

THE PALIVERSE PROJECT

The Universe of Buddha's Wisdom

The Triple Canon (Tipiṭaka)

The Canon of Discourses (Sutta Piṭaka)

5. The Collection of Minor Texts (5. Khuddaka Nikāya)

20. The Questions of Milinda (20. Milindapañhapāḷi)

2-3. The Questions of Milinda (2-3. Milindapañho)

[Mil 3.1-8, PTS 25-95]



PaliVerse

5. The Collection of Minor Texts

20. The Questions of Milinda

2-3.

The Questions of Milinda

1. The Great Chapter

1. The Question on Description

1. Then King Milinda approached the Venerable Nāgasena; having approached, he exchanged friendly greetings with the Venerable Nāgasena, and having concluded the pleasant and memorable talk, he sat down to one side. The Venerable Nāgasena also, by his friendly response, pleased the mind of King Milinda. Then King Milinda said this to the Venerable Nāgasena: "How are you known, venerable sir? What is your name, venerable sir?" "I am known as 'Nāgasena,' great king; my fellow monks in the holy life address me as 'Nāgasena,' great king. But although mother and father give a name such as 'Nāgasena' or 'Sūrasena' or 'Vīrasena' or 'Sīhasena,' yet, great king, this is only a term, a designation, a description, a conventional expression, a mere name, that is to say, 'Nāgasena'; no person is found here."

Then King Milinda said thus: "Let the venerable five hundred Greeks and eighty thousand monks hear me: this Nāgasena says thus: 'No person is found here.' Is it proper to approve of that?" Then King Milinda said this to the Venerable Nāgasena: "If, venerable Nāgasena, no person is found, then who gives you the requisites of robes, almsfood, lodging and medicine for the sick? Who consumes them? Who guards morality? Who devotes himself to meditation? Who realises the path, the fruition, and Nibbāna? Who kills a living being? Who takes what is not given? Who engages in sexual misconduct? Who speaks falsely? Who drinks intoxicants? Who commits the five heinous actions? Therefore there is no wholesome, there is no unwholesome, there is no doer or causer of wholesome and unwholesome actions, there is no result and consequence of well-done and wrongly-done actions. If, venerable Nāgasena, whoever kills you, there is no killing of a living being for him either. For you too, venerable Nāgasena, there is no teacher, there is no preceptor, there is no full ordination. You say: 'My fellow monks in the holy life address me as Nāgasena, great king.' Which Nāgasena is here? Is the head hair Nāgasena, venerable sir?" "No indeed, great king." "Is the body hair Nāgasena?" "No indeed, great king." "Nails, etc. teeth, etc. skin, etc. having asked for meat, etc. sinews, etc. bones, etc. bone marrow, etc. kidneys, etc. heart, etc. liver, etc. pleura, etc. spleen, etc. lungs, etc. intestines, etc. mesentery, etc. undigested food, etc. excrement, etc. bile, etc. phlegm, etc. pus, etc. blood, etc. sweat, etc. fat, etc. tears, etc. grease, etc. spittle, etc. snot, etc. synovial fluid, etc. urine, etc. Is the brain in the head Nāgasena?" "No indeed, great king." "Is then, venerable sir, matter Nāgasena?" "No indeed, great king." "Is feeling Nāgasena?" "No indeed, great king." "Is perception Nāgasena?" "No

indeed, great king." "Are activities Nāgasena?" "No indeed, great king." "Is consciousness Nāgasena?" "No indeed, great king." "Is then, venerable sir, matter, feeling, perception, activities, and consciousness together Nāgasena?" "No indeed, great king." "Is then, venerable sir, something apart from matter, feeling, perception, activities, and consciousness Nāgasena?" "No indeed, great king." "Though I question and question, venerable sir, I do not see Nāgasena. Is then just the sound 'Nāgasena' Nāgasena, venerable sir?" "No indeed, great king." "Then who is Nāgasena here? You speak falsely, venerable sir, you speak a lie; there is no Nāgasena."

Then the Venerable Nāgasena said this to King Milinda: "You, great king, are delicate like a warrior, extremely delicate. For you, great king, at the noon period of the day, having trodden on hot ground, hot sand, rough gravel and pebbles, coming on foot, your feet are hurt, your body becomes weary, your mind is injured, body-consciousness accompanied by pain arises. Did you come on foot or by vehicle?" "I did not come on foot, venerable sir; I came by chariot." "If you, great king, came by chariot, tell me about the chariot. Is the pole the chariot, great king?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Is the axle the chariot?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Are the wheels the chariot?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Is the body of the chariot the chariot?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Is the chariot-rod the chariot?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Is the yoke the chariot?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Are the reins the chariot?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Is the goad-stick the chariot?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Is the pole, axle, wheels, body of the chariot, chariot-rod, yoke, reins and goad the chariot, great king?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "But then, great king, is there a chariot apart from the pole, axle, wheels, body of the chariot, chariot-rod, yoke, reins and goad?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Though I am asking and asking, great king, I do not see a chariot. Is the mere sound 'chariot' the chariot, great king?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Then what is the chariot here? You speak falsehood, great king, you speak a lie; there is no chariot. You, great king, are the foremost king in the whole of Jambudīpa; being afraid of whom do you speak a lie? Let the venerable five hundred Greeks and eighty thousand monks hear me: this King Milinda says thus 'I came by chariot'; if you, great king, came by chariot, tell me about the chariot - being told thus, he does not produce a chariot. Is it proper to approve of that?" When this was said, the five hundred Greeks, having given applause to the Venerable Nāgasena, said this to King Milinda: "Now, great king, speak if you are able."

Then King Milinda said this to the Venerable Nāgasena: "I do not speak falsely, Venerable Nāgasena; dependent on the pole, dependent on the axle, dependent on the wheels, dependent on the body of the chariot, dependent on the chariot-rod, the term, designation, description, conventional expression, mere name 'chariot' occurs."

"Good indeed, great king, you understand the chariot. Just so indeed, great king, for me too, dependent on the hair of the head, dependent on the body hair, etc. dependent on the brain in the head, dependent on materiality, dependent on feeling, dependent on perception, dependent on activities, dependent on consciousness, the term, designation, description, conventional expression, mere name 'Nāgasena' occurs; but in the ultimate sense, a person is not found here. This too was spoken, great king, by the nun Vajirā in the presence of the Blessed One -

"Just as indeed from an assemblage of parts, there is the word 'chariot';
So when the aggregates exist, there is the convention 'a being'."

"Wonderful, Venerable Nāgasena, marvellous, Venerable Nāgasena, most variegated discernments of questions have been answered. If the Buddha were standing, he would give applause. Good, good, Nāgasena, most variegated discernments of questions have been answered."

The Question on Description is first.

2. The Question on Counting the Rains Retreats

2. "How many rains retreats have you, Venerable Nāgasena?" "I have seven rains retreats, great king." "What are these seven, venerable sir - are you seven, or is the counting seven?"

Now at that time, the shadow of King Milinda, adorned with all ornaments, decorated and prepared, was seen on the ground, and the shadow was seen in a water jar. Then the Venerable Nāgasena said this to King Milinda: "This shadow of yours, great king, is seen on the ground and in the water jar. But then, great king, are you the king, or is the shadow the king?" "I, Venerable Nāgasena, am the king; this shadow is not the king, but in dependence on me the shadow occurs." "Just so indeed, great king, the counting of rains retreats is seven, but I am not seven; in dependence on me, seven occurs, like the simile of the shadow, great king." "Wonderful, Venerable Nāgasena, marvellous, Venerable Nāgasena, most variegated discernments of questions have been answered."

The Question on Counting the Rains Retreats is second.

3. The Question on Investigation

3. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, will you converse with me?" "If you, great king, will converse in the manner of the wise, I will converse; but if you will converse in the manner of kings, I will not converse." "How, venerable Nāgasena, do the wise converse?" "In the conversation of the wise, great king, there is winding up and there is unwinding, there is refutation and there is redress, there is agreement and there is counter-agreement, yet the wise do not become angry on account of that; thus, great king, do the wise converse." "But how, venerable sir, do kings converse?" "Kings, great king, in conversation assert one matter; whoever contradicts that matter, they command punishment for him: 'Decree punishment for this one'; thus, great king, do kings converse." "I will converse in the manner of the wise, venerable sir, not in the manner of kings. Let the venerable one converse freely, just as he converses with a monk or a novice or a lay follower or a monastery attendant; thus freely let the venerable one converse, do not be afraid." "Very well, great king," the elder gave thanks.

The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, I will ask." "Ask, great king." "You have been asked by me, venerable sir." "It has been answered, great king." "But what, venerable sir, has been answered by you?" "But what, great king, has been asked by you?"

The Question on Investigation is third.

4. The Question on the Infinite Body

4. Then this occurred to King Milinda: "This monk is wise, competent to converse with me, and there will be many points to be asked by me; while those points remain unasked, the sun will set; what if I were to converse tomorrow in the inner palace." Then the king said this to Devamantiya: "Well then, you, Devamantiya, should inform the venerable sir: 'Tomorrow there will be a conversation with the king in the inner palace.'" Having said this, King Milinda, having risen from his seat, having asked permission of the elder Nāgasena, having mounted his chariot, departed rehearsing "Nāgasena, Nāgasena."

Then Devamantiya said this to the Venerable Nāgasena: "The king, venerable sir, Milinda, says thus: 'Tomorrow there will be a conversation with the king in the inner palace.'" "Very well," the elder gave thanks. Then after that night had passed, Devamantiya and Anantakāya and Maṅkura and Sabbadinna approached King Milinda; having approached, they said this to King Milinda: "Should the venerable Nāgasena come, great king?" "Yes, let him come." "With how many monks should he come?" "With however many monks he wishes, let him come with that many monks."

Then Sabbadinna said: "Let him come, great king, with ten monks." For the second time also the king said: "With however many monks he wishes, let him come with that many monks." For the second time also Sabbadinna said: "Let him come, great king, with ten monks." For the third time also the king said: "With however many monks he wishes, let him come with that many monks." For the third time also Sabbadinna said: "Let him come, great king, with ten monks." "But all this honour has been prepared; I say: 'With however many monks he wishes, let him come with that many monks.' This one, my good Sabbadinna, speaks otherwise; are we not competent to give food to the monks?" When this was said, Sabbadinna became ashamed.

Then Devamantiya and Anantakāya and Maṅkura approached the Venerable Nāgasena; having approached, they said this to the Venerable Nāgasena: "The king, venerable sir, Milinda, says thus: 'With however many monks he wishes, let him come with that many monks.'" Then the Venerable Nāgasena, having dressed in the earlier period of the day, taking his bowl and robe, entered Sāgala together with eighty thousand monks.

Then Anantakāya, going in dependence on the Venerable Nāgasena, said this to the Venerable Nāgasena: "Venerable Nāgasena, as for this that you say 'Nāgasena', which one here is Nāgasena?" The elder said: "But who do you think here is 'Nāgasena'?" "That which, venerable sir, is the wind inside, the soul, that enters and exits, that I think is 'Nāgasena'." "But if that wind, having exited, should not enter, or having entered, should not exit, would that man live?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "But those who are conch-blowers, who blow conches, does the wind enter them again?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "But those who are flute-blowers, who blow flutes, does the wind enter them again?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "But those who are horn-blowers, who blow horns, does the wind enter them again?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Then why do they not die from that?" "I am not competent to converse with you, a debater; please, venerable sir, explain the meaning." "This is not the soul; these are called in-breath and out-breath, bodily activities," the elder spoke a talk on the higher teaching. Then Anantakāya declared his state as a lay follower.

The Question on the Infinite Body is fourth.

5. The Question on Going Forth

5. Then the Venerable Nāgasena approached the dwelling of King Milinda; having approached, he sat down on the prepared seat. Then King Milinda, with his own hand, satisfied and served the Venerable Nāgasena together with his following with superior solid and soft food, and clothed each and every monk with a suit of garments, and clothed the Venerable Nāgasena with the three robes, and said this to the Venerable Nāgasena: "Venerable Nāgasena, please remain here with ten monks; let the rest go."

Then King Milinda, knowing that the Venerable Nāgasena had finished eating and had removed his hand from the bowl, having taken a certain low seat, sat down to one side. Seated to one side, King Milinda said this to the Venerable Nāgasena:

"Venerable Nāgasena, on what subject shall there be friendly conversation?" "We, great king, are desirous of meaning; let there be friendly conversation on meaning."

The king said: "For what purpose, Venerable Nāgasena, is your going forth, and what is your ultimate goal?" The elder said: "So that, great king, this suffering might cease, and other suffering might not arise. For this purpose, great king, is our going forth; final Nibbāna without clinging is our ultimate goal."

"But, Venerable Nāgasena, do all go forth for this purpose?" "No indeed, great king, some go forth for this purpose, some go forth driven by kings, some go forth driven by thieves, some go forth oppressed by debt, some go forth for the purpose of livelihood; but those who go forth rightly, they go forth for this purpose."

"But you, venerable sir, did you go forth for this purpose?" "I, great king, went forth when young; I did not know 'I am going forth for this particular purpose'; but this occurred to me: 'These ascetics, disciples of the Sakyan, are wise; they will train me.' Having been trained by them, I know and I see: 'For this particular purpose is the going forth.'"

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The Question on Going Forth is fifth.

6. The Question on Conception

6. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, is there anyone who, having died, does not reunite?" The elder said: "Someone reunites, someone does not reunite." "Who reunites, who does not reunite?" "One with mental defilement, great king, reunites; one free from mental defilement does not reunite." "But you, Venerable Nāgasena, will you reunite?" "If, great king, I will be one with clinging, I will reunite; if I will be one without clinging, I will not reunite."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The Question on Conception is sixth.

7. The Question on Wise Attention

7. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, one who does not reunite, does he not reunite by wise attention?" "By wise attention, great king, and by wisdom and by other wholesome mental states." "Is not, venerable sir, wise attention just wisdom?"

"No indeed, great king, attention is one thing, wisdom is another; for these goats, sheep, oxen, buffaloes, camels and donkeys also have attention, but they do not have wisdom."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The Question on Wise Attention is seventh.

8. The Question on the Characteristic of Attention

8. The king said: "What is the characteristic of attention, Venerable Nāgasena, what is the characteristic of wisdom?" "Consideration is the characteristic of attention, great king, cutting is the characteristic of wisdom."

"How is consideration the characteristic of attention, how is cutting the characteristic of wisdom? Give a simile." "Do you know, great king, barley reapers?" "Yes, venerable sir, I know." "How, great king, do barley reapers reap barley?" "Having grasped a sheaf of barley with the left hand, venerable sir, having grasped a sickle with the right hand, they cut with the sickle."

"Just as, great king, a barley reaper, having grasped a sheaf of barley with the left hand, having grasped a sickle with the right hand, cuts the barley, even so, great king, one who practises meditation, having grasped the mind with attention, cuts the defilements with wisdom. Thus, great king, consideration is the characteristic of attention, thus cutting is the characteristic of wisdom."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The Question on the Characteristic of Attention is eighth.

9. The Question on the Characteristic of Morality

9. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, as for this that you say 'and by other wholesome mental states', what are those wholesome mental states?" "Morality, great king, faith, energy, mindfulness, concentration - these are those wholesome mental states." "What is the characteristic of morality, venerable sir?" "The characteristic of morality is support, great king, for all wholesome mental states; morality is the support for the faculties, powers, factors of enlightenment, path factors, establishments of mindfulness, right strivings, bases for spiritual power, meditative absorptions, deliverances, concentrations and attainments. Indeed, great king, one who practises meditation, established in morality, based upon morality, established upon morality, develops the five faculties - the faith faculty, the energy faculty, the mindfulness faculty, the concentration faculty, the wisdom faculty - and all wholesome mental states do not decline." "Give a simile." "Just as, great king, whatever seed-plants and growing plants attain growth, increase, and expansion, all of them, in dependence on earth, established upon earth, attain growth, increase, and expansion. Just so, great king, one who practises meditation, based upon morality, established upon morality, develops the five faculties - the faith faculty, the energy faculty, the mindfulness faculty, the concentration faculty, the wisdom faculty."

"Give a further simile." "Just as, great king, whatever activities requiring strength are done, all of them are done in dependence on earth, established upon earth. Just so,

great king, one who practises meditation, based upon morality, established upon morality, develops the five faculties - the faith faculty, the energy faculty, the mindfulness faculty, the concentration faculty, the wisdom faculty."

"Give a further simile." "Just as, great king, a city builder, wishing to build a city, first having had the city site cleared, having had stumps and thorns removed, having had the ground made level, then afterwards, having divided it by the demarcation of streets, crossroads, and intersections and so on, builds the city. Just so, great king, one who practises meditation, based upon morality, established upon morality, develops the five faculties - the faith faculty, the energy faculty, the mindfulness faculty, the concentration faculty, the wisdom faculty."

"Give a further simile." "Just as, great king, an acrobat, wishing to display his craft, having had the ground dug, having had gravel and potsherds removed, having had the ground made level, displays his craft on soft ground. Just so, great king, one who practises meditation, based upon morality, established upon morality, develops the five faculties - the faith faculty, the energy faculty, the mindfulness faculty, the concentration faculty, the wisdom faculty. This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One -

'A wise man established in morality, developing the mind and wisdom;
An ardent and prudent monk, he can disentangle this tangle.'

'This is the support like the earth for living beings, and this is the root for the growth of wholesomeness;
And this is the foremost in all the Conquerors' instruction - the aggregate of morality, the excellent Pātimokkha.'"

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The Question on the Characteristic of Morality is ninth.

10. The Question on Faith with the Characteristic of Confidence

10. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, what is the characteristic of faith?" "Faith has the characteristic of placidity, great king, and faith has the characteristic of leaping forward." "How, venerable sir, does faith have the characteristic of placidity?" "Faith, great king, when arising, suppresses the mental hindrances; the mind free from mental hindrances becomes clear, serene, and undisturbed. Thus, great king, faith has the characteristic of placidity."

"Give a simile." "Just as, great king, a wheel-turning monarch, travelling on the highway together with his fourfold army, might cross a small body of water, and that water would become stirred up by elephants, horses, chariots, and infantry - turbid, agitated, and muddy. And having crossed over, the wheel-turning monarch might command the people: 'Bring drinking water, my good men, I will drink,' and the king might have a water-clearing gem. 'Yes, Sire,' those people, having assented to the wheel-turning monarch, would throw that water-clearing gem into the water; as soon as it was thrown into that water, the shells, moss, and water plants would disappear,

the mud would settle, and the water would become clear, serene, and undisturbed. Then they would offer drinking water to the wheel-turning monarch: 'Drink, Sire, the drinking water.'

"Just as, great king, the water, so should the mind be seen; just as those people, so should one who practises meditation be seen; just as the shells, moss, water plants, and mud, so should the mental defilements be seen. Just as the water-clearing gem, so should faith be seen; just as when the water-clearing gem is thrown into the water, the shells, moss, and water plants would disappear, the mud would settle, and the water would become clear, serene, and undisturbed, even so, great king, faith when arising suppresses the mental hindrances; the mind free from mental hindrances becomes clear, serene, and undisturbed. Thus, great king, faith has the characteristic of placidity."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The Question on Faith with the Characteristic of Confidence is tenth.

11. The Question on Faith with the Characteristic of Leaping Forward

11. "How, venerable sir, does faith have the characteristic of leaping forward?" "Just as, great king, one who practises meditation, having seen the liberated mind of others, leaps forward into the fruition of stream-entry or the fruition of once-returning or the fruition of non-returning or arahantship, and makes exertion for the attainment of the unattained, for the achievement of the unachieved, for the realisation of the unrealised. Thus, great king, faith has the characteristic of leaping forward."

"Give a simile." "Just as, great king, a great rain cloud might pour down on the upper mountain, and that water, flowing according to the slope, having filled the mountain grottoes, clefts, and channels, might fill the river, and it might flow overflowing both banks; then a great multitude of people, having come, not knowing the shallowness or depth of that river, might stand frightened and hesitant on the bank; then a certain man, having come, seeing his own strength and power, having tightly bound his loin-cloth, having leaped forward, might cross over; having seen him crossed over, the great multitude of people too might cross over. Even so, great king, one who practises meditation, having seen the liberated mind of others, leaps forward into the fruition of stream-entry or the fruition of once-returning or the fruition of non-returning or arahantship, and makes exertion for the attainment of the unattained, for the achievement of the unachieved, for the realisation of the unrealised. Thus, great king, faith has the characteristic of leaping forward. This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One in the excellent Connected Collection:

'By faith one crosses the flood, by diligence the ocean;
By energy one gets over suffering, by wisdom one becomes purified.'

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The Question on Faith with the Characteristic of Leaping Forward is eleventh.

12. The Question on the Characteristic of Energy

12. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, what is the characteristic of energy?" "The characteristic of energy is support, great king; all wholesome mental states supported by energy do not decline."

"Give a simile." "Just as, great king, a man might support a falling house with another piece of timber, and being supported, that house would not fall. Even so, great king, the characteristic of energy is support; all wholesome mental states supported by energy do not decline."

"Give a further simile." "Just as, great king, a great army might defeat a small army, then the king might remind and send reinforcements to one another, and give power step by step to his own small army, and together with that, the small army might defeat the great army. Even so, great king, the characteristic of energy is support; all wholesome mental states supported by energy do not decline. This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One - 'The noble disciple with energy, monks, abandons the unwholesome, develops the wholesome. He abandons the blameworthy, develops the blameless. He maintains himself in purity.'"

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The Question on the Characteristic of Energy is twelfth.

13. The Question on the Characteristic of Mindfulness

13. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, what is the characteristic of mindfulness?" "Mindfulness has the characteristic of non-floating, great king, and the characteristic of taking up." "How, venerable sir, does mindfulness have the characteristic of non-floating?" "Mindfulness, great king, when arising, keeps afloat mental states that are wholesome and unwholesome, blameworthy and blameless, inferior and superior, dark and bright, and their counterparts: 'These are the four establishments of mindfulness, these are the four right strivings, these are the four bases for spiritual power, these are the five faculties, these are the five powers, these are the seven factors of enlightenment, this is the noble eightfold path, this is serenity, this is insight, this is true knowledge, this is liberation.' Thereupon one who practises meditation associates with mental states that should be associated with, and does not associate with mental states that should not be associated with. He keeps company with mental states that should be kept company with, and does not keep company with mental states that should not be kept company with. Thus, great king, mindfulness has the characteristic of non-floating."

"Give a simile." "Just as, great king, the storekeeper of a wheel-turning monarch reminds the wheel-turning monarch of his glory morning and evening: 'So many, Sire, are your elephants, so many horses, so many chariots, so many infantry, so much unwrought gold, so much gold, so much property - may the Sire remember that' - thus he keeps afloat the king's property. Even so, great king, mindfulness when arising keeps afloat mental states that are wholesome and unwholesome, blameworthy and blameless, inferior and superior, dark and bright, and their counterparts: 'These are the four establishments of mindfulness, these are the four right strivings, these are the four bases for spiritual power, these are the five faculties, these are the five powers, these are the seven factors of enlightenment, this is the noble eightfold path, this is serenity, this is insight, this is true knowledge,

this is liberation.' Thereupon one who practises meditation associates with mental states that should be associated with, and does not associate with mental states that should not be associated with. He keeps company with mental states that should be kept company with, and does not keep company with mental states that should not be kept company with. Thus, great king, mindfulness has the characteristic of non-floating."

"How, venerable sir, does mindfulness have the characteristic of taking up?"

"Mindfulness, great king, when arising, follows the courses of mental states that are beneficial and harmful: 'These mental states are beneficial, these mental states are harmful. These mental states are helpful, these mental states are unhelpful.'

Thereupon one who practises meditation dispels harmful mental states, and takes up beneficial mental states. He dispels unhelpful mental states, and takes up helpful mental states. Thus, great king, mindfulness has the characteristic of taking up."

"Give a simile." "Just as, great king, the adviser treasure of a wheel-turning monarch knows what is beneficial and harmful for the king: 'These are beneficial for the king, these are harmful. These are helpful, these are unhelpful.' Thereupon he dispels what is harmful, and takes up what is beneficial. He dispels what is unhelpful, and takes up what is helpful. Even so, great king, mindfulness when arising follows the courses of mental states that are beneficial and harmful: 'These mental states are beneficial, these mental states are harmful. These mental states are helpful, these mental states are unhelpful.' Thereupon one who practises meditation dispels harmful mental states, and takes up beneficial mental states. He dispels unhelpful mental states, and takes up helpful mental states. Thus, great king, mindfulness has the characteristic of taking up. This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One - 'But mindfulness, monks, I say is useful everywhere.'"

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The Question on the Characteristic of Mindfulness is thirteenth.

14. The Question on Concentration

14. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, what is the characteristic of concentration?" "Concentration has the characteristic of being chief, great king; whatever wholesome mental states there are, all of them have concentration as chief, slant towards concentration, slope towards concentration, incline towards concentration."

"Give a simile." "Just as, great king, whatever rafters there are of a pinnacle building, all of them go to the pinnacle, slant towards the pinnacle, converge at the pinnacle, the pinnacle is declared the foremost among them. Just so, great king, whatever wholesome mental states there are, all of them have concentration as chief, slant towards concentration, slope towards concentration, incline towards concentration."

"Give a further simile." "Just as, great king, some king might enter battle together with his fourfold army, and the entire army - elephants, horses, chariots, and infantry - would have him as chief, slant towards him, slope towards him, incline towards him, and would follow him around. Just so, great king, whatever wholesome mental states there are, all of them have concentration as chief, slant towards concentration, slope

towards concentration, incline towards concentration. Thus, great king, concentration has the characteristic of being chief. This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One - "Develop concentration, monks; a concentrated monk, monks, understands as it really is."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The Question on Concentration is fourteenth.

15. The Question on the Characteristic of Wisdom

15. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, what is the characteristic of wisdom?"

"Indeed, great king, it was previously said by me: 'Cutting is the characteristic of wisdom,' but also illuminating is the characteristic of wisdom." "How, venerable sir, is illuminating the characteristic of wisdom?" "Wisdom, great king, when arising, dispels the darkness of ignorance, generates the light of true knowledge, shows the light of knowledge, and makes the noble truths obvious. Thereupon one who practises meditation sees with right wisdom: 'impermanent' or 'suffering' or 'non-self.'"

"Give a simile." "Just as, great king, a man might bring a lamp into a dark house; the lamp having entered dispels the darkness, generates light, shows illumination, and makes forms obvious. Just so indeed, great king, wisdom when arising dispels the darkness of ignorance, generates the light of true knowledge, shows the light of knowledge, and makes the noble truths obvious. Thereupon one who practises meditation sees with right wisdom: 'impermanent' or 'suffering' or 'non-self.' Thus indeed, great king, illuminating is the characteristic of wisdom."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The Question on the Characteristic of Wisdom is fifteenth.

16. The Question on the Accomplishment of a Single Function by Various Phenomena

16. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, do these mental states, being different, bring into existence one purpose?" "Yes, great king, these mental states, being different, bring into existence one purpose: they strike down the mental defilements."

"How, venerable sir, do these mental states, being different, bring into existence one purpose, strike down the mental defilements? Give a simile." "Just as, great king, an army, being different - elephants and horses and chariots and infantry - bring into existence one purpose: in battle they conquer the enemy army. Even so, great king, these mental states, being different, bring into existence one purpose: they strike down the mental defilements."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The Question on the Accomplishment of a Single Function by Various Phenomena is sixteenth.

The Great Chapter is first.

In this chapter there are sixteen questions.

2. The Chapter on the Course

1. The Question on the Continuity of Phenomena

1. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, one who arises, is he the same, or is he another?" The elder said: "Neither the same nor another."

"Give a simile." "What do you think, great king, when you were young, tender, dull, an infant lying on your back, are you the same as you are now grown up?" "No indeed, venerable sir, that young, tender, dull infant lying on his back was one, I who am now grown up am another." "This being so, great king, there will be no mother, there will be no father, there will be no teacher, there will be no one skilled in crafts, there will be no one virtuous, there will be no one wise. Is it then, great king, that the mother of the embryo is one, the mother of the foetus in the second stage is another, the mother of the foetus in the third stage is another, the mother of the compact mass is another, the mother of the small child is another, the mother of the grown-up is another, one learns a craft, another becomes trained, one commits an evil deed, another's hands and feet are cut off?" "No indeed, venerable sir. But you, venerable sir, when this is said, what would you say?" The elder said: "I indeed, great king, was young, tender, dull, an infant lying on his back, I indeed am now grown up; in dependence on this very body, all those are included as one."

"Give a further simile." "Just as, great king, some man might light a lamp, would it burn the whole night?" "Yes, venerable sir, it would burn the whole night." "Is then, great king, the flame in the first watch the same as the flame in the middle watch?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Is the flame in the middle watch the same as the flame in the last watch?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Is then, great king, the lamp in the first watch one, the lamp in the middle watch another, the lamp in the last watch another?" "No indeed, venerable sir, in dependence on that very same it burned the whole night." "Just so indeed, great king, the continuity of phenomena connects; one arises, another ceases; it connects as if simultaneously; therefore neither the same nor another; the latter consciousness goes into the inclusion of the former consciousness."

"Give a further simile." "Just as, great king, milk when being milked after an interval of time would turn into curds, from curds into butter, from butter into ghee, if anyone, great king, were to say thus: 'Whatever is the milk, that very thing is the curds; whatever is the curds, that very thing is the butter; whatever is the butter, that very thing is the ghee' - would he, speaking thus, speak rightly, great king?" "No indeed, venerable sir, it arose in dependence on that very same." "Just so indeed, great king, the continuity of phenomena connects; one arises, another ceases; it connects as if simultaneously; therefore neither the same nor another; the latter consciousness goes into the inclusion of the former consciousness."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The Question on the Continuity of Phenomena is first.

2. The Question on Putting Together

2. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, one who does not reunite, does he know 'I will not reunite'?" "Yes, great king, one who does not reunite knows 'I will not reunite'." "How, venerable sir, does he know?" "Whatever cause, whatever condition,

great king, there is for reuniting, by the cessation of that cause, of that condition, he knows 'I will not reunite'."

"Give a simile." "Just as, great king, a farmer householder, having ploughed and sown, might fill a granary. If at a later time he would neither plough nor sow, and would consume or give away or do as he wishes with the grain that was stored, would he know, great king, that farmer householder, 'My granary will not be filled'?" "Yes, venerable sir, he would know." "How would he know?" "Whatever cause, whatever condition there is for the filling of the granary, by the cessation of that cause, of that condition, he knows 'My granary will not be filled'." "Just so indeed, great king, whatever cause, whatever condition there is for reuniting, by the cessation of that cause, of that condition, he knows 'I will not reunite'."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The Question on Putting Together is second.

3. The Question on Knowledge and Wisdom

3. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, for whom knowledge has arisen, has wisdom arisen for him?" "Yes, great king, for whom knowledge has arisen, wisdom has arisen for him." "What, venerable sir, is that very knowledge that very wisdom?" "Yes, great king, that very knowledge is that very wisdom." "But, venerable sir, for whom that very knowledge, that very wisdom has arisen, would he be bewildered, or would he not be bewildered?" "In some cases, great king, he would be bewildered, in some cases he would not be bewildered." "Where, venerable sir, would he be bewildered?" "In branches of knowledge not previously known, great king, or in a direction not previously visited, or regarding a designation not previously heard, he would be bewildered." "Where would he not be bewildered?" "But whatever, great king, has been done by that wisdom as 'impermanent' or 'suffering' or 'non-self', there he would not be bewildered." "But where, venerable sir, does his delusion go?" "Delusion, great king, ceases right there as soon as knowledge has arisen."

"Give a simile." "Just as, great king, some man might light a lamp in a dark house, then the darkness would cease, and light would appear. Just so indeed, great king, as soon as knowledge has arisen, delusion ceases right there."

"But where, venerable sir, does wisdom go?" "Wisdom too, great king, having done its own function, ceases right there; but what has been done by that wisdom as 'impermanent' or 'suffering' or 'non-self', that does not cease."

"Venerable Nāgasena, as for this that you say: 'Wisdom, having done its own function, ceases right there; but what has been done by that wisdom as 'impermanent' or 'suffering' or 'non-self', that does not cease' - give a simile for that." "Just as, great king, some man wishing to send a letter at night, having summoned a scribe, having lit a lamp, might have the letter written; but when the letter has been written, he might extinguish the lamp; even when the lamp has been extinguished, the letter would not be destroyed. Just so indeed, great king, wisdom, having done its own function, ceases right there; but what has been done by that wisdom as 'impermanent' or 'suffering' or 'non-self', that does not cease."

"Give a further simile." "Just as, great king, in the eastern districts people place five water pots at each house to extinguish a fire; when the house is ablaze, they throw those five water pots on top of the house, and then the fire is extinguished. Now, great king, does it occur to those people: 'We shall do the pot-function again with those pots'?" "No indeed, venerable sir, those pots are finished with; what use are those pots?" "Just as, great king, the five water pots, so should the five faculties be seen: the faith faculty, the energy faculty, the mindfulness faculty, the concentration faculty, the wisdom faculty. Just as those people, so should one who practises meditation be seen. Just as the fire, so should the mental defilements be seen. Just as the fire is extinguished by the five water pots, so the mental defilements are extinguished by the five faculties; and the mental defilements once extinguished do not arise again. Just so indeed, great king, wisdom, having done its own function, ceases right there; but what has been done by that wisdom as 'impermanent' or 'suffering' or 'non-self', that does not cease."

"Give a further simile." "Just as, great king, a physician, having taken five-root medicines, having approached a sick person, having ground those five-root medicines, might give them to the sick person to drink, and by them the disorders would be expelled. Now, great king, does it occur to that physician: 'I shall do the medicine-function again with those five-root medicines'?" "No indeed, venerable sir, those five-root medicines are finished with; what use are those five-root medicines?" "Just as, great king, the five-root medicines, so should the five faculties be seen: the faith faculty, the energy faculty, the mindfulness faculty, the concentration faculty, the wisdom faculty; just as the physician, so should one who practises meditation be seen. Just as the disease, so should the mental defilements be seen. Just as the diseased man, so should the worldling be seen. Just as the disorders of the sick person are expelled by the five-root medicines, and when the disorders are expelled the sick person becomes healthy, so the mental defilements are expelled by the five faculties; and the mental defilements once expelled do not arise again. Just so indeed, great king, wisdom, having done its own function, ceases right there; but what has been done by that wisdom as 'impermanent' or 'suffering' or 'non-self', that does not cease."

"Give a further simile." "Just as, great king, a warrior experienced in battle, having taken five arrows, might enter the battle to conquer the enemy army, and he, having gone into battle, might shoot those five arrows, and by them the enemy army might be broken, would it occur thus to that warrior experienced in battle, great king: 'I will again perform the function of arrows with those arrows'?" "No indeed, venerable sir, those arrows are sufficient; what use are those arrows?" "Just as, great king, the five arrows, so should the five faculties be seen - the faith faculty, the energy faculty, the mindfulness faculty, the concentration faculty, the wisdom faculty. Just as, great king, the warrior experienced in battle, so should one who practises meditation be seen. Just as the enemy army, so should the mental defilements be seen. Just as by the five arrows the enemy army is broken, so by the five faculties the mental defilements are broken, and the mental defilements once broken do not come to be again. Just so indeed, great king, wisdom, having done its own function, ceases right there; but what has been done by that wisdom as 'impermanent' or 'suffering' or 'non-self', that does not cease."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The Question on Knowledge and Wisdom is third.

4. The Question on the Person Who Puts Together and Experiences

4. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, one who does not reunite, does he feel any unpleasant feeling?" The elder said: "He feels something, he does not feel something." "What does he feel, what does he not feel?" "He feels bodily feeling, great king, he does not feel mental feeling." "How, venerable sir, does he feel bodily feeling, how does he not feel mental feeling?" "Whatever cause, whatever condition there is for the arising of bodily unpleasant feeling, by the non-cessation of that cause, of that condition, he feels bodily unpleasant feeling; whatever cause, whatever condition there is for the arising of mental unpleasant feeling, by the cessation of that cause, of that condition, he does not feel mental unpleasant feeling. This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One - 'He feels one feeling, bodily, not mental.'"

"Venerable Nāgasena, one who feels unpleasant feeling, why does he not attain final nibbāna?" "There is not, great king, attraction or aversion for a Worthy One, and Worthy Ones, being wise, do not cause the unripe to fall, they wait for the ripening. This too was spoken, great king, by the elder Sāriputta, the General of the Teaching -

"I do not delight in death, I do not delight in life;
And I await the time, like a hired servant earning his wages.

"I do not delight in death, I do not delight in life;
And I await the time, fully aware, mindful."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The Question on the Person Who Puts Together and Experiences is fourth.

5. The Question on Feeling

5. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, is pleasant feeling wholesome or unwholesome or indeterminate?" "It may be, great king, wholesome, it may be unwholesome, it may be indeterminate." "If, venerable sir, the wholesome is not suffering, if suffering is not wholesome, 'the wholesome is suffering' does not arise." "What do you think, great king, suppose one were to place a red-hot iron ball in a man's hand, and place a cold lump of ice in his other hand, would both of them burn, great king?" "Yes, venerable sir, both of them would burn." "Are both of them hot, great king?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Are both of them cold, great king?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Understand the refutation: if the hot burns, yet both of them are not hot, therefore it does not arise. If the cold burns, yet both of them are not cold, therefore it does not arise. Why then, great king, do both of them burn, yet both of them are not hot, and both of them are not cold? One is hot, one is cold, both of them burn, therefore it does not arise." "I am not competent to converse with you, a debater; please, explain the meaning." Then the elder convinced King Milinda with a talk connected with the higher teaching:

"There are, great king, these six pleasures connected with the household life, six pleasures connected with renunciation, six displeasures connected with the household life, six displeasures connected with renunciation, six equanimities connected with the household life, six equanimities connected with renunciation - these are six sets of six. In the past too there are thirty-six kinds of feeling, in the future too there are thirty-six kinds of feeling, in the present too there are thirty-six kinds of feeling; having collected them together, having combined them, there are one hundred and eight feelings."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The Question on Feeling is fifth.

6. The Question on the Unity and Diversity of Mentality-Materiality

6. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, who reunites?" The elder said: "Mentality-materiality, great king, reunites." "Does this very same mentality-materiality reunite?" "Indeed not, great king, this very same mentality-materiality does not reunite; but with this mentality-materiality one performs action, whether beautiful or evil, and by that action another mentality-materiality reunites." "If, venerable sir, this very same mentality-materiality does not reunite, surely he will be freed from evil actions?" The elder said: "If it did not reunite, one would be freed from evil actions. But because, great king, it reunites, therefore one is not freed from evil actions."

"Give a simile." "Just as, great king, some man might steal mangoes from another man, and the owner of the mangoes, having seized him, might show him to the king: 'This man, Sire, has stolen my mangoes.' He might speak thus: 'I, Sire, did not steal this man's mangoes; those mangoes that were planted by him are different, those mangoes that were stolen by me are different; I am not liable to punishment.' Would that man, great king, be liable to punishment?" "Yes, venerable sir, he would be liable to punishment." "For what reason?" "Although he might speak thus, venerable sir, without rejecting the former mango, by the later mango that man would be liable to punishment." "Just so indeed, great king, with this mentality-materiality one performs action, whether beautiful or evil, and by that action another mentality-materiality reunites; therefore one is not freed from evil actions."

"Give a further simile." "Just as, great king, some man might steal rice from another man, etc. might steal sugar-cane, etc. Just as, great king, some man in the winter season, having kindled a fire, having warmed himself, without extinguishing it, might depart; then that fire might burn another man's field; the owner of the field, having seized him, might show him to the king: 'This man, Sire, has burnt my field.' He might speak thus: 'I, Sire, did not burn this man's field; that fire which was not extinguished by me is different, that fire by which this man's field was burnt is different; I am not liable to punishment.' Would that man, great king, be liable to punishment?" "Yes, venerable sir, he would be liable to punishment." "For what reason?" "Although he might speak thus, venerable sir, without rejecting the former fire, by the later fire that man would be liable to punishment." "Just so indeed, great king, with this mentality-materiality one performs action, whether beautiful or evil, and by that action another mentality-materiality reunites; therefore one is not freed from evil actions."

"Give a further simile." "Just as, great king, some man, having taken a lamp, having ascended a mansion, might eat; the lamp burning might set fire to the grass; the grass burning might set fire to the house; the house burning might set fire to the village; the villagers, having seized that man, might speak thus: 'Why did you, friend, burn the village?' He might speak thus: 'I, friend, did not burn the village; that lamp-fire by whose light I ate is different, that fire by which the village was burnt is different.' They, disputing, might come to your presence. Whose case would you uphold, great king?" "The villagers', venerable sir." "Why?" "Although he might speak thus, but that fire arose from that very source." "Just so indeed, great king, although the mentality-materiality at the time of death is different, and the mentality-materiality at conception is different, but that arose from that very source; therefore one is not freed from evil actions."

"Give a further simile." "Just as, great king, some man might ask for a young girl in marriage, pay the bride-price, and depart. She at a later time would be grown up and come of age; then another man, having paid the bride-price, might marry her. The first one, having come, might say thus: 'Why, my good man, do you take away my wife?' He might say thus: 'I am not taking away your wife; that girl who was young and tender, who was asked for by you and for whom the bride-price was paid, is different; this girl who is grown up and come of age, who was asked for by me and for whom the bride-price was paid, is different.' They, disputing, might come to your presence. Whose case would you uphold, great king?" "The first one's, venerable sir." "Why?" "Although he might speak thus, yet she who is grown up arose from that very one." "Just so indeed, great king, although the mentality-materiality at the time of death is different, and the mentality-materiality at conception is different, yet it arose from that very one; therefore one is not released from evil actions."

"Give a further simile." "Just as, great king, some man might buy a pot of milk from a cowherd's hand, and having left it in his very hand, might depart, saying 'I will take it and go tomorrow'; that on the following day might turn into curds. He, having come, might say thus: 'Give me the pot of milk.' He might offer curds. The other might say thus: 'I did not buy curds from your hand; give me the pot of milk.' He might say thus: 'Without your knowing, the milk has become curds.' They, disputing, might come to your presence. Whose case would you uphold, great king?" "The cowherd's, venerable sir." "Why?" "Although he might speak thus, yet it arose from that very one." "Just so indeed, great king, although the mentality-materiality at the time of death is different, and the mentality-materiality at conception is different, yet it arose from that very one; therefore one is not released from evil actions."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The Question on the Unity and Diversity of Mentality-Materiality is sixth.

7. The Question on the Elder's Putting Together and Not Putting Together

7. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, but will you reunite?" "Enough, great king, what is there for you in asking that? Was it not declared by me beforehand: 'If, great king, I will be one with clinging, I will reunite; if I will be one without clinging, I will not reunite'?"

"Give a simile." "Just as, great king, some man might perform a service for a king. The king, being pleased, might grant him an office; he, endowed and furnished with the five types of sensual pleasure by that office, might indulge himself; if he were to tell people: 'The king does nothing for me.' Would that man, great king, be acting properly?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, what is there for you in asking that? Was it not declared by me beforehand: 'If I will be one with clinging, I will reunite; if I will be one without clinging, I will not reunite'?"

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The Question on the Elder's Putting Together and Not Putting Together is seventh.

8. The Question on the Putting Together of Mentality-Materiality

8. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, as for this that you say 'mentality-materiality', therein what is mentality, what is materiality?" "Whatever therein, great king, is gross, that is materiality; whatever therein are subtle mental states of consciousness and mental factors, that is mentality." "Venerable Nāgasena, for what reason does mentality alone not reunite, or materiality alone?" "Mutually dependent, great king, these phenomena arise together."

"Give a simile." "Just as, great king, if there were no embryo of a hen, there would be no egg either; whatever therein is the embryo, whatever is the egg, both of these are mutually dependent, their arising is together. Even so, great king, if therein there were no mentality, there would be no materiality either; whatever therein is mentality, whatever is materiality, both of these are mutually dependent, their arising is together. Thus this has transmigrated for a long course of time."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The Question on the Putting Together of Mentality-Materiality is eighth.

9. The Question on the Course of Time

9. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, as for this that you say 'a long course', what is this called a course?" "The past, great king, is a period; the future is a period; the present is a period." "But, venerable sir, do all periods exist?" "Some period, great king, exists; some does not exist." "But which, venerable sir, exists; which does not exist?" "Those activities, great king, that are past, departed, ceased, changed - that period does not exist; those mental states that are resultant, those that are states that have resultant quality, and those that give conception elsewhere - that period exists. Those beings who have deceased and have arisen elsewhere - that period also exists. Those beings who have deceased and have not arisen elsewhere - that period does not exist. And those beings who have attained final Nibbāna - that period also does not exist because of having attained final Nibbāna."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The Question on the Course of Time is ninth.

The Chapter on the Course of Time is second.

In this chapter there are nine questions.

3. The Chapter on Examination

1. The Question on the Root of Duration

1. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, what is the root of the past course of time, what is the root of the future course of time, what is the root of the present course of time?" "Of the past course of time, great king, and of the future course of time, and of the present course of time, ignorance is the root. With ignorance as condition, activities; with activities as condition, consciousness; with consciousness as condition, mentality-materiality; with mentality-materiality as condition, the six sense bases; with the six sense bases as condition, contact; with contact as condition, feeling; with feeling as condition, craving; with craving as condition, clinging; with clinging as condition, existence; with existence as condition, birth; with birth as condition, ageing and death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, displeasure, and anguish come to be. Thus the former end of this whole mass of suffering, of this course of time, is not discerned."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the root of duration is the first.

2. The Question on the Former End

2. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, as for this that you say 'the former end is not discerned', give a simile for that." "Just as, great king, a man might place a small seed in the earth, and from that a sprout having arisen, gradually attaining growth, increase, and expansion, would give fruit. From that, having taken the seed, he might plant it again, and from that too a sprout having arisen, gradually attaining growth, increase, and expansion, would give fruit. Is there an end to this continuity?" "There is not, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, the former end of the course of time is not discerned."

"Give a further simile." "Just as, great king, there would be an egg from a hen, from the egg a hen, from the hen an egg. Is there an end to this continuity?" "There is not, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, the former end of the course of time is not discerned."

"Give a further simile." The elder, having drawn a wheel on the ground, said this to King Milinda: "Is there, great king, an end to this wheel?" "There is not, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, these wheels were spoken of by the Blessed One: 'Dependent on the eye and forms, eye-consciousness arises; the meeting of the three is contact; with contact as condition, feeling; with feeling as condition, craving; with craving as condition, clinging; with clinging as condition, action; from action, the eye is born again.' Is there an end to this continuity?" "There is not, venerable sir."

"Dependent on the ear and sounds, etc. dependent on the mind and mental phenomena, mind-consciousness arises; the meeting of the three is contact; with contact as condition, feeling; with feeling as condition, craving; with craving as condition, clinging; with clinging as condition, action; from action, the mind is born again.' Is there an end to this continuity?" "There is not, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, the former end of the course of time is not discerned."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the former end is the second.

3. The Question on Discerning the End

3. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, as for this that you say 'the former end is not discerned', what is that former end?" "Whatever, great king, is the past period, that is the former end." "Venerable Nāgasena, as for this that you say 'the former end is not discerned', but, venerable sir, is the entire former end not discerned?" "Some, great king, is discerned, some is not discerned." "Which, venerable sir, is discerned, which is not discerned?" "Before this, great king, entirely in every way, in every manner, ignorance did not exist - this former end is not discerned; that which, not having been, comes into being, having been, disappears - this former end is discerned."

"Venerable Nāgasena, that which, not having been, comes into being, having been, disappears - does that not, being cut off at both ends, go to its end?" "If, great king, being cut off at both ends, it goes to its end, is it possible to make what is cut off at both ends grow?" "Yes, that too is possible to make grow." "I am not, venerable sir, asking this - is it possible to make grow from the end?" "Yes, it is possible to make grow."

"Give a simile." The elder gave him the simile of a tree, and the aggregates are the seeds of the whole mass of suffering.

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on discerning the end is the third.

4. The Question on Activities Arising

4. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, are there any activities which are born?" "Yes, great king, there are activities which are born." "Which are those, venerable sir?" "When the eye exists, great king, and forms exist, eye-consciousness exists; when eye-consciousness exists, eye-contact exists; when eye-contact exists, feeling exists; when feeling exists, craving exists; when craving exists, clinging exists; when clinging exists, existence exists; when existence exists, birth exists; when birth exists, ageing and death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, displeasure, and anguish come to be; thus is the origin of this whole mass of suffering. When the eye is absent, great king, and forms are absent, eye-consciousness does not exist; when eye-consciousness is absent, eye-contact does not exist; when eye-contact is absent, feeling does not exist; when feeling is absent, craving does not exist; when craving is absent, clinging does not exist; when clinging is absent, existence does not exist; when existence is absent, birth does not exist; when birth is absent, ageing and death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, displeasure, and anguish do not exist; thus is the cessation of this whole mass of suffering."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on activities arising is the fourth.

5. The Question on Existing Activities Arising

5. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, are there any activities which, not existing, are born?" "There are not, great king, any activities which, not existing, are born; only existing activities are born, great king."

"Give a simile." "What do you think, great king, was this house in which you are sitting born not existing?" "There is nothing, venerable sir, here born not existing; it was born only existing. These timbers, venerable sir, were in the forest, and this clay was in the earth, and through the appropriate effort of women and men, thus this house came into being." "Just so, great king, there are no activities which, not existing, are born; only existing activities are born."

"Give a further simile." "Just as, great king, whatever seed-plants and growing plants placed in the earth, gradually attaining growth, increase, and expansion, would give flowers and fruits, those trees were not born not existing; only existing were those trees born. Just so, great king, there are no activities which, not existing, are born; only existing are those activities born."

"Give a further simile." "Just as, great king, a potter, having extracted clay from the earth, makes various vessels, those vessels were not born not existing; they were born only existing. Just so, great king, there are no activities which, not existing, are born; only existing activities are born."

"Give a further simile." "Just as, great king, if there were no sound-board of a lute, no hide, no trough, no neck, no head, no strings, no plectrum, and no appropriate effort of a man, would sound be produced?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "But when, great king, there is a sound-board of a lute, there is hide, there is a trough, there is a neck, there is a head, there are strings, there is a plectrum, and there is appropriate effort of a man, would sound be produced?" "Yes, venerable sir, it would be produced." "Just so, great king, there are no activities which, not existing, are born; only existing activities are born."

"Give a further simile." "Just as, great king, if there were no fire-stick, no fire-stick spindle, no fire-stick cord, no upper fire-stick, no rag, and no appropriate effort of a man, would that fire be produced?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "But when, great king, there is a fire-stick, there is a fire-stick spindle, there is a fire-stick cord, there is an upper fire-stick, there is a rag, and there is appropriate effort of a man, would that fire be produced?" "Yes, venerable sir, it would be produced." "Just so, great king, there are no activities which, not existing, are born; only existing activities are born."

"Give a further simile." "Just as, great king, if there were no gem, no sunshine, no cow-dung, would that fire be produced?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "But when, great king, there is a gem, there is sunshine, there is cow-dung, would that fire be produced?" "Yes, venerable sir, it would be produced." "Just so, great king, there are no activities which, not existing, are born; only existing activities are born."

"Give a further simile." "Just as, great king, if there were no mirror, no light, no face, would a reflection arise?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "But when, great king, there is a mirror, there is light, there is a face, would a reflection arise?" "Yes, venerable sir, it would be produced." "Just so, great king, there are no activities which, not existing, are born; only existing activities are born."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on existing activities arising is the fifth.

6. The Question on One Who Has Attained the Highest Knowledge

6. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, is one who has attained the highest knowledge found?" "But who, great king, is this one called 'one who has attained the highest knowledge'?" "That which, venerable sir, is the soul inside that sees form with the eye, hears sound with the ear, smells odour with the nose, tastes flavour with the tongue, touches tangible object with the body, cognises mental phenomena with the mind, just as we, seated here in the mansion, through whichever window we might wish to see, through that window we would see, through the eastern window too we would see, through the western window too we would see, through the northern window too we would see, through the southern window too we would see. Just so indeed, venerable sir, this soul inside, through whichever door it wishes to see, through that door it sees."

The elder said: "I will speak about the five doors, great king; listen to that, pay close attention. If the soul inside sees form with the eye, just as we, seated here in the mansion, through whichever window we might wish to see, through that window we would see just form, through the eastern window too we would see just form, through the western window too we would see just form, through the northern window too we would see just form, through the southern window too we would see just form, just so by this soul inside, with the ear too just form should be seen, with the nose too just form should be seen, with the tongue too just form should be seen, with the body too just form should be seen, with the mind too just form should be seen; with the eye too just sound should be heard, with the nose too just sound should be heard, with the tongue too just sound should be heard, with the body too just sound should be heard, with the mind too just sound should be heard; with the eye too just odour should be smelled, with the ear too just odour should be smelled, with the tongue too just odour should be smelled, with the body too just odour should be smelled, with the mind too just odour should be smelled; with the eye too just flavour should be tasted, with the ear too just flavour should be tasted, with the nose too just flavour should be tasted, with the body too just flavour should be tasted, with the mind too just flavour should be tasted; with the eye too just tangible object should be touched, with the ear too just tangible object should be touched, with the nose too just tangible object should be touched, with the tongue too just tangible object should be touched, with the mind too just tangible object should be touched; with the eye too just mental phenomena should be cognised, with the ear too just mental phenomena should be cognised, with the nose too just mental phenomena should be cognised, with the tongue too just mental phenomena should be cognised, with the body too just mental phenomena should be cognised?" "No indeed, venerable sir."

"Your latter statement does not connect with your former, great king, nor your former with your latter. Or else, great king, just as we, seated here in the mansion, when these latticed windows are opened, with the great space facing outward, we see form more clearly, just so by this soul inside too, when the eye-doors are opened, with the great space, form should be seen more clearly; when the ears are opened, etc. when the nose is opened, etc. when the tongue is opened, etc. when the body is opened,

with the great space, sound should be heard more clearly, odour should be smelled, flavour should be tasted, tangible object should be touched?" "No indeed, venerable sir."

"Your latter statement does not connect with your former, great king, nor your former with your latter. Or else, great king, if this Dinna, having gone out, were to stand in the outer door-porch, would you know, great king, 'This Dinna, having gone out, is standing in the outer door-porch'?" "Yes, venerable sir, I know." "Or else, great king, if this Dinna, having entered inside, were to stand before you, would you know, great king, 'This Dinna, having entered inside, is standing before me'?" "Yes, venerable sir, I know." "Just so indeed, great king, would that soul inside, when flavour is placed on the tongue, know sourness or saltiness or bitterness or pungency or astringency or sweetness?" "Yes, venerable sir, he would know." "Would it know those flavours when they have entered inside - sourness or saltiness or bitterness or pungency or astringency or sweetness?" "No indeed, venerable sir."

"Your latter statement does not connect with your former, great king, nor your former with your latter. Just as, great king, some man, having had a hundred pots of honey brought, having had a honey trough filled, having closed a man's mouth, were to throw him into the honey trough, would that man know, great king, whether the honey is good or not good?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "For what reason?" "Because, venerable sir, the honey has not entered his mouth."

"Your latter statement does not connect with your former, great king, nor your former with your latter." "I am not competent to converse with you, a debater; please, venerable sir, explain the meaning."

The elder convinced King Milinda with a talk connected with the higher teaching: "Here, great king, dependent on the eye and forms, eye-consciousness arises; concomitant with it are contact, feeling, perception, volition, unified focus, life faculty, and attention - thus these mental states arise from conditions; no one who has attained the highest knowledge is found here. Dependent on the ear and sounds, etc. Dependent on the mind and mental phenomena, mind-consciousness arises; concomitant with it are contact, feeling, perception, volition, unified focus, life faculty, and attention - thus these mental states arise from conditions; no one who has attained the highest knowledge is found here."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on one who has attained the highest knowledge is the sixth.

7. The Question on Eye-Consciousness and So On

7. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, where eye-consciousness arises, does mind-consciousness also arise there?" "Yes, great king, where eye-consciousness arises, mind-consciousness also arises there."

"Which indeed, venerable Nāgasena, arises first - eye-consciousness and afterwards mind-consciousness, or does mind-consciousness arise first and afterwards eye-consciousness?" "First, great king, eye-consciousness arises, afterwards mind-consciousness."

"Does indeed, venerable Nāgasena, eye-consciousness command mind-consciousness 'Where I arise, you too arise there,' or does mind-consciousness command eye-consciousness 'Where you will arise, I too will arise there'?" "No indeed, great king, there is no conversation between them with each other."

"How, venerable Nāgasena, where eye-consciousness arises, does mind-consciousness also arise there?" "Because of inclination, great king, and because of the door, and because of practice, and because of habituation."

"How, venerable Nāgasena, because of inclination, where eye-consciousness arises, does mind-consciousness also arise there? Give a simile." "What do you think, great king, when the sky rains, by which way would the water go?" "By whichever way there is a slope, venerable sir, by that way it would go." "Then at another time the sky would rain, by which way would that water go?" "By whichever way, venerable sir, the former water went, that too would go by that way."

"Does indeed, great king, the former water command the latter water 'By which way I go, you too go by that way,' or does the latter water command the former water 'By which way you will go, I too will go by that way'?" "No indeed, venerable sir, there is no conversation between them with each other; they go because of inclination." "Just so indeed, great king, because of inclination, where eye-consciousness arises, mind-consciousness also arises there; eye-consciousness does not command mind-consciousness 'Where I arise, you too arise there,' nor does mind-consciousness command eye-consciousness 'Where you will arise, I too will arise there'; there is no conversation between them with each other; they arise because of inclination."

"How, venerable Nāgasena, because of the door, where eye-consciousness arises, does mind-consciousness also arise there? Give a simile." "What do you think, great king, suppose there were a king's border city with strong walls and gateways, with a single door, and from there a man wished to depart, by which way would he depart?" "By the door, venerable sir, he would depart." "Then another man wished to depart, by which way would he depart?" "By whichever way, venerable sir, the former man departed, he too would depart by that way."

"Does indeed, great king, the former man command the latter man 'By which way I go, you too go by that way,' or does the latter man command the former man 'By which way you will go, I too will go by that way'?" "No indeed, venerable sir, there is no conversation between them with each other; they go because of the door." "Just so indeed, great king, because of the door, where eye-consciousness arises, mind-consciousness also arises there; eye-consciousness does not command mind-consciousness 'Where I arise, you too arise there,' nor does mind-consciousness command eye-consciousness 'Where you will arise, I too will arise there'; there is no conversation between them with each other; they arise because of the door."

"How, venerable Nāgasena, because of practice, where eye-consciousness arises, does mind-consciousness also arise there? Give a simile." "What do you think, great king, suppose first one cart were to go, then by which way would a second cart go?" "By whichever way, venerable sir, the former cart went, that too would go by that way."

"Does indeed, great king, the former cart command the latter cart: 'By which way I go, you too go by that way,' or does the latter cart command the former cart: 'By which way you will go, I too will go by that way'?" "No indeed, venerable sir, there is no conversation between them with each other; they go because of habit." "Just so indeed, great king, because of habit, where eye-consciousness arises, there mind-consciousness also arises; eye-consciousness does not command mind-consciousness: 'Where I arise, you too arise there,' nor does mind-consciousness command eye-consciousness: 'Where you will arise, I too will arise there'; there is no conversation between them with each other; they arise because of habit."

"How, venerable Nāgasena, because of repeated practice, where eye-consciousness arises, does mind-consciousness also arise there? Give a simile." "Just as, great king, for a beginner in the branches of knowledge of seal-making, calculation, enumeration, and writing, there is slowness, but at a later time, because of repeated practice through careful action, there is no slowness. Just so indeed, great king, because of repeated practice, where eye-consciousness arises, there mind-consciousness also arises; eye-consciousness does not command mind-consciousness: 'Where I arise, you too arise there,' nor does mind-consciousness command eye-consciousness: 'Where you will arise, I too will arise there'; there is no conversation between them with each other; they arise because of repeated practice."

"Venerable Nāgasena, where ear-consciousness arises, does mind-consciousness also arise there?" Etc. Where nose-consciousness arises, etc. Where tongue-consciousness arises, etc. Where body-consciousness arises, does mind-consciousness also arise there?" "Yes, great king, where body-consciousness arises, there mind-consciousness also arises."

"Does indeed, venerable Nāgasena, body-consciousness arise first and mind-consciousness afterwards, or does mind-consciousness arise first and body-consciousness afterwards?" "Body-consciousness, great king, arises first, mind-consciousness afterwards."

"Does indeed, venerable Nāgasena, etc. there is no conversation between them with each other; they arise because of repeated practice."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on eye-consciousness and so on is the seventh.

8. The Question on the Characteristic of Contact

8. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, where mind-consciousness arises, do contact and feeling also arise there?" "Yes, great king, where mind-consciousness arises, contact also arises there, feeling also arises there, perception also arises there, volition also arises there, applied thought also arises there, sustained thought also arises there, all phenomena with contact as chief also arise there."

"Venerable Nāgasena, what is the characteristic of contact?" "Touching is the characteristic of contact, great king."

"Give a simile." "Just as, great king, two rams might fight; among them, just as one ram, so should the eye be seen; just as the second ram, so should matter be seen. Just as their collision, so should contact be seen."

"Give a further simile." "Just as, great king, two hands might strike together; among them, just as one hand, so should the eye be seen. Just as the second hand, so should matter be seen. Just as their collision, so should contact be seen."

"Give a further simile." "Just as, great king, two cymbals might strike together; among them, just as one cymbal, so should the eye be seen. Just as the second cymbal, so should matter be seen. Just as their collision, so should contact be seen."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the characteristic of contact is the eighth.

9. The Question on the Characteristic of Feeling

9. "Venerable Nāgasena, what is the characteristic of feeling?" "Feeling has the characteristic of being felt, great king, and the characteristic of being experienced."

"Give a simile." "Just as, great king, some man might perform a service for a king, and the king, being pleased, might grant him an office; he, endowed and furnished with the five types of sensual pleasure by that office, might indulge himself; it might occur to him: 'Formerly I performed a service for the king, and the king, being pleased, granted me an office; on that account I feel this kind of feeling.'

"Or else, great king, some man, having done wholesome action, upon the body's collapse at death, might be reborn in a fortunate realm, in a heavenly world; and there, endowed and furnished with the five divine types of sensual pleasure, he might indulge himself; it might occur to him: 'Formerly I did wholesome action; on that account I feel this kind of feeling.' Thus indeed, great king, feeling has the characteristic of being felt and the characteristic of being experienced."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the characteristic of feeling is the ninth.

10. The Question on the Characteristic of Perception

10. "Venerable Nāgasena, what is the characteristic of perception?" "Perceiving is the characteristic of perception, great king. What does it perceive? It perceives blue, it perceives yellow, it perceives red, it perceives white, it perceives crimson. Thus, great king, perceiving is the characteristic of perception."

"Give a simile." "Just as, great king, a king's storekeeper, having entered the storehouse, having seen the royal treasures of blue, yellow, red, white, and crimson forms, perceives them. Thus, great king, perceiving is the characteristic of perception."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the characteristic of perception is the tenth.

11. The Question on the Characteristic of Volition

11. "Venerable Nāgasena, what is the characteristic of volition?" "Volition has the characteristic of willing, great king, and the characteristic of constructing."

"Give a simile." "Just as, great king, some man, having prepared poison, might drink it himself and give it to others to drink, he himself would be afflicted, and others too would be afflicted. Just so indeed, great king, here a certain person, having willed unwholesome action through volition, upon the body's collapse at death, would be reborn in a realm of misery, an unfortunate realm, a nether world, in hell. And those who follow his example, they too, upon the body's collapse at death, are reborn in a realm of misery, an unfortunate realm, a nether world, in hell.

"Or else, great king, some man, having prepared together ghee, butter, oil, honey and molasses, might drink it himself and give it to others to drink, he himself would be happy, and others too would be happy. Just so indeed, great king, here a certain person, having willed wholesome action through volition, upon the body's collapse at death, is reborn in a fortunate realm, in a heavenly world. And those who follow his example, they too, upon the body's collapse at death, are reborn in a fortunate realm, in a heavenly world. Thus indeed, great king, volition has the characteristic of willing and the characteristic of constructing."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the characteristic of volition is the eleventh.

12. The Question on the Characteristic of Consciousness

12. "Venerable Nāgasena, what is the characteristic of consciousness?" "Cognition is the characteristic of consciousness, great king."

"Give a simile." "Just as, great king, a city guardian seated in the middle of a city crossroads would see a man coming from the eastern direction, would see a man coming from the southern direction, would see a man coming from the western direction, would see a man coming from the northern direction. Even so, great king, whatever form a man sees with the eye, that he cognises with consciousness. Whatever sound he hears with the ear, that he cognises with consciousness. Whatever odour he smells with the nose, that he cognises with consciousness. Whatever flavour he tastes with the tongue, that he cognises with consciousness. Whatever tangible object he touches with the body, that he cognises with consciousness; whatever mental phenomenon he cognises with the mind, that he cognises with consciousness. Thus, great king, cognition is the characteristic of consciousness."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the characteristic of consciousness is the twelfth.

13. The Question on the Characteristic of Applied Thought

13. "Venerable Nāgasena, what is the characteristic of applied thought?" "Absorption is the characteristic of applied thought, great king."

"Give a simile." "Just as, great king, a carpenter fixes well-prepared wood into a joint, even so, great king, absorption is the characteristic of applied thought."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the characteristic of applied thought is the thirteenth.

14. The Question on the Characteristic of Sustained Thought

14. "Venerable Nāgasena, what is the characteristic of sustained thought?" "Stroking is the characteristic of sustained thought, great king."

"Give a simile." "Just as, great king, a bronze plate when struck afterwards resounds and reverberates, just as, great king, the striking, so should applied thought be seen. Just as the resounding, so should sustained thought be seen."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the characteristic of sustained thought is the fourteenth.

The Sustained Thought Chapter is the third.

In this chapter there are fourteen questions.

4. The Chapter on Nibbāna

1. The Question on Distinguishing Contact and So On

1. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, is it possible, having separated these mental states that have come to a unified condition again and again, to declare their difference: 'This is contact, this is feeling, this is perception, this is volition, this is consciousness, this is applied thought, this is sustained thought'?" "It is not possible, great king, having separated these mental states that have come to a unified condition again and again, to declare their difference: 'This is contact, this is feeling, this is perception, this is volition, this is consciousness, this is applied thought, this is sustained thought.'"

"Give a simile." "Just as, great king, a king's cook might make a sauce or a curry, and therein he might put curds, and he might put salt, and he might put ginger, and he might put cumin, and he might put pepper, and he might put other ingredients, and the king might say to him thus: 'Bring me the flavour of the curds, bring me the flavour of the salt, bring me the flavour of the ginger, bring me the flavour of the cumin, bring me the flavour of the pepper, bring me the flavour of all the ingredients that were put in.' Is it possible, great king, having separated those flavours that have come to a unified condition again and again, to bring the flavour - sourness or saltiness or bitterness or pungency or astringency or sweetness?" "No indeed, venerable sir, it is not possible, having separated those flavours that have come to a unified condition again and again, to bring the flavour - sourness or saltiness or bitterness or pungency or astringency or sweetness; but they are present each with its own characteristic." "Just so indeed, great king, it is not possible, having separated these mental states that have come to a unified condition again and again, to declare their difference: 'This is contact, this is feeling, this is perception, this is volition, this is consciousness, this is applied thought, this is sustained thought'; but they are present each with its own characteristic."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on distinguishing contact and so on is the first.

2. The Question on Nāgasena

2. The elder said: "Salt, great king, is cognisable by eye." "Yes, venerable sir, cognisable by eye." "Well indeed, great king, you know." "But is it, venerable sir, cognisable by tongue?" "Yes, great king, cognisable by tongue." "But, venerable sir, is all salt cognised by the tongue?" "Yes, great king, all salt is cognised by the tongue."

"If, venerable sir, all salt is cognised by the tongue, then why do oxen bring it by carts? Should not just the salt be brought?" "It is not possible, great king, to bring just the salt; these phenomena have come to a unified condition, having gone to diversity of range - salt and heaviness. But is it possible, great king, to weigh salt on a scale?"

"Yes, venerable sir, it is possible." "It is not possible, great king, to weigh salt on a scale; heaviness is weighed on a scale."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on Nāgasena is the second.

3. The Question on Action-Produced Five Sense Bases

3. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, these five sense bases, are they produced by different actions, or by one action?" "By different actions, great king, they are produced, not by one action."

"Give a simile." "What do you think, great king, if in one field different seeds were sown, would different fruits of those different seeds be produced?" "Yes, venerable sir, they would be produced." "Just so indeed, great king, whatever five sense bases there are, all those are produced by different actions, not by one action."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on action-produced five sense bases is the third.

4. The Question on the Difference of Action

4. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, for what reason are human beings not all equal - some are short-lived, some are long-lived, some have many illnesses, some have few illnesses, some are ugly, some are beautiful, some are of little influence, some are influential, some are of little wealth, some are of great wealth, some are of low birth, some are of high birth, some are lacking wisdom, some are wise?"

The elder said: "But why, great king, are trees not all equal - some are sour, some are salty, some are bitter, some are pungent, some are astringent, some are sweet?" "I think, venerable sir, because of the difference in seeds." "Just so indeed, great king, because of the difference in actions, human beings are not all equal - some are short-lived, some are long-lived, some have many illnesses, some have few illnesses, some are ugly, some are beautiful, some are of little influence, some are influential, some are of little wealth, some are of great wealth, some are of low birth, some are of high birth, some are lacking wisdom, some are wise. This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One - 'Beings are owners of their actions, young man, heirs to their

actions, they originate from their actions, are bound to their actions, have their actions as their refuge; it is action that divides beings, that is to say, into the inferior and the superior."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the difference of action is the fourth.

5. The Question on Making Effort

5. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, you say 'so that this suffering might cease, and other suffering might not arise.' For this purpose, great king, is our going forth." "What is the use of striving beforehand? Should one not strive when the time has arrived?" The elder said: "When the time has arrived, great king, effort does not accomplish its function; only effort made beforehand accomplishes its function."

"Give a simile." "What do you think, great king, when you were thirsty, would you then have a well dug, have a lake dug, thinking 'I will drink water'? "No indeed, venerable sir." "Just so, great king, when the time has arrived, effort does not accomplish its function; only effort made beforehand accomplishes its function."

"Give a further simile." "What do you think, great king, when you were hungry, would you then have a field ploughed, have rice planted, have grain brought in, thinking 'I will eat a meal'? "No indeed, venerable sir." "Just so, great king, when the time has arrived, effort does not accomplish its function; only effort made beforehand accomplishes its function."

"Give a further simile." "What do you think, great king, when a battle was at hand for you, would you then have a moat dug, have a wall built, have a gateway built, have a watchtower built, have grain brought in; would you then train in elephants, train in horses, train in chariots, train in bows, train in swords?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Just so, great king, when the time has arrived, effort does not accomplish its function; only effort made beforehand accomplishes its function. This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One -

"One should do beforehand that which one would know to be for one's own welfare;
Not with the thinking of a carter should the wise one, after deliberation, exert.

"Just as a carter, having left the smooth, level highway;
Having mounted an uneven path, grieves like one with a broken axle.

"So having departed from the Teaching, having followed what is not the Teaching;
The fool, having reached the mouth of death, grieves like one with a broken axle."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on making effort is the fifth.

6. The Question on the Heat of Hell Fire for Hell Beings

6. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, you say 'the fire of hell is more intensely hot than ordinary fire; even a small stone thrown into ordinary fire, though being cooked for a day, does not go to dissolution; but even a stone the size of a pinnacle building thrown into the fire of hell goes to dissolution in a moment' - I do not believe this statement; and yet you say 'those beings who have arisen there, they, though being cooked in hell for many thousands of years, do not go to dissolution' - I do not believe that statement either."

The elder said: "What do you think, great king, those female sea-monsters, female crocodiles, female turtles, female peahens, and female pigeons that exist - do they eat hard stones and gravel?" "Yes, venerable sir, they eat them." "But do those things, having gone into the interior of their bellies, go to dissolution?" "Yes, venerable sir, they go to dissolution." "But does the embryo in their womb also go to dissolution?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "For what reason?" "I think, venerable sir, because of being caused by action, it does not go to dissolution." "Just so indeed, great king, because of being caused by action, beings doomed to hell, though being cooked in hell for many thousands of years, do not go to dissolution. This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One - 'He does not die until that evil deed is exhausted.'"

"Give a further simile." "What do you think, great king, those female lions, female tigers, female leopards, and female dogs that exist - do they eat hard bones and meat?" "Yes, venerable sir, they eat them." "But do those things, having gone into the interior of their bellies, go to dissolution?" "Yes, venerable sir, they go to dissolution." "But does the embryo in their womb also go to dissolution?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "For what reason?" "I think, venerable sir, because of being caused by action, it does not go to dissolution." "Just so indeed, great king, because of being caused by action, beings doomed to hell, though being cooked in hell for many thousands of years, do not go to dissolution."

"Give a further simile." "What do you think, great king, those delicate Greek women, delicate warrior-caste women, delicate brahmin women, and delicate householder women that exist - do they eat hard sweetmeats and meat?" "Yes, venerable sir, they eat them." "But do those things, having gone into the interior of their bellies, go to dissolution?" "Yes, venerable sir, they go to dissolution." "But does the embryo in their womb also go to dissolution?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "For what reason?" "I think, venerable sir, because of being caused by action, it does not go to dissolution." "Just so indeed, great king, because of being caused by action, beings doomed to hell, though being cooked in hell for many thousands of years, do not go to dissolution. This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One - 'He does not die until that evil deed is exhausted.'"

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the heat of hell fire for hell beings is the sixth.

7. The Question on the Earth-Supporter

7. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, you say 'this great earth is established upon water, the water is established upon wind, the wind is established upon space' - I do not believe this statement either." The elder, having taken water with a water-

strainer, convinced King Milinda: "Just as, great king, this water is supported by wind, so too that water is supported by wind."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the earth-supporter is the seventh.

8. The Question on Cessation and Nibbāna

8. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, is cessation Nibbāna?" "Yes, great king, cessation is Nibbāna." "How, venerable Nāgasena, is cessation Nibbāna?" "All ignorant worldlings, great king, delight in the internal and external sense bases, assert them, and remain grasping them; they are carried away by that stream; they are not released from birth, from ageing, from death, from sorrow, from lamentation, from sufferings, from displeasures, from anguishes; they are not released from suffering, I say. But a learned noble disciple, great king, does not delight in the internal and external sense bases, does not assert them, and does not remain grasping them; for him not delighting in that, not asserting it, not remaining grasping it, craving ceases; from the cessation of craving comes the cessation of clinging; from the cessation of clinging comes the cessation of existence; from the cessation of existence comes the cessation of birth; from the cessation of birth, ageing and death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, displeasure, and anguish cease; thus is the cessation of this whole mass of suffering; thus, great king, cessation is Nibbāna."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on cessation and Nibbāna is the eighth.

9. The Question on Attaining Nibbāna

9. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, does everyone obtain Nibbāna?" "Indeed not, great king, not everyone obtains Nibbāna; but, great king, whoever is rightly practising directly knows the phenomena to be directly known, fully understands the phenomena to be fully understood, abandons the phenomena to be abandoned, develops the phenomena to be developed, realises the phenomena to be realised - he obtains Nibbāna."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on attaining Nibbāna is the ninth.

10. The Question on Knowing the Happiness of Nibbāna

10. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, one who does not obtain Nibbāna, does he know 'Nibbāna is happiness'?" "Yes, great king, one who does not obtain Nibbāna knows 'Nibbāna is happiness'." "How, venerable Nāgasena, does one not obtaining know 'Nibbāna is happiness'?" "What do you think, great king, those whose hands and feet have not been cut off, would they know, great king, 'the cutting off of hands and feet is painful'?" "Yes, venerable sir, they would know." "How would they know?" "Venerable sir, having heard the sound of lamentation of others whose hands and feet have been cut off, they know 'the cutting off of hands and feet is painful'." "Just so indeed, great king, having heard the sound of those who have seen Nibbāna, one knows 'Nibbāna is happiness'."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on knowing the happiness of Nibbāna is the tenth.

The Nibbāna Chapter is the fourth.

In this chapter there are ten questions.

5. The Chapter on the Buddha

1. The Question on the Presence or Absence of the Buddha

1. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, has the Buddha been seen by you?" "No indeed, great king." "Then has the Buddha been seen by your teachers?" "No indeed, great king." "Well then, Venerable Nāgasena, there is no Buddha." "But then, great king, has the Ūhā river in the Himalayas been seen by you?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Then has the Ūhā river been seen by your father?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Well then, great king, there is no Ūhā river." "There is, venerable sir; although the Ūhā river has not been seen by me, and the Ūhā river has not been seen by my father either, yet there is the Ūhā river." "Just so indeed, great king, although the Blessed One has not been seen by me, and the Blessed One has not been seen by my teachers either, yet there is the Blessed One."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the presence or absence of the Buddha is the first.

2. The Question on the Buddha's Unsurpassed State

2. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, is the Buddha unsurpassed?" "Yes, great king, the Blessed One is unsurpassed." "How, venerable Nāgasena, do you know the Buddha is unsurpassed, having never seen him before?" "What do you think, great king, those by whom the great ocean has never been seen before, would they know, great king, 'the great ocean is indeed great, deep, immeasurable, hard to fathom, wherein these five great rivers constantly and continuously flow, as follows: the Ganges, the Yamunā, the Aciravatī, the Sarabhū, the Mahī, yet neither deficiency nor fullness of it is discerned'?" "Yes, venerable sir, they would know." "Just so indeed, great king, having seen the great disciples who have attained final Nibbāna, I know 'the Blessed One is unsurpassed'."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the Buddha's unsurpassed state is the second.

3. The Question on Knowing the Buddha's Unsurpassed State

3. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, is it possible to know 'the Buddha is unsurpassed'?" "Yes, great king, it is possible to know 'the Blessed One is unsurpassed'." "How, venerable Nāgasena, is it possible to know 'the Buddha is unsurpassed'?" "Once in the past, great king, there was an elder named Tissa who was a writing teacher; many years have passed since he died - how is he known?" "By his writing, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, whoever sees the Teaching sees the Blessed One, for the Teaching, great king, was taught by the Blessed One."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on knowing the Buddha's unsurpassed state is the third.

4. The Question on Seeing the Dhamma

4. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, has the Teaching been seen by you?" "By the Buddha's guidance indeed, great king, by the Buddha's regulation, for life it should be practised by disciples."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on seeing the Dhamma is the fourth.

5. The Question on Reconnection without Transmigration

5. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, does one not transmigrate and yet reunite?" "Yes, great king, one does not transmigrate and yet reunites." "How, venerable Nāgasena, does one not transmigrate and yet reunite? Give a simile." "Just as, great king, some man might light a lamp from a lamp, has that lamp, great king, passed over from the other lamp?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, one does not transmigrate and yet reunites."

"Give a further simile." "Do you recall, great king, when you were young, having learned some verse near a verse-teacher?" "Yes, venerable sir." "Has that verse, great king, passed over from the teacher?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, one does not transmigrate and yet reunites."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on reconnection without transmigration is the fifth.

6. The Question on One Who Has Attained the Highest Knowledge

6. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, is one who has attained the highest knowledge found?" The elder said: "In the ultimate reality, great king, one who has attained the highest knowledge is not found."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on one who has attained the highest knowledge is the sixth.

7. The Question on Transmigration to Another Body

7. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, is there any being who transmigrates from this body to another body?" "No indeed, great king." "If, Venerable Nāgasena, there is no one transmigrating from this body to another body, surely he will be freed from evil actions?" "Yes, great king, if he did not reunite, he would be freed from evil actions; but because, great king, he reunites, therefore he is not released from evil actions."

"Give a simile." "Just as, great king, some man might steal mangoes from another man, would he be liable to punishment?" "Yes, venerable sir, he would be liable to punishment." "But, great king, he did not steal those mangoes that were planted by him; why would he be liable to punishment?" "Those mangoes, venerable sir, arose in

dependence on those; therefore he would be liable to punishment." "Just so indeed, great king, with this mentality-materiality one performs action, whether beautiful or non-beautiful, and by that action another mentality-materiality reunites; therefore one is not released from evil actions."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on transmigration to another body is the seventh.

8. The Question on the Existence of the Fruit of Action

8. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, when action has been done by this mentality-materiality, whether wholesome or unwholesome, where do those actions remain?" "They would follow, great king, those actions, like a shadow that does not depart." "But is it possible, venerable sir, to show those actions: 'Here or there those actions remain'?" "It is not possible, great king, to show those actions: 'Here or there those actions remain.'"

"Give a simile." "What do you think, great king, these trees that have not produced fruit, is it possible to show their fruits: 'Here or there those fruits remain'?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, with uninterrupted continuity it is not possible to show those actions: 'Here or there those actions remain.'"

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the existence of the fruit of action is the eighth.

9. The Question on Knowing What Arises

9. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, one who arises, does he know 'I will arise'?" "Yes, great king, one who arises knows 'I will arise'." "Give a simile." "Just as, great king, a farmer householder, having placed seeds in the ground, when the sky rains properly, knows 'grain will be produced'?" "Yes, venerable sir, he would know." "Just so indeed, great king, one who arises knows 'I will arise'."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on knowing what arises is the ninth.

10. The Question on Evidence of the Buddha

10. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, does the Buddha exist?" "Yes, great king, the Blessed One exists." "But is it possible, Venerable Nāgasena, to point out the Buddha: 'Here or there'?" "The Blessed One, great king, has attained final Nibbāna through the Nibbāna element without residue of clinging; it is not possible to point out the Blessed One: 'Here or there'."

"Give a simile." "What do you think, great king, of a great mass of fire that was burning, the flame that has passed away, is it possible to show that flame: 'Here or there'?" "No indeed, venerable sir, that flame has ceased, gone beyond designation." "Just so indeed, great king, the Blessed One has attained final Nibbāna through the Nibbāna element without residue of clinging, has passed away; it is not possible to

point out the Blessed One: 'Here or there'; but by the body of the Teaching, great king, it is possible to point out the Blessed One. For the Teaching, great king, was taught by the Blessed One."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on evidence of the Buddha is the tenth.

The Chapter on the Buddha is the fifth.

In this chapter there are ten questions.

6. The Chapter on Mindfulness

1. The Question on Cherishing the Body

1. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, is the body dear to those gone forth?" "Indeed not, great king, the body is not dear to those gone forth." "Then why, venerable sir, do you cherish it and treat it as your own?" "But have you, great king, ever at some time gone to battle and received an arrow wound?" "Yes, venerable sir, I have." "Is that wound, great king, anointed with ointment and smeared with oil and wrapped with a fine cloth bandage?" "Yes, venerable sir, it is anointed with ointment and smeared with oil and wrapped with a fine cloth bandage." "Is that wound dear to you, great king, that it is anointed with ointment and smeared with oil and wrapped with a fine cloth bandage?" "The wound is not dear to me, venerable sir, but it is anointed with ointment and smeared with oil and wrapped with a fine cloth bandage for the purpose of the flesh healing." "Just so indeed, great king, the body is not dear to those gone forth, yet those gone forth, without clinging, care for the body for the support of the holy life. And yet, great king, the body was said by the Blessed One to be like a wound; therefore those gone forth care for the body like a wound, without clinging. This too was spoken, great king, by the Blessed One -

'Covered with moist skin, a great wound with nine doors;
It oozes all around, impure and foul-smelling.'

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on cherishing the body is the first.

2. The Question on the State of Omniscience

2. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, is the Buddha omniscient, all-seeing?" "Yes, great king, the Blessed One is omniscient, all-seeing." "Then why, Venerable Nāgasena, did he lay down the training rules for disciples gradually?" "But is there, great king, any physician who knows all medicines on this earth?" "Yes, venerable sir, there is." "Now, great king, does that physician give medicine to a sick person when the time has arrived, or when the time has not arrived?" "When the time has arrived, venerable sir, he gives medicine to a sick person, not when the time has not arrived." "Just so indeed, great king, the Blessed One, omniscient, all-seeing, does not lay down a training rule for disciples when the time has not arrived; when the time has arrived, he lays down a training rule for disciples, not to be transgressed for life."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

3. The Question on the Marks of a Great Man

3. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, is the Buddha endowed with the thirty-two characteristics of a great man and adorned with the eighty minor features, gold-coloured, with skin resembling gold, with a fathom-wide radiance?" "Yes, great king, the Blessed One is endowed with the thirty-two characteristics of a great man and adorned with the eighty minor features, gold-coloured, with skin resembling gold, with a fathom-wide radiance."

"But, venerable sir, were his mother and father also endowed with the thirty-two characteristics of a great man and adorned with the eighty minor features, gold-coloured, with skin resembling gold, with a fathom-wide radiance?" "No, great king, his mother and father were not endowed with the thirty-two characteristics of a great man and adorned with the eighty minor features, gold-coloured, with skin resembling gold, with a fathom-wide radiance."

"This being so, Venerable Nāgasena, a Buddha endowed with the thirty-two characteristics of a great man and adorned with the eighty minor features, gold-coloured, with skin resembling gold, with a fathom-wide radiance does not arise; but a son is either similar to his mother or takes after his mother's side, or a son is similar to his father or takes after his father's side." The elder said: "But is there, great king, any lotus, a hundred-petalled one?" "Yes, venerable sir, there is." "But where is its origin?" "It is born in mud and grows in water." "Is the lotus, great king, similar to the mud in colour or in odour or in flavour?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Then is it similar to the water in odour or in flavour?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, the Blessed One is endowed with the thirty-two characteristics of a great man and adorned with the eighty minor features, gold-coloured, with skin resembling gold, with a fathom-wide radiance, yet his mother and father were not endowed with the thirty-two characteristics of a great man and adorned with the eighty minor features, gold-coloured, with skin resembling gold, with a fathom-wide radiance."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the marks of a great man is the third.

4. The Question on the Blessed One's Holy Life

4. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, is the Buddha a practitioner of the holy life?" "Yes, great king, the Blessed One is a practitioner of the holy life." "Well then, Venerable Nāgasena, the Buddha is a pupil of Brahmā?" "But do you, great king, have a chief elephant?" "There is, venerable sir." "Does that elephant, great king, ever at some time trumpet the cry of a heron?" "Yes, venerable sir, it trumpets." "Well then, great king, that elephant is a pupil of the heron bird?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "But then, great king, is Brahmā with a Buddha or without a Buddha?" "With a Buddha, venerable sir." "Well then, great king, Brahmā is a pupil of the Blessed One."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the Blessed One's holy life is the fourth.

5. The Question on the Blessed One's Full Ordination

5. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, is full ordination beautiful?" "Yes, great king, full ordination is beautiful." "But, venerable sir, is there full ordination for the Buddha, or is there not?" "The Blessed One, great king, was fully ordained at the foot of the Bodhi tree together with the knowledge of omniscience; there is no full ordination given to the Blessed One by others. Just as, great king, the Blessed One lays down a training rule for disciples not to be transgressed for life."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the Blessed One's full ordination is the fifth.

6. The Question on Tears Being Medicine and Non-medicine

6. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, one who weeps when his mother has died, and one who weeps out of love for the teaching - of these two who are weeping, whose tears are medicine, whose are not medicine?" "For one, great king, the tears are impure and hot due to lust, hate and delusion; for one they are pure and cool due to joy and pleasure. That which is cool, great king, that is medicine; that which is hot, that is not medicine."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on tears being medicine and non-medicine is the sixth.

7. The Question on the Difference between One with Lust and One without Lust

7. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, what is the difference between one with lust and one without lust?" "One, great king, is attached, one is unattached." "What is this, venerable sir, called attached and unattached?" "One, great king, is desirous, one is not desirous." "I see, venerable sir, such a thing: both one with lust and one without lust, all of them wish only for beautiful solid food or soft food; no one wishes for evil." "One not free from lust, great king, eats food experiencing the flavour and experiencing lust for the flavour; but one without lust eats food experiencing the flavour, but not experiencing lust for the flavour."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the difference between one with lust and one without lust is the seventh.

8. The Question on the Support of Wisdom

8. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, where does wisdom dwell?" "Nowhere, great king." "Well then, Venerable Nāgasena, there is no wisdom." "Where does the wind dwell, great king?" "Nowhere, venerable sir." "Well then, great king, there is no wind."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the support of wisdom is the eighth.

9. The Question on the Round of Rebirths

9. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, as for this that you say 'wandering in the round of rebirths', which is that wandering in the round of rebirths?" "Here, great king, one born here dies right here, having died here arises elsewhere, having been born there dies right there, having died there arises elsewhere; thus, great king, is the wandering in the round of rebirths." "Give a simile." "Just as, great king, some man, having eaten a ripe mango, might plant the seed, from that a great mango tree having arisen would give fruits, then that man, having eaten a ripe mango from that too, might plant the seed, from that too a great mango tree having arisen would give fruits; thus the end of these trees is not discerned. Just so indeed, great king, one born here dies right here, having died here arises elsewhere, having been born there dies right there, having died there arises elsewhere; thus, great king, is the wandering in the round of rebirths."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the round of rebirths is the ninth.

10. The Question on Refuge Made Long Ago

10. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, by what does one remember what was done long ago in the past?" "By mindfulness, great king." "Is it not so, Venerable Nāgasena, that one remembers by consciousness, not by mindfulness?" "Do you recall, great king, having done some task and then forgotten it?" "Yes, venerable sir." "Were you then, great king, without consciousness at that time?" "No indeed, venerable sir, mindfulness was not present at that time." "Then why, great king, do you say thus: 'One remembers by consciousness, not by mindfulness'?"

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on refuge made long ago is the tenth.

11. The Question on Mindfulness of One Who Directly Knows

11. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, does all mindfulness arise as directly knowing, or is there also mindfulness that is produced?" "Both directly knowing, great king, and also produced mindfulness." "If indeed, Venerable Nāgasena, all mindfulness is directly knowing, there is no produced mindfulness?" "If there is not, great king, produced mindfulness, there is nothing to be done by craftsmen through work-fields or craft-fields or fields of knowledge, teachers would be useless. But because, great king, there is produced mindfulness, therefore there is something to be done through work-fields or craft-fields or fields of knowledge, and there is use for teachers."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on mindfulness of one who directly knows is the eleventh.

The Chapter on Mindfulness is the sixth.

In this chapter there are eleven questions.

7. The Chapter on the Process of Formless States

1. The Question on the Arising of Mindfulness

1. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, in how many ways does mindfulness arise?" "In seventeen ways, great king, mindfulness arises." "In which seventeen ways?" "Through direct knowing, great king, mindfulness arises; through a reminder, mindfulness arises; through gross consciousness, mindfulness arises; through consciousness of welfare, mindfulness arises; through consciousness of harm, mindfulness arises; through a similar sign, mindfulness arises; through a dissimilar sign, mindfulness arises; through recognition by speech, mindfulness arises; through a characteristic, mindfulness arises; through reminding, mindfulness arises; through a seal, mindfulness arises; through counting, mindfulness arises; through retention, mindfulness arises; through meditation, mindfulness arises; through binding to a book, mindfulness arises; through depositing, mindfulness arises; through experience, mindfulness arises.

"How does mindfulness arise through direct knowing? Just as, great king, the Venerable Ānanda and the female lay follower Khujjuttarā, or whoever else remembers former births, remember their births, thus mindfulness arises through direct knowing.

"How does mindfulness arise through a reminder? Whoever is by nature forgetful, and others bind him for the purpose of making him remember, thus mindfulness arises through a reminder.

"How does mindfulness arise through gross consciousness? When one is consecrated in a kingdom, or when one has attained the fruition of stream-entry, thus mindfulness arises through gross consciousness.

"How does mindfulness arise through consciousness of welfare? In whatever situation one was made happy, one remembers 'In such and such a situation I was thus made happy,' thus mindfulness arises through consciousness of welfare.

"How does mindfulness arise through consciousness of harm? In whatever situation one was made to suffer, one remembers 'In such and such a situation I was thus made to suffer,' thus mindfulness arises through consciousness of harm.

"How does mindfulness arise through a similar sign? Having seen a similar person, one remembers one's mother or father or brother or sister; having seen a camel or an ox or a donkey, one remembers another such camel or ox or donkey, thus mindfulness arises through a similar sign.

"How does mindfulness arise through a dissimilar sign? One remembers 'The colour of so-and-so is like this, the sound is like this, the odour is like this, the flavour is like this, the tangible object is like this,' thus also mindfulness arises through a dissimilar sign.

"How does mindfulness arise through recognition by speech? Whoever is by nature forgetful, others remind him, and by that he remembers, thus mindfulness arises through recognition by speech.

"How does mindfulness arise through a characteristic? Whoever by nature knows oxen by their limbs, knows by their characteristics, thus mindfulness arises through a characteristic.

"How does mindfulness arise through reminding? Whoever is by nature forgetful, whoever reminds him again and again 'Remember, friend, remember, friend,' thus mindfulness arises through reminding.

"How does mindfulness arise through a seal? Because of having trained in writing, one knows 'After this letter, this letter should be made,' thus mindfulness arises through a seal.

"How does mindfulness arise through counting? Because of having trained in counting, accountants count even much, thus mindfulness arises through counting.

"How does mindfulness arise through retention? Because of having trained in retention, retainers retain even much, thus mindfulness arises through retention.

"How does mindfulness arise from meditation? Here a monk recollects manifold past lives, that is, one birth, two births, etc. Thus with aspects and terms he recollects past lives; in this way mindfulness arises from meditation.

"How does mindfulness arise from binding to a book? Kings, not remembering an instruction, say 'Bring that book'; by that book they remember; in this way mindfulness arises from binding to a book.

"How does mindfulness arise from depositing? Having seen goods placed in deposit, one remembers; in this way mindfulness arises from depositing.

"How does mindfulness arise from what has been experienced? Because of having been seen, one remembers form; because of having been heard, one remembers sound; because of having been smelled, one remembers odour; because of having been tasted, one remembers flavour; because of having been touched, one remembers tangible object; because of having been cognised, one remembers mental phenomena; in this way mindfulness arises from what has been experienced. By these seventeen ways, great king, mindfulness arises."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the arising of mindfulness is the first.

2. The Question on Attaining Mindfulness of the Buddha's Virtues

2. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, you say 'whoever would do unwholesome deeds for a hundred years, and at the time of death would obtain mindfulness of one virtue of the Buddha, he would arise among the gods' - I do not believe this; and yet you say 'by this killing of living beings one would arise in hell' - I do not believe this either."

"What do you think, great king, would even a small stone float on the water without a boat?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "What then, great king, would even a hundred cartloads of stones placed on a boat float on the water?" "Yes, venerable sir." "Just as, great king, the boat, so wholesome actions should be seen."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on attaining mindfulness of the Buddha's virtues is the second.

3. The Question on Effort for the Abandoning of Suffering

3. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, do you strive for the abandoning of past suffering?" "No indeed, great king." "But do you, venerable sir, strive for the abandoning of future suffering?" "No indeed, great king." "But do you strive for the abandoning of present suffering?" "No indeed, great king." "If you do not strive for the abandoning of past suffering, do not strive for the abandoning of future suffering, do not strive for the abandoning of present suffering, then for what purpose do you strive?" The elder said: "So that, great king, this suffering might cease, and other suffering might not arise - for this purpose we strive."

"But is there, venerable Nāgasena, future suffering for you?" "There is not, great king." "You, venerable Nāgasena, are too clever, you who strive for the abandoning of non-existing future sufferings?" "But are there, great king, any hostile kings, adversaries, enemies present for you?" "Yes, venerable sir, there is." "Would you then, great king, have a moat dug, have a wall built, have a gateway built, have a watchtower built, have grain brought in?" "No indeed, venerable sir, that has been prepared beforehand." "Would you, great king, then train in elephants, train in horses, train in chariots, train in bows, train in swords?" "No indeed, venerable sir, that has been trained beforehand." "For what purpose?" "For the purpose of warding off future dangers, venerable sir." "Is there, great king, future danger?" "There is not, venerable sir." "You too, great king, are too clever, you who prepare for the purpose of warding off non-existing future dangers."

"Give a further simile." "What do you think, great king, when you were thirsty, would you then have a well dug, have a pond dug, have a lake dug, thinking 'I will drink water'?" "No indeed, venerable sir, that has been prepared beforehand." "For what purpose?" "For the purpose of warding off future thirst, venerable sir, it has been prepared." "But is there, great king, future thirst?" "There is not, venerable sir." "You, great king, are too clever, you who prepare that for the purpose of warding off non-existing future thirst."

"Give a further simile." "What do you think, great king, when you were hungry, would you then have a field ploughed, have rice sown, thinking 'I will eat a meal'?" "No indeed, venerable sir, that has been prepared beforehand." "For what purpose?" "For the purpose of warding off future hunger, venerable sir." "But is there, great king, future hunger?" "There is not, venerable sir." "You, great king, are too clever, you who prepare for the purpose of warding off non-existing future hunger."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on effort for the abandoning of suffering is the third.

4. The Question on the Brahma World

4. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, how far from here is the Brahma world?" "The Brahma world is far from here, great king. A stone the size of a pinnacle building falling from there, descending forty-eight thousand yojanas in a day and night, would

reach the earth in four months."

"Venerable Nāgasena, you say 'just as a strong man might extend his bent arm or bend his extended arm, even so a monk possessing supernormal power, having attained mastery of mind, having vanished from the Indian subcontinent, might appear in the Brahma world' - I do not believe this statement, that he would go so many hundreds of yojanas so extremely quickly."

The elder said: "But where, great king, is your birthplace?" "There is, venerable sir, an island named Alasanda; I was born there." "How far, great king, is Alasanda from here?" "About two hundred yojanas, venerable sir." "Do you recall, great king, having done some task there, remembering it?" "Yes, venerable sir, I remember." "Quickly indeed, great king, you have gone about two hundred yojanas."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the Brahma world is the fourth.

5. The Question on the Equal State of Two Beings Arisen in the World

5. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, one who has died here and would arise in the Brahma world, and one who has died here and would arise in Kashmir - which takes longer, which is quicker?" "The same, great king."

"Give a simile." "But where, great king, is your birthplace?" "There is, venerable sir, a village named Kalasi; I was born there." "How far, great king, is the village of Kalasi from here?" "About two hundred yojanas, venerable sir." "How far, great king, is Kashmir from here?" "Twelve yojanas, venerable sir." "Come now, great king, think of the village of Kalasi." "It has been thought of, venerable sir." "Come now, great king, think of Kashmir." "It has been thought of, venerable sir." "Which indeed, great king, took longer to think of, which was quicker?" "The same, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, one who has died here and would arise in the Brahma world, and one who has died here and would arise in Kashmir - they arise in the same time."

"Give a further simile." "What do you think, great king, if two birds were to go through the sky, and one of them were to settle on a high tree, and one were to settle on a low tree, when they have settled at the same time, whose shadow would first become established on the ground, whose shadow would become established on the ground after a long time?" "The same, venerable sir." "Just so indeed, great king, one who has died here and would arise in the Brahma world, and one who has died here and would arise in Kashmir - they arise in the same time."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the equal state of two beings arisen in the world is the fifth.

6. The Question on the Factors of Enlightenment

6. The king said: "How many, venerable Nāgasena, are the factors of enlightenment?" "There are seven factors of enlightenment, great king." "But with how many factors of enlightenment, venerable sir, does one become enlightened?" "With one factor of enlightenment, great king, one becomes enlightened - with the enlightenment factor of investigation of phenomena." "Then why, venerable sir, are

they called 'seven factors of enlightenment'?" "What do you think, great king, does a sword thrown into a sheath, not grasped by the hand, have the ability to cut what is to be cut?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Just so, great king, without the enlightenment factor of investigation of phenomena, with the six factors of enlightenment one does not become enlightened."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the factors of enlightenment is the sixth.

7. The Question on the Smallness and Greatness of Evil and Merit

7. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, which indeed is more, merit or demerit?" "Merit indeed, great king, is more; demerit is little." "For what reason?" "One doing demerit, great king, becomes remorseful: 'An evil deed was done by me,' therefore evil does not grow. One doing merit, great king, is not remorseful; for one not remorseful, gladness arises; in one who is gladdened, rapture arises; when the mind is filled with rapture, the body becomes calm; one whose body is calm feels happiness; the mind of one who is happy becomes concentrated; one who is concentrated understands as it really is; for that reason merit grows. A man, great king, with hands and feet cut off, having given one bundle of water-lilies to the Blessed One, will not go to the nether world for ninety-one cosmic cycles. By this reason too, great king, I say: 'Merit is more, demerit is little.'"

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the smallness and greatness of evil and merit is the seventh.

8. The Question on Doing Evil Knowingly and Unknowingly

8. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, one who knowing commits an evil deed, one who not knowing commits an evil deed, for whom is there more demerit?" The elder said: "Whoever indeed, great king, not knowing commits an evil deed, for him there is more demerit." "Well then, Venerable Nāgasena, whoever among our princes or chief ministers not knowing commits an evil deed, do we punish him twofold?" "What do you think, great king, a red-hot iron ball, blazing, in flames, aglow - one knowing might grasp it, one not knowing might grasp it - which one would be burnt more severely?" "Whoever indeed, venerable sir, not knowing might grasp it, he would be burnt more severely." "Just so indeed, great king, whoever not knowing commits an evil deed, for him there is more demerit."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on doing evil knowingly and unknowingly is the eighth.

9. The Question on Going to Uttarakuru and So On

9. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, is there anyone who could go to Uttarakuru with this body, or to the Brahma world, or else to another island?" "There is, great king, one who could go to Uttarakuru with this body consisting of the four great elements, or to the Brahma world, or else to another island."

"How, Venerable Nāgasena, could one go to Uttarakuru with this body consisting of the four great elements, or to the Brahma world, or else to another island?" "Do you recall, great king, having jumped a span or a cubit on this earth?" "Yes, venerable sir, I recall 'I, Venerable Nāgasena, jump even eight cubits.'" "How do you, great king, jump even eight cubits?" "I, venerable sir, produce the thought 'I will land here' - together with the arising of the thought my body becomes light." "Just so indeed, great king, a monk possessing supernormal power, having attained mastery of mind, having placed the body upon the mind, goes through the sky by the power of mind."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on going to Uttarakuru and so on is the ninth.

10. The Question on Long Bones

10. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, you say thus 'bones are long, even a hundred yojanas,' but there is not even a tree a hundred yojanas tall, how then could there be bones a hundred yojanas long?"

"What do you think, great king, have you heard 'in the great ocean there are fish even five hundred yojanas in size'?" "Yes, venerable sir, I have heard." "Is it not, great king, that a fish five hundred yojanas in size would have bones that are long, even a hundred yojanas?"

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on long bones is the tenth.

11. The Question on the Cessation of In-breath and Out-breath

11. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, do you say thus 'it is possible to stop the in-breath and out-breath'?" "Yes, great king, it is possible to stop the in-breath and out-breath." "How, venerable Nāgasena, is it possible to stop the in-breath and out-breath?" "What do you think, great king, have you ever heard anyone snoring?" "Yes, venerable sir, I have heard." "Would that sound, great king, cease when the body is bent?" "Yes, venerable sir, it would cease." "If indeed, great king, that sound of one with undeveloped body, undeveloped morality, undeveloped mind, undeveloped wisdom will cease when the body is bent, how then will the in-breath and out-breath not cease for one with developed body, developed morality, developed mind, developed wisdom who has attained the fourth meditative absorption?"

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the cessation of in-breath and out-breath is the eleventh.

12. The Question on the Ocean

12. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, 'the ocean, the ocean' is said; for what reason is water called 'the ocean'?" The elder said: "However much, great king, there is water, that much there is salt. However much there is salt, that much there is water. Therefore it is called 'the ocean'."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

13. The Question on the Ocean Having One Flavour

13. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, for what reason does the ocean have one flavour, the flavour of salt?" "Because of the water having been established for a long time, great king, the ocean has one flavour, the flavour of salt."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the ocean having one flavour is the thirteenth.

14. The Question on the Subtle

14. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, is it possible to cut all that is subtle?" "Yes, great king, it is possible to cut all that is subtle." "But what, venerable sir, is all subtle?" "Mental phenomena, great king, are all subtle; but not all mental phenomena are subtle, great king. 'Subtle' or 'gross' - this is a designation for mental phenomena. Whatever is to be cut, all that is cut by wisdom; there is no second cutting by wisdom."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the subtle is the fourteenth.

15. The Question on the Different Meanings of Consciousness

15. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, 'consciousness' or 'wisdom' or 'soul in what has come to be' - are these phenomena different in meaning and different in phrasing, or are they one in meaning and only different in phrasing?" "Cognition is the characteristic of consciousness, great king; understanding is the characteristic of wisdom; a soul in what has come to be is not found." "If a soul is not found, then who now sees form with the eye, hears sound with the ear, smells odour with the nose, tastes flavour with the tongue, touches tangible object with the body, cognises mental phenomena with the mind?" The elder said: "If a soul sees form with the eye... etc. cognises mental phenomena with the mind, that soul, when the eye-doors are torn out, facing outward with the great space, would see form more clearly; when the ears are torn out, when the nose is torn out, when the tongue is torn out, when the body is torn out, with the great space, would hear sound more clearly, would smell odour, would taste flavour, would touch tangible object?" "No indeed, venerable sir." "Well then, great king, a soul in what has come to be is not found."

"You are clever, Venerable Nāgasena."

The question on the different meanings of consciousness is the fifteenth.

16. The Question on the Difficulty of Defining Immaterial Phenomena

16. The king said: "Venerable Nāgasena, has something difficult been done by the Blessed One?" The elder said: "Something difficult, great king, has been done by the Blessed One." "But what, Venerable Nāgasena, has been done by the Blessed One that is difficult?" "Something difficult, great king, has been done by the Blessed One: the defining of these immaterial mental states of consciousness and mental factors occurring with a single object has been declared: 'This is contact, this is feeling, this is

perception, this is volition, this is consciousness."

"Give a simile." "Just as, great king, some man, having plunged into the great ocean by boat, having taken water with a cupped hand, having tasted it with his tongue, would he know, great king, that man: 'This is water of the Ganges, this is water of the Yamunā, this is water of the Aciravatī, this is water of the Sarabhū, this is water of the Mahī'?" "It is difficult, venerable sir, to know." "More difficult than this indeed, great king, has been done by the Blessed One: the defining of these immaterial mental states of consciousness and mental factors occurring with a single object has been declared: 'This is contact, this is feeling, this is perception, this is volition, this is consciousness.'" "Well said, venerable sir," the king rejoiced.

The question on the difficulty of defining immaterial phenomena is the sixteenth.

The Chapter on Defining Immaterial Phenomena is the seventh.

In this chapter there are sixteen questions.

Questions and Answers of Milinda

The elder said: "Do you know, great king, what time it is now?" "Yes, venerable sir, I know: 'Now the first watch has passed, the middle watch is proceeding, torches are being lit, four banners have been commanded to go from the treasury as royal gifts.'"

The Greeks said thus: "You are clever, great king, the elder is wise." "Yes, my good men, the elder is wise; if such were the teacher and such as I the disciple, a wise person would soon understand the Teaching." The king, pleased with his answering of questions, having covered the elder Nāgasena with a woollen blanket worth a hundred thousand, said: "Venerable Nāgasena, from this day forth I provide you with eight hundred meals; whatever is allowable in the inner palace, with that I invite you." "Enough, great king, I am living." "I know, Venerable Nāgasena, you are living, but protect yourself and protect me." "How do you protect yourself? Lest the reproach of others should come: 'Nāgasena pleases King Milinda, but did not obtain anything' - thus protect yourself. How do you protect me? Lest the reproach of others should come: 'King Milinda is pleased but does not show a sign of his pleasure' - thus protect me." "Let it be so, great king." "Just as, venerable sir, a lion, the king of beasts, even when placed in a golden cage, faces outward, just so indeed I, venerable sir, although I dwell in a house, I remain facing outward. If I, venerable sir, were to go forth from home into homelessness, I would not live long; I have many enemies."

Then the Venerable Nāgasena, having answered King Milinda's questions, having risen from his seat, went to the monastery. And when the Venerable Nāgasena had recently departed, this occurred to King Milinda: "What was asked by me, what was answered by the venerable Nāgasena?" Then this occurred to King Milinda: "Everything was well asked by me, everything was well answered by the venerable Nāgasena." And to the Venerable Nāgasena too, who had gone to the monastery, this occurred: "What was asked by King Milinda, what was answered by me?" Then this occurred to the Venerable Nāgasena: "Everything was well asked by King Milinda, everything was well answered by me."

Then the Venerable Nāgasena, after that night had passed, having dressed in the earlier period of the day, taking his bowl and robe, approached the dwelling of King Milinda; having approached, he sat down on the prepared seat. Then King Milinda, having paid respect to the Venerable Nāgasena, sat down to one side. Seated to one side, King Milinda said this to the Venerable Nāgasena:

"Let it not be thus for the venerable sir: 'Nāgasena was asked questions by me' - that with that very pleasure you spent the remainder of the night - it should not be seen thus by you. For me, venerable sir, during the remainder of the night, this occurred: 'What was asked by me, what was answered by the venerable sir?' - 'Everything was well asked by me, everything was well answered by the venerable sir.'"

The elder also said thus - "Let not the great king think thus: 'The question was answered by me to King Milinda' - that you spent the remainder of the night with that very pleasure - it should not be seen thus by you. For me, great king, during the remainder of that night, this occurred: 'What was asked by King Milinda, what was answered by me?' - 'All was well asked by King Milinda, all was well answered by me.'" Thus those two great beings gave thanks to each other's well-spoken words.

The Questions and Answers of Milinda's Questions are concluded.

Prologue on the Dilemmas

Eight Places to be Avoided for Incantations

A debater in useless talk, a sophist, of superior intelligence, discerning;
Milinda, for the breaking open of knowledge, approached Nāgasena.

Dwelling in his shadow, questioning again and again;
Having become one of penetrating intelligence, he too became a master of the
three Canons.

Studying the ninefold teaching, in the night-time, gone to a private place;
He saw the sheep-like questions, difficult to unravel, with refutation.

"There is what is spoken by method, there is what is spoken with hidden
meaning;
There is what is spoken according to intrinsic nature, in the Dispensation of the
King of the Dhamma.

"Not understanding the meaning of those, in the sheep-like sayings spoken by
the Conqueror;
In the future time, there will be strife therein.

"Come, having inspired confidence in the discussion, I will have the sheep-like
questions cut through;
By the path pointed out by him, they will point out in the future."

Then King Milinda, when the night became light, when dawn rose, having washed his
head, having raised joined palms on his head, having recollected the Perfectly
Enlightened Ones of the past, future, and present, took upon himself eight duty-
practices: "For the next seven days from now, having taken upon myself eight virtues,

austere asceticism will have to be practised by me; I, having practised austere asceticism, having pleased the teacher, will ask the sheep-like questions." Then King Milinda, having removed his ordinary suit of garments and having taken off his ornaments, having put on the ochre robe, having fastened a shaven-head covering on his head, having entered the state of a sage, took upon himself eight virtues: "For this week, royal business should not be instructed by me, a mind connected with lust should not be produced, a mind connected with hate should not be produced, a mind connected with delusion should not be produced, even towards slaves, workmen and servants, there should be humble conduct, bodily and verbal conduct should be guarded, the six sense bases should be guarded without remainder, the mind should be placed in the development of friendliness." Having taken upon himself these eight virtues, having established his mind in those very eight virtues, not going outside, having spent a week, on the eighth day, when the night became light, having taken the morning meal early, with eyes downcast, speaking moderately, with well-composed deportment, with undistracted mind, joyful, elated, clear-minded, having approached the elder Nāgasena, having paid homage with his head at the elder's feet, standing to one side, he said this -

"There is, Venerable Nāgasena, a certain matter to be discussed by me together with you; no other third person should be desired therein, in an empty place, in a secluded forest, endowed with eight factors, suitable for an ascetic. There that question will have to be asked; there nothing should be made secret by me, not confidential; I am worthy to hear what is confidential when a good discussion has been reached; that matter should be examined even by simile. Like what? Just as, Venerable Nāgasena, the great earth is worthy of receiving what is cast upon it when casting has been reached. Just so indeed, Venerable Nāgasena, I am worthy to hear what is confidential when a good discussion has been reached." Having entered a secluded forest grove together with the teacher, he said this - "Venerable Nāgasena, here eight places should be avoided by a man wishing to discuss; a wise man does not discuss a matter in those places; even a discussed matter falls to ruin and does not come to be. Which eight places? An uneven place should be avoided, a fearful place should be avoided, an excessively windy place should be avoided, a concealed place should be avoided, a temple of a deity should be avoided, a road should be avoided, a battle should be avoided, a water landing place should be avoided. These eight places should be avoided."

The elder said: "What is the fault in an uneven place, in a fearful place, in an excessively windy place, in a concealed place, in a temple of a deity, on a road, in a battle, at a water landing place?" "In an uneven place, Venerable Nāgasena, a discussed matter scatters, disperses, oozes away, and does not come to be; in a fearful place the mind becomes extremely parched; extremely parched, one does not rightly perceive the matter; in an excessively windy place the sound becomes obscure; in a concealed place they stand listening; in a temple of a deity a discussed matter turns out to be serious; on a road a discussed matter becomes hollow; in a battle it becomes unsteady; at a water landing place it becomes unconcealed. Here it is said -

"An uneven place, a fearful place, an excessively windy place, a concealed place, one dependent on a deity;

A road and a battle and a ford, these eight should be avoided."

Eight places to be avoided for consultation.

Eight Persons who Destroy Incantations

"Venerable Nāgasena, these eight persons, when being consulted, destroy the matter discussed. What are the eight? One of lustful temperament, one of hateful temperament, one of deluded temperament, one of conceited temperament, a greedy one, a lazy one, one who thinks alone, and a fool. These eight persons destroy the matter discussed."

The elder said: "What is the fault in them?" "One of lustful temperament, venerable Nāgasena, destroys the matter discussed through the influence of lust; one of hateful temperament destroys the matter discussed through the influence of hate; one of deluded temperament destroys the matter discussed through the influence of delusion; one of conceited temperament destroys the matter discussed through the influence of conceit; a greedy one destroys the matter discussed through the influence of greed; a lazy one destroys the matter discussed through laziness; one who thinks alone destroys the matter discussed through thinking alone; a fool destroys the matter discussed through foolishness. Here it is said -

"The lustful and corrupt and deluded, the conceited, the greedy, and likewise the lazy;

One who thinks alone and a fool, these are destroyers of the purpose."

Eight persons who destroy counsel.

Nine Destroyers of Secret Incantations

"Venerable Nāgasena, these nine persons reveal a secret discussed and do not keep it. Which nine? One of lustful temperament, one of hateful temperament, one of deluded temperament, a coward, one interested in worldly gain, a woman, a drunkard, a eunuch, and a child."

The elder said: "What is the fault in them?" "One of lustful temperament, venerable Nāgasena, reveals a secret discussed through the influence of lust and does not keep it; one of hateful temperament, venerable sir, reveals a secret discussed through the influence of hate and does not keep it; a deluded one reveals a secret discussed through the influence of delusion and does not keep it; a coward reveals a secret discussed through the influence of fear and does not keep it; one interested in worldly gain reveals a secret discussed because of material gains and does not keep it; a woman reveals a secret discussed because of the weakness of her wisdom and does not keep it; a drunkard reveals a secret discussed because of craving for liquor and does not keep it; a eunuch reveals a secret discussed because of uncertainty and does not keep it; a child reveals a secret discussed because of fickleness and does not keep it. Here it is said -

"The lustful and corrupt and deluded, the coward, one interested in worldly gain;

A woman, a drunkard, and a eunuch, the ninth is a child.

"These nine persons in the world, fickle, wavering, unsteady;
A secret discussed with them quickly becomes known."

Nine persons who destroy secret counsel.

Eight Causes for Attaining Wisdom

"Venerable Nāgasena, by eight causes full understanding matures and reaches ripeness. Which eight? By the maturing of age full understanding matures and reaches ripeness; by the maturing of fame full understanding matures and reaches ripeness; by questioning full understanding matures and reaches ripeness; by dwelling at a ford full understanding matures and reaches ripeness; by wise attention full understanding matures and reaches ripeness; by discussion full understanding matures and reaches ripeness; by cultivating affection full understanding matures and reaches ripeness; by dwelling in a suitable place full understanding matures and reaches ripeness. Here it is said -

"By age, by fame and questioning, by dwelling at a ford, wisely;
Discussion, cultivating affection, and by dwelling in a suitable place.

"These eight states are causes for the clarity of full understanding;
For those in whom these come together, their full understanding breaks
forth."

Eight causes for the attainment of wisdom.

Virtues of a Teacher

"Venerable Nāgasena, this piece of ground is free from the eight faults of consultation, and I am the supreme companion in counsel in the world, and I am a keeper of secrets - as long as I shall live, so long shall I keep the secret; and by eight causes my full understanding has reached maturity. Rare nowadays is a disciple like me. When a disciple is rightly practising, there are twenty-five qualities of a teacher towards teachers; with those qualities a teacher should rightly proceed. What are the twenty-five qualities?

"Here, venerable Nāgasena, a teacher should constantly and continuously establish protection for a pupil, what should not be associated with and what should be associated with should be known, the heedless and the heedful should be known, the sleeping place should be known, sickness should be known, whether food has been obtained or not obtained should be known, distinction should be known, what has come into the bowl should be shared, he should be encouraged 'Do not fear, the benefit is progressing for you,' 'He is dealing with this person' - the dealing should be known, the dealing in the village should be known, the dealing in the monastery should be known, laughter and jest should not be made with him, conversation should be made with him, having seen a fault it should be tolerated, one should be one who acts attentively, one should be one who acts without breaking, one should be one who acts without secrecy, one should be one who acts without remainder, 'I generate this one in the crafts' - the productive thought should be established, 'How may this one not decline' - the thought of growth should be established, 'I make this one powerful by the power of training' - the thought should be established, a friendly

thought should be established, in misfortunes he should not be abandoned, in what is to be done there should be no negligence, when there is a stumble he should be supported by the Teaching. These, venerable sir, are the twenty-five qualities of a teacher for a teacher. Proceed rightly towards me with those qualities. A doubt has arisen in me, venerable sir. There are the ram-like questions spoken by the Conqueror; in the future time strife will arise concerning them, and in the future time those of intelligence like you will be rare. Give me vision in those questions for the refutation of the doctrines of others."

Virtues of a Lay Follower

The elder, having received it saying "Good!", illuminated the ten qualities of a lay follower for a lay follower. "These are the ten qualities of a lay follower for a lay follower, great king. What are the ten? Here, great king, a lay follower shares happiness and suffering with the Community, takes the Teaching as authority, delights in sharing according to his strength, having seen the decline of the Conqueror's Dispensation, strives for its growth. He holds right view, is free from superstitious beliefs in auspicious signs, even for the sake of his life does not point to another teacher, his bodily and verbal conduct is guarded, he rejoices in concord, delights in concord, is not envious, and does not practise in the Dispensation by means of scheming, he has gone for refuge to the Buddha, he has gone for refuge to the Teaching, he has gone for refuge to the Community. These, great king, are the ten qualities of a lay follower for a lay follower. All those qualities are found in you. It is fitting for you, proper, befitting, suitable that you, having seen the decline of the Conqueror's Dispensation, wish for its growth. I give you permission; ask me as you please."

The Introductory Discourse to the Sheep-like Questions is concluded.



ABOUT THIS TRANSLATION

This translation is part of the PaliVerse Project - the first complete, unified English translation of the Pāli Canon together with its Commentaries (Aṭṭhakathā) and Subcommentaries (Tīkā), accompanied by interactive study tools. PaliVerse is an ongoing project. The AI translations are continuously improved through experts' revisions and feedback. This text is the latest translation as of the date of download.

PDF Creation Date: 14 September 2026

HOW TO CITE

PaliVerse (2026). The Triple Canon. The Canon of Discourses. 5. The Collection of Minor Texts. 20. The Questions of Milinda. 2-3. The Questions of Milinda Retrieved from paliverse.org

© 2026 The PaliVerse Project · All Rights Reserved
Centre for Study and Practice of Theravāda Buddhism
Civic Non-Profit Company registered in Greece
This PDF may be freely distributed for study and practice.

PaliVerse.org