abandoned; does a once-returner not fall away from the fruition of once-returning? Yes. For a Worthy One, lust has been abandoned, etc. moral fearlessness has been abandoned; does a Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? That should not be said.

256. For a non-returner, identity view has been abandoned; does a non-returner not fall away from the fruition of non-returning? Yes. For a Worthy One, lust has been abandoned, etc. moral fearlessness has been abandoned; does a Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? That should not be said.

For a non-returner, sceptical doubt has been abandoned, etc. subtle anger has been abandoned; does a non-returner not fall away from the fruition of non-returning? Yes. For a Worthy One, lust has been abandoned, etc. moral fearlessness has been abandoned; does a Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? That should not be said.

257. For a stream-enterer, identity view has been abandoned; does a stream-enterer not fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? Yes. For a non-returner, identity view has been abandoned... subtle anger has been abandoned; does a non-returner not fall away from the fruition of non-returning? That should not be said.

For a stream-enterer, sceptical doubt has been abandoned, etc. delusion leading to the realms of misery has been abandoned; does a stream-enterer not fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? Yes. For a non-returner, identity view has been abandoned, etc. subtle anger has been abandoned; does a non-returner not fall away from the fruition of non-returning? That should not be said.

258. For a once-returner, identity view has been abandoned; does a once-returner not fall away from the fruition of once-returning? Yes. For a non-returner, identity view has been abandoned, etc. subtle anger has been abandoned; does a non-returner not fall away from the fruition of non-returning? That should not be said.

For a once-returner, sceptical doubt has been abandoned, etc. gross anger has been abandoned; does a once-returner not fall away from the fruition of once-returning? Yes. For a non-returner, identity view has been abandoned, etc. subtle anger has been abandoned; does a non-returner not fall away from the fruition of non-returning? That should not be said.

259. For a stream-enterer, identity view has been abandoned; does a stream-enterer not fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? Yes. For a once-returner, identity view has been abandoned, etc. gross anger has been abandoned; does a once-returner not fall away from the fruition of once-returning? That should not be said.

For a stream-enterer, sceptical doubt has been abandoned, etc. delusion leading to the realms of misery has been abandoned; does a stream-enterer not fall away from the fruition of stream-entry? Yes. For a once-returner, identity view has been abandoned, etc. gross anger has been abandoned; does a once-returner not fall away from the fruition of once-returning? That should not be said.

260. Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Is it not that for a Worthy One lust has been abandoned, its root cut off, made like a palm stump, brought to obliteration, subject to non-arising in the future? Yes. If for a Worthy One lust has been abandoned, its root cut off, made like a palm stump, brought to obliteration, subject to non-arising in the future, then indeed sir, it should not be said - "a Worthy One falls away from arahantship."

Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Is it not that for a Worthy One hate has been abandoned, etc. delusion has been abandoned... conceit has been abandoned... wrong view has been abandoned... sceptical doubt has been abandoned... sloth has been abandoned... restlessness has been abandoned... shamelessness has been abandoned... moral fearlessness has been abandoned, its root cut off, made like a palm stump, brought to obliteration, subject to non-arising in the future? Yes. If for a Worthy One moral fearlessness has been abandoned, its root cut off, made like a palm stump, brought to obliteration, subject to non-arising in the future, then indeed sir, it should not be said - "a Worthy One falls away from arahantship."

Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Is it not that for a Worthy One the path has been developed for the abandoning of lust? Yes. If for a Worthy One the path has been developed for the abandoning of lust, then indeed sir, it should not be said - "a Worthy One falls away from arahantship."

Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Is it not that for a Worthy One the establishments of mindfulness have been developed for the abandoning of lust, etc. the right strivings have been developed... the bases for spiritual power have been developed... the faculties have been developed... the powers have been developed... the factors of enlightenment have been developed? Yes. If for a Worthy One the factors of enlightenment have been developed for the abandoning of lust, then indeed sir, it should not be said - "a Worthy One falls away from arahantship."

Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Is it not that for the Worthy One, for the abandoning of hate, etc. for the abandoning of moral fearlessness, the path has been developed, etc. the factors of enlightenment have been developed? Yes. If for the Worthy One, for the abandoning of moral fearlessness, the factors of enlightenment have been developed, then indeed sir, it should not be said - "a Worthy One falls away from arahantship."

261. Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Is it not that a Worthy One is without lust, without hate, without delusion, one who has done what had to be done, one who has laid down the burden, one who has attained his own welfare, one who has utterly eliminated the fetters of existence, one completely liberated through final knowledge, one whose cross-bar has been lifted, whose moat has been filled in, whose pillar has been pulled out, who is unbolted, a noble one whose flag has fallen, whose burden has been laid down, who is unbound, who has well-conquered victory; suffering has been fully understood by him, the origin has been abandoned, cessation has been realised, the path has been developed, what should be directly known has been directly known, what should be fully understood has been fully understood, what should be abandoned has been abandoned, what should be developed has been developed, what should be realised has been realised? Yes. If a Worthy One is without lust, without hate, without delusion, etc. what should be realised has been realised, then indeed sir, it should not be said - "a Worthy One falls away from arahantship."

262. Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? A temporarily liberated Worthy One falls away from arahantship, a perpetually liberated Worthy One does not fall away from arahantship. Does a temporarily liberated Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Does a perpetually liberated Worthy One fall away from arahantship? That should not be said.

Does a perpetually liberated Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? Yes. Does a temporarily liberated Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? That should not be said.

For a temporarily liberated Worthy One, lust has been abandoned; does a temporarily liberated Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. For a perpetually liberated Worthy One, lust has been abandoned; does a perpetually liberated Worthy One fall away from arahantship? That should not be said.

For a temporarily liberated Worthy One, hate has been abandoned, etc. moral fearlessness has been abandoned; does a temporarily liberated Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. For a perpetually liberated Worthy One, moral fearlessness has been abandoned; does a perpetually liberated Worthy One fall away from arahantship? That should not be said.

For a temporarily liberated Worthy One, the path has been developed for the abandoning of lust; does a temporarily liberated Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. For a perpetually liberated Worthy One, the path has been developed for the abandoning of lust; does a perpetually liberated Worthy One fall away from arahantship? That should not be said.

For a temporarily liberated Worthy One, the establishments of mindfulness have been developed for the abandoning of lust, etc. the right strivings have been developed... the bases for spiritual power have been developed... the faculties have been developed... the powers have been developed... the factors of enlightenment have been developed; does a temporarily liberated Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. For a perpetually liberated Worthy One, the establishments of mindfulness have been developed for the abandoning of lust, etc. the factors of enlightenment have been developed; does a perpetually liberated Worthy One fall away from arahantship? That should not be said.

For a temporarily liberated Worthy One, for the abandoning of hate, etc. for the abandoning of moral fearlessness, the path has been developed, etc. the factors of enlightenment have been developed; does a temporarily liberated Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. For a perpetually liberated Worthy One, for the abandoning of moral fearlessness, the path has been developed, etc. the factors of enlightenment have been developed; does a perpetually liberated Worthy One fall away from arahantship? That should not be said. Etc.

A temporarily liberated Worthy One is without lust, without hate, without delusion, one who has done what had to be done, one who has laid down the burden, one who has attained his own welfare, one who has utterly eliminated the fetters of existence, one completely liberated through final knowledge, one whose cross-bar has been lifted, whose moat has been filled in, whose pillar has been pulled out, who is unbolted, a noble one whose flag has fallen, whose burden has been laid down, who is unbound, who has well-conquered victory; suffering has been fully understood by him, the origin has been abandoned, cessation has been realised, the path has been developed, what should be directly known has been directly known, what should be fully understood has been fully understood, what should be abandoned has been abandoned, what should be developed has been developed, what should be realised has been realised, does a temporarily liberated Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. A perpetually liberated Worthy One is without lust, without hate, without delusion, etc. what should be realised has been realised, does a perpetually liberated Worthy One fall away from arahantship? That should not be said.

263. For a perpetually liberated Worthy One, lust has been abandoned; does a perpetually liberated Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? Yes. For a temporarily liberated Worthy One, lust has been abandoned; does a temporarily liberated Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? That should not be said.

For a perpetually liberated Worthy One, hate has been abandoned, etc. moral fearlessness has been abandoned; does a perpetually liberated Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? Yes. For a temporarily liberated Worthy One, moral fearlessness has been abandoned; does a temporarily liberated Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? That should not be said.

For a perpetually liberated Worthy One, the path has been developed for the abandoning of lust, etc. the factors of enlightenment have been developed; does a perpetually liberated Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? Yes. For a temporarily liberated Worthy One, the path has been developed for the abandoning of lust, etc. the factors of enlightenment have been developed; does a temporarily liberated Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? That should not be said.

For a perpetually liberated Worthy One, for the abandoning of hate, etc. for the abandoning of moral fearlessness, the path has been developed, etc. the factors of enlightenment have been developed; does a perpetually liberated Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? Yes. For a temporarily liberated Worthy One, for the abandoning of moral fearlessness, the path has been developed, etc. the factors of enlightenment have been developed; does a temporarily liberated Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? That should not be said.

A perpetually liberated Worthy One is without lust, without hate, without delusion, etc. what should be realised has been realised; does a perpetually liberated Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? Yes. A temporarily liberated Worthy One is without lust, without hate, without delusion, etc. what should be realised has been realised; does a temporarily liberated Worthy One not fall away from arahantship? That should not be said. Etc.

264. Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Did the Elder Sāriputta fall away from arahantship? That should not be said. The Elder Mahāmoggallāna... the Elder Mahākassapa... the Elder Mahākaccāyana... the Elder Mahākoṭṭhika... did the Elder Mahāpanthaka fall away from arahantship? That should not be said.

Did the Elder Sāriputta not fall away from arahantship? Yes. If the Elder Sāriputta did not fall away from arahantship, then indeed sir, it should not be said - "a Worthy One falls away from arahantship."

The Elder Mahāmoggallāna... the Elder Mahākassapa... the Elder Mahākaccāyana... the Elder Mahākoṭṭhika... did the Elder Mahāpanthaka not fall away from arahantship? Yes. If the Elder Mahāpanthaka did not fall away from arahantship, then indeed sir, it should not be said - "a Worthy One falls away from arahantship."

Comparison of Noble Persons.

3. Decline in Discourse Demonstration

265. Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Was it not said by the Blessed One -

"Various indeed are the practices, proclaimed by the ascetic;
They do not go to the beyond twice, nor is this sensed as once only."

Is there such a discourse? Yes. Well then, it should not be said - "a Worthy One falls away from arahantship."

Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Is there something to be cut for one who has cut? That should not be said.

Is there something to be cut for one who has cut? Yes. Was it not said by the Blessed One -

"Free from craving, without grasping, for whom there is no function;
For one who has cut there is nothing to be cut, the mental flood and snare
have been uprooted."

Is there such a discourse? Yes. Well then, it should not be said - "there is something to be cut for one who has cut."

266. Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Is there adding to what has been done? That should not be said.

Is there adding to what has been done? Yes. Was it not said by the Blessed One -

"For that monk rightly liberated, with peaceful mind;
There is no adding to what has been done, nothing to be done is found.

"Just as a rock, one solid mass, is not moved by the wind;
So forms, flavours, sounds, odours and contacts, all these.

"Desirable and undesirable phenomena do not cause such a one to tremble;
The mind is steady, liberated, and he contemplates its passing away."

Is there such a discourse? Yes. Well then, it should not be said - "there is adding to what has been done."

267. Should it not be said - "a Worthy One falls away from arahantship"? Yes. Was it not said by the Blessed One - "Monks, these five things lead to the decline of a monk who is temporarily liberated. Which five? Taking pleasure in work, taking pleasure in talk, taking pleasure in sleep, taking pleasure in company, and he does not review the mind as it is liberated. These, monks, are the five things that lead to the decline of a monk who is temporarily liberated." Is there such a discourse? Yes. Well then, a Worthy One falls away from arahantship.

Is there taking pleasure in work for a Worthy One? That should not be said.

Is there taking pleasure in work for a Worthy One? Yes. Is there lust, sensual lust, prepossession by sensual lust, mental fetter of sensual lust, mental flood of sensuality, mental bond of sensuality, mental hindrance of sensual desire for a Worthy One? That should not be said.

Is there taking pleasure in talk for a Worthy One, is there taking pleasure in sleep for a Worthy One, is there taking pleasure in company for a Worthy One? That should not be said.

Is there taking pleasure in company for a Worthy One? Yes. Is there lust, sensual lust, prepossession by sensual lust, mental fetter of sensual lust, mental flood of sensuality, mental bond of sensuality, mental hindrance of sensual desire for a Worthy One? That should not be said.

268. Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. A Worthy One falling away from arahantship, overcome by what does he fall away? He falls away overcome by lust. Dependent on what does prepossession arise? It arises dependent on underlying tendency. Is there underlying tendency for a Worthy One? That should not be said.

Is there underlying tendency for a Worthy One? Yes. Is there for a Worthy One the underlying tendency to sensual lust, the underlying tendency to aversion, the underlying tendency to conceit, the underlying tendency to wrong view, the underlying tendency to sceptical doubt, the underlying tendency to lust for existence, the underlying tendency to ignorance? That should not be said.

He falls away overcome by hate, etc. He falls away overcome by delusion. Dependent on what does prepossession arise? It arises dependent on underlying tendency. Is there underlying tendency for a Worthy One? That should not be said. Etc.

Is there underlying tendency for a Worthy One? Yes. Is there for a Worthy One the underlying tendency to sensual lust, etc. the underlying tendency to ignorance? That should not be said.

Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. For a Worthy One falling away from arahantship, what goes to production? Lust goes to production. Does identity view go to production, does sceptical doubt go to production, does adherence to moral rules and austerities go to production? That should not be said. Does hate go to production, etc. Does delusion go to production, does identity view go to production, does sceptical doubt go to production, does adherence to moral rules and austerities go to production? That should not be said.

Does a Worthy One fall away from arahantship? Yes. Does a Worthy One accumulate? That should not be said. Does a Worthy One diminish? That should not be said. Does a Worthy One abandon? That should not be said. Does a Worthy One cling? That should not be said. Does a Worthy One scatter? That should not be said. Does a Worthy One heap up? That should not be said. Does a Worthy One extinguish? That should not be said. Does a Worthy One kindle? That should not be said.

Is it not that a Worthy One neither accumulates nor diminishes; having diminished, he stands firm? Yes. If a Worthy One neither accumulates nor diminishes, having diminished, stands firm, then indeed sir, it should not be said - "a Worthy One falls away from arahantship."

Is it not that a Worthy One neither abandons nor clings; having abandoned, he stands firm? Yes. If a Worthy One neither abandons nor clings, having abandoned, stands firm, then indeed sir, it should not be said - "a Worthy One falls away from arahantship."

Is it not that a Worthy One neither scatters nor heaps up; having scattered, he stands firm? Yes. If a Worthy One neither scatters nor heaps up, having scattered, stands firm, then indeed sir, it should not be said - "a Worthy One falls away from

arahantship."

Is it not that a Worthy One neither extinguishes nor kindles, having extinguished, he stands firm? Yes. If a Worthy One neither extinguishes nor kindles, having extinguished, he stands firm, then indeed sir, it should not be said - "a Worthy One falls away from arahantship."

The Discussion on Decline is finished.



ABOUT THIS TRANSLATION

This translation is part of the PaliVerse Project - the first complete, unified English translation of the Pāli Canon together with its Commentaries (Aṭṭhakathā) and Subcommentaries (Tīkā), accompanied by interactive study tools. PaliVerse is an ongoing project. The AI translations are continuously improved through experts' revisions and feedback. This text is the latest translation as of the date of download.

PDF Creation Date: 14 September 2026

HOW TO CITE

PaliVerse (2026). The Triple Canon. 3. The Canon of Higher Teaching. 05. Points of Controversy. 2. Discussion on Falling Away Retrieved from paliverse.org

© 2026 The PaliVerse Project · All Rights Reserved
Centre for Study and Practice of Theravāda Buddhism
Civic Non-Profit Company registered in Greece
This PDF may be freely distributed for study and practice.

PaliVerse.org